

Lessons learnt in the use of 'contract' teachers  
Synthesis report





# Lessons learnt in the use of 'contract' teachers

Synthesis report

Yael Duthilleul



International Institute for Educational Planning

The views and opinions expressed in this paper are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of UNESCO or IIEP. The designations employed and presentation of material throughout this review do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO or IIEP concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or its authorities, or concerning its borders or boundaries.

This report was completed as part of a study on “Contract teachers and their impact on meeting EFA goals” undertaken for the World Bank and financed through the Norwegian Trust Fund.

Published by:  
International Institute for Educational Planning  
7-9 rue Eugène Delacroix, 75116 Paris  
e-mail: [info@iiep.unesco.org](mailto:info@iiep.unesco.org)  
IIEP web site: [www.unesco.org/iiep](http://www.unesco.org/iiep)

Cover design:  
Typesetting: Linéale Production  
Printed in IIEP's printshop  
ISBN: 92-803-1286-3  
© UNESCO 2005

## Foreword to the series

At the World Education Forum, held in Dakar in April 2000, the international community reaffirmed its commitment to ensuring universal access to basic education of high quality by the year 2015. Efforts have led to noteworthy increases in school enrolment. In spite of progress achieved, however, a high proportion of children still do not have access to education, while others drop out of school. It is clear that merely increasing resources and augmenting the capacity of school systems is inadequate to deal effectively with the problem.

In its research project on quality basic education for all, the IIEP looks at different innovations aiming to improve the provision and functioning of basic education so that it becomes more flexible and more open to the varying needs of children and adolescents who are out-of-school or in difficult circumstances. Such innovations include:

- all programmes that aim at increasing the ‘educability’ of children before or while they are attending schools, through health and nutrition programmes;
- non-traditional teaching experiments carried out in every part of the world that use alternative forms of organizing education and training, different teaching/learning methods and assist children and adolescents to struggle against exclusion;
- different management methods that allow communities to have a better say in the conduct and organization of education of their children.

It is hoped that these innovations will expand and influence the way the traditional education system is organized and managed.

Gudmund Hernes  
Director, IIEP



# Contents

Foreword to the series	5
List of abbreviations	9
Introduction	11
Chapter 1. The case of Cambodia: from dependence to replacement of contract teachers	17
Chapter 2. The case of India: the number of contract teachers on the increase	23
Chapter 3. The case of Nicaragua: promoting changes in teachers' contracts	29
Chapter 4. The experience of West African countries in the use of contract teachers	33
Chapter 5. Lessons learnt from employing contract teachers	39
Chapter 6. Reforming teacher policies in Sweden and England	47
Chapter 7. Promoting an effective use of contract teachers	55
Contract teachers' education, training and support	56
Final comments	67
References	69
Appendix	75





## List of abbreviations

ADEA	Association for the Development of Education in Africa
DPEP	District Primary Education Programme
EFA	Education for All
GDP	Gross domestic product
GNP	Gross national product
HLTA	Higher-level teaching assistant
ICT	Information and communication technology
NER	Net enrolment rate
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PASEC	Program for Analysis of Education Systems in Confemen countries
Rs	Rupees
SSA	Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
US\$	United States dollars
VEC	Village Education Committee



# Introduction

Stability is one of the key characteristics of a teaching job all over the world. This stability, usually associated with public service, is also an important element in ensuring the provision of quality education. Schools in which a large share of the staff is permanent and has been working at the same school for a significant period of time tend to have better student outcomes than those in which a large proportion of the staff rotates every year. There are, however, some problems with teacher deployment associated with the rigidity of the system and burdensome administrative requirements. Some of these problems are related to the slow capacity of the system to respond to fluctuations in student enrolment or replace absent teachers, teachers on leave or retired staff. Others are related to the lack of effective mechanisms to ensure that schools in hard-to-reach rural and remote areas are effectively staffed and that teachers are accountable for student outcomes. Finally, others still are related to the limited capacity of the system to provide effective incentives for professional and career development and to deal with under-performing teachers. While in principle most systems have provisions for dismissal of teachers in cases of disciplinary problems, underperformance or redundancy, in practice education systems are usually constrained in their capacity in this domain. Under-performing teachers are usually transferred to another school or to an administrative post rather than given extra support to improve their practice, or else are fired when all support options have been exhausted.

In this context, fixed-term contracts, or contracts of limited duration, have some appeal as they provide a degree of flexibility to the sector and facilitate quick adjustments to pressing and urgent demands. The regulations surrounding fixed-term contracts vary by country, but most countries impose

limits on the number of times a fixed-term contract can be renewed before it must be transformed into a permanent contract. These contracts at times also involve a change in the terms of employment, which may result in stronger accountability towards the school community and higher student and teacher attendance if the direct employer is located at the school level. Some even argue that the instability associated with these types of contracts acts as an incentive for teachers to perform at their best in order to secure a more permanent position.

In Europe, fixed-term contracts are usually established to replace absent teachers or employ teachers that are not fully qualified during times of teacher shortages. Developing countries also employ teachers on fixed-term contracts for similar reasons. There are, however, some indications that the number of teachers working under fixed-term contracts has been increasing in the last decade, both in Europe (Eurydice, 2003) and in developing countries (ILO, 1996), as a result of financial pressures. This increase suggests that the practice of employing teachers under a fixed-term contract is becoming more common as a cost-saving strategy, rather than as a flexible response to urgent needs. Teachers under a fixed-term contract, in general referred to as ‘contract teachers’ in the developing world, tend to have lower qualifications than regular, public-service teachers. They are hired by the government or the local community on an annual basis, usually for lower salaries than regular teachers and receive no additional social benefits. For example, in Peru these contract teachers represent about 11 per cent of all teachers. While initially these contracts were established to make up for teacher shortages in rural areas, they have since been used to substitute teachers on leave, to respond to increases in student enrolment, and even to replace teachers while the official vacancies are not filled (Diaz and Saavedra, 2002). A similar trend is found in Chile, where contract teachers can represent up to 20 per cent of the teaching force.

Contract teachers in developing countries have also been used as a strategy to expand access, particularly in rural and remote areas. In China,

contract teachers hired directly by the local community represented about half of all teachers in primary and secondary education by 1980. Efforts to replace them with professionally trained teachers have proven difficult given the shortage of qualified teachers, and have resulted in rural schools being closed and community contract teachers being replaced by substitute teachers with less experience and preparation (Wang, 2002).

Contract teachers have been a key factor in increasing access to the early primary grades in some states in India such as Rajasthan, Madhya Pradesh and Andhra Pradesh, where thousands of local contract teachers (or ‘para-teachers’ as they prefer to call them) have been hired by the local communities to supplement the existing teaching force. They have been particularly useful in remote and hard-to-reach areas, as well as in areas where the home language is different from that of the school (Sujatha, 2002). They have also provided an effective means of offering remedial and non-formal education to out-of-school children in India and Bangladesh (Banerjee, Cole, Duflo and Linden, 2003; Nath, 2002).

The practice of hiring contract teachers rather than regular teachers for a public service position has become quite dominant in West Africa, with several countries in the sub-region currently employing over half of their teachers under contract. In some countries, accepting a contract teacher position has become the only doorway to a regular teacher position, and in others contract teachers are even filling official vacancies.

While the logic of making schooling available to more students at a lower cost can be attractive for governments with limited resources and a commitment to meeting the EFA goal of universal primary education by 2015, the importance of ensuring quality learning for all requires an assessment of the impact of this policy on the ground.

The purpose of this report is to shed some light on this complex issue. To do this, a review was undertaken of three countries that had particular

experiences regarding contract teachers: Cambodia, India and Nicaragua. All three of these countries have a significant number of children out of school, suffer from teacher shortages, and continue to have an education of unsatisfactory quality and limited resources. They have all also relied on contract teachers at some point in time.

In Cambodia (Geeves and Bredenberg, 2004), contract teachers were hired to counter the shortages in rural and remote areas between 1996 and 2001. With their number reaching a peak in 2001, they represented about 9 per cent of the total primary teaching force. Recently, however, the government has reversed this policy and instead is now promoting the redeployment of teachers and non-teaching staff to remote areas, as well as the increase in double shifts and the recruitment of more candidates from remote areas to teacher education programmes.

In India (Govinda and Josephine, 2004), para-teachers have been used since the mid-1980s to provide non-formal education to out-of-school children and to provide schooling to children in isolated, remote areas. However, since the late 1990s, pressure to ensure universal primary education and limited resources has caused an increase in the use of contract teachers in formal primary schools, to the point of replacing regular teacher appointments.

In Nicaragua (Castro, 2004), teachers' contractual arrangements have changed as a result of a reform that has promoted education decentralization and school autonomy since the 1990s. In autonomous schools, teachers are employed by the school council rather than by the Ministry of Education and are offered financial incentives on top of their base salary on the basis of their performance. By 2002, about one third of primary and secondary schools serving more than half of the total student population had become autonomous, and it is expected that all public schools will be incorporated into the new system by 2006.

To complement the analysis of contract teachers in developing countries, a review was also commissioned of teacher policy reforms in Sweden and England. These two countries have recently introduced important modifications in the ways in which teachers are employed and paid (Strath, 2004) and their work structured (Department of Education and Skills, 2004), which brings some interesting perspectives and lessons to some of the key issues that are at the heart of the concerns regarding teacher policies.

In the first section of this document, the experiences of Cambodia, India and Nicaragua regarding contract teachers are presented. A brief outline of the experiences of countries in the West Africa sub-region, where the practice of contract teachers has become dominant, is then given, drawing mostly on recent work completed by the World Bank. This is followed by a discussion on the recent experiences of Sweden and England in reforming teacher policies. The last section draws on the lessons learnt from these experiences and concludes with some policy implications.





## *Chapter 1*

### The case of Cambodia: from dependence to replacement of contract teachers

Contract teachers have a relatively long history in Cambodia. When the system re-opened its schools in 1979 after the tragic period of the Khmer Rouge regime, the lack of teachers led the government to rely on a massive recruitment of volunteers to staff classrooms. At that time, anyone who was literate could be appointed to teach after having undertaken a short in-service course. These teachers, with minimum education, underwent massive (in numbers of teachers but not in length) in-service training in the late 1980s and early 1990s. This process led to wide-scale certification and facilitated the absorption of those qualified into the civil service as ‘equivalency certified teachers’. Gradually, 18 primary teacher training centres were established in the 24 provinces, which began to produce ‘pedagogically trained teachers’. At first, only seven years of basic education were required to enter the year-long programme. The programme was gradually upgraded to 12 years’ completed education plus two years’ teacher training in 1998, which is the current standard. Today, at the dawn of the twentieth century, about 70 per cent of the 49,603 primary teachers have completed lower secondary education.

During the late 1990s, severe teacher shortages began to emerge once again. The gap between the number of classes and the number of teachers at the primary level soared from 2,161 (about 5 per cent of the teaching force) in 1997 to 4,840 by 1998 and 7,209 by 1999. By 2003, the gap consisted of 11,382 teachers (or about 23 per cent of the primary teaching force), showing a slight decline in the rate of increase following the peak of 2001.

All of these shortages were experienced in rural and remote areas (MOEYS, 1997-2003).

The shortages of the late 1990s were the result of a combination of factors. First, the gradual cessation of conflict in Cambodia, which began after the 1993 elections, and the reintegration of formerly insecure areas resulted in an increase in the number of schools and students in the system, boosting the demand for teachers. Second, in 1994 a change was introduced in the entry requirements to teacher training institutions. Candidates were required to complete 11 years of education instead of eight. The change was well rooted on quality grounds but underestimated the effects on recruitment, particularly from rural and remote areas where students were unable to complete upper secondary education, usually for lack of schools. This resulted in a much larger number of candidates applying from urban areas. Third, in 1996, mandatory retirement for teachers at the age of 55 (which was later lifted to 60) was enforced and resulted in a decrease in the number of teachers. Finally, the success of the pro-poor focus of government policies since the year 2000, which boosted the primary school net enrolment rate from 83 per cent to 90 per cent in 2004, intensified the shortage.

The government reintroduced the practice of direct appointment of contract teachers in 1997 as an emergency strategy to deal with shortages. Contract teachers were directly recruited by the school director and paid by the state under a fixed contract of one year. They were offered a salary that was more or less equal to those of regular teachers, but without the latter's additional social benefits (the equivalent of 25 United States dollars (US\$) per month) and with the distinction that they were paid in chunks over 9-12 months rather than monthly.

These contract teachers, hired since 1997, were for the large majority (i) former teachers who had recently retired at the age of 55; (ii) younger people who had completed grade 12 but not necessarily passed the final

examination; and (iii) young students from remote areas who had completed grade 8. In the newly re-integrated areas, where no former teachers were available, the government had to rely on local people with low educational levels and no pedagogical training, and on young people from distant provinces who had completed grade 9 and were attracted to the areas because of the perceived economic opportunities. In very remote areas, contract teachers were often ethnic minority people who had a very low educational level but could work with children in their own language and were trusted by the parents.

These contract teachers played a key role in helping the government address shortages during the late 1990s in rural areas. They were also a useful mechanism by which the government could respond to political developments in remote and re-integration areas where no other human resources were available. They filled all identified vacancies in 1997 and 85 per cent of them in 1998. By 1999 and 2000, contract teachers filled 40 and 36 per cent of the teaching gap respectively for those years. The number of contract teachers reached its highest level in 2001 with 4,214 teachers recruited, representing about 9 per cent of the total teaching force, even if they only filled 32 per cent of the teaching gap of that year (13,044). The large majority were appointed in rural areas and the others in the most remote parts of the country.

In many cases, contract teachers were retired former teachers, so their educational level could not be contested. In some cases, the educational level of the young contract teachers recruited was higher than that of the few permanent teachers in the area who were part of those teachers appointed after 1979 with a minimum educational level.

Suddenly, in around 2002, the government decided to re-orient its policy and the number of contract teachers declined dramatically. Only 1,152 contract teachers remained in 2003, representing less than 2.5 per cent of the teaching force. The official argument for the change of policy was a

need to improve quality and efficiency, but in fact there were also concerns about corruption in the appointment of contract teachers. There had been reports of unofficial fees being deducted from contract teachers' payments and of high fees being requested in exchange for entry into the teaching service or transfer to another school. Some highly publicized cases led to embarrassment within the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports.

The measures introduced to improve quality and efficiency included: (i) the re-deployment of non-teaching staff to teaching positions; (ii) the re-deployment of certified teachers from areas where their number is more than sufficient to areas of need, and the deployment of recently graduated teachers to areas of need; (iii) double shifting; (iv) special region-specific teacher recruitment measures; and (v) increases in class size.

The redeployment of non-teaching staff (principals, deputy principals, secretaries and librarians) to teaching posts has not delivered the expected results, in part because there is a parallel effort to boost the role of principals, which averts their return to the classroom. There are no official figures testifying to how many of the non-teaching staff have returned to teaching positions, but the total number of non-teaching staff has remained relatively stable; their share was reduced only from 22 per cent in 1999 to 19.5 per cent in 2003, instead of the 15 per cent target that was expected from this policy.

Since 2001, some teachers have been deployed from areas where they are in surplus to areas of high demand, but not to the level expected, in spite of the financial incentives offered (ranging from US\$75-375) and the substantial budgetary provisions. About 2,000 redeployments have occurred (of the initial 4,435 planned), and most of these have been between schools in the same commune or district. It has proven difficult to attract and retain teachers in remote areas in spite of financial incentives.

Double shifting became the main strategy of the government to deal with the shortage of teachers. It became unpopular among teachers in rural schools, mostly because payments corresponding to the second shift were always late and subject to cuts. Teachers began to develop alternative strategies to deal with this problem: from combining two classes of the same level into a single class, to teaching each class for only two hours instead of the expected four, or even sub-contracting the teaching of one of the two classes to someone else (reintroducing an unaccountable *de facto* contract teacher). None of these actions could contribute to the improved quality that the elimination of contract teachers was attempting to achieve.

In order to boost the number of candidates from remote areas for teacher training programmes, the entry requirements were adjusted. The new requirements allowed candidates from a number of specified areas, where opportunities for upper secondary teachers were non-existent or limited, to apply with only a grade 9 education. There have already been four intakes of students with grade 9 qualifications in the teacher training programmes who show the same promotion and retention rates as those candidates who have completed grade 12, although there is no information available on performance in the classroom. Those entering teacher training centres with a grade 9 education now represent about one third of the student-teacher population. The understanding is that after completion of their studies, these candidates will be posted to their own villages in remote areas, where they will have the necessary family and social support that will make them more likely to remain in the post.

In 2002, the pupil-class ratio rose from 45:1 to 50:1, in another attempt to improve efficiency and educate more students using fewer teachers. However, there has been resistance to the implementation of this policy, which is not perceived as compatible with the quality objective that is supposed to guide the reform.

On the basis of the experience of the last years, one of the most promising policies to address teacher shortages in Cambodia appears to be that of attracting teacher candidates from remote and rural areas and training them to become teachers in their home towns. This policy may have a higher chance of success with female candidates, as they are more prone to stay in their villages. While the current policy to lower entry requirements for candidates from remote areas applies only to six provinces, there are talks of extending it to other rural and remote areas. The challenge remains in ethnic minority areas, where bilingual approaches and flexibility in teacher education and training are more likely to offer an appropriate solution to the problem of teacher shortages.

## *Chapter 2*

### The case of India: the number of contract teachers on the increase

The education system in India has been expanding since the 1950s, and particularly from around 1985, with the launching of special programmes and interventions aimed at achieving the EFA goals. The basic education system has grown from about 200,000 schools in 1950 to more than 800,000 in 2004, and enrolments in primary and upper primary have increased from 22.3 million to 155.7 million. In spite of all these efforts, an estimated 42 million children of school-going age remain out of school and around 40 per cent of children entering grade 1 drop out without completing the five-year primary cycle. Demand for school places and teachers is not uniform across states: Seventy-five per cent of the 42 million out-of-school children are concentrated in six states. These states tend to be the poorest and hence most dependent on resources from the central government for any improvements in education. Under these constraints, recruiting teachers on a contract basis has been seen as a solution that does not entail a recurrent burden on the state and promotes some savings. The number of para-teachers in the system has more than doubled in the last few years (there were an estimated 500,000 in 2005), and this increase is expected to continue. However, since their salaries do not form part of the official government payroll, there are no official statistics to systematically record their presence in the system.

The development of the policies and practices related to para-teachers has been facilitated by the decentralization trend that started in the mid-1990s and made it possible to transfer teacher management responsibilities

to lower levels. The federal structure of governance in India leaves to the various state governments the responsibility of formulating the rules and regulations regarding recruitment and service conditions of school teachers and para-teachers, which helps explain the great variation that exists.

The expansion in the use of para-teachers to fill regular vacancies has been clearly supported by the national government, who is a key player in the process of achieving the goal of universal elementary education via the resources it channels through large-scale interventions, such as the District Primary Education Programme (DPEP) in the 1990s and its subsequent expansion, the Education for All Campaign or Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA). National policy documents of the late 1990s, such as the recommendations of the National Committee of State Education Ministers, present para-teachers as the solution by which teacher shortages can be dealt with in an affordable manner; not just in remote and difficult areas, but throughout the whole country. These documents also express dissatisfaction with public-service teachers, their absenteeism and lack of motivation, and their accountability towards the community.

Prior to this trend, there had been some earlier experiences in the use of para-teachers in both non-formal education programmes for out-of-school children and in formal schools in remote areas. In Himachal Pradesh, para-teachers were hired to help single-teacher government schools cope with increased enrolments and provide schooling in remote areas where regular teachers were reluctant to go. The strategy was also a way to provide employment to educated youth. In contrast with these early initiatives, the schemes introduced in the late 1990s have clearly focused on employing para-teachers in regular schools where otherwise fully-employed regular teachers would have been appointed.

A closer examination of the various schemes operating in the country reveals that para-teachers are appointed in two types of situations. In the first case, para-teachers are recruited for postings in regular schools. This scheme



has been in place in six states since the launching of DPEP, and other states have joined in under SSA in the last two years. It was created (i) to meet the existing shortage of teachers; (ii) to counter teacher absenteeism; and (iii) to alleviate adverse student-teacher ratios. The expansion of this scheme is resulting in a virtual stopping of the recruitment of regular-pay-scale teachers in some states, with all vacancies being filled by para-teachers. In this case, para-teachers coexist with regular teachers in formal primary schools.

In the second case, para-teachers are recruited to work in remote, hilly and isolated areas that do not qualify as suitable terrain on which to establish an official primary school according to the existing norms. Some of these schools only accept students in the first two grades, while others function as single-teacher schools up to grade 5. This scheme began operating in the late 1990s under DPEP and is now absorbed into SSA. In this case, the employment of para-teachers is being promoted with central funds under the framework of ensuring universal access and not as a means of conserving state government resources.

While there are no official data to report on the number of para-teachers employed today, it is clear that the number has been increasing steadily in the last years. A recent survey also shows great variation in the use of para-teachers in the major Indian states; the state of Gurajat took pole position, with para-teachers constituting 43 per cent of rural primary teachers and 14 per cent of urban primary teachers.

Local community leadership plays an important role in the recruitment of para-teachers in most states. The honorarium paid to para-teachers varies widely across states, ranging from 900 to 3,500 rupees (Rs) in urban areas and around Rs1,000 per month in remote areas. In comparison, a regular teacher receives about Rs5,000 per month, which is the equivalent of about US\$100. Para-teachers are appointed on an annual basis and renewal of their contract is possible if performance is satisfactory. In practice, however,

no formal framework for evaluation exists and most para-teachers see their contract renewed. Most contracts are issued by the local village bodies or school committees that, in addition to promoting accountability, offer the state government a way to avoid possible litigation under the principle of 'equal pay for equal work'. Some states foresee the absorption of para-teachers into regular public service positions after a minimum length of service and completion of certain educational requirements. However, as regular posts are being filled by para-teachers who are not offered public service status, these provisions are becoming less relevant.

Para-teachers are, in most cases, local residents and hence speak the language of the community. The minimum educational level required is 12 years, which is the same as for a regular teacher, except in remote areas where these qualifications are lowered. The major difference in background between a regular teacher and a para-teacher is that the former is required to complete the two years of initial teacher education, while para-teachers are asked to undertake an induction programme of varied length prior to starting their assignment and some days of in-service training during the year. The training programmes do not seem to sufficiently address the different needs of para-teachers appointed to remote areas.

In evaluating the impact of para-teachers on student learning in India, it is important to keep in mind that the learning environment in regular primary schools is far from satisfactory. A recent study reported that most of the teaching observed in para-teachers' classrooms was textbook-based. Para-teachers lacked the competences and support materials to work effectively with multi-grade classrooms, but so did regular teachers. Para-teachers work under the direction and guidance of the principal and inspectors treat para-teachers on equal grounds as regular teachers when assessing school performance. In practice, however, most schools are never supervised; therefore the evaluation of para-teachers is no more effective than that of regular teachers. Poor accountability and performance

assessments affect both types of teachers equally. The results of a small study on student achievement in states using para-teachers suggest that the overall performance of children in all four projects evaluated was unsatisfactory and that there was nothing markedly different in the achievement of para-teacher schools and government primary schools.

For the purpose of contributing to this report, additional feedback from key stakeholders on their experiences in the use of para-teachers was collected from two districts in Uttar Pradesh. Discussions focused on the experience of having para-teachers work alongside regular teachers in government primary schools.

Data revealed that 80 per cent of para-teachers hired in the state had much higher qualifications than the minimum 12 years required: Forty-five per cent had a Bachelor degree and 35 per cent a Masters. Overall, all stakeholders questioned (para-teachers, teachers, principals, local administrators and Village Education Committee (VEC) members) were satisfied with the involvement of local people in the selection process, as this had instilled a sense of ownership and accountability at the community level. The possibility to hire local people who speak the same language and dialect as the children and community members was also greatly appreciated by almost all respondents.

In spite of their higher education level, the para-teachers questioned were unanimous in their request for additional training and support to carry out their teaching tasks. They also suggested that the training programmes differentiate between the needs of newly appointed para-teachers and those who had had their contracts renewed. In spite of their lower salary and status, para-teaches were satisfied merely with the fact that they had a job. The VEC confirmed that numerous candidates applied for each position. Some of the para-teachers encountered hoped to be absorbed by the public service system in the future.

Discussions revealed that para-teachers were responsible for opening and closing the school each day. They were also responsible for the cleaning and maintenance of the school premises. While these chores were seen as natural given that they live in close proximity to the school, they also revealed that regular teachers came to the school at their convenience and did not carry out their job as expected. Half of the para-teachers reported being involved in administrative tasks and around 45 per cent reported teaching grades 4 and 5 – activities supposed to be carried out by regular teachers.

The regular teachers questioned were supportive of the practice of appointing para-teachers and appreciated their good work which, in fact, relieved them of some of their tasks. They were, however, the only ones that raised concerns about the long-term impact of this practice on the quality of the teaching profession. Most stakeholders focused on the immediate benefits of the scheme and did not question its long-term implications. They valued the improvements in the functioning of the school, as these helped boost enrolments and increased regularity in student attendance. Local officials saw it as a solution to teacher absenteeism and school non-functioning. The higher education level of para-teachers was appreciated and seen as a key factor in sustaining quality. It was believed that the competences they lacked could be improved through in-service training.

## *Chapter 3*

### The case of Nicaragua: promoting changes in teachers' contracts

Nicaragua in the early 1990s was one of the poorest countries in Latin America, with one of the lowest net primary enrolment rates in the region (NER of 75.4 per cent). High drop-out and repetition rates resulted in low effective educational progress; the average educational attainment of the population was about four years. About one third of all primary teachers had not received any preparation for the job, and the percentage was even higher in rural areas. Most of these unaccredited teachers (*empíricos*) were primary school graduates who had been recruited by the Ministry of Education during the 1980s in response to a significant increase in school enrolments during that period. In preparation for their job, they had been provided with some short-term training. The sector was poorly financed, with only about US\$42 spent per primary school student per year, and more than 90 per cent of the government education budget was devoted to recurrent expenditures.

In order to improve the quality and efficiency of the system, the government launched a decentralization strategy that promoted school autonomy and introduced changes in teacher contracts. Financial transfers to the converted autonomous schools were established on a per-student basis. The school council, made up of the school principal, teacher and parent representatives, was given authority to control those and any additional resources that it was able to generate through its own fundraising efforts. It was also given the power to hire and fire teachers within the existing legal framework that governed teachers' rights, and it could offer them additional financial incentives on the basis of their performance.

It was assumed that parent and community participation in school management decisions would create greater local interest in school success, increase the accountability of teachers and school administrators, and develop an increased willingness on the part of parents and local communities to provide additional financial support to schools. It was also expected that through such a model the social contract between the family, the state and civil society in the provision of public education would be restored. Initially, it was expected that additional financial resources would be raised through the collection of school fees. But later, when student enrolments in autonomous schools began to decline, this aspect of the reform was eliminated and financial contributions from parents became optional.

The reform began as a pilot in 1993, with 20 large urban secondary schools that had volunteered to participate in the programme. By 1995, primary schools started to join in. The programme was also adapted to incorporate small rural schools through the creation of school networks. By 2002, about 37 per cent of primary and secondary schools, covering almost 63 per cent of students, had become autonomous. By 2006, all public schools are expected to be incorporated into the system.

Teachers hired by school councils in autonomous schools have the same legal status as teachers in centralized schools and receive the same basic salary. However, the terms of their contracts are different. Teachers hired by the school council have a one-year probation status before their contract is made permanent. This probationary period can be extended to two years if performance is not considered fully satisfactory by the school council. Teachers in autonomous schools are required to teach a minimum of 35 students per class, while there is no minimum in centralized schools. These numbers in fact tend to be higher in urban areas, with about 42 students per teacher in primary schools and 49 in secondary (versus 36 and 40 in centralized schools). Teachers in autonomous schools benefit from

closer supervision and technical support from the school principal than teachers in centralized schools. In addition, they can be financially rewarded on the basis of their performance. One type of financial incentive is a bonus provided through a government investment programme that rewards student and teacher attendance and student promotion. The other financial incentive is provided by the school council from its own fund-raising efforts, which makes it more uncertain and limited, particularly in primary schools. Overall, teachers in autonomous schools can receive about a one to one-and-a-half additional monthly salary per year as a bonus financed from government resources, and some may also receive the equivalent of an additional month's salary from school-generated resources.

In spite of the financial incentives offered, teacher salaries remain a challenging issue and a contributing factor to teacher shortages. While it is true that efforts to increase teacher salaries have been constant and that in the last five years salaries have increased by an average of 16.5 per cent annually, in 2003 the average salary for a teacher with 25 years of experience was only US\$100 per month. A teacher's salary remained significantly lower than that of a public employee (about US\$206) and was insufficient to cover an estimated full basket of basic needs (US\$154). The differences in salary between those teachers who are professionally trained and those who are not have also tended to disappear.

After more than ten years of experience with autonomous schools, results show that net enrolment rates have increased from 75 per cent to 83.5 per cent in primary schools, and from 20 per cent to 38.7 per cent in secondary schools. Overall, primary dropout rates have been reduced from 14 per cent to 6.5 per cent and promotions to sixth grade have increased from 20 per cent to 36 per cent. The share of accredited teachers is higher in autonomous schools (81 per cent versus 70 per cent) and student repetition and drop-out are lower, particularly in urban secondary schools.

A study of third graders' achievement in language and mathematics showed that, statistically, students from autonomous schools have significantly better results. The results for sixth graders were less conclusive and not statistically significant: Students in both types of schools achieved roughly equal results in language, and those in centralized schools performed somewhat better in mathematics. However, the first national achievement tests indicate that most third and sixth graders in the country have a very poor mastery of curriculum content. Poverty, lack of educational resources and inadequate teacher education can in part explain these results. Public opinion, nonetheless, tends to consider autonomous schools to be of better quality than centralized schools.



## *Chapter 4*

### The experience of West African countries in the use of contract teachers

In the last ten years, countries in the West Africa sub-region have also come to rely on contract teachers as a strategy to expand access. Senegal was one of the first countries to introduce this practice as a national policy in 1995. Noting that enrolments had fallen from 58.5 per cent to 54.5 per cent between 1990 and 1994, partly as a result of teacher shortages, and with teacher salaries representing on average over six times the GDP per capita and engaging up to 90 per cent of the education bill, the government decided to staff classrooms through the development of an alternative low-cost strategy.

The country was already allocating up to 4.2 per cent of GDP to education, had an average of 59 students per teacher and was extensively applying double-shift and multi-grade teaching. However, it could only afford 250 additional teachers per year, when in fact 2,000 were needed to accommodate the increase in enrolments. This is why they decided to embark on a strategy to recruit ‘volunteers’ to fill the gap.

The strategy opened the door to 1,500 new positions during the first year. Candidates were required to have a high-school diploma and were provided with four months of training to teach in primary school. They were offered a salary that was about twice the GDP per capita. Their initial contract was limited to two years, with the option to renew it only once, but they could apply later for a regular teaching position on obtaining the necessary qualifications. The strategy proved very successful: Primary enrolment rates increased from 58.5 per cent in 1994 to 75.3 per cent in

2001, and student-teacher ratios declined from 59:1 to 49:1 (Ndoye, 1997; 2001).

Countries in West Africa differ in the extent to which they have relied on contract teachers to expand their education systems, with some countries such as Côte d'Ivoire not having any, while Niger, on the other hand, has half of its teachers under contract. A closer examination of some of these trends could suggest that those West African countries that have relied more on contract teachers in the last five to ten years have been more successful in increasing access. For example, in Niger primary net enrolment rates increased from about 27 per cent to 38 per cent between 1998 and 2001, while in Côte d'Ivoire they remained at around 28 per cent during the same period (UNESCO, 2005; Mingat, 2004).

West African countries have also promoted access by making it possible for parents to directly hire teachers. Many community schools have developed as a result of this policy. In some cases, the government provides a subsidy to cover teacher salaries, or complements the community's efforts with professional guidance and teacher support. Several West African countries have promoted this option as another strategy to increase access (e.g. Togo, Mali, Senegal), and in some cases this strategy has been preferred over contract teachers. For example, countries such as Chad and Madagascar that officially have no contract teachers have relied heavily on community teachers (67 per cent and 53.9 per cent respectively) subsidized by the state. In Chad, net primary enrolments increased from about 23 per cent to 27 per cent between 1998 and 2001. No figures are available for Madagascar in 1998. The table below presents the latest comparative information on the different types of teachers in the countries in the sub-region.

**Table 4.1**      **Distribution of primary teachers**

Country	Public servants (%)	Contract teachers (%)	Parents (%)
Benin (2002)	54.7	16.4	29.0
Burkina Faso (2003)	64.1	23.6	12.2
Cameroon (2002)	34.9	20.4	44.7
Chad (2002*)	32.5	0.0	67.5
Congo (2003)	42.0	3.9	54.2
Côte d'Ivoire (2001)	87.3	0.0	12.7
Guinea (2003)	30.9	38.9	30.1
Madagascar (2003*)	46.1	0.0	53.9
Mali (2000)	70.8	8.2	21.0
Niger (2003)	46.0	50.2	3.8
Senegal (2003)	43.6	41.5	15.0
Togo	35.0	30.5	34.6
Total	49.0	19.5	31.6

\* Community teachers receive a state subsidy.

Source: Mingat, 2004.

To understand why contract teachers have come to constitute such an important share of the teaching body in most West African countries, it is necessary to consider the low primary enrolment rates of about 37 per cent on average for the sub-region, the generally overcrowded classrooms and the relatively high teacher salaries, which suggest that a large number of teachers and resources are needed if universal primary education is to be achieved by 2015. In relation to GNP per capita, teachers in West Africa – particularly those from the Sahel – are, in comparative terms, among the better paid in the world. Even taking into account the fact that teacher salaries have tended to decline in the last two decades, the average teacher

salary in Sahel countries in the year 2000 remained at 6.4 times the GNP per capita, while in the rest of Africa it was about 4.4, in Asia about 2.9, in the Middle East and North Africa about 2.3 and in Latin America 2.3 times the GNP per capita. For these countries it became financially impossible to hire the additional teachers needed<sup>1</sup> to provide universal primary education at the current average salary rate.

There are, however, many differences in terms of how countries have implemented contract teacher policies. While most countries require a minimum of completed lower secondary education, there are significant differences in the length and modality of the training provided. Countries such as Senegal, Mali and Mauritania provide three months of training, while others such as Niger and Burkina Faso offer one year and Guinea as much as 18 months. In the cases of Senegal, Burkina Faso and Togo, there is a career development plan associated with being a contract teacher, which is not available in the other countries (see *Appendix* for a detailed table).

As mentioned above, in some countries the only way to become a teacher is to first be a volunteer. The fact that such a path has been created as a means of entry into the teaching profession appears to be resented by some regular teachers, who claim that the selection criteria applied to recruit volunteers at the local level is not transparent, and that the incentives offered to teach in remote areas are not aligned with the level of responsibilities or complexities of the job (De Grauwe, 2004).

However, in countries where this is not an option, other management issues emerge. For example, in Guinea contract teachers claimed that they did not have adequate professional support, were not sufficiently paid and did not receive their salary regularly (Solaux, Suchaut, Dogoh-Bibi,

1. Recent estimates suggest that in order to meet EFA goals, the number of teachers in West Africa should increase from 221,000 to about 654,000 by 2015 (Mingat, 2004).

Zébangou and Condé, 2001). As a result, many of them did not wish to continue in their jobs the following year.

Vegas and De Laat (2002) warn against the negative consequences on student learning of hiring contract teachers instead of regular teachers. In their analysis of data from Togo, they found that while the initial introduction of a contract teacher system might not have an effect on teacher performance, the increased turnover of qualified contractual teachers observed would most likely result in a decline in the quality of the pool of contractual teachers over time, thus being detrimental to student performance in the long run. Unfortunately, except in a few cases, most countries report having difficulties in ensuring regular payment of their contract teachers.

Implementing a policy of contract teachers can bring out other sensitive issues as well. An analysis of teacher identity and status in Benin (Welmond, 2002) demonstrated how the policies of frozen salaries and increased recruitment of lesser-paid teachers had resulted in a more embittered teacher body, education of questionable legitimacy and more political instability. The analysis explained how the introduction of contract teachers went against one of the basic elements of teacher identity in Benin: that of being a respected civil servant. Teachers felt betrayed by the state: They had been promised a steady salary, job security, opportunities for social mobility and high social status, and instead their salaries were frozen, they were at risk of being made redundant, they had to escape the teacher profession in order to advance and they saw their image decline. As a consequence, they engaged in a host of unconstructive behaviours and tactics (absenteeism, tardiness, moonlighting, etc.) that did not contribute to improved learning.

The challenge of managing a very heterogeneous teaching body was evidenced at a recent conference co-sponsored by ADEA, the World Bank and Education International in Bamako. Officials from 12 French-speaking African countries, together for the first time with teacher unions and parent organizations, analyzed issues and shared views regarding the experience

of employing contract teachers. As a result of the conference, an official statement was released confirming the countries' appreciation for the contribution that contract teachers had made to improving access, but also raising concerns about the potential social risks that current salary disparities between different types of teachers were generating and that alerted to the need to better address the education and training needs of these teachers. It was recommended that contract teachers working at the primary level complete at least lower secondary education and have six months of initial training, that they have access to professional development opportunities and support throughout their careers, that they be offered a decent salary with social benefits, and that disparities among different types of teachers in terms of recruitment, education and training be gradually reduced (ADEA, World Bank, Education International and Minister of Education of Mali, 2004).

## *Chapter 5*

### Lessons learnt from employing contract teachers

The previous sections have presented the experiences of different countries and regions in the use of contract teachers. In the case of Cambodia, contract teachers have been an essential resource to improve access in rural and remote areas, particularly where ethnic minorities speaking different languages reside. The current efforts of the government to replace them with professionally-trained local residents seems promising, but in the most remote and bilingual areas it will most likely need to continue relying on contract teachers to ensure provision of education to the population. In India, para-teachers are seen by the national government as a cost-saving strategy to improve enrolment rates in the most poor and underdeveloped states. However, they have also become a strategy to increase accountability towards the community and contribute to improving student and teacher attendance and performance, thus addressing some of the problems experienced with regular teachers. Similar issues have been addressed in Nicaragua with the changes introduced in teachers' contracts, the difference being that the country has tackled them by reforming the overall teacher management system. In West Africa, the expansion of contract teachers has been determined by the large number of teachers needed to ensure universal primary education, the relatively high teacher salaries and the limited resources to expand the system as needed.

The cases presented make it clear that the emergence and expansion of contract teachers in these different education systems cannot be seen in isolation, but rather must be understood in the context of overall country resources, educational challenges and teacher policy frameworks. Some of the positive outcomes associated with contract teachers, such as their

improved accountability towards the community or their more regular attendance, are the result of changes in institutional arrangements that respond to the weaknesses identified in the teacher policy framework. Some of the negative or unsatisfactory aspects, such as their limited competences or high turnover rate, point to the importance of effective teacher training, support and management. Reviewing and assessing the impact of contract teachers on the system requires reviewing the overall teacher policy framework that is in place in the country.

The following section summarizes the findings and lessons learnt from these experiences.

## Contract teachers

Many different types of teachers fall under the label of 'contract teachers' (e.g. para-teachers, volunteers, community teachers), which makes it more difficult to draw generalizations about what contract teachers are or do. Contract teachers are in general employed under different terms from regular teachers. They are not public servants and in most cases their contracts are limited to one year, usually with a possibility of renewal. Their salaries tend to be lower than those of public servant teachers and they rarely have rights to other benefits associated with the job, although situations vary by country. Countries also differ in the extent to which they regulate the requirements and conditions of employment of contract teachers: the minimum education required, the training and support provided, and the number of times the contract can be renewed. The situation is different for teachers in Nicaragua, as the changes introduced in their contracts have not affected their basic salary or their social benefits, but rather have changed who employs them and the incentives offered.

Countries also differ in terms of who hires and appoints contract teachers: in Cambodia it is the school principal; in Nicaragua the School



Committee; and in India the Village Education Committee that plays the key role. In West Africa it can be the local education office or the community, with or without state financial support. There are also countries that lack a framework by which to regulate alternative contractual arrangements and leave to the local communities the freedom to hire volunteers to teach in the schools.

The co-existence of such a diversity of employment conditions is causing increasing concerns about the social challenges it brings to the system and to the teaching profession. There is growing international commitment to ensuring that contract teachers have a certain minimum education, that they be provided with at least six months of initial training and professional support, that they be offered career development options and that they have social benefits attached to their salaries.

## Serving different objectives

Contract teachers have been used to address different objectives: (i) to increase access in remote areas where regular teachers are not interested in being appointed; (ii) to provide schooling in post-conflict areas where no teachers are available; (iii) to serve ethnic minority populations in which local volunteers can communicate more effectively with students and parents than regular teachers; (iv) to improve student-teacher ratios in public schools; (v) to provide assistance to existing teachers; (vi) to provide a source of employment for educated youth; and (vii) to offer a cost-saving strategy to quickly increase access to primary education.

It is in West Africa that the use of contract teachers has spread most in the last ten years, with some countries now having almost half of their teaching body made up of contract teachers. The reasons for this trend are closely linked to the specific characteristics of the sub-region: the large number of children that remain out of school; the shortage of teachers; the

limited resources; and the historically relatively high teacher salaries. There are, however, differences among countries in the sub-region concerning the extent to which they have relied on contract teachers to expand their systems and in the approach they have followed; some preferring to let the communities assume a larger role, others making it more clearly a government policy.

Of the three country cases reviewed, India is the closest to the West African experience, in that para-teachers have become a government policy and the preferred strategy to expand access. In the case of India, the preference for contract teachers cannot be justified on the basis of extremely high teacher salaries, as average teacher salaries are about 2.5 times the GNP per capita (although in fact this relationship is higher than in Cambodia or Nicaragua), but rather on the basis of limited resources and expressed government dissatisfaction with the work of regular teachers, who have developed a reputation for increased absenteeism and lack of motivation. While these two issues are probably more the result of a lack of adequate accountability and incentive systems, the government has preferred to address them by replacing regular public teachers with para-teachers rather than by reforming the system.

Cambodia's education system was re-established on the basis of volunteers with minimum education who were later absorbed into the public service. Contract teachers later re-emerged as a strategy to address shortages, particularly in rural and remote areas where regular teachers would not be available or interested in being appointed. They represented about 9 per cent of the primary teaching force in 2001. However, and to the contrary of the other countries reviewed for this study, the government suddenly decided to suspend this practice. Concerns about corrupt practices and abuses in the appointment and management of contract teachers were at the heart of this decision. Again, lack of effective accountability was the real problem. The recent changes in policy have contributed to the decrease in

the share of contract teachers to less than 2.5 per cent, although it has proven difficult to totally eradicate them in some areas.

The experience of Nicaragua regarding changes in teachers' contracts is a good example of a reform oriented towards transforming the incentive systems and regulations of a teacher's career, associating financial benefits with performance and strengthening accountability towards the community. In this respect, it addresses some of the key issues identified as problematic in other countries and shows the impact that these types of changes can bring to a system, regardless of whether it is teachers or para-teachers that are under discussion.

## The impact of contract teachers

### *On increasing access*

Contract teachers have certainly contributed to increasing student access in all the countries examined. They have played a particularly critical role in reaching out to those students in rural and remote areas where regular teachers are usually not interested in being appointed or where there are not enough students to open a regular school.

Contract teachers hired by local communities have been a key factor in increasing access to the early primary grades in some states in India. In Uttar Pradesh, contract teachers directly hired by the village committee have contributed to the more regular functioning of schools and helped achieve more regular student attendance. In West Africa, countries that have relied more on contract teachers have tended to show a larger increase in their primary enrolment rates. In Cambodia, it was only by hiring local community people as contract teachers that schooling could be provided in some remote, post-conflict areas serving ethnic minorities.

There is, however, some recent evidence from studies examining teachers' attendance in Ecuador and India that does not support the conclusion that contract teachers have a higher attendance rate than regular teachers. In Ecuador (World Bank, 2004), survey results from a nationally representative sample of primary schools report that the absence rate of contract teachers was higher than that of civil servants (19.1 per cent versus 13.4 per cent), while in India (Kremer, Chaudhury, Roger, Muralidharan, Hammer, 2004), they were about the same (24 per cent for contract teachers versus 23.1 per cent for civil servants), in spite of civil servants receiving higher salaries.

### ***On improving quality***

The most recent examinations of student achievement in West African countries conducted in the context of the programme to analyze education systems in the region (PASEC) confirmed that teachers make a difference to second and fifth graders' achievement. However, the study could not distinguish any difference between the achievement of students taught by a regular teacher and that of those taught by a contract teacher (Bernard, Tiyaab and Vianou, 2004). Given the great variation in teacher education and training in the countries in the region, and in the education and training of contract teachers, the specific characteristics and practices of teachers that have an impact on student achievement remain to be examined.

In Nicaragua, third graders in autonomous schools had higher achievement in language and mathematics than those in centralized schools, but the results were less conclusive for sixth graders. Overall, the public image of autonomous schools tends to be higher than that of centralized schools, as was noted in a recent public opinion poll. According to a 2001 poll, 8.1 per cent of those surveyed thought that autonomous schools were of excellent quality, while only 3.9 per cent were of the same opinion with regard to centralized schools. The largest concentration of professionally trained teachers in these schools could help explain such a response.

Private schools, however, were considered better by the largest share of respondents.

The co-existence of contract and regular teachers in the same schools in India makes it challenging to disentangle the effects of each group on student learning. Overall, one would be inclined to think that teachers without proper education, training and support for the job would be less capable of ensuring quality learning. One critical factor to keep in mind is that overall educational quality in all these countries remains unsatisfactory, in spite of the higher number of educated and trained teachers in the system. In this context, the presence of contract teachers lacking proper training for the job may not aggravate an already bleak scenario. It is important to remember that efforts to eliminate contract teachers in Cambodia resulted in a degradation in the quality of the environment in the short term, with more overcrowded classrooms and less teaching-learning time.

### ***On addressing equity***

Locally-hired contract teachers have played a critical role in Cambodia and India in helping ethnic minorities of different languages to have access to schooling. They have been essential in facilitating communication with parents and communities and in making schooling relevant for them. In most cases, they represent the sole resource in the area and their preparation and support requires special attention. They have also played an essential role in providing children from rural and remote areas with access to education, as was mentioned previously. In West Africa, their presence has been key to providing schooling to thousands of children who remained out of the system, and in that way has also contributed to addressing equity concerns.

## Concerns regarding contract teachers

While there have been some positive outcomes from having contract teachers in the system, there are areas that need particular attention if this impact is to be sustained. The lack of clear accountabilities and effective teacher deployment practices in Cambodia facilitated the emergence of corrupt practices and abuses in the appointment of contract teachers. The fact that these abuses were made public shamed the government and was a determinant in the change of policy that led to their recruitment being suspended. In West African countries, the absence of a clear framework to regulate contract teachers' education, recruitment and career opportunities has led in some cases to disappointment and high staff turnover, resulting in a loss of the initial positive effects of their participation in the system and raising concerns over their impact on the quality of the system.

Another important aspect to consider is the social impact of these diverse groups of teachers under different contracts and employment conditions in the system and the challenge this diversity brings to effective management. While in many countries the presence of contract teachers in schools has been welcomed by regular teachers, who appreciate the help and support they can provide, they have also caused some new tensions within the teaching profession. There is increased resentment from regular teachers, who feel their education and training is no longer being valued as contract teachers are appointed without having to undergo the same training and selection processes. Managing such a diverse group of interests requires a clear and fair framework by which to regulate the teaching profession, teachers' recruitment and careers.

## *Chapter 6*

# Reforming teacher policies in Sweden and England

The experiences reviewed have confirmed that contract teachers have been a valuable resource for countries facing teacher shortages and limited available funds. However, their impact on the system could be enhanced if their recruitment, preparation and career were managed as part of a coherent and integrated teacher policy framework. In fact, some of the policy issues that contract teachers help address, as well as some of the concerns raised by their presence in the system, are the same as those that stimulate and guide the development of teacher policies in general.

Most countries these days are being challenged by a shortage of competent teachers. In the developed world, this crisis has generated increased attention on teacher policies and an interest in reviewing strategies that are already in place to attract, develop, recruit and retain effective teachers. A recent OECD report summarizes the trends in 25 countries (OECD, 2005). It recommends the development of targeted policies designed to address specific country concerns rather than general policies that apply to all teachers equally. It also recognizes that while shortages are not experienced by all countries in the same way, even those with teacher surpluses need to strengthen their policy and management framework to ensure that competent teachers remain in the system.

The experiences of Sweden and England were selected for a more in-depth review for this report given the pertinence of some of their recent reforms to the discussion on contract teachers. While neither of these two countries rely on contract teachers, the reforms they have introduced in the last few years are good illustrations of how to move towards a more diversified teaching profession.

In Sweden (Strath, 2004), the centrally controlled system of fixed teacher pay ladders was abolished and replaced in 1996 by an individualized salary scale that allows teachers to be financially rewarded for their individual contributions to student learning and school development as a supplement to the nationally agreed minimum salary. Over the course of the eight years that the system has been in place, there has been a major shift in teachers' perspectives, from an initially very negative attitude towards this change to a majority of teachers supporting the new salary system and teacher unions endorsing it. This change is one of the most controversial ones and faces the strongest resistance from teacher unions, who tend to favour a policy of homogeneity. In this respect, the experience of Sweden is particularly interesting to understand and follow.

In England (Department of Education and Skills, 2004), the recognition that teachers' workloads had increased in the last few years as a result of increased administrative requirements, and that such an increase was limiting teachers' capacity to concentrate their attention on improving students' learning, led the government, in agreement with the teacher unions, to develop a new strategy to make better use of support staff in schools. As a result of this agreement, tasks and responsibilities have been redistributed between teachers and support staff, so that teachers have more time to concentrate on the core of teaching and learning. The strategy clarified the education and training needs of support staff and provided them with the necessary training and opportunities to develop in their careers and further contribute to school improvement.

Below is a brief presentation of both of these countries' experiences.<sup>2</sup>

2. For more detailed discussions please read Strath (2004) and Department of Education and Skills (2004).



## The reform process towards individualized pay for teachers in Sweden

The changes introduced in Sweden should be understood in the context of a country undergoing a major decentralization reform that transferred responsibilities from the central government to local municipal authorities. These reforms, launched in the early 1990s, were intended to improve efficiency and increase local responsibility in the public sector at a time of severe budgetary constraints due to a slowdown in economic growth since the late 1970s. Teachers' salaries had stagnated and declined relative to other professions requiring similar educational profiles, and particularly in relation to the private sector. In addition, there was an unclear division of responsibilities among teachers between the central and local levels; the central level being responsible for employment conditions, including working hours and pay, and the local level having to ensure that schools were adequately staffed. While municipalities were responsible for hiring teachers, they had no say on salary and employment conditions. These factors called for rationalization and improved efficiency in light of the diminishing resources and increasing demand for high quality education.

The process of decentralization was accomplished through a series of steps over the years. Initially, local authorities assumed full responsibility for teachers' employment conditions and salaries. However, at this early stage, teacher remuneration was still based on a fixed pay scheme, which was only abandoned in 1995. Teacher unions initially fiercely opposed the change of authority, fearing that employment conditions would worsen if the municipalities were given more power. However, teacher salaries had lost in real value during the 1980s and there were still differences in status and employment conditions between different categories of teachers: Primary and vocational education teachers were not paid an equal salary to that of upper secondary teachers. Teacher unions, representing primary and preschool teachers, were in a strong position to bargain for improved

conditions. In fact, prior to decentralization, their demands for fewer hours of instruction for primary and preschool teachers and an ending salary for primary teachers equal to that of those working in upper secondary were approved. But even secondary teachers obtained a dramatic 25 per cent raise on average in a couple of years, which probably helped convince the unions to accept devolution to the local level given the strong political support for it.

The shift towards an individualized pay scheme only came about in 1995. There is strong agreement among teacher unions, employers' associations and independent researchers as to why this agreement was finally approved. These were (i) a change in the direction of co-operation between the two teacher unions instead of opposing each other, in order to gain more bargaining power; (ii) a deadlock in negotiations between the Swedish Association of Local Authorities (SALA) and the teacher unions, in which there were few possibilities to improve teachers' salaries unless the unions agreed to the municipalities' preconditions that salaries be individualized and that teachers' time be controlled at the local level; and (iii) a joint decision by the teacher unions to assume responsibility for school development, and not just be seen as opposing change and striving to maximize their members' own utility without taking into consideration the needs of students, parents and society.

A series of five-year agreements between employers (SALA) and teacher unions have governed the employment conditions of teachers since 1995. The centrally-agreed salary scheme with fixed ladders was replaced by an individual-based pay system determined locally over an agreed minimum salary. The first agreement was transitional and gave local stakeholders the opportunity to decide how to deal with the new changes. A major part of this agreement was to decide on local priorities in school development and how to relate these to a means of rewarding effective teachers. The first agreement contained several yearly guarantees regarding teacher pay raises

and a 10 per cent additional increase in teachers' pay collectively over the five-year period, although the employer was given the opportunity to reward teachers who had made an extra effort. The second agreement, which came into effect in 2000, provided fewer guarantees in terms of pay raises, but the link between performance and pay was more clearly spelled out. While the first agreement gave municipalities and schools the chance to adjust to the changed conditions, there were great expectations with the second in terms of implementation.

As a result of the introduction of individualized pay, municipalities, in collaboration with stakeholders, were required to define their goals and the criteria by which they evaluate both teachers' performance and their contribution towards reaching those goals. This process was by itself challenging and constructive. As an instrument to reward and recruit effective teachers, the system has not resulted in a major dispersion of the wage structure, partly because shortages of experienced teachers – particularly in some subject areas – have resulted in higher salaries being offered to beginning teachers in order to attract them to the posts and create competition. To a degree, it can be said that individualized pay has helped address some of these shortages. Municipal officials and principals in general have expressed satisfaction with the system, although it poses new challenges for principals to effectively hire and reward teachers' performance. For some municipalities that have a lower proportion of qualified teachers and experience more difficulties in attracting qualified teachers to work in their schools, it has meant putting most of their resources into attracting new teachers and leaving less to reward the performance of the good teachers in the system, which may in the long run put pressures on the system and result in unions pushing for a minimum guaranteed wage increase in the next agreement.

After eight years of experience with the system, the large majority of teachers support it, more so among the young teachers. The changes

introduced bring new challenges for teacher unions who, in light of the fact that teachers now negotiate their salary directly with their employers, may be called on to play a different role: one of quality assurance in the wage formation process; or of focusing on being a key actor in school improvement, defining criteria for teacher evaluation and improving the public image of teachers. An important issue to consider is equality of conditions across municipalities and the risk that deteriorating resources may hamper the possibility of supporting the evolution of salaries.

## Raising standards and tackling workload: the use of support staff in England

The reform in England was sparked by a concern that while standards for student achievement were continuing to rise, there were marked differences in performance between the strongest and the weakest students. It was acknowledged that those students at the bottom needed more help if the goal of raising student achievement was to be accomplished. It was felt that in order to do this teachers would need more time to prepare lessons, teach and assess, and take into account the individual needs and circumstances of each student. Yet teacher time was in short supply. An independent review of teachers' workload had revealed that a teacher's working hours during term-time were on average 52 hours per week. In addition, the study revealed that about 20 per cent of that time was spent on non-teaching activities that could well be handled by other adults or using information and communication technology (ICT).

To believe that the problem could be addressed by massive recruiting of additional teachers is tempting, but unfeasible. Teacher numbers were already at their highest point in 20 years and filling the needs would imply that 10 per cent of new graduates would have to be recruited into the teaching profession. While the government reiterated its commitment to hire 10,000 more teachers, an expansion beyond this figure was unrealistic given

the budgetary constraints. Moreover, there was a general view that there were other ways to make time for teachers, using ICT and restructuring the school workforce, as had already been done in areas such as medicine and law. There was a belief that reducing teachers' overall burden and raising the quality of their teaching could be possible by ensuring that valuable teacher time was no longer diverted to a range of clerical and other non-teaching tasks. A national agreement, "Raising Standards and Tackling Workload", was signed by the government, employers and the majority of the school workforce unions on 15 January 2003 to create time for teachers and head teachers, and hence time to ensure that students meet the standards set.

The agreement recognized that the development of more support staff in a wider range of roles is integral to the success of school workforce reform. The use of support staff had been on the increase in the last years, and this increase had been more dramatic since 1999. Under the support staff category, a diverse group of school personnel had been included. In 2004 about 230,000 support staff included teaching assistants, support staff for special needs classes or students, other types of educational support staff, ethnic minority student support staff, childcare staff, matrons/nurses/medical staff, secretaries, bursars, other clerical staff and technicians. The first three categories represented about 150,000 staff.

The agreement provided support staff with real opportunities for training and career development to enable them to progress and further contribute to school improvement as part of a whole school approach to raising standards. The respective roles of teachers and support staff were clarified. It was stipulated that support staff could carry out 'specified work' relating to teaching and learning, such as (i) planning and preparing lessons; (ii) delivering lessons to students; (iii) assessing the development, progress and attainment of students; and (iv) reporting on the development, progress and attainment of students. However, this work had to be carried out to support or assist the work of teachers, not to replace them. The duties

undertaken by support staff must be subject to the direction and supervision of a teacher, and the school principal must be satisfied with the skills and experience of the support staff required to carry out the specified work.

Special attention was given under the new framework to developing effective management and supervision of support staff. In addition, the induction training for teaching assistants was revised and introductory training for all support staff developed to raise student achievement. In addition, the new position of Higher-level teaching assistant (HLTA) was created. To achieve HLTA status, support staff must be assessed and meet all the national professional standards. The Teacher Training Agency was called to play a strategic role in the development and delivery of training for the whole school workforce.

Although it is still too early to assess the impact of this reform, there is some evidence that the better and more efficient use of support staff is already making a difference: Reports of better-quality teaching in lessons where teaching assistants are present have emerged, students are receiving more individualized attention, and positive working relationships are developing between teachers and support staff.

## *Chapter 7*

### Promoting an effective use of contract teachers

Teacher shortages are also a major concern of developing countries, where the lack of qualified teachers could well jeopardize the accomplishment of the goal of having all children attend and complete free quality primary education by 2015. As early as 2002, the EFA Global Monitoring Report indicated that the number of additional primary teachers needed could range from 15 million to 35 million, representing an increase of between 6 and 14 per cent of the figures given in the mid-1990s. The numbers vary widely by region, but are higher in sub-Saharan Africa and South and West Asia, where the greatest number of out-of-school children are to be found.

The challenge of numbers is aggravated by the lack of proper qualifications of many of the teachers already in the system. According to the 2004 World Development Indicators, between one fifth and one third of primary teachers in Latin America, sub-Saharan Africa and South and West Asia have received no training for the job. Ensuring that sufficient teachers are available also represents an additional burden for a government's budget. Teacher salaries represent the largest share of educational expenditures in most countries, but in low- and middle-income countries salaries may take up between 80 and 90 per cent of primary education expenditures.

The use of contract teachers has emerged as a solution to the double pressure of growing enrolments and budgetary constraints. The importance of ensuring quality learning for all requires reviewing this policy and making the necessary adjustments to the overall teacher policy framework to ensure that the goals will be met. A series of policy suggestions are presented in the following section.

## Contract teachers' education, training and support

Attracting staff with educational backgrounds and experience in areas other than teaching is an effective way of increasing the number of teachers in the system at times of shortages. Several developed countries are introducing these 'alternative' paths into the teaching profession as a way of addressing urgent needs, but also as a way of enriching the teaching profession with new perspectives and experiences. To be an effective policy, adjustments in teacher education and training programmes are required in order to provide newcomers with the necessary support to become competent teachers in little time.

In developing countries, the adaptation of this policy translates into recruiting candidates with varied levels of education and quickly placing them in the new job, with or without having completed an induction programme. As was seen, the level of initial education of contract teachers is quite diverse. In some countries, contract teachers have the same level of education as regular teachers; in others, particularly in the case of recent graduates, they may have even higher levels of education than some regular teachers hired in the past; and in others still they may have lower levels of completed initial education. In Cambodia and India, a substantial number of contract teachers have completed higher levels of education than is required for the position, and at times they are even retired teachers. The level of education, however, has tended to be lower in remote areas that lack opportunities for further study.

In India, attention has been given to having all contract teachers complete an induction programme prior to starting their job. They are also offered some additional days of in-service training during the year. In West Africa, countries varied in the amount of initial training and support provided to contract teachers, from zero to 18 months. In Nicaragua, in-service training is provided by the Ministry of Education to all teachers,



regardless of whether they work in autonomous or in centralized schools. However, those in autonomous schools have the additional benefit of receiving support and being under closer supervision of the school principal on a regular basis. Unfortunately, in Cambodia, given the government's decision to suspend contract teachers, they were excluded from participating in in-service training programmes.

In all cases, contract teachers have emphasized the need for further training and support to effectively do their jobs. This remains one of the most critical issues and pending challenges. It was one of the aspects that raised the most concerns at the conference on contract teachers that took place in Bamako in November 2004. The conference engaged all participating countries to ensure that a minimum of lower secondary education be required and that at least six months of induction training be provided.

These concerns over the importance of teacher education and preparation for the job are in line with research findings that confirm that teacher quality is one of the most important factors in explaining differences in student achievement (see Santiago, 2002). Research on effective teaching is helping to elucidate the complexity of the teaching job, with policy implications for teachers' education and development. Teachers' academic qualifications, and to a certain degree their subject matter knowledge and pedagogical preparation in subject-specific courses, as well as classroom management, student assessment and curriculum development have all been found to make a difference.

There is increasing recognition that teachers' initial education is just the first stage of preparation and that teacher training and development should be seen as a continuum throughout a teacher's career. This initial education should equip teachers for their job; not merely addressing subject matter knowledge and pedagogical training, but also providing them with the skills for reflective practice and research on the job. The importance of practical experience has been emphasized as well as the need to make

teachers' education more flexible, and modular programmes have been introduced that allow newcomers from different fields and professional backgrounds to easily join the profession.

Most developing countries face the challenge of strengthening and updating their teacher education and training programmes to effectively equip teachers with the necessary knowledge and competencies required. New programmes would benefit from a modular approach that could see teachers' development within a lifelong-learning framework and provide the necessary support at different stages. This type of approach could also integrate the specific needs of contract teachers, with a set of modules to complete over time being developed and school practice being used as an opportunity for reflection. It is clear that teachers' education and support cannot be overlooked if quality learning is the objective.

- *Being a contract teacher does not necessarily imply having a lower educational level than regular teachers. The key issue, however, is to provide contract teachers with adequate training and support for the job. A lack of attention to this aspect will result in low-quality teaching practices and poorer student results, in spite of improved attendance. Opening the profession to candidates with different educational backgrounds and experiences requires rethinking and adjusting teacher initial education, training and support systems.*

### ***Career and incentives***

The negative impacts of a 'safe' teaching job on the quality of the system have been at the heart of many debates on improving education. However, what seems to be most detrimental to the teaching profession is not the stability usually associated with a teaching position, but rather the lack of appropriate incentives and opportunities for career development. This, together with the fact that most financial rewards are given on the basis of seniority and not performance, have not contributed to creating and

sustaining a stimulating professional environment. Options for enriching the teaching career with opportunities other than school management include the creation of new positions, such as subject head teachers, mentors and student counsellors. Establishing alternative doorways into the profession, such as support staff and teaching assistants, also adds diversity to the profession.

In the case of contract teachers, the absence of opportunities for career development in some countries resulted in increased turnover and loss of the most competent contract teachers. Those countries that defined contract teacher positions within the teaching profession and clearly specified the opportunities for career growth appear to have better results in terms of teacher retention and professional development.

A good example of this practice can be found in Senegal, where the use of contract teachers was conceived from the beginning as a doorway into the teaching profession, limiting the time a volunteer could be under contract and giving clear indication of the steps and requirements needed to move up in the profession. The system seems to be paying off. There is even some anecdotal evidence that a recent candidate was selected to fill a competitive high-level post who started his career as a volunteer teacher in a local school. If contract teacher positions are to become the doorway into the teaching career, it is necessary that the right incentives, training and promotion opportunities be designed to ensure selection and retention of the most competent teachers.

Countries are also introducing changes in teachers' salary structure in order to better reward performance, offer incentives for development, and attract teachers with the necessary competence and skills to, and retain them in, different geographical areas. In Nicaragua, the changes introduced in teachers' contracts have contributed to having a better-trained teaching body in autonomous schools. In Sweden, teachers have welcomed the opportunity to see their salaries increase as a result of better performance.

Trends to enrich the teaching career with professional options and provide incentives on the basis of performance in order to stimulate the development of competencies and ensure that the best staff remain can be found in several countries.

However, not all incentive programmes have been successful, and in developing countries the experience has produced inconclusive results. Some researchers have argued that individual rewards go against the collaborative nature of teaching and that the difficulties in measuring performance have lead to subjectivity and resistance (Murnane and Cohen, 1986; Johnson, 1986). How the incentive programme is designed also seems to make a difference; in developing countries, performance-based pay represents a small part of teachers' compensation, which may have contributed to their lower impact on performance.

The topic has, however, re-emerged with more refined and objective measures of teachers' work and more transparent systems of reward allocation. Several countries are developing and introducing systems that offer teachers additional pay on the basis of performance as a vehicle to improve the quality of teaching.

These reforms are not without their complexities, however. Developing effective criteria agreed upon by all parties to evaluate teachers' performance takes time. Breaking the culture of equal gains for everybody and a tendency to compensate the losers is challenging. There are also concerns that the practice of offering differential salaries may negatively impact on municipalities and schools with limited resources. Having to offer higher salaries to attract teachers to the job may leave them with fewer resources to reward those who excel (Strath, 2004).

- *Introducing incentives to reward teaching performance is contributing to the development of a more professional environment for teachers.*

*Providing appropriate opportunities for career growth and development is essential to retain and develop contract teachers' potential.*

### ***Accountabilities towards the community***

Some of the positive outcomes associated with the presence of contract teachers in the system are the result of closer school or community involvement in staffing decisions and more effective management and support. In India and Nicaragua, where the local community is involved in the selection process and monitors teachers' performance, there is higher satisfaction with the more regular functioning of the school and increased student and teacher attendance. In Cambodia, contract teachers from the local community have proven more effective than regular teachers in communicating with parents speaking minority languages. Part of the dissatisfaction expressed regarding regular teachers is in fact a result of selection processes used by higher levels of management that do not promote accountability towards local communities.

These findings coincide with research on education decentralization that suggests that schools exerting more autonomy over staffing decisions and closer monitoring of teacher performance have higher student achievement. In an analysis of the impact of decentralization on student learning in Nicaragua, King and Ozler (1998) found that schools that exerted more autonomy over staffing decisions had higher student performance. These results were confirmed in Honduras, where community schools with autonomy to hire and fire teachers had higher student achievement, in spite of hiring younger, less experienced and less qualified teachers (Di Gropello and Marshall, 2004). Similar results were found in the rural community programme of El Salvador, where enhanced teacher monitoring and a teacher salary that rewards performance were associated with better student achievement (Jimenez and Sawada, 2003). Even if more autonomous schools chose to hire younger and less experienced teachers, the closer supervision

and monitoring they provide tend to produce better results. These findings apply to teacher management in general, not only to contract teachers.

There is increasing recognition that as schools are given more responsibility for improving the outcomes of students, they need to be more involved and more accountable for personnel decisions. Giving more autonomy to schools over staffing issues, however, may lead to greater inequities and inefficiencies, with some schools, for example, having fewer resources to attract and compete for good teachers. Central and regional authorities have a key role to play in ensuring an equitable distribution of resources and in establishing the necessary institutional arrangements to guarantee a fair and transparent selection process.

There is, however, also the risk that changes associated with decentralization, school autonomy and increased accountability may lead to a greater sense of isolation in teachers (Brown, Seddon, Angus and Rushbrook, 1996) and heavier workloads. Teachers may also feel a loss of professionalism as a result of a higher degree of control placed over their practices that leaves little room for professional discretion (Elkins and Elliot, 2004).

- *When accountabilities towards the school community are clearly defined and teachers are closely monitored and supported in their job, results tend to improve (regardless of whether they are regular teachers or under contract). However, stronger involvement of schools in personnel decisions needs to be complemented by effective regional and central-level instances that ensure an equitable distribution of resources and a fair and transparent selection process.*

### ***Contract teachers working alongside regular teachers***

The benefits of having additional staff in schools are confirmed by the views of stakeholders in the state of Uttar Pradesh in India. Regular teachers

welcomed para-teachers in the schools and expressed satisfaction with the help they provided, as this relieved them of various chores including school opening, closing, cleaning and maintenance, and also contributed to decreasing the number of students per class.

England's experience in restructuring teachers' work to make better use of their competencies is valuable in this respect and provides a good example of the trends regarding teachers' careers and education and training that have been discussed previously. It had been estimated that teachers in the country were spending some 20 per cent of their time on non-teaching tasks that could be done by other adults and/or using ICT. While the idea of hiring more teachers was attractive to some, resource constraints and the realization that there were other ways to make time for teachers prompted the development of a new strategy. The objective was to reduce teachers' overall burden and improve the quality of teaching by ensuring that valuable teacher time was no longer diverted to a range of clerical and other non-teaching tasks. In agreement with key partners, it was decided to progressively reduce teachers' overall hours; change their contracts to ensure that they did not have to undertake unnecessary administrative or clerical tasks; reduce their burden; provide cover for absent teachers; provide sufficient time to plan, prepare and assess their lessons; and ensure the relay of support staff and effective management to carry out their work. The reform of support staff roles to help teachers and students and the creation of personal administrative assistants for teachers, cover supervisors and higher-level teaching assistants have been key elements of this reform.

The strategy provides support staff with real opportunities for training and career development, to enable them to progress and further contribute to school improvement. Although it is too soon to evaluate the impact of these changes, there are some early encouraging results about the positive impact of support staff in schools.

While the limited resources available in developing countries may constrain their capacity to hire support staff in addition to regular teachers, there is room for considering restructuring teachers' jobs to make better use of their competencies. If all school staff, professional and contract teachers, could be considered as a team responsible for delivering quality education to the children in a school, roles and responsibilities could be redistributed among them so that professional teachers could better lead and guide contract teachers.

- *Restructuring the school force to make better use of available resources can help improve student learning. Contract teachers under effective guidance and support can effectively contribute to improving school functioning and become a valuable resource for regular teachers.*

### ***The integration of contract teachers into the teaching force***

The experiences reviewed suggest that there is more to gain from a national policy framework that conceives of contract teachers as part of the teaching profession than from promoting fragmentation within the teaching body. Nicaragua's recent reforms are a good example of how changes in teachers' contracts can be introduced while at the same time preserving teachers' legal status and their base salary.

Both Cambodia and Nicaragua have succeeded in integrating their teacher volunteers into the teaching force upon completion of the necessary qualification and training. In China, a similar process was followed with community teachers, who were given the opportunity to pass a certification exam and join publicly-governed schools.

Having flexible points of entry into the profession and training programmes that can be adapted to the needs of adults with different professional backgrounds is in line with current thinking among OECD countries that are today facing teacher shortages.



- *Volunteer teachers or contract teachers can be effectively absorbed into the regular teaching body after satisfactory completion of certain educational requirements. Attention needs to be paid, however, to supporting their continued development and addressing their specific educational needs.*

### ***Phasing it out***

In Cambodia, sudden attempts to eliminate contract teachers have resulted in higher student-teacher ratios and more teachers working double shifts, with less time to plan lessons and support students' learning. Irregular practices developed, from teachers subcontracting one shift to other teachers (a de facto contract teacher), to teaching two groups in one shift, to halving the time between two groups. All these practices in fact contributed to lowering the quality of education in the short term rather than improving it. Reports from similar initiatives to replace contract teachers in China also proved how difficult, time-consuming and expensive this effort can be. Countries with contract teachers need to carefully plan a gradual approach to replace them if they want to prevent further negative consequences stemming from their decision. In many instances, providing opportunities for contract teachers to undergo in-service training and receive support may prove a more effective strategy.

- *The sudden elimination of contract teachers may result in further deterioration of the quality of the system. A careful plan that foresees the necessary resources is needed in any effort to phase them out.*

### ***Involving teacher unions in the policy development process***

There is increased awareness among policy-makers that reforms cannot be successfully implemented if key actors such as teacher unions are not involved early on in the decision-making process. At the same time, teacher unions are finding opportunities in the process to change their image

from one in which their interests are maximized, to one that places them as partners in improving schools and takes into consideration the needs of students, parents and society. In Sweden, for example, the reform has allowed the unions to play a major role in education design and innovation and has helped demonstrate the importance of teachers in ensuring quality. The meeting of West African countries in Bamako in November of 2004 created for the first time an opportunity for government, teacher unions and parent representatives to discuss issues regarding contract teachers. Bringing all parties around the table was a breakthrough in policy-making and an important step for the next stage of policy developments.

- *Teacher unions may find in the reform processes opportunities to redefine their role and image to become a key player in the improvement of education. Their participation is essential to the success of the policy development and implementation process.*

## Final comments

The experiences presented in this paper have confirmed the contribution that contract teachers have made in certain countries to the quick expansion of access, ensuring that ethnic minorities and remote populations are served. Ensuring quality learning for all students remains a big challenge, and all teachers need further support. However, while there was some initial optimism in thinking that contract teachers hired by the local community would have a better attendance record than regular teachers, recent results from national surveys on selected countries do not tend to support this conclusion, forcing policy-makers to think further about the overall teacher policy framework that is necessary to ensure that all classrooms are effectively staffed with competent teachers.

An international trend appears to be emerging both in developed and developing countries in light of the new educational challenges and socio-economic contexts that the world is facing. There is a move away from a uniform teacher policy framework and the conception of a teaching force as a homogeneous group, with a lifelong career dominated by seniority, towards a more flexible and diversified teaching profession that allows entry to professionals of diverse backgrounds and at different points in time through different doorways; one that provides opportunities for career development and enrichment and rewards performance. Finding the right incentives to attract, recruit and retain competent teachers remains a challenge, but providing the necessary support and opportunities for professional development to such a diverse teaching force, made of individuals with such different educational backgrounds, is probably one of the most critical tasks ahead for most countries.



## References

- ADEA; World Bank; Education International; Minister of Education of Mali. 2004. *Official communiqué*. Conference on contract teachers. Bamako, Mali, 21-23 November, 2004.
- Banerjee, A.; Cole, S.; Duflo, E.; Linden, L. 2003. *Remedying education: evidence from two randomized experiments in India*. Available at: [http://econ-www.mit.edu/faculty/download\\_pdf.php?id=677](http://econ-www.mit.edu/faculty/download_pdf.php?id=677) (retrieved on 22 December 2005)
- Bernard, J.M.; Tiyaab, B.F.; Vianou, K. 2004. *Profils enseignants et qualite de l'education primaire en Afrique subsaharienne francophone : bilan et perspective de dix années de recherche du PASEC*. Paper presented at the Conference on Contract Teachers, Bamako, Mali, 21-23 November, 2004.
- Brown, L.; Seddon, T.; Angus, L.; Rushbrook, P. 1996. "Professional practice in education in an era of contractualism: Possibilities, problems and paradoxes". In: *Australian Journal of Education*, 40(3), 311-327.
- Castro, V. 2004. *Contratos laborales docentes y su impacto en los indicadores de Educación para Todos*. Paris: IIEP-UNESCO. Available at: <http://www.unesco.org/iiep/eng/research/basic/PDF/teachers4.pdf> (retrieved on 22 December 2005)

## References

Department of Education and Skills. 2004. *Raising standards and tackling workload: The use of support staff*. Paris: IIEP-UNESCO.

Available at:

<http://www.unesco.org/iiep/eng/research/basic/PDF/teachers1.pdf>  
(retrieved on 22 December 2005)

De Grauwe, A. 2004. *Améliorer l'école dans un contexte de décentralisation. Synthèse des études de terrains sur les bureaux locaux et les écoles*. Séminaire politique, Cotonou, 21-23 July, 2004. Paris: IIEP-UNESCO.

Diaz, H.; Saavedra, J. 2002. "Perú: sobran regulaciones, faltan estímulos". In: J.C. Navarro (Ed.), *¿ Quiénes son los maestros ? : Carreras e incentivos docentes en America Latina*. Washington, DC: IDB.

Di Gropello, E.; Marshall, J.H. 2004. *Teacher efforts and schooling outcomes in rural Honduras*. Paper downloaded in August 2004 from [www.sapere.org](http://www.sapere.org).

Elkins, T.; Elliot, J. 2004. "Competition and control: the impact of government regulation on teaching and learning in England schools". In: *Research Papers in Education*, 19(1), 15-30.

Eurydice. 2003. *The teaching profession in Europe: Profile, trends and concerns. Report III: Working conditions and pay. General lower secondary education* (Key topics in education in Europe 3). Brussels: Eurydice.

Geeves, R.; Bredenberg, K. 2004. *Contract teachers in Cambodia*. Paris: UNESCO-IIEP.

Available at:

<http://www.unesco.org/iiep/eng/research/basic/PDF/cambodia.pdf>  
(retrieved on 22 December 2005)

- Govinda, R.; Josephine, Y. 2004. *Para teachers in India*. Paris: IIEP-UNESCO.  
Available at:  
<http://www.unesco.org/iiep/eng/research/basic/PDF/teachers5.pdf>  
(retrieved on 22 December 2005)
- ILO. 1996. *Recent developments in the education sector*. Geneva: ILO.
- Jimenez, E.; Sawada, Y. 2003. *Does community management help kids in schools? Evidence using panel data from El Salvador EDUCO Programme* (CIRJE discussion paper 236).
- Johnson, S.M. 1986. "Incentives for teachers: What motivates, what matters". In: *Education Administration Quarterly*, 22(3), 54-79.
- King, E.; Ozler, B. 1998. *What's decentralization got to do with learning? The case of Nicaragua's school autonomy reform* (Working paper 9, Series on Impact Evaluation of Education Reforms). Washington, DC: World Bank, Development Economics Research Group.
- Kremer, M.; Chaudhury, N.; Roger, H.; Muralidharan, K.; Hammer, J. 2005. "Teacher absence in India: a snapshot". In: *Journal of the European Economic Association*. Forthcoming.
- Mingat, A. 2004. *La rémunération de l'enseignement primaire dans les pays francophones d'Afrique sub-saharienne*. Paper presented at the Conference on Contract Teachers, Bamako, Mali, 21-23 November, 2004.
- MOEYS. 1997-2003. Education statistics and indicators. Cambodia: MOEYS.

## References

- Murnane, R.; Cohen, D. 1986. "Merit pay and the evaluation problem: Why most merit pay plans fail and few survive?". In: *Harvard Educational Review*, 56(1), 1-17.
- Nath, S. 2002. "The transition from non-formal to formal education: the case of BRAC, Bangladesh". In: *International Review of Education*, 48(6), 517-524.
- Ndoye, M. 1997. "Senegal: Defining and implementing priorities in the education sector". In: *Prospects*, 27(4), 609-617.
- Ndoye, M. 2001 (April-June). "Education volunteers: new teachers to take up the challenge of Education for All". In: *IIEP Newsletter*, 19(2), 9-10.
- Ndoye, M. 2004. *Principales conclusions sur l'état des lieux (tendances, succès, défis)*. Presentation made by ADEA at the Conference on Contract Teachers, Bamako, Mali, 22 November, 2004.
- OECD. 2005. *Teachers matter: Attracting, developing and retaining effective teachers*. Paris: OECD.
- Santiago, P. 2002. *Teacher demand and supply: Improving teaching quality and addressing teacher shortages. A literature review and a conceptual framework for future work*. OECD Education Working Papers, N° 1. Paris: OECD.
- Solaux, G.; Suchaut, B.; Dogoh-Bibi, P.; Zébangou, M.; Condé, A. (Eds.). 2001. *Pour une expertise en management des personnels enseignants*. Paris: ADEA, CNDP.



- Strath, A. 2004. *Teacher policy reforms in Sweden: the case of individualised pay*. Paris: IIEP-UNESCO.  
Available at:  
<http://www.unesco.org/iiep/eng/research/basic/PDF/teachers2.pdf>  
(retrieved on 22 December 2006)
- Sujatha, K. 2002. *Education of Indian scheduled tribes: a study of community schools in the district of Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh*. Paris: IIEP.
- UNESCO. 2002. *EFA Global Monitoring Report 2002. Education for All: is the world on track?* Paris: UNESCO.
- UNESCO. 2005. *EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005. Education for All: the quality imperative*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Vegas, E.; De Laat, J. 2002. *Do differences in teacher contracts affect student performance? Evidence from Togo*. Unpublished.
- Wang, C. 2002 (March). "Minban education: the planned elimination of the 'people-managed' teachers in reforming China". In: *International Journal of Educational Development*, 22(2), 109-129.
- Welmond, M. 2002. "Globalization viewed from the periphery: the dynamics of teacher identity in the Republic of Benin". In: *Comparative Education Review*, 46(1), 37-65.
- World Bank. 2004. *World development indicators*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- World Bank. 2004. *Creating fiscal space for poverty reduction in Ecuador: A fiscal management and public expenditure review*. Volume 2. Washington, DC: World Bank.



# Appendix

**Table 1. Summary table of contract teachers' employment conditions in West African countries**

Country/ region	Category	Reasons	Minimum level of education and training	Length of initial training	Length of contract	Career development plan	Source of financing	Management type	Regularity of payment
Chad	Community teacher	Limited state resources / creation of community schools	BEPC + selection of candidate applications	9 months during service and 4 months for those with a diploma	9 months with a policy of a permanent contract	No	PTA/PTA (state)	Community	No
Niger	Contract teachers	Limited state resources	BEPC + 1 year in a teacher training school + selection exam	1 year	Permanent contract after 4 years	No	State + technical & financial partners	Decentralized level	No
Guinea	Contract teachers	Limited state resources	Bac + selection exam	18 months	Fixed-term	No	State	Decentralized level	Yes
Senegal	Educational volunteers / contract teachers	Limited state resources / slow down the decline	BEPC + selection exam	3 months at the start, + 6 month after 2000	2 years (voluntary) permanent (contract teachers)	Yes	State	Decentralized level	Yes
Madagascar	Community teachers	Frozen recruitment / shortage of teachers	BEPC or higher	0	No contract	No	Parents and HIPC	Community	No
Benin	(1) State contract teachers (2) Community agents	Shortage of civil service workers / limited state resources	BEPC / initial, continuous and modular training	Modular training in a 4- year sequence	2 years renewable once + fixed- term contract	Under discussion	National and community budget	State and community- based	Yes

	Contract teachers	Limited state resources	DFENEP + Selection exam	1 year	Permanent	Yes	State / external partners	Decentralized level	Yes
Burkina Faso	Contract teachers	Limited state resources	DFENEP + Selection exam	1 year	Permanent	Yes	State / external partners	Decentralized level	Yes
Rep. of Congo	Contract teachers	Deficit Destruction of schools	BEPC - Test, CFEEN	2 years' continuous training	Fixed term Permanent	Non	State-PTA state	National Ministry of Education	No
	Volunteers	Civil war				Yes		Community public service	Yes
Mali	Contract teachers and community teachers	State resources / community	DIFM - CAP - BT - Bac - Level 9 A	3 months	Permanent	Being developed	State / technical & financial partners / community	Management community and decentralized structures	Yes
Mauritania	Temporary staff	Situation of contract teachers / lack of competencies	BEPC + teachers or associate teachers	3 months	Permanent / fixed term / 1 year renewable	None	State	State	Yes
	Retirees					None	State	State	Yes
Togo	Auxiliary teachers	Limited state resources	BEPC + final year level + selection exam	1 week / initial training of 3 years followed by 2 years in the field	Permanent	Yes	State	Decentralized	Yes

Bac = *Baccalauréat* / main secondary education examination  
 BEPC = *Brevet d'études du premier cycle* / End of lower secondary school diploma  
 BT = *Brevet de technicien* / Technical diploma  
 CAP = *Certificat d'Aptitude Professionnelle* / Certificate of professional aptitude  
 CFEEN = *Certificat de Fin d'Études des Ecoles Normales* / End of study examination in teacher training schools  
 DIFEM = *Diplôme des îles françaises de la Métropole* / Diploma of the French regions of metropolitan France  
 DFENEP = *Diplôme de fin d'études de l'ENEP* / End of study diploma from the national teacher institutions in Burkina Faso  
 HIPC = Highly indebted poor country  
 PTA = Parent-teacher association

Source: Ndoye, 2004.



## IIEP publications and documents

More than 1,200 titles on all aspects of educational planning have been published by the International Institute for Educational Planning. A comprehensive catalogue is available in the following subject categories:

### *Educational planning and global issues*

General studies - global/developmental issues

### *Administration and management of education*

Decentralization - participation - distance education - school mapping - teachers

### *Economics of education*

Costs and financing - employment - international co-operation

### *Quality of education*

Evaluation - innovation - supervision

### *Different levels of formal education*

Primary to higher education

### *Alternative strategies for education*

Lifelong education - non-formal education - disadvantaged groups - gender education

Copies of the Catalogue may be obtained on request from:

IIEP, Communication and Publications Unit

[info@iiep.unesco.org](mailto:info@iiep.unesco.org)

Titles of new publications and abstracts may be consulted  
at the following web site: [www.unesco.org/iiep](http://www.unesco.org/iiep)





## The International Institute for Educational Planning

The International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP) is an international centre for advanced training and research in the field of educational planning. It was established by UNESCO in 1963 and is financed by UNESCO and by voluntary contributions from Member States. In recent years the following Member States have provided voluntary contributions to the Institute: Denmark, Finland, Germany, Iceland, India, Ireland, Norway, Sweden and Switzerland.

The Institute's aim is to contribute to the development of education throughout the world, by expanding both knowledge and the supply of competent professionals in the field of educational planning. In this endeavour the Institute co-operates with interested training and research organizations in Member States. The Governing Board of the IIEP, which approves the Institute's programme and budget, consists of a maximum of eight elected members and four members designated by the United Nations Organization and certain of its specialized agencies and institutes.

Chairperson:

*Raymond E. Wanner (USA)*

Senior Adviser on UNESCO issues to the Senior Vice-President for Programs, United Nations Foundation, Washington DC, USA.

Designated Members:

*Lavinia Gasperini*

ERP Partnership Coordinator, SDRE, United Nations Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO), Rome, Italy.

*Thelma Kay*

Chief, Emerging Social Issues Division, United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UNESCAP), Bangkok, Thailand.

*Jean-Louis Sarbib*

Senior Vice-President for Africa, Human Development Network, World Bank, Washington DC, USA.

*Jomo Kwame Sundaram*

Assistant Secretary-General, United Nations Economic Development, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, New York, USA.

Elected Members:

*Aziza Bennani (Morocco)*

Ambassador and Permanent Delegate of Morocco to UNESCO.

*José Joaquín Brunner (Chile)*

Director, Education Programme, Fundación Chile, Santiago, Chile.

*Birger Fredriksen (Norway)*

Former Senior Education Adviser for the Africa Region, World Bank.

*Takyiwaa Manuh (Ghana)*

Director, Institute of African Studies, University of Ghana, Ghana.

*Philippe Mehaut (France)*

LEST-CNRS, Aix-en-Provence, France.

*Teiichi Sato (Japan)*

Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary and Permanent Delegate of Japan to UNESCO.

*Tuomas Takala (Finland)*

Professor, University of Tampere, Tampere, Finland.

*Inquiries about the Institute should be addressed to:*  
The Office of the Director, International Institute for Educational Planning,  
7-9 rue Eugène Delacroix, 75116 Paris, France