ABSTRACT

          A group of human resource development (HRD) practitioners
participated in an innovative session on applying metaphor in HRD research
and practice. The session objectives were as follows: (1) facilitate a
dialogue between those who wrote for and those who read the Advances in
Developing Human Resources (ADHR) issue on metaphor in HRD; (2) extend the
dialogue beyond the ADHR issue by exploring the application of metaphor in
HRD research and practice through case studies; (3) identify new
opportunities for research into HRD metaphor and a network of interested
researchers. The session was designed in four parts as follows: (1) an
introduction that included definitions of metaphor, introductions to the
language of metaphor and various forms of metaphor, descriptions of the
theoretical links between metaphor and behavior/behavior change, and examples
of the use of metaphor in HRD research and practice; (2) small group
discussions on metaphor in HRD research and practice; (3) a group discussion
debriefing during which each small group shared a summary of its discussions
and conclusions and facilitators identified cross-cutting agreements,
concerns, and questions about metaphor application in HRD research and
practice; and (4) a wrap-up during which the session's main learning points
were identified and summarized. (Contains 8 references.) (MN)

2002 AHRD Conference

Innovative Session 8

Honolulu, Hawaii

February 27 - March 3, 2002

Applying Metaphor in HRD Research and Practice: Innovative Session

Darren C. Short
Perspectives Inc., UK

Alexander Ardichvili
University of Illinois

Barbara J. Daley
University of Wisconsin – Milwaukee

Erica Kalata
Deloitte

Theresa J. Kraemer
University of South Florida

K. Peter Kuchinke
University of Illinois

Verna J. Willis
Georgia State University

>   *This paper provides information on the innovative session in the form of a brief theoretical framework, a set of session objectives, and a description of the process. It is intended to inform conference participants as they make the decision about whether to attend the session, and to provide them with background reading prior to the session.*

Keywords: Metaphor, Research Design, HRD Practice

"... metaphors are capable of giving us a new understanding of our experience. Thus they can give new meaning to our pasts, to our daily activity, and to what we know and believe" (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980, p. 139).

Volume 3, issue 3 of the series *Advances in Developing Human Resources* (ADHR) was dedicated to Metaphor in Human Resource Development. It brought together articles written by some of the HRD scholars who have been at the forefront of exploring the current, and potential, use of metaphor in HRD research, practice, and education. Part of the history of that issue can be traced back to an innovative session on metaphor held during the 2000 AHRD conference in Raleigh-Durham. This session will further the work by providing a vehicle for facilitating dialogue between the authors and readers on the content of the ADHR issue with the view to clarifying understanding, exploring the application of metaphor in HRD research and practice, and highlighting options for collaborative research. The session will give equal weight to application of metaphor in HRD research and practice, as well as to theoretical aspects of metaphor.

This brief paper provides a theoretical framework for the session, and outlines the session objectives and design. Conference attendees are also invited to read other papers on metaphor elsewhere in the conference proceedings.

Theoretical Framework

Despite there being well over 125 documented definitions of metaphor (Leary, 1990), there is a clear tradition that views them as central to the task of accounting for our perspectives on the world (Cameron, 1999). This cognitive stance argues that people not only use metaphorical language, but the way they view the world is structured using metaphor that frame realities. Metaphors are therefore considered to not only influence language but also behavior. As such, the metaphors used in HRD (as elsewhere) influence how reality is framed by those in the field, how

problems are conceptualized, how solutions are designed, and how efforts are evaluated (Tsoukas, 1991). That nature of that influence could benefit or hinder the field but, without an explicit analysis of the impact of metaphor on HRD, those in the field will be unaware of the benefits, the hindrances, and how to change the situation. This gives rise to discussions on how perspectives, language, and behavior of those in HRD can be influenced by changing the metaphors-in-use.

Metaphor analyses have been completed for several fields of study, for example: psychology (Leary, 1990), human resource management (Dunn, 1990), information systems (Kendall & Kendall, 1993), organizations (Morgan, 1997), and teaching (Cortazzi & Jin, 1999). The ADHR issue on metaphor made a major contribution in closing the gap between HRD and other disciplines in the level of attention paid to metaphor. It did that in the areas of:

- Understanding metaphor theory: Summarizing metaphor theory and research from the disciplines of applied linguistics and cognitive-psychology, and in so doing highlighting the importance of further research into HRD metaphor.
- Learning about HRD from current metaphors-in-use: Research was reported that studied metaphors in the language of HRD, with analyses of what those metaphors may tell us of how we conceive of HRD, what values underpin our language and behaviors, and how aware HRD professionals are of the metaphors they use and their potential implications.
- Metaphors in HRD research, practice, and education: Examples were provided of how metaphors were collected and analyzed in HRD research, of how metaphors could be (and were being) used by HRD practitioners both in training and in organizational change, and of how metaphors could be used in the education of HRD academics and practitioners.
- Critical analysis of metaphor in HRD: Dominant metaphors were highlighted, as was the need to challenge such metaphors and generate new metaphors that could influence how situations were perceived and actions were designed. Examples were offered of how different surface metaphors could influence conceptual metaphors and behaviors in HRD.
- Strategies for metaphor in HRD: Cross-cutting analysis of the content of the issue, when combined with work of other scholars, led to the first steps in understanding the concept of best practice in HRD research, practice, and education.

Short (2001), when reflecting on the content of the ADHR issue, highlighted six main implications for HRD, and five of those six form the basis of this innovative session. The five are:

- HRD researchers should increase their understanding of the application of metaphor in data collection, analysis, and reporting; paying attention to the options, benefits, and risks. They would be helped by the development of agreed best practice in the use of metaphor in HRD research.
- HRD practitioners need to reflect critically on the metaphors that drive their work within organizations, including the dominant metaphors they use for conceiving of organizations and their role in them. That process would be supported greatly by the sharing of practices, for example through conference papers and journal articles.
- Metaphor should be considered for inclusion in the education of HRD professionals, both in terms of theory and its application to HRD. For example, the development of HRD practitioners could usefully cover methods for applying metaphor in organizational diagnosis, intervention design, and communication during planned change.
- HRD professionals should continue to explore the application of metaphor in other disciplines and consider its suitability for transferring into HRD, as demonstrated through the application of metaphor in psychotherapy and the potential for its use in HRD consultancy, coaching, and counseling.
- Systematic research is needed to fully understand the impact of metaphor on HRD. In completing that, the discipline would benefit from challenging dominant metaphors and questioning how those lead to practices and beliefs that are currently taken for granted.

Session Objectives

The innovative session is designed with the over-arching objectives of:

- Facilitating a dialogue between those who wrote for, and those who read, the ADHR issue on metaphor in HRD, to allow questions to be raised, and provide further clarification on the application of metaphor in HRD.
- Extending the dialogue beyond the ADHR issue by exploring the application of metaphor in HRD research and practice using case studies (linked to a symposium paper on the use of client- and consultant-generated metaphor in HRD practice).
- Identifying new opportunities for research into HRD metaphor and a network of interested researchers.

Within those over-arching objectives, the session will provide a forum where:
- Researchers can discuss the application of metaphor in data collection, analysis, and reporting; paying attention to the options, benefits, and risks. Research described in the ADHR issue will act as the introduction to metaphor application in HRD research, and a case study will then be used to provide the basis for small group discussions of application options, methods, and issues.
- Practitioners can reflect critically on their use of client metaphors to analyze situations and identify potential interventions. Again, the case study will provide the broad context for the discussion on application by HRD practitioners.
- All participants have the opportunity to explore the theoretical foundations on metaphor, and the links between metaphor, cognition, behavior, and behavior change.

Session Content and Structure

The session will be designed in four parts:
- Introduction – Participants will hear an overview of the session, and be introduced to the facilitators. This part will also include definitions of metaphor, introductions to the language of metaphor (e.g. labels), illustrations of the various forms of metaphor, and descriptions of the theoretical links between metaphor, behavior, and behavior change. Speakers will also illustrate the use of metaphor in HRD research and practice, and in so doing to provide participants with an understanding of methods and issues for use later in the session.
- Group discussions on metaphor in HRD research and practice – In small groups, participants will utilize a case study to apply basic metaphor techniques, both from the context of the researcher and the practitioner. This will allow for discussion, thus increasing the opportunity for participants to raise examples, ideas, issues, and concerns. Participants will also have the opportunity to dialogue with ADHR authors over the application of metaphor in HRD research and practice.
- Group discussion debriefing – Each small group will share a summary of its discussions and conclusions; and facilitators will identify cross-cutting agreements, concerns, and questions about metaphor application in HRD research and practice.
- Summarizing learning – main learning points will be identified and summarized.

Is this New and Innovative?

The session is innovative in several ways:
- It uses a session at an AHRD conference to maintain the momentum from an ADHR issue, in part by facilitating dialogue between authors and readers, and in part by supporting application of ADHR learning points through case studies discussed in small groups.
- It furthers work on five of the six 'main implications' identified by the ADHR, thus moving forward a small step on a lot of fronts.
- It provides participants with the opportunity to discuss and apply material from a symposium paper on the application of metaphor in psychotherapy and lessons for HRD.
- It allows for levels of participation and interaction not possible from symposia sessions.
- It provides a forum for identifying new examples of metaphor application in HRD research and practice, as part of continuing work to describe best practice. These will be used in the design of future research.

I-8

What this Session Contributes to HRD

With reference to the session's stated objectives, its contribution to HRD includes the following:
- Facilitating a dialogue between those who wrote for, and those who read, the ADHR issue on metaphor in HRD – this will allow for questions about the issue to be raised, provide further clarification on the application of metaphor in HRD, elicit new examples and viewpoints on metaphor in HRD, further clarify current knowledge on best practice, and identify new opportunities for research into HRD metaphor.
- Providing conference attendees with the opportunity to apply metaphor in small groups case study discussions, thus increasing their understanding of application techniques.
- The session content will be summarized and used in writings on best practice in applying metaphor in HRD.

References

Cameron, L. (1999). Operationalising metaphor for applied linguistic research. In L. Cameron & G. Low (Eds.), *Researching and applying metaphor* (pp. 3-28). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Cortazzi, M., & Jin, L. (1999). Bridges to learning: Metaphors of teaching, learning and language. In L. Cameron & G. Low (Eds.), *Researching and applying metaphor* (pp. 149-176). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Dunn, S. (1990). Root metaphor in the old and new industrial relations. *British Journal of Industrial Relations, 28*(1).

Kendall, J. E., & Kendall, K. E. (1993). Metaphors and methodologies: Living beyond the systems machine. *MIS Quarterly, 17*(2), 149-169.

Leary, D. E. (1990). Psyche's muse: The role of metaphor in the history of psychology. In D. E. Leary (Ed.), *Metaphors in the history of psychology* (pp. 1-78). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Morgan, G. (1997). *Images of organization.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Short, D.C. (2001). Strategies for applying metaphor in HRD research, practice, and education. *Advances in Developing Human Resources, 3*(3), 379-396.

Tsoukas, H. (1991). The missing link: A transformational view of metaphors in organizational science. *Academy of Management Review, 16*, 566-585.

U.S. Department of Education
Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI)
National Library of Education (NLE)
Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC)

ERIC®

REPRODUCTION RELEASE
(Specific Document)

I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:

Title:
2002 AHRD Conference Proceedings

Author(s): Toby Marshall Egan & Susan A. Lynham

Corporate Source:
Academy of Human Resource Development

Publication Date:
February 2002

II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, *Resources in Education* (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following three options and sign at the bottom of the page.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 1 documents	The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2A documents	The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2B documents
PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY ___ Sample ___ TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)	PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE, AND IN ELECTRONIC MEDIA FOR ERIC COLLECTION SUBSCRIBERS ONLY, HAS BEEN GRANTED BY ___ Sample ___ TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)	PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY ___ Sample ___ TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
1	2A	2B
Level 1	Level 2A	Level 2B
[X]	[ ]	[ ]
Check here for Level 1 release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche or other ERIC archival media (e.g. electronic) and paper copy.	Check here for Level 2A release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche and in electronic media for ERIC archival collection subscribers only	Check here for Level 2B release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche only

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits.
If permission to reproduce is granted, but no box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries.

Sign here, → please

Signature:

Printed Name/Position/Title:

Organization/Address:
Academy of Human Resource
Development
College of Technology
Bowling Green State University
Bowling Green, OH 43403-0301

Telephone: 419.372.9155
FAX: 419.372.8385
E-Mail Address: office@ahrd.org
Date: 2-28-03

(over)

III. DOCUMENT AVAILABILITY INFORMATION (FROM NON-ERIC SOURCE):

If permission to reproduce is not granted to ERIC, or, if you wish ERIC to cite the availability of the document from another source, please provide the following information regarding the availability of the document. (ERIC will not announce a document unless it is publicly available, and a dependable source can be specified. Contributors should also be aware that ERIC selection criteria are significantly more stringent for documents that cannot be made available through EDRS.)

Publisher/Distributor:
Address:
Price:

IV. REFERRAL OF ERIC TO COPYRIGHT/REPRODUCTION RIGHTS HOLDER:

If the right to grant this reproduction release is held by someone other than the addressee, please provide the appropriate name and address:

Name:
Address:

V. WHERE TO SEND THIS FORM:

Send this form to the following ERIC Clearinghouse:

Acquisitions Coordinator
ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult, Career, and Vocational Education
Center on Education and Training for Employment
1900 Kenny Road
Columbus, OH 43210-1090

However, if solicited by the ERIC Facility, or if making an unsolicited contribution to ERIC, return this form (and the document being contributed) to: