DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 459 445 CS 014 584

AUTHOR Baker, Kim; Gormley, Kathleen; Lawler, Marianna; McDermott, Peter

TITLE Discovering the Voices of Multiethnic Literature through Critical Reading and Discussion.

PUB DATE 2001-11-00

NOTE 10p.; Paper presented at the New York State Reading Conference (Syracuse, NY, November 8-10, 2001).

PUB TYPE Reference Materials - Bibliographies (131) -- Speeches/Meeting Papers (150)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.

DESCRIPTORS Bibliographies; Class Activities; *Critical Reading; *Discussion (Teaching Technique); Intermediate Grades; Learning Activities; Middle Schools

IDENTIFIERS Critical Literacy; *Multicultural Literature; *Multiethnic Literature

ABSTRACT

Although children often receive classroom opportunities to retell and summarize information, they must also learn how to critically examine what they read. Critical reading of multiethnic literature helps children develop understanding, respect, and value for the diverse cultures and people in the world. This paper discusses the value of integrating critical reading and discussion activities with multiethnic literature. The paper uses simulations of three critical literacy activities which were selected because they are effective for teaching critical thinking in intermediate and middle grades. The paper's first activity involves teaching students to ask their own questions about the social assumptions authors used when composing their texts, while the second activity, "Inquiry Charts," provides a visual display of information that is gathered from several sources, and the third activity, "Dialogic Thinking," is a discussion strategy that helps students understand different points of view about a topic. Includes a bibliography of 81 selected works of multiethnic literature. (Contains sample activity charts for 4 activities.) (NKA)

Discovering the Voices of Multiethnic Literature through Critical Reading and Discussion

Presentation for the New York State Reading Conference
Syracuse, New York
November 8-10, 2001

by

Kim Baker
Kathleen Gormley
Marianna Lawler
Peter McDermott

The Education Division
The Sage Colleges
Troy, New York 12190
(www.sage.edu)

Overview of Presentation

In this presentation we discuss the value of integrating critical reading and discussion activities with multiethnic literature. Although children often receive classroom opportunities to retell and summarize information, they must also learn how to critically examine what they read. This is especially true when children read literature representing the life experiences of people who differ from themselves in terms of ethnicity, culture, dialect or language. Critical reading of multiethnic literature helps children develop understanding, respect, and value for the diverse cultures and people in our world.

Children can use critical reading to question, analyze, problem solve, compare and contrast, and evaluate the literature they read with their own world views. Critical reading involves higher levels of thinking, and it can require the synthesis of multiple sources of information that are found everyday in books, magazines, websites, and videos.

Three critical literacy activities are simulated during our presentation. We selected these learning activities because we believe they are effective for teaching critical thinking in intermediate and middle grades. The first activity involves teaching students to ask their own questions about the social assumptions authors used when composing their texts (Simpson, 1996); after reading literature students are encouraged to generate "what if" questions that challenge the fabric of the text (e.g., characters, setting, problem. and resolution). The second activity, "Inquiry-charts" (Hoffman, 1992) provide a visual display of information that is gathered from several sources. Inquiry charts can be effectively used in all subject areas. The third activity, "Dialogic Thinking" (Commeryas, 1993) is a discussion strategy that helps students understand different points of view about a topic. To use "Dialogic Thinking" a teacher constructs a provocative question about a topic and asks students to brainstorm ideas that support different points of view about it; the activity closes when students articulate a position representing their own point of view.

We are sharing multiethnic books that we enjoy. Many of the books are contemporary classics and are widely used in classrooms. Others are newer and represent new stories and voices about ethnic and social diversity. We think all of our choices will be invaluable reading for intermediate and middle school students.

References

Commeyras. M. (1993). Promoting critical thinking through dialogical-thinking reading lessons. The Reading Teacher, 46, 486-494.

Hoffman. J. (1992). Critical reading/thinking across the curriculum: Using I-charts to support student learning. *Language Arts*, 69, 121-127.

Simpson. A. (1996). Critical questions: Whose questions? The Reading Teacher, 50, 118-127.

Literature Representing the African American Experience

Angelou, M. (1993). Life doesn't frighten me. New York: Stewart, Tabori & Chang.

Chocolate, D. (1996). Kente Colors. New York: Walker and Company.

Collier, Bryan. (2000). Uptown. New York: Henry Holt and Company.

Draper, S. (1997). Forged by fire. New York: Aladdin Paperbacks.

Feelings, T. (1993). Soul looks back in wonder. New York: Dial Books.

Flournoy, V. (1985). The patchwork quilt. New York: Dial Books for Young Readers.

Hamilton, V. (1995). Her stories: African American Folktales. New York: The Blue Sky Press.

Hoffman, M. (1991). Amazing grace. New York: Dial Books for Young Readers.

Howard, E. (1991). Aunt Flossie's Hats (and crab cakes later). New York: Clarion Books.

King, C. (1997). I have a dream: Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. New York: Scholastic Press.

Littlesugar, A., Cooper, F. (2001). Freedom School, Yes. New York: Philomel Books

Medearis, M., Medearis, A. (2000). Daisy and the doll. Middlebury, VT: The Vermont Folklife Center.

Madearis, A. (1995). The freedom riddle. New York: Lodestar Books.

McGill, A. (1999). Molly Bannaky. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.

McKissack, P & F. (1998). Let my people go: Bible stories told by a freeman of color. New York: Atheneum Books for Young Readers.

Mennen, I. (1994). One round moon and a star for me. New York: Orchard Books.

Mitchell, M. (1993). Uncle Jed's barbershop. New York: Simon & Schuster Books for Young Readers.

Mollel, T. (1990). The orphan boy. New York: Clarion Books.

Ringgold, F. (1991). Tarbeach. New York: Crown Publishers, Inc.

Ringgold, F. (1992). Aunt Harriet's underground railroad in the sky. New York: Crown Publishers, Inc.

Shange, N. (1997). Whitewash. New York: Walker and Company.

Smalls, I. (1999). Kevin and his dad. New York: Little, Brown and Company.

Tarpley, N. (1998). I love my hair! New York: Little Brown and Company.

Taylor, M. (1995). The Well. New York: Penguin Putnum, Inc.

Vaughn, M. (2001). The secret to freedom. New York: LEE & LOW BOOKS, Inc.

Woodson, J. (1994). I hadn't meant to tell you this. New York: Bantam Doubleday Dell Books for Young Readers.

Wiles, D. (2001). Freedom summer. New York: Atheneum Books for Young Readers.

Woodson, J. (1997). The house you pass on the way. New York: Bantam Doubleday Dell Books for Young Readers.

Literature representing the Asian and Asian American Experience

Choi, S. (1991). Year of impossible goodbyes. New York: Dell Publishing.

Jiang, J. (1997). Red scarf girl. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, Inc.

Ho, M. (1991). The clay marble. Canada: HarperCollins Canada Ltd.

Lee, M. (1997). Nim and the war effort. New York: Frances Foster Books.

Mochizuki, K. (1993). Baseball saved us. New York: Lee & Low Books, Inc.

Mochizuki, K. (1997). Passage to freedom. New York: Lee & Low Books, Inc.

Say, A. (1991). Tree of cranes. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Say. A. (2000). The sign painter. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Whelan, G. (2000). Homeless bird. New York: HarperCollins Publishers.

Yep, L. (1975). Dragonwings. New York: Harper & Row.

Yuomoto, K. (1992). The friends. New York: Bantam Doubleday Dell Books for Young Readers.

Literature representing the Native American Experience

Bruchac, J. (1994). A boy called slow. New York: Philomel.

Bruchac, J. (1996). Between Earth & Sky. Orlando, Florida: Harcourt Brace & Company.

Bruchac, J. (2000). Pushing up the sky. New York: Dial Books for Young Readers.

Bruchac, J., Bruchac, J. (2000). Native American Games and Stories. Golden, Colorado: Fulcrum Publishing.

Bruchac, J., London, J. (1992). Thirteen moons on turtle's back. New York: Philomel Books.

Hobbs, W. (1989). Bearstone. New York: Avon Books.

Grutman, J., Matthaei, G. (1995). Julia Singing Bear. Charlottesville, VA: Thomasson-Grant, Inc.

Waldman, N. (2001). They came from the Bronx: how the buffalo were saved from extinction. Honesdale, PA: Boyds Mills Press, Inc.

Waldman, N. (2001). Wounded knee. New York: Atheneum Books for Young Readers.

Martin, R. (1992). The rough face girl. New York: G. P. Putnum's Son.

Matthaei,G., Grutman, J. (2001). The sketchbook of Thomas Blue Eagle. San Fransico, CA: Chronicle Books.

Luenn, N. (1992). Mother Earth. New York: Aladdin Paperbacks.

Magdanz, J. (1996). Go home river. Seattle, WA: Alaska Northwest Books.

Mikaelsen, B. (2001). Touching spirit bear. New York: HarperCollins.

Wood, N. (1995). Dancing moons. New York: Doubleday.

Literature Representing the Latino/a Experience

Ada A. (1991). The Gold Coin. New York: Aladdin Paperbacks.

Albert, R. (1994). Alejandro's Gift. San Francisco: Chronicle Books.

Alicea, G., DeSena, C. (1995). The air down here: true tales from a South Bronx boyhood. San Francisco, CA: Chronicle Books.

Allende, I. (1985). The house of spirit. New York: Bantam Books.

Arnold, S. (2001). Child of the son: A Cuban legend. Troll Associates.

Cameron, A. (1988). The most beautiful place in the world. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Publisher.

Castaneda, O. (1993). Abuela's weave. New York: LEE & LOW BOOKS, Inc.

Cisneros, S. (1984). The House on Mango Street. New York: Vintage Books.

Cuyler, M. (1999). From here to there. New York: Henry Holt and Company, Inc.

Dorros, A. (1991). Abuela. New York : Dutton Children's Books.

Esquirel, L. (1989). Like water for chocolate. New York: Doubleday.

Gonzalez, G. (1993). Gaucho. New York : Alfred A. Knopf.

Griego, M., Bucks, B., Gilbert, S., and Kimball, L. (1981). Tortillitas para Mama and other Spanish nursery rhymes. New York: Henry Holt and Company.

_Hijuelos, O. (1989). The mambo kings play songs of love. New York: Harper & Row Publishers, Inc.

Kimmel, E. (2000). The runaway tortilla. Delray Beach, FL: Winslow Press.

Mohr, N. (1990). Felita. New York: Bantam Skylark Books.

Paulsen, G. (1993). Sisters/Hermanas. New York: Harcourt Brace & Company.

San Souci, R. (1995). The little seven-colored horse: A Spanish American folktale. San Francisco: Chronicle Books.

Soto, G. (1985). Living up the street. New York: Dell Publishing.

Soto, G. (1990). A fire in my hands. New York: Scholastic, Inc.

Soto, G. (1990). A summer life. New York: Dell Publishing.

Soto, G. (1990). Baseball in April and other stories. Orlando, FL: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich Publishers.

Soto, G. (1992). Pacific Crossing. Orlando, FL: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Suarez-Rivas, M. (2000). Latino read-aloud stories. New York: Black Dog & Leventhal Publishers, Inc.

Inquiry-Chart

The I-chart procedure is organized around three phases: a planning phase, an Interacting phase. and an Integrating and Evaluating Phase. The **Planning** phase includes a broad array of activities that the teacher engages in prior to working directly with students. The second step is one of question formation. These questions, drive the inquiry process. The third step is one of I-chart construction with the major sections identified. The teacher records the topic, title, and the quiding questions on the chart. **Interacting** is the second phase. The teacher probes students for how they would response to each of the questions on the chart. These ideas may be accurate or inaccurate. All observations are recorded. The interesting information and new questions sections is where to record additional information and questions for future inquiry.

The final steps are clustered under the **Integrating and Evaluating** Phase. Students generate summary statements for each of the questions by incorporating information found in the research process.

Topic:	Question:	Question:	Question:	Question:	Question:
What I already know ?					
Summary					

Hoffman, J. (1992). Critical reading/thinking across the curriculum:Using I-charts to support student learning. *Language Arts*, 69, 121-127.

Dialogic Reading/Thinking Lesson

Who can authentically write about a culture?		
Position A: Only people who are members of the community can authentically write about a culture.	**Position B**: Outsiders who are well-informed can provide fresh and authentic accounts of a culture..	**Position C**: (your choice)
Supports for A:	*Supports for B:*	*Supports for C:*
Group's conclusion:		

The goal of the D-TRL is to engage students in critical thinking about a story. Dialogic thinking helps students learn to argue for and against different points of view. The D-RTL requires discussion. Prior to reading the teacher constructs a central question. Students then identify reasons supporting a particular answer to the question. After listing their reasons, each is evaluated. Reasons are verified with text information, prior experience, and/or logic. At the end of each lesson students draw a conclusion about the central question.

Commeyras, M. (1993). Promoting critical thinking through dialogical-thinking reading lessons. The Reading Teacher, 46, 486-494.

Critical Questions

In this article Simpson shares her basic understandings about critical literacy. She often begins her lessons with teacher questions, and samples of these questions are presented below. Ultimately, students must be guided in learning how to ask their own critical questions [Simpson, A. (1996). Critical questions: Whose questions? *The Reading Teacher*, 50, 118-127].

Characters are not real but are constructed by authors.

1. How/why did the author ...? (i.e., Continually bring to the foreground the role of the author or illustrator in constructing the story or text. How could it have been written differently?)

Stories are not reflections of reality but are selective versions of it, told from a particular point of view.

2. Whose voices are not heard? Who is telling the story? Whose point of view is presented and whose isn't?

In telling a story an author will leave gaps in the text that the reader must fill.

3. What is missing in this version? What's been left out?

Readers will fill those gaps differently.

4. How does your reading of this compare with mine? Why is it different?

The author positions the reader to respond in particular ways through use of language, point of view, etc.

5. What does the author want you, the reader, to think and feel about particular characters and events? How does he or she achieve this?
It is possible to challenge and resist this preferred or dominant reading.

6. What is another way -- an alternative way -- of reading this text?

Authors write for particular audiences and assume that these audiences have specific cultural knowledge and values.

7. What has the author assumed is the "natural" way things are or "should be"?

Some values are privileged by the social and cultural context through which they are mediated.

8. What is he or she assuming is "best? What kinds of people, contexts, and experiences are either ignored or devalued?

In addition, Simpson offers ideas for critical text analysis. Some of her ideas are:

9. Setting questions: *How else could the author present this information?*

10. Disrupting questions: *What would happen if you changed the words or sections?*

11. Juxtapose texts: *Compare different accounts of the same event.*

12. Supply alternative endings: *Write different outcomes.*

13. Role play/role reversal: *Uncover what is unsaid.*

14. Insertions and additions: *Add new information or someone else's version.*

15. Deletions: *What would happen if information was withheld or deleted?*

Shared Inquiry

The purpose of Shared Inquiry is to develop rich discussions about literature. Although discussion between teacher and students is good, discussion among students is more desirable. Consequently, the teacher's role should be that of guide and facilitator.

In Shared Inquiry teachers develop 4-6 interpretative questions about a reading. These are open-ended questions and ones which might be reasonably answered in at least two different ways. Interpretative questions require students to think deeply about a text. Here are some ideas for developing interpretative questions:

Ask questions about the plot.

What did the character really want?
What did she learn along the way?

Ask questions about story images and symbols.

What does it (image) mean in the story?
What does this image mean in your own life?

Ask questions about contrasting story elements

How are Jack and the Giant alike and different?
How is Junebug's mother alike or different from the aunt?

Ask questions that go "against the grain."

These are questions about social assumptions of ethnicity, gender, class, language, and so on:
Suppose the genders of the characters were reversed, How would the story be different?

Ask questions about ethics.

Was this character right to do what he did?
Would it be right to do this in real life?

Ask metaphysical questions.

These are questions about abstract concepts of hate, love, bravery, and so on.
What do we mean when se way that someone is brave?
Is it brave to face practical danger for on reason?

Ask questions to unmask the author.

With whom did you think the author wanted you to sympathize?
Did you feel it hard to go along with the author's ending?

(Borrowed from the Reading and writing for Critical Thinking Project - International Reading Association)

U.S. Department of Education
Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI)
National Library of Education (NLE)
Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC)

REPRODUCTION RELEASE

(Specific Document)

CS 014 584

I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:

Title: Discovering the Voices of Multiethnic Literature through Critical reading and Discussion

Author(s): McDermott, Peter, Baker, K., Gormley, K. & Hauler, M.

Corporate Source: The Sage Colleges

Publication Date: 11-8-01

II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, *Resources in Education* (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following three options and sign at the bottom of the page.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 1 documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

1

Level 1

☒

Check here for Level 1 release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche or other ERIC archival media (e.g., electronic) *and* paper copy.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2A documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE, AND IN ELECTRONIC MEDIA FOR ERIC COLLECTION SUBSCRIBERS ONLY, HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2A

Level 2A

☐

Check here for Level 2A release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche and in electronic media for ERIC archival collection subscribers only

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2B documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2B

Level 2B

☐

Check here for Level 2B release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche only

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits.
If permission to reproduce is granted, but no box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries.

Sign here, → please

Signature: Peter McDermott	Printed Name/Position/Title: Associate Prof
Organization/Address: The Sage Colleges	Telephone: 518 244 2493 FAX: 244 2334
	E-Mail Address: McDerp@Sage.edu Date: 11-5-01

(over)

III. DOCUMENT AVAILABILITY INFORMATION (FROM NON-ERIC SOURCE):

If permission to reproduce is not granted to ERIC, *or*, if you wish ERIC to cite the availability of the document from another source, please provide the following information regarding the availability of the document. (ERIC will not announce a document unless it is publicly available, and a dependable source can be specified. Contributors should also be aware that ERIC selection criteria are significantly more stringent for documents that cannot be made available through EDRS.)

Publisher/Distributor:
Address:
Price:

IV. REFERRAL OF ERIC TO COPYRIGHT/REPRODUCTION RIGHTS HOLDER:

If the right to grant this reproduction release is held by someone other than the addressee, please provide the appropriate name and address:

Name:
Address:

V. WHERE TO SEND THIS FORM:

Send this form to the following ERIC Clearinghouse:

University of Maryland
ERIC Clearinghouse on Assessment and Evaluation
1129 Shriver Laboratory
College Park, MD 20742
Attn: Acquisitions

However, if solicited by the ERIC Facility, or if making an unsolicited contribution to ERIC, return this form (and the document being contributed) to:

ERIC Processing and Reference Facility
1100 West Street, 2nd Floor
Laurel, Maryland 20707-3598

Telephone: 301-497-4080
Toll Free: 800-799-3742
FAX: 301-953-0263
e-mail: ericfac@inet.ed.gov
WWW: http://ericfac.piccard.csc.com

EFF-088 (Rev. 9/97)