

## DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 352 976

IR 054 326

AUTHOR Andelson, Eric  
TITLE A Study of Graphic Novel Cataloging Records.  
PUB DATE Feb 92  
NOTE 93p.; Master's Thesis, Kent State University.  
PUB TYPE Dissertations/Theses - Masters Theses (042)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC04 Plus Postage.  
DESCRIPTORS Bibliographic Utilities; \*Cataloging; College Libraries; Higher Education; Library Research; Online Catalogs; Online Searching; Research Methodology; Statistical Analysis; \*Subject Index Terms; Tables (Data)

IDENTIFIERS Bowling Green State University OH; \*Graphic Novels; OCLC; Statistical Package for the Social Sciences

## ABSTRACT

Graphic novels are a blending of words and art in which the illustrations bear the same relationship to the text that a film carries to its screenplay. The hypothesis of this research is that, as a new form of literature, graphic novels will display inconsistent cataloging. Methodology consisted of searching the titles generated from Bowling Green State University's subject heading, Graphic Novels, against OCLC records. There are 191 titles, with 299 OCLC records and 3,416 holdings. All records for the same title were downloaded from OCLC, encoded, and entered into SPSS. Statistical analysis such as tabulating and frequency distribution are utilized in analyzing the cataloging records. Definitions, examples, AACR2 cataloging rules, subject headings, added entries, and classification numbers clarify the format as well as the cataloging of graphic novels. One conclusion is that there are consistencies as well as inconsistencies in the cataloging record. Another is that graphic novels are not automatically considered juvenile works. Several recommendations based on the study findings are offered: (1) "chiefly ill." should be used in the physical field; (2) a subject heading "Graphic Novels" should be assigned in order to bring out this form of literature; (3) libraries may want to class graphic novels together locally; and (4) more individuals and roles should be listed in the statement of responsibility or notes. An appendix lists the titles of the graphic novels used for analysis. Thirteen computer/CD-Rom citations and seven catalogs are listed in addition to 32 references. (Author/ALF)

\*\*\*\*\*  
\* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made \*  
\* from the original document. \*  
\*\*\*\*\*

☐ This document has been reproduced as  
received from the person or organization  
originating it

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve  
reproduction quality

• Points of view or opinions stated in this docu-  
ment do not necessarily represent official  
OERI position or policy

ED352976

## A STUDY OF GRAPHIC NOVEL CATALOGING RECORDS

A Masters Research Paper submitted to the  
Kent State University School of Library Science  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree Master of Library Science

by

Eric Andelson

February 1992

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS  
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Eric Andelson

## A STUDY OF GRAPHIC NOVEL CATALOGING RECORDS

by

Eric Andelson

### ABSTRACT

Graphic novels are a blending of words and art. The illustrations in a graphic novel bear the same relationship to the text that a film carries to its screenplay. The hypothesis is that as a new form of literature, graphic novels will display inconsistent cataloging. The Bowling Green State University Popular Culture Library uses the Subject Heading "**Graphic Novels**". The titles generated from BGSU's Subject Heading were searched against OCLC records. There are 191 titles, with 299 OCLC records and 3416 holdings. All records for the same title were downloaded from OCLC, encoded and entered into SPSS. Statistical analysis such as tabulating and frequency distribution are utilized in analyzing the cataloging records. Definitions, examples, AACR2 cataloging rules, subject headings, added entries, classification numbers, etc. clarify the format as well as the cataloging of graphic novels. One conclusion is that there are consistencies as well as inconsistencies in the cataloging record. Another is that graphic novels are not automatically considered juvenile works. A subject heading **Graphic Novels** should be assigned in order to bring out the form of the literature.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE	
A. Definitions of the Graphic Novel.....	4
B. Bibliographic control.....	10
C. Cataloging Questions	
1) Format.....	15
2) Access Points.....	16
3) Classification.....	17
4) Illustration.....	18
5) Seriality.....	19
3. METHODOLOGY.....	20
A. Coding Form.....	23
4. LIST OF TABLES	
Table	
1. Number of OCLC records per title.....	24
2. The year entered in OCLC.....	27
3. The form of <b>ill.</b> in OCLC.....	29
4. The value of <b>F</b> in <b>F/M/B</b> .....	33
5. Intellectual level: <b>Int lvl</b> .....	35
6. Translated.....	37
7A. LC number.....	39
7A1. LC number if known translation.....	39
7B. LC classification.....	40
7B1. LC classification (if fiction).....	40
8. Dewey number.....	45
8A. Dewey number (if fiction).....	45
9. Other form.....	48
10. "Graphic novel" mentioned in.....	50
11. Number of Subject Headings.....	52
11A. Number of SH not visual in type.....	52
11B. Number of SH (if fiction).....	53
12. Total number of people responsible.....	55
13. Are all "roles" indicated.....	55
14. Total number of people traced.....	55
15. Mentioned in record, but not traced.....	57
16. Holdings records.....	60

5. CONCLUSION.....	62
6. APPENDIX 1.....	64
Graphic novel titles used for analysis	
7. Bibliography.....	85

## INTRODUCTION

Graphic novels are a form in which graphic narration and text are combined in such a way that neither can survive without the other. They share, with novels, a beginning, middle and end. They range from a trade paperback reprint of a comic book to serious literary works. As of this moment, there is no single definition for the form.

Graphic novels are becoming popular in America. They are entering the world of mainstream publishing, are appearing in bookstores, and are bought and cataloged by libraries. Warner Brothers, Fawcett, and Simon & Schuster are among the large houses publishing graphic novels. The book chain, Waldenbooks, has a "Graphic Novels" section, and the Library of Congress is currently cataloging them.<sup>1</sup>

Graphic novels have been published in Europe and Asia since World War II, but not until the late 1970's, have they been published in any number in the U.S.A.. It is only in the last few years that the general public has become aware of them. As late as 1989, a reviewer identified Maus, published in 1986, as the first graphic novel. "What...Spiegelman has done is the seemingly impossible: He has fused the novel and the

-----

1. The Library of Congress has revised cataloging priorities including minimal-level cataloging. Graphic novels are not expressly listed, but are likely to be affected by the revisions. Cataloging Priorities and Levels of Cataloging, Cataloging Service Bulletin, Winter 1991, 3-7.

cartoon...."<sup>1</sup>

An important reason for the late arrival of graphic novels in our country was the publication of Fredric Wertham's book, Seduction of the Innocent, in which he linked comics and juvenile delinquency, a theory popular in the 1950's.<sup>2</sup> The ensuing uproar resulted in a "Comics Code Authority" which limited the nature of comics to material deemed suitable to children and juveniles.

The Code banned inflammatory words such as "Fear", "Horror", "Weird", and "Terror" from titles.<sup>3</sup> They had stories changed in order to ensure that the "good guys" won.<sup>4</sup> A criminal not only had to lose, but could not commit a realistic crime.<sup>5</sup> Social problems such as prostitution, racism, and drug abuse were taboo. The Code has changed since its inception, but it is still in existence.

Between 1940 and the early sixties the industry commonly accepted the profile of the comic book reader as that of a '10-year old from Iowa.' In adults the reading of comic books was regarded as a sign of low intelligence. Publishers neither encouraged nor

---

<sup>1</sup>Dreifus, Claudia. "An Interview with Art Spiegelman." Progressive November 1989: 34.

<sup>2</sup>Wertham, Fredric. Seduction of the Innocent. New York: Rinehart, 1954.

<sup>3</sup>Thompson, Don. "The spawn of the son of M.C. Gaines" The comic-book book, 312.

<sup>4</sup>ibid. 314.

<sup>5</sup>Code for Editorial Matter, General Standards. Part A: #2. "No comics shall explicitly present the unique details and methods of a crime".

supported anything more.<sup>1</sup>

The situation has changed. Waldenbooks states, "...research indicates that those buying comics these days are in their 20's and 30's."; furthermore, the adult reader now has comics and graphic novels aimed towards him/her.<sup>2</sup> This trend has lead to graphic novels deserving consideration as serious works.

Cataloging problems emerge when standard conventions are used to describe a new form. Questions arise in definition, subject headings, terminology, and physical description. A systematic analysis of the cataloging records of identified graphic novels will help define the term as well as point out inconsistencies in cataloging records.

---

<sup>1</sup>•Eisner, Will. Comics & Sequential Art. Tamarac, Florida: Poorhouse Press, 1985: 138.

<sup>2</sup>•Condon, Garret. "Graphic Novels Appeal to New Generation of Comic-Book Readers." [vertical file at OSU]

## REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

### A. Definitions of the Graphic Novel

Definitions are in a state of flux. There is no single definition for the graphic novel that satisfies everyone. In the comic world, whose publications (fanzines) can be considered part of the alternative press it is a source of continuous debate. There are articles on graphic novels by the mainstream press, but the definition of the term is often assumed. One of the first, semi-formal definitions in mainstream publishing, appeared in Publishers Weekly in 1987.<sup>1</sup>

The author, George Beahm, is director of marketing for a company that produces and sells graphic novels. He addresses some of the problems in defining them:

The graphic novel is, in short, a new format with an identity problem, handicapped by preconceived notions. The erroneous assumption: because a graphic novel uses comic art as its medium of expression, many don't take it seriously.

They are not slick comic books for kids or adults whose lips move when they read.

Graphic novels are not comics or magazines.

Graphic novels are not necessarily about comic book superheroes.

Graphic novels are not simple stories simply told.<sup>2</sup>

Beahm's company, Donning Company Publishers, and its imprint, Starblaze, published some of the graphic novels used in

-----  
<sup>1</sup>Beahm, George. "Graphic Novels: Comics, Magazines, or Books?" Publishers Weekly November 6, 1987: 22.

<sup>2</sup>ibid.

this masters paper. Appendix I contains the list of all graphic novels analyzed in this study. Some examples from the Donning Company are titles #2, 135, & 185.

Bodian's Publishing Desk Reference: A Comprehensive Dictionary of Practices and Techniques for Book and Journal Marketing and Bookselling was published in 1988.<sup>1</sup> Bodian's definition of the graphic novel cites Beahm's 1987 article:

**GRAPHIC NOVEL** A short novel that tells its story through comic artwork, typically in trade paperback format (7"x10" or 8 1/2"x11"), usually in full color, and priced from \$6.95 to \$12.95. A comic novel combines prose and the visual excitement of artwork. Usually a minimum of 64 pages, but can extend to over 100 pages depending on the story.<sup>2</sup>

Virtually every article on graphic novels has its own definition. In 1989, Gregory Walker reviews some graphic novels for Booklist.<sup>3</sup>

Graphic novels... are the most sophisticated form of comics art. Similar to novelettes and short stories in length and narrative style, they set new visual standards with artwork that rivals the best in children's books and paperback covers.<sup>4</sup>

Graphic novels mentioned in Walker's review are titles #9, 20, 55, 73, 154, 186, & 191 of this paper.

-----  
<sup>1</sup>Bodian, Nat G. Bodian's Publishing Desk Reference: A Comprehensive Dictionary of Practices and Techniques for Book and Journal Marketing and Bookselling. Phoenix: Oryx Press, 1988. 154.

<sup>2</sup>ibid., 154.

<sup>3</sup>Walker, Gregory. "Comics and Graphic Novels." Booklist April 1, 1989: 1370-1374.

<sup>4</sup>ibid., 1370.

In order to catalog them, some libraries have had to create a working definition for the graphic novel, due to the lack of a standard for the genre. An example is the Popular Culture Library at Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, Ohio. Their definition, adopted in November 1987, lead to a locally assigned subject heading of "Graphic Novels". Note that their definition also mentions Beahm's article. A list compiled from Bowling Green's subject heading forms the graphic novels analyzed in this paper.

### GRAPHIC NOVELS

1. The graphic novel is both a "literary genre/form" as well as a "publication format." It is a hybrid genre, most easily described as a novel or collection of short stories in comic-book format, but with fuller plots and characterization, and more narrative cohesion than conventional serialized comic books. The graphic novel is both a literary genre (in form, technique, and subject matter), as well as a publication format.... Graphic novels may focus on may different kinds of content -- fiction, as well as non-fiction. ...-- these may be traditional popular novels that have been adapted and re-released in the graphic novel format with elaborate illustrations, or may be independent stories that can stand alone, but that compromise an important part of a fictional character's mythos. Other graphic novels more clearly related to conventional comic books. These include comic books re-released in the graphic novel format (i.e., six Superman issues reprinted in one hardbound volume) as well as new stories with new graphic art (i.e., a folio graphic novel featuring the Hulk's early years not treated in conventional comic books), or may be extensions of serially-published comic books (i.e., graphic novels may fill in the premiere or penultimate issue that has not been previously published in conventional comic book form).

2. Graphic novels can be distinguished from comic books primarily by their format and illustrative style (but this is not always the case). They can also be distinguished from comic books because they are usually novel-length, or are otherwise self-contained (i.e., in the case of a collection of stories). They are not 26/28 cm, pulp paper, regular serials, as are

conventional comic books.

3. See Publishers Weekly May 22, 1987 for a published, although not "scholarly" definition of graphic novels. BGSU never plays a "leadership role" in defining any comic-type materials.

4. I suggest that the Popular Culture Library's collection of graphic novels be classed in LC, and put on the regular shelves... They need to be brought together in the card and online catalogs with common added subject headings, and with series title tracings in the 440 field. In addition, we need to include data on the adaptor, artist, illustrator, editor, etc.<sup>1</sup>

Another library that has a locally assigned subject heading of "Graphic novels" is Hennepin County Library (Minnesota). The Authority record reads;

Graphic novels 105 095 966 VA H-50  
pn here are entered novels in comic-art form,  
usually published as full-color trade  
paperbacks.  
sa Cartoon novels. / Fotonovelas. / Movie novels.  
/ Stories without words.  
x Comic book novels. / Novels, graphic.  
cn 80-4366260 HCL form.

Vendors sometimes bypass defining the product by listing them with trade paperbacks. The Fantasy Collection and The Premium Specialty Collection are two vendor catalogs which use the headings "Trade Paperback" and "Hardcovers" to describe their graphic novels.<sup>2</sup> A closer look shows that they are created from the same database, the only difference being The Premium Specialty Collection is for dealers and contains discount and -----

<sup>1</sup> McCallum, Brenda. "Working definition", [memmo], Nov 16, 1987.

<sup>2</sup> The Fantasy Collection. [Catalog] Capital city distribution, May 1990. 74.

The Premium Specialty Collection. [Catalog] Capital city distribution, October 1990. 74.

ordering information. The Fantasy Collection is aimed at the individual buyer and has no discount information.

Catalogs are also issued by publishers of graphic novels. An example is Eclipse Books. The back of their 1989 catalog says, "Eclipse Books has been publishing graphic novels for more than ten years and remains the innovator in content, design, and packaging."<sup>1</sup> Examples of Eclipse's publishing in BGSUs list are titles #016, 073, 085, 104, 150, and 126. On the verso of the title page of Classic DC Graphic Novels Catalog (put out by DC Comics) has "This Classic DC Graphic Novels catalog represents DC's crowning achievements in the comic art form. The following new and original graphic novels and trade paperback collections, reprinting rare Golden Age and contemporary stories, have been appreciated by readers for years."<sup>2</sup> Examples of DC's publishing in BGSUs list are titles 008, 020, 112, 113, 122, 131, and 163.

In the definitions, the use of the term "novel" implies visual formats that are not considered graphic novels. Bound collections of newspaper strips, such as Calvin and Hobbs, Ziggy, Peanuts, etc. do not follow the common definition of a novel -- that it has a beginning, middle and end. Collected strips usually only tell an ongoing story at best. Other compiled strips, such as Prince Valiant or Little Orphan Annie might be considered graphic novels as their compilations tell a

-----  
<sup>1</sup>. Eclipse Books [Catalog], Catalogue design by Larry Marder, 1989. [16]

<sup>2</sup>. Classic DC Graphic Novels Catalog, Diamond Comic Distributors, 1989. [12]

complete story.

This ambiguity could lead to a bias against considering any bound collection of newspaper strips, a graphic novel. This bias could extend to compilations from a magazine or bound mini-series. Many of the titles used in this study have a prior history in another form; some examples are titles # 46, 58, 96, 112, 181.

Anthologies on the whole are another format that do not fit the definition of a novel. Collections are not considered novels even if they are linked by a common theme or story. An exception is made if the reviewer, cataloger or reader is not aware of the prior history of the anthology. Science fiction uses the term **fix-up** which is "a book made up of stories originally published separately, but altered to fit together... they are usually marketed as novels."<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>. Nicholls, Peter, ed. The Science Fiction Encyclopedia, 9.

## B. Bibliographic Control

There are major problems in conducting a literature review of graphic novels. One is that the term "graphic novel" is still evolving, and graphic novels are confused with comic books and other graphic art. Another problem is that much of the literature and discussion about the form, occur in material to which the researcher or librarian has limited access, such as the alternative press. The exclusiveness as well as lack of access to "comic" publications will probably lead to mainstream writings, opinions and definitions being accepted as the standard. This paper, for the most part, looks at sources available in mainstream publishing.

Most librarians prefer to order material after reading reviews or looking at the material itself; others use approval plans. Approval plans demand a definition for the material that the vendor and the librarian agree on. Publishers Weekly is the only mainstream tool that constantly reviews graphic novels. Keith DeCandido's 1990 article in Library Journal is one of the few treatments of graphic novels in library related literature.<sup>1</sup>

DeCandido lists three major serial sources for critical discussion of graphic novels: The Comics Journal, The Comics Buyer's Guide, and Amazing Heroes.<sup>2</sup> From a librarian's -----

<sup>1</sup>DeCandido, Keith R. A. "Picture This: Graphic Novels in Libraries." Library Journal March 15, 1990: 50-55.

<sup>2</sup>ibid., 51.

standpoint, they are not good sources as they have no indexes. Furthermore, access to them is limited for according to OCLC cataloging records, The Comics Journal is only held in eighteen locations, The Comics Buyer's Guide in seven and Amazing Heroes in four.<sup>1</sup> The holding's record makes it obvious that the three magazines are not used often by librarians. And though DeCandido "...reviews comics and graphic novels for The Comics Journal", these reviews do not appear on most reviewing indexes.<sup>2</sup>

There are no comprehensive indexes for graphic novels, comics, or comic-related art. In order to deal with this, special libraries such as The Cartoon, Graphic, and Photographic Arts Research Library at Ohio State University or the Russel B. Nye Popular Culture Collection at Michigan State University keep vertical files.

Another source of information is the graphic novel itself. Many have forewards and other information in the preface or colophon of the book. Mention is often made of other graphic novels by the same publishers and/or authors.

Many graphic novels remain in print or are reprinted; therefore, a librarian can usually preview a graphic novel at a local comic or book store before purchasing. Most book

-----  
<sup>1</sup>Amazing Heroes. Stamford, CT: Zam, OCLC #7616065.

The Comics Buyer's Guide. Iola, WI: Krause Publications, OCLC #9185196.

The Comics Journal. Bethel, CT: The Comics Journal, OCLC #4521305.

<sup>2</sup>DeCandido, 50.

stores have some graphic novels; Waldenbooks, for example, has labeled racks.

Of special interest to the librarian is Robert Overstreet's annual bible for comic book collectors since many graphic novels began as a serial or multi-volume works (comic book mini-series).<sup>1</sup> Overstreet usually will indicate if a graphic novel or trade paperback has been published for a comic. A limitation, however, is that he does not always show if the graphic novel is a reprint.

A good example of a graphic novel reprint is Watchmen.<sup>2</sup> It first appeared as a DC comics twelve issue mini-series. A collector would pay over \$40.00 to get all twelve ,out-of-print, issues from a comic book store. The graphic novel, a reprint of all issues, costs \$16.95. Watchmen is not on BGSUs list of titles, probably because it was cataloged before the subject heading "graphic novels" was assigned.

Another source of listings is the publishers series such as First Comics Graphic Novel, DC Graphic Novel and Marvel Graphic Novel. If a work is in a series, good cataloging should include

-----

<sup>1</sup>Overstreet, Robert M. Official Overstreet Comic Book Price Guide. 18th ed. New York: House of Collectibles, 1988.

<sup>2</sup>Moore, Alan & Dave Gibbons ill. & letterer, John Higgins colorist. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1986. OCLC # 15063233.

----- . Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #17257135.

----- . Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #18203911.

----- . Watchmen. New York: Warner books, 1987. OCLC #17301724.

series added entries. Randall Scott, a cataloger at Michigan State University, specializes in comic books and other related art. He wrote the chapter "Cataloging Comics" in Cataloging Special Materials.<sup>1</sup> Scott traces series in his cataloging on OCLC.

There are dissertations directly relating to the graphic novel, but they do not relate to cataloging. Two of them are "Reinventing the Wheel" and "L'aventure D'une Ecriture".<sup>2</sup> "Reinventing the Wheel" is a master's thesis relating to the graphic novel, Watchmen. "L'aventure D'une Ecriture" is about "bandes dessinees" or "B.D's", a Belgian/European term for comic art and graphic novels. The abstract to "L'aventure D'une Ecriture" provides yet another definition of graphic novels, "... a theatre of writing where a contagion between writing, graphics, literature, painting and theatre occurs."<sup>3</sup>

Almost every article dealing with graphic novels cites their popularity in Europe or Asia, but offers little concrete information to confirm the fact. Two exceptions are articles by

-----  
<sup>1</sup>Scott, Randall. "Cataloging Comics." in Cataloging Special Materials: Critiques and Innovations, ed. Sanford Berman, 50-70: Oryx Press, 1986.

<sup>2</sup>Fauvel, Marie-Louise. "L'Aventure D'Une Ecriture: La Bande Dessinee D'essai." (Ph.D. diss., University of Wisconsin, 1989) [French Text] 200, Dialog, Dissertation Abstracts International, #01100712.

Holman, Curtis Lehner. "Reinventing the Wheel: A Multi-Perspective Analysis of Alan Moore and Dave Gibbon's Graphic Novel 'Watchmen'." (M.A. diss., University of Georgia, 1989), Dialog, Dissertation Abstracts International, #01099187.

<sup>3</sup>Fauvel, *ibid*.

Roger Du Mars and Anne Devreux.<sup>1</sup> Du Mars lists some of the translated graphic novels and says that "...Japanese readers purchased more than 1.5 billion graphic novels in 1986."<sup>2</sup> The Devreux article deals with the history and popularity of Belgian bandes dessinees (graphic novels). In 1983, 28.7% of the Belgian book industry consisted of graphic novels. In 1985 the percentage had gone to 32.7% constituting 52 million dollars.<sup>3</sup> Devreux lists some graphic novels on BGSUs list such as Titles #72 and 76. Examples from the Du Mars article are Titles #22, 112, 143, 144, and 162.

-----  
<sup>1</sup>Devreux, Anne Shapiro. "Biff Wham Bam!: Call it Bandes Dessinee or Graphic Novel, it's the Newest Belgian Winner!" Belgian American Trade Review [Vertical file, Ohio State University]: 18-21.

Du Mars, Roger Dean. "The Comic Book Grows Up, Graphic Novels: Not Just Kid Stuff." Christian Science Monitor December 28, 1988:[Vertical file, Ohio State University]

<sup>2</sup>Du Mars.

<sup>3</sup>Devreux, 18.

## C. Cataloging Questions

### 1) Format

To a librarian, a major difference between a comic book and a graphic novel is that the graphic novel (in trade paperback or hardcover form) can withstand more circulations. Libraries that carry comic books do not always catalog them, because comic books are not built to withstand the forces generated by cataloging, yet alone patron use. Graphic novels, on the other hand, can withstand the normal wear and care that most library materials undergo.

The newness of the format in this country stretches the existing cataloging rules and conventions. There are very few catalogers dealing with the form in this country. One of them is Randall Scott at Michigan State University Library. Sanford Berman described Scott as "... the foremost library authority and advocate for ... comic books... as well as producing the basic tools and guides for both collecting and organizing comic book collections. In this otherwise neglected but significant field, he has no peer."<sup>1</sup>

Scott uses AACR2 conventions and rules. He tries to extend and modify them in a logical and systematic manner. His recent book, Comics Librarianship: a handbook, is an invaluable source in interpreting the data for this masters paper.<sup>2</sup> The Ohio

-----

<sup>1</sup>Scott, Randall. Comics Librarianship: a handbook. Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 1990.

2. *ibid.*

State University's "Cartoon, Graphic and Photographic Arts Research Library" uses a Scott article as a reference source.<sup>1</sup>

## 2) Access Points

Who is the Main Entry and how many Added Entries to list poses a problem with graphic novels for a graphic novel can have more than eighteen individuals playing different roles.<sup>2</sup> Some of the roles found in graphic novels are Pencilers, Inkers, Letterers, Creators, Adapters, Visual Effects Specialists, Colorists, Illustrators, Writers, Editors, Authors, Painters, Calligraphers, Translators, Cover Artists, and so forth. The publishers often have their own statement of responsibility: Presidents, Design Directors, Managing Editors, Production Directors, Editors, Co-Editors, Controllers, and so on. Sometimes there are layers of editors, with separate ones for the publisher and for the graphic novel. Michigan State University "...classifies by the first name on the title page, when a graphic novel is presented as by an artist/writer or a writer/artist team".<sup>3</sup>

This plethora of roles can lead to the use of a title main entry. Graphic novels that adopt a comic book format can cause confusion for comic books often have a changing cover title while keeping a constant indica title. Comic book bibliographies such  
-----

<sup>1</sup>Scott, Randall. "Cataloging Comics." *ibid.*

<sup>2</sup>Miller, Frank. Batman : The Dark Knight Returns New York, NY : Warner Books, 1986. ISBN 0-446-38505-0 NOTE: This is Title 112.

<sup>3</sup>.Scott, Comics Librarianship, 76-77.

as Overstreet use the indica title as a main entry. AACR2rev in rule 12.0B1, uses the title page as chief source of information. This leads to a single comic having several different titles.<sup>1</sup> A 1986 rule interpretation allows the use of a "stable" title.<sup>2</sup>

### 3) Classification

A preliminary look at the classification numbers indicates that graphic novels and comics are often classified together. Dewey has most in the 741's (Drawing & Drawings). Library of Congress (LC) often classifies them in PN6700's (Comic Books, Strips, etc.).<sup>3</sup> PN6700 contains material about comics, anthologies, works about illustration, newspaper strip reprints, how to draw comics, etc. Graphic novels, obviously are an "etc.".

Bodian lists two sizes for graphic novels: 7"x10" and 8 1/2"x11".<sup>4</sup> These are the standard sizes for comic books and magazines respectively. Graphic novels thus fit the standard shelves in comic book stores but not most library fiction shelves. This size difference might be the basis for the

-----

<sup>1</sup>•Scott, Randall. Comics Librarianship, 63-66.

NOTE: Randall uses the example of the comic book Scout which has been compiled into graphic novels Scout: Mount Fire & Scout: The Four Monsters.

<sup>2</sup>•LCRI Cumulated 12.0b1:CSB34.

<sup>3</sup>• Scott, Comics Librarianship, 77.

<sup>4</sup>•Bodian, ibid.

preference of using PN6700's as the shelves are usually taller.

Scott, at Michigan State University, has the advantage of an archival research library which allows a certain flexibility in classification numbers. His preference is to list comic books by title.<sup>1</sup> "The MSU call number system differs from the LC schedule mainly in its treatment of United States comic books. Grouping is by decade in which a serial begins, with subgrouping by publisher."<sup>2</sup>

#### 4) Illustration

The graphic novel can not exist without illustration which is one of the main differences between it and a conventional novel. The graphic novel's illustration also tells a sequential story. AACR2 makes no distinction between illustrations that are an accessory to the story and illustrations that are vital. AACR2 in section 2.5c. Illustrative matter uses terms such as **ill.**, **all ill.**, **chiefly ill.**, **col. ill.**, **ill. (some col.)**. The preference would be to use **chiefly ill.** for graphic novels. A Library of Congress memorandum states "Describe an illustrated printed monograph as **ill** in all cases..."<sup>3</sup> Catalogers following this memorandum will have a serious information loss. Fortunately the rule interpretation allows other libraries to use fuller forms of **ill.**

-----

1. *ibid*, 70.

2. *ibid*, 73.

3. Cataloging Service Bulletin, No. 47 (Winter 1990), 30.

## 5) Seriality

Graphic novels may start as a serialization, either as part of an ongoing comic book or a separately published mini-series, thus cataloging records may exist for both series and the graphic novel. Cataloging records on OCLC, however, do not always show if the graphic novel originally was serialized as a comic book. Watchmen, for example, started out as a twelve issue mini-series, yet two of the OCLC records do not mention this.<sup>1</sup> The other two records have "Originally published in 12 issues, magazine form, 1986-1987." and "'Originally published by DC Comics Inc. in twelve issues in magazine form, 1986-1987"--T.p. verso."<sup>2</sup> Another example is the graphic novel Maus, title # 162 of this study. On the verso of the title page:

Chapters 1 through 6 first appeared, in somewhat different form, in Raw magazine between 1980 and 1985. "Prisoner on the Hell Planet" originally appeared in Short Order Comix #1, 1973.<sup>3</sup>

None of the Maus, OCLC records show this information.

-----  
<sup>1</sup>Moore, Alan & Dave Gibbons ill. & letterer, John Higgins colorist. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1986. OCLC # 15063233.

\_\_\_\_\_. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #17257135.

<sup>2</sup>\_\_\_\_\_. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC # 18203911.

\_\_\_\_\_. Watchmen. New York: Warner books, 1987. OCLC #17301724.

<sup>3</sup>Spiegelman, Art. Maus: A Survivor's Tale. New York: Pantheon Books, 1986. OCLC #13524314.

## METHODOLOGY

The hypothesis is that as a new format, graphic novels will suffer from inconsistent cataloging. Some of the inconsistencies might be in classification, subject analysis, added entries, physical description, and so on.

Since November 1987, Bowling Green State University's "Popular Culture Library", uses the term "Graphic Novels" as a locally assigned subject heading in cataloging. The catalogers have used a single definition of graphic novels.<sup>1</sup>

These bibliographic records, from the Bowling Green State University's online catalog in October 1990, make up the graphic novels titles used in this study. The titles from BGSU will be searched in OCLC with the expectation that some titles will have multiple records. All existing records on OCLC for each title will be downloaded and encoded for statistical analysis. The statistical package, SPSS, will be used to analyze the data. In this way, inconsistency, ambiguity and similarity in the cataloging of graphic novels can be quantified.

The following data was extracted and encoded from the OCLC records:

1) Accession Number: The number given to each unique OCLC record.

2) Title Number: The number given to each title used.  
-----

<sup>1</sup>•Exerpts are reprinted in the section, A. Definitions of the Graphic Novel, of this masters paper.

## OCLC FIXED FORMAT:

3) OCLC Number: The OCLC number is listed but not analyzed. It will facilitate checking data.

4) Entrd: The year the graphic novel was cataloged on OCLC. This is system supplied. The assumption is that most graphic novels will be cataloged on OCLC.

5) M/F/B: The **F** allows the cataloger to indicate if the work is fiction or non fiction. This is optional cataloging.

6) Int lvl: The cataloger can indicate if the work is a juvenile work (through age 16). This is optional cataloging. One constant in the definitions of graphic novels is that they are not children's works. The assumption is that a **j** would be rare in cataloging.

## OCLC FIXED TAGS

7) 300 ill: A graphic novel is chiefly illustration. The cataloging record should indicate this.

8) 040/Translation: If graphic novels have a longer history outside the USA, then it is likely that many American graphic novels would be translated from other countries.

9) 050/090/Classification Number LC: The LC call number, up to the first decimal point, will be noted. This will be the only Alpha-numeric record. All other records are numeric.

10) 080/082/092/Classification Number DEWEY: The first three digits of the Dewey number, up to the decimal point, will be noted. The term graphic novel implies that they are novels, therefore they should have a call number that reflects that

11) 5xx/Other Form: Graphic novels can start life serialized in a comic book, adapted from a novel or appearing in another form.

Questions 12-14) Does the phrase "graphic novel(s)" appear in the OCLC cataloging record?

12) 245/Title: Is the term part of the title?

13) 5xx/Note: Is the term in the Notes field?

14) 4xx/Series: Is the term part of a series name?

Questions 15-16) The Subject Headings given a work reflect the perceived nature of the item. The assumption at this point is that the cataloger will focus on the visual aspect of the graphic novels and that the subject headings will reflect this.

15) 65x/69x Number: The number of subject headings.

16) 65x/69x Not-graphic: The number of subject headings from question 15 that do not reflect the visual nature of the work. (i.e. do not have Comic books, strips, etc.).

Questions 17-19) A look at almost any graphic novel indicates that there can be many people responsible for the work. The question of how many are listed and subsequently traced is important.

17) Total number of people responsible: This will be taken from the 100, 245, 500 tags.

18) Total number of people traced: How many are traced in the added entries and main entry.

19) Is role of everybody indicated:

Questions 20-26) Cataloging rules state which names deserve added entries. The plethora of names in graphic novels might lead to cataloging shortcuts, especially since some of the roles associated with the names do not appear in cataloging rule books. Questions 20-26 look at names listed in the 245, 500, etc field in the OCLC record that were not given added entries.

20) Original Author not traced:

21) Writer/Adapter not traced:

22) Colorist/Illustrator/Painter/Artist not traced:

23) Calligrapher/Letterer not traced:

24) Editor not traced:

25) Translator not traced:

26) Other's not traced:

27) Number of Holdings: A large number of holdings for graphic novels could indicate that libraries are buying and cataloging them.

MASTER'S RESEARCH PAPER: CODING FORM

**OCLC CODING: BOOKS FORMAT**

- 1) Accession Number: \_\_, \_\_, \_\_  
2) Title Number: \_\_, \_\_, \_\_

**OCLC FIXED FORMAT**

- 3) OCLC: \_\_, \_\_, \_\_, \_\_, \_\_, \_\_, \_\_, \_\_ (OCLC Number)  
4) Entrd: \_\_, \_\_ (first 2 digits= year)  
5) M/F/B: \_\_ (F only, 2nd pos. not/Fic=0, Fic=1)  
6) Int lvl: \_\_ ([ ]=0, j=1)

**OCLC TAGS**

- 7) 300 ill: \_\_ ([ ]=0, ill=1, chiefly/mostly/totally ill=2, etc.=3)  
8) Translation: \_\_ (all sources not-trans=0, trans=1)  
9) 050/090: \_\_, \_\_, \_\_, \_\_, \_\_ (050 priority PN21.5=P, N, 0, 0, 2, 1)  
10) 080/082/092: \_\_, \_\_, \_\_ (082 priority 73.215=0, 7, 3)

- (Originally pub. in other form/serialized/adapted, etc.)  
11) 5xx Other form: \_\_ (all sources no=0, yes=1)

- ("Graphic Novel(s)" mentioned)  
12) 245/Title: \_\_ (245 tag, only no=0, yes=1)  
13) 5xx Note: \_\_ (5xx tags, only no=0, yes=1)  
14) 4xx Series: \_\_ (4xx tags, only no=0, yes=1)

- 15) 65x/69x Number: \_\_, \_\_ (Topical Subject Headings)  
16) 65x/69x Not-graphic: \_\_, \_\_ (# not reflecting graphic nature  
ie. "comic books, strips, etc.")

- 17) Total number of people responsible:  
\_\_\_\_ (100, 245, 500 tags)

- 18) Total number of people traced:  
\_\_\_\_

- 19) Is role of everybody indicated: \_\_ (no=0, yes=1)

- (#20-26 refer only to people in #17)  
20) Original Author not traced: \_\_ (no=0, yes=1)  
21) Writer/Adapter not traced: \_\_ (no=0, yes=1)  
22) Colorist/illustrator/painter/artist not traced: \_\_ (no=0, yes=1)  
23) Calligrapher/Letterer not traced: \_\_ (no=0, yes=1)  
24) Editor not traced: \_\_ (no=0, yes=1)  
25) Translator not traced: \_\_ (no=0, yes=1)  
26) Other's not traced: \_\_ (no=0, yes=1)

- 27) Number of holdings: \_\_, \_\_, \_\_

**NOTES/QUESTIONS**

TABLE 1 Number of OCLC Records per Title								
Number of OCLC Records Per Title	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	11
Number of Titles	132	39	11	2	2	1	3	1
% of total titles	69.1%	20.4%	5.8%	1%	1%	0.5%	1.6%	0.5%

The Mean is for 1.502 OCLC records per title.  
The Standard Deviation is 1.243.

TITLE #54 has 11 OCLC records.  
TITLE #2, 143, 181 has 7 OCLC records.  
TITLE #135 has 6 OCLC records.  
TITLE #58, 112 has 5 OCLC records.  
TITLE #80, 162 has 4 OCLC records.  
TITLE #15,20,24,25,50,59,77,83,144,172,174 has 3 OCLC records.

Most of the titles only have one OCLC record. Multiple records should occur only if there are significant differences between the old record and the new material to be cataloged. Title #54, A Contract With God by Will Eisner, has 11 OCLC records. They represent cataloging done by four different libraries including DLC. OSU created eight different OCLC records for eight foreign language editions; Swedish, Danish, German, French, Finish, Yiddish, Italian and Spanish. Eisner is traced but, none of the translators, even when the translators are mentioned in the statement of responsibility.<sup>1</sup> The other three records are for different publishers or copyright dates. In total, there are 38 holding records for the 11 OCLC records.

Thieves world started as a fantasy anthology in which  
-----

<sup>1</sup>.AACR2 does not usually trace translators, see TABLE 6.

different authors write about the same town. This multi-volume series proved to be so popular that it also has been published in multi-volume graphic novel form. Title #2 is for Thieves World Graphics which has seven OCLC records. Five of the OCLC records are by DLC. Two of the records treat Thieves World Graphics as multi-volume work, four records are for single volume works, and one record treats them as a serial. Three records classify them in PN6727(Comic books, by author)/741, two records do not classify them(do not use LC format), one record puts them in PS3551(Literature, by author)/813 and one record in PN6726(Comic books, by collections). OCLC lists 47 holdings.

Another graphic novel with seven holdings is Title #143, Corto Maltese by Hugo Pratt. This is one of the few graphic novels that is completely done by one person. The graphic novels are made up of collected stories about Corto Maltese. The records are for works in Italian, French and English. Three records classify them in PN6768(Comic books, Italy, by Title), one in PN6767(Comic books, Italy by Author) and one in PN6748(Comic books, France, by Title). OCLC lists 47 holdings.

The last graphic novel with seven OCLC records is Title #181, Early days of the Southern Knights. The Southern Knights is a comic book whose issues have been compiled into trade paperbacks. Early Days of the Southern Knights, Volume two, has on the back "...this graphic novel is just what you need..."<sup>1</sup> Volume 3 drops the term graphic novel and uses graphic album  
-----

<sup>1</sup>·Vogel, Henry Early Days of the Southern Knights, Vol. 2, New Yor, New York: Comics Interview. 1986.

instead. There is a separate OCLC record for each volume. All of the classification numbers are for PN6728(Comic books, by title).

Title #135, Elfquest has six OCLC records. Elfquest's popularity caused it to be reprinted as a color comic. There are also Elfquest mini-series. The comics and mini-series were then reprinted as graphic novels. Later on, these graphic novels were reprinted with enhanced color as The Complete Elfquest. Since The Complete Elfquest does not indicate which Elfquest graphic novels it reprints, it was not included in the analysis of graphic novel titles. DLC treats it as a multi-volume work with classification number PS3566(American literature, individual authors)/813(Literature, American). The only other classification number given is PN6728. There are 207 holdings on OCLC for this title.

The examples of graphic novels with multiple records indicates that there is considerable flexibility in the cataloging. This could be caused by different interpretations of the AACR2 cataloging rules by different libraries, or a sense of confusion on the material being catalogued.

TABLE 2 The year entered in OCLC		
Year entered on OCLC	Number of Records	Percent
1976	1	0.3%
1977	1	0.3%
1978	3	1.0%
1979	6	2.0%
1980	6	2.0%
1981	3	1.0%
1982	3	1.0%
1983	4	1.3%
1984	27	9.0%
1985	25	8.4%
1986	30	10.0%
1987	42	14.0%
1988	48	16.1%
1989	65	21.7%
1990	35	11.7%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

This table is interesting, but not very valid for the following reasons. First, it reflects BGSU's adoption of a locally defined subject heading of "graphic novels" in late 1985. The expected conclusion is that there would be more graphic novels cataloged in a subject heading after the subject heading was adopted. The second reason is that there was no retrospective conversion to give previously cataloged graphic novels the subject heading "graphic novels". The last reason is that BGSU has a budget, which constrains purchasing.

The graphic novels cataloged before the 1980's indicate some

of the earlier titles. The earliest record is title #77[record #248], Ulysses, entered in 1976. The other two records for this title were entered in 1979 and 1988. The 1976 record is for the English translation from the French original. The more recent records are for French reprints of the graphic novel. All records have the classification number PN6747(Comic books, France, by author), with one having Homer as Main Entry and another having the adapter as Main Entry.

Barbarella was originally a comic strip in a magazine during 1962. The strips were then collected to form the graphic novel. The movie starring Jane Fonda was based on the graphic novel. The other entries were cataloged in 1983, 1986, 1988 and 1989. Title #58[record #181], Barbarella, was cataloged in 1977. Three entries are in French, two in English. There are two DLC records. Three records, including DLC, have a classification number of NC1499(Fine arts, Drawing, Pictorial humor, France, by author). The other numbers are NC1599(Fine arts, Drawing, Pictorial humor, Denmark, by author) and PN6748(Literature, collections, comic books, France, by title).

TABLE 3 The form of ill. in OCLC		
	Number of Records	Percent
no ill.	7	2.3%
ill., color ill.	240	80.3%
totally ill. mostly ill. chiefly ill.	52	17.4%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

OCLC records with no entry for **ill.** are:

Title #2[005,007,286], Title #15[019], Title #58[180],  
Title #143[259] and Title #179[156].

This data was taken from the OCLC 300 Physical Description field. Germane AACR2 rules are 2.5C1 and 2.5C6.

Using the cataloging term **ill.** or **color ill.** reduces the status of the artwork of a graphic novel to a mere addendum. The term **chiefly ill.**<sup>1</sup> is a more accurate reflection of the ratio of text to illustration that exists.

A convention of graphic novel cataloging should be the use of the term **chiefly ill.** Table #3 indicates that this is not how they are cataloged. There are two main places in an OCLC record where information on the illustration level can be obtained. The first is in the OCLC Fixed Field illus:. This is intended to reflect and expand on the 300 field. Illus: reveals  
-----

<sup>1</sup> **chiefly ill.** is preferred by AACR2 even though **mostly ill.** and **totally ill** are also used by some member libraries.

the form but not the quantity of the illustration. The only two codes applicable to graphic novels are **a**[illustrations] or **[]**[no illustrations]. This is optional cataloging with **[]** also used as the default.

The OCLC 300 Physical Description filed, Subfield **b** is where AACR2 rules 2.5C1 and 2.5C6 apply. This is not optional cataloging. Therefore, the seven records with no coding for **ill.** were a surprise. Record #156 has no 300 field but did code illus: a. Record #180 has a 300 field, no **ill.**, but did have a subject heading of "French Wit and Humor, Pictorial". Records #19 and #259 have **Enc lvl:** of **K** which indicates that the catalogers believed that they were cataloging at the Less-than-full level. Records #5,7 and 286 belong to the "Thieves Worlds" anthologies and are DLC records. Record #5 has **Enc lvl: J** which indicates that the record has been deleted. Record #7 has **Enc lvl: 8** which is Pre-Publication-level cataloging. Record #286 is a serial record with no **Enc lvl:** field. The 580 field has "Graphic novels based on ...". The presence of this note indicates an effort made to clarify the form of the record.

There are 52 OCLC records that have **chiefly ill., mostly ill.,** or **totally ill.** DLC has cataloged 24 of these records. The most records were cataloged in 1988 with 14 entries. 24 of the records have a Dewey number and 43 have a LC number. 23 records have one or more subject headings. There are 848 holdings for the 52 records.

The presence of **chiefly ill.** implies that the artwork is a major factor in the graphic novel. There are, however, six

records that have an artist in the statement of responsibility, but no added entry for the artist.

These are;

Title 2[rec 4,6]Thieves' world graphics  
Title 53[rec 51]Teenage mutant ninja turtles  
Title 108[rec 93]Les oiseaux du maitre  
Title 164[rec 138]Batman: the cult  
Title 168[rec 251]Incredible Hulk and the Thing...

Title 2[rec 4,6], Thieves' World Graphics was first discussed with Table 1. Record 4 has in the statement of responsibility; "adapted by Robert Asprin and Lynn Abbey ; art by Tim Sale". Sale is not traced. Record 6 has the same entries for the statement of responsibility and Sale is not traced. Record 2,3,5,7 cataloged by DLC for the same title, trace Sale. A look at Thieves' world graphics has Sale clearly listed by role, on the cover, title page and CIP.

Title 53[rec 51], Teenage mutant ninja turtles has in the statement or responsibility; "Kevin Eastman and Peter Laird" who are traced. In the OCLC 500 field, "Steve Lavigne, letterer ; Kevin Eastman, Ken Feduniewicz, Janice Cohen, colorists". Lavigne, Feduniewicz and Cohen were not traced. This is the colorized reprinting of the first three issues of the original black and white comic book which has since been made into two movies, animated cartoons and other spin offs.

Title 108[rec 93], Les Oiseaux du Maitre, has in the statement of responsibility; **[dessins] par...** and **couleur**. The **[dessins] par** is traced, but the **couleur** is not. Record 94 for the same title has only **col. ill.** and the **couleur** is not traced.

Title 164[rec 138], Batman: the cult cataloged by DLC, has

in the statement of responsibility; "Jim Starlin, writer ; Berni Wrightson, illustrator ; Bill Wray, color artist ; Todd Klein, letterer". The OCLC 500 field has "Created by Bob Kane". Wray and Klein are not traced. Record 137 for the same title has in the statement of responsibility "Jim Starlin, writer ; Berni Wrightson, illustrator ; Bill Wray, color artist". All are traced.

Title 168[rec 251], Incredible Hulk and the Thing..., has in the statement of responsibility; "story by Jim Starlin ; art by Berni Wrightson ; Jim Novak, letterer ; Carl Potts, titles designer ; Allen Milgrom, editor". The OCLC 490 field has "Stan Lee presents...". Starlin and Wrightson are the only two traced.

The recommendation is that **chiefly ill.** should be used in the physical description field.

TABLE 4 The value of F in M/F/B			
	Value of F	Number of Records	Percent
[serial rec]	.	6	2.0%
Not fiction	0	104	34.8%
Fiction	1	189	63.2%

serial records do not have an M/F/B field.

This data is from the F in the OCLC Fixed Fields Format M/F/B. This represents optional cataloging with 0 as the default. The F stands for the fiction code. The choices are fiction 1 or non-fiction 0. Drama is not considered fiction by OCLC and should be coded 0. A cataloger must deliberately code 1 for fiction.

Novels are usually considered fiction. Graphic novels should then be considered mostly fiction also. Only a few of the graphic novel titles in this study could be considered non-fiction. Two of these are Title #16 and #162. Title #16 is Brought to Light which deals with undercover actions by the USA government in South America. The classification number in both records is for F1436. Record #20, by DLC, has six Subject Added entries and 64 holding records. Record #21 is for the British publication of the same work. Both records have 0 for F.

Title #162 is Maus; a survivor's tale by Spiegelman. This is a grim retelling of Spiegelman's parents experiences as Jews during WWII. Classification numbers are PS3569 and DU810 for LC and 741 and 940 for DEWEY. ill: is 2 for all entries and there is a total of 648 holding records. The F in M/F/B is coded 0 for

all four records.

Fiction works are not usually given Dewey classification numbers unless they are in the 800's (Literature & rhetoric). There are only 12 Dewey records with a classification number having a F code of 1. These are:

Title 2[rec 3]	Dewey is 741	<u>Thieves world</u>
Title 2[rec 5]	Dewey is 813	<u>Thieves world</u>
Title 4[rec 9]	Dewey is 741	<u>Through the looking .</u>
Title 6[rec 237]	Dewey is 741	<u>Robotech</u>
Title 68[rec 281]	Dewey is 741	<u>Hamlet</u>
Title 112[rec 201]	Dewey is 741	<u>Batman: Dark Knight</u>
Title 185[rec 234]	Dewey is 741	<u>Lightrunner</u>
Title 133[rec 117]	Dewey is 813	<u>Love shots</u>
Title 135[rec 295]	Dewey is 813	<u>Elfquest</u>
Title 148[rec 125]	Dewey is 813	<u>Silver metal lover</u>
Title 61[rec 278]	Dewey is 823	<u>Great expectations</u>
Title 30[rec 298]	Dewey is 843	<u>Hunting party</u> <sup>1</sup>

Another point to look at is the use of subject headings. Works of fiction traditionally do not have many subject headings; most have none. A look at Table 11B allows a comparison of the fiction label and subject headings. There are 172 subject headings for all 299 records. There are 75 subject headings for the 189 records coded for fiction. This seems to confirm that works considered fiction receive fewer subject headings.

More use of the fiction code F leads to a fuller cataloging record. This is not, however, mandatory cataloging.

-----  
<sup>1</sup>.SEE Table 8A to compare this against regular Dewey numbers.

TABLE 5 Intellectual Level: Int 1vl		
Int 1vl value	Number of Records	Percent
0	287	96%
j	12	4%

The OCLC fixed field code **Int 1vl** is optional cataloging for the intellectual level of the work. A **j** indicates a belief that the work is intended for juveniles through age 16. The default as well as a non-juvenile work is **0**. The 12 records coded **j** are:

Title 4 : Through the looking glass  
 Title 24[rec 24] : Yankee named Blueberry  
 Title 50[rec 46] : Willow; the official...  
 Title 107[rec 92] : Heroes of the equinox  
 Title 109 : World without stars  
 Title 153 : Enchanted apples of Oz  
 Title 87 : The hunger dogs  
 Title 136 : The adventures of Tom Sawyer  
 Title 161 : Dr. Jeckel & Mr. Hyde  
 Title 67 : Count of Monte Cristo  
 Title 95 : Call of the wild  
 Title 135[rec 295]: Elfquest

There are other ways to determine if a work is considered juvenile. The presence of a 520 field is rare in fiction cataloging, with the exception of childrens material.<sup>1</sup> This is often seen with the 650 field having a second indicator value of 1.<sup>2</sup> There are seven records with a 520 field. Seven records also have a 650 field, with five of those records having a 1 in -----

<sup>1</sup>.The 520 field **Summary, Abstract, or Annotation Note** is optional cataloging.

<sup>2</sup>.A 1 in the second indicator value of the 6xx field **Subject Added Entries** stands for **LC Subject Heading for Children's Literature, or Annotated Card Program (AC)**.

the second indicator. Only six records have the 520 field and a 650 field together. This leads to a conclusion that the OCLC j code and the Library of Congress's Annotated Card Program are not closely linked by catalogers for graphic novels.

The fact that only twelve records were coded j indicates that graphic novels are not automatically treated as juvenile works by the catalogers.

TABLE 6 Translated		
	Number of Records	Percent
YES	73	24.4%
NO	226	75.6%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

Other countries and cultures have been creating graphic novels longer than the U.S.A. Popular and successful graphic novels in one county usually are considered prime candidates for publication in another. It, therefore it should not be surprising that a number of graphic novels in this country are translations. The cataloging records, unfortunately, do not always note this.

Table 6 was constructed by using the cataloging records, the actual graphic novel, discussions with comic book dealers, and references in texts.<sup>1</sup> Therefore consider that at least 24.4% of the records were translated.

AACR2 allows the translator to be listed in the statement of responsibility, but often consider added entries to be superfluous.<sup>2</sup> A contract with God by Will Eisner is a good example..<sup>3</sup> The OCLC 041 **Languages** field is required cataloging.

-----

<sup>1</sup>.Table 9 was formed the same way.

<sup>2</sup>.AACR2 rule 21.30K **Translators**. Note that graphic novels do not fit many of the conditions necessary for translator added entries.

<sup>3</sup>.This is discussed with TABLE 1.

An indicator of 1 indicates that the work is a translation or includes a translation.

Classification numbers for translations normally follow the original text, but this is true only if the cataloger knows the work is a translation, and knows in what language/country the work was originally published. A look at Table 7A and 7A1 shows some flexibility with this practice.

Michigan State University shelves "comic book which are or may be translations, with the publications of the country in which they are published."<sup>1</sup> This allows translations of Batman graphic novels to be classified by language, but "Collections of comic strips in book form, even if they are translated, are shelved with the language they originated with..."<sup>2</sup> Books are felt to be less ambiguous.

---

<sup>1</sup>•Scott, Comics Librarianship, 86.

<sup>2</sup>•ibid.

TABLE 7A LC number		
LC number	Number of Records	Percent
no number	43	14.4%
D 810	1	0.3%
F1436	2	.7%
NC1499	4	1.3%
NC1599	1	.3%
PN1997	1	.3%
<u>PN6725-6728</u>	154	51.1%
<u>PN6737</u>	3	1.0%
<u>PN6745-6748</u>	36	12.0%
<u>PN6765-6768</u>	10	3.3%
<u>PN6775-6778</u>	2	.7%
PN6790	10	3.3%
<u>PQ 1-3999</u>	7	2.1%
PQ4876	1	.3%
PQ7798	1	.3%
<u>PR 1-9680</u>	5	1.7%
<u>PS 1-3576</u>	16	7.0%
PT2673	1	.3%
PZ 10	1	.3%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 7A1 LC number if known translation		
LC number	Number of Records	Percent
no number	11	15.1%
NC1499	1	1.4%
NC1599	1	1.4%
PN1997	1	1.4%
<u>PN6725-6728</u>	11	15.0%
<u>PN6737</u>	2	2.7%
<u>PN6745-6748</u>	24	32.8%
<u>PN6765-6768</u>	7	9.6%
<u>PN6775-6778</u>	2	2.8%
PN6790	6	8.2%
<u>PQ 1-3999</u>	3	4.2%
PQ7798	1	1.4%
<u>PS 1-3576</u>	2	2.7%
PT2673	1	.3%
TOTAL	73	100.0%

TABLE 7B LC classification		
LC classification	Number of Records	Percent
no number	43	14.4%
History	1	0.3%
U.S.(local)	2	.7%
Fine Arts	5	1.7%
Drama	1	.3%
Comic Books	215	71.9%
Literature	31	10.4%
Juvenile	1	0.3%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 7B1 LC classification (if fiction)		
LC classification	Number of Records	Percent
no number	20	10.6%
History	0	0.0%
U.S.(local)	0	0.0%
Fine Arts	2	1.1%
Drama	0	0.0%
Comic Books	138	73.0%
Literature	28	14.8%
Juvenile	1	0.5%
TOTAL	189	100.0%

Table 7B1 represents the LC classification for the **F** in the OCLC fixed field coded 1, which represents fiction. See Table 4 for more information about **M/F/B**.

Library of Congress classification

- D History: General and Old World
  - D 204-849 Modern history
    - D 731-838 World War II
    - D 810 TITLE #162[REC 195]
- F United States(Local) and America except the United States
  - F 1421-1577 Central America
    - TITLE #16[REC 20,21]
- N Fine Arts
  - NC Drawing. Design. Illustration
    - NC 1300-1766 Pictorial humor, caricature, etc.
    - NC 1490-1499 France
      - NC 1499 Special artists
        - TITLE #58[REC 180,181,183,] #59[REC 185]
    - NC 1590-1599 Denmark
      - NC 1599 Special artists
        - TITLE #58[REC 182]
- PN 1-6790 LITERATURE (General)
  - PN 1600-3307 Drama
    - PN 1993-1999 Motion pictures
      - PN 1997-1997.85 Plays, scenarios, etc.
        - TITLE #189[REC 189]
  - PN 6010-6790 Collections of general literature
    - PN 6700-6790 Comic books, strips, etc.
      - PN 6725-6728 United States
        - PN 6726 Collections
          - PN 6727 Individual authors or works, A-Z
          - PN 6728 Individual comic strips. By title, A-Z.
      - PN 6735-6738 Great Britain
        - PN 6737 Individual authors or works, A-Z
      - PN 6745-6748 France
        - PN 6747 Individual authors or works, A-Z
        - PN 6748 Individual comic strips, By title, A-Z
      - PN 6765-6768 Italy
        - PN 6767 Individual authors or works, A-Z
        - PN 6768 Individual comic strips, By title, A-Z
      - PN 6775-6778 Spain
        - PN 6777 Individual authors or works, A-Z
        - PN 6778 Individual comic strips, By title, A-Z
      - PN 6790 Other regions or countries, A-Z
- PQ 1-3999 French literature
  - PQ 1600-2651 Modern literature, Individual authors
    - PQ 2149-2551 19th century 1901-1960
    - PQ 2660-2686 1961- .A-Z
  - PQ 3801-3999 Provincial, local, colonial, etc.
- PQ 4001-5991 Italian literature
  - PQ 4860-4886 Individual authors, 1961-
- PQ 6001-8999 Spanish literature
  - PQ 7000-8921 Provincial, local, colonial, etc.

- PQ 7020-8921 Outside of Spain
  - PQ 7071-8560 America
    - PQ 7081-8560 Spanish America
      - PQ 7551-8549 South America
        - PQ 7600-7798 Argentine Republic
          - PQ 7798 Individual authors, 1961- .A-Z
- PR 1-9680 English literature
  - PR 3991-5990 19th century, 1770/1800-1890/1900
  - PR 6050-6076 1961-
- PS 1-3576 American literature
  - PS 700-3576 Individual authors
    - PS 700-3390 19th century
    - PS 3500-3549 1900-1960
    - PS 3550-3576 1961-
- PT 1-4897 German literature
  - PT 1501-2688 Individual authors and works
    - PT 2660-2688 1961-
      - Title 100
- PZ 1-90 Fiction and Juvenile belles lettres
  - PZ 5-90 Juvenile belles lettres
    - PZ 10 Science and industry
      - (PZ 10 no longer used.)
      - Title 95

Most of the graphic novels are classed in Literature (LC classification P) with 82.2% of the records. The percentage drops when comic books are separated from national literature. The majority of graphic novels are classed under "Comic books, strips, etc." with 71.9% of the records. There are several reasons for this. First of all, the illustrative nature of graphic novels makes it a simplistic choice. Secondly, the closest analogy to a graphic novel is "Comic books, strips, etc." Thirdly, the larger size of many graphic novels makes it hard to fit them in fiction shelves.

Title 162[rec 195], Maus is the only one to be classed as History in both LC classification(D 810) and Dewey(940). None of the other records for this title have LC classifications, but two

are classed in 741(Dewey) and one in 940(Dewey). A look at Table #16 shows that record 195 has 641 holdings, indicating not only the popularity of the title, but satisfaction with this cataloging record.

Title 58, Barbarella, has three records in Fine Arts and one record in Comic books. Another title by the same author is Title 59, Barbarella, the Moon Child. This has one record in Fine Arts and two records in Comic books. One record in Comic books is cuttered by title and another for the author. All records for both titles are in the classification for France. The exception is for Title 58, record 182, which has the work listed in Fine Arts under Denmark.

Since his inception, Batman has had numerous comic books, authors, writers, artists and graphic novels. Seven of the graphic novels are Titles 8, 112, 113, 122, 131, 163 and 164. The seven titles have 13 records. Seven Batman records have a Dewey number of 741. Eight Batman records have an LC classification number of PN6728, which is classed by title. In the PN6727-PN6728 range 105 records are classed by author and 48 records by title.

A look at Table 7A1 shows that most translations are not classed with U.S.A. comic books. The percentage drops from 51.1% in the general population to 15%. Classification for French comic books rises from 12% in the general population to 32.8%. Comparing Table 7B with Table 7B1 shows that about the same percentage of records are classed with comic books This shows that many catalogers consider the illustrations more important than the literature (fiction) aspect of graphic novels in

determining classification.

"Comic books, strips, etc." is too broad a heading for graphic novel classification. A search of the shelves under PN6727-PN6728 will not find graphic novels in one location, which is a disservice to the "novel" aspect of the works. The probability the Library of Congress will overhaul "Comic books, strips, etc." from a classification standpoint is not likely. Changing computer records is much easier and cheaper than retrospectively changing class numbers on the shelves.

The pattern is to allow a range of three for each countries classification for "Comic books, strips, etc.". This does not allow much hidden space for a new number for "graphic novels". Yet, without this, patrons will not be able to find them classed together on the shelf.

TABLE 8 DEWEY number		
Dewey number	Number of Records	Percent
no number	226	75.6%
303	1	0.3%
741	63	21.1%
791	1	.3%
813	4	1.3%
823	1	.3%
843	1	.3%
940	2	.7%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 8A DEWEY number when the F in M/F/B is 1 (FICTION)		
Dewey number	Number of Records	Percent
no number	177	93.7%
741	6	3.2%
813	4	2.1%
823	1	.5%
843	1	.5%
TOTAL	189	100.0%

See Table 4 for a fuller explanation of the fiction code.

Dewey Decimal Classification, edition 20

300 Social Sciences

303 Social Processes

700 The arts

740 Drawing & Decorative arts

741 Drawing and Drawings

741.5 Cartoon, caricatures, comics

790 Recreational & performing arts

791 Public performances

(other than musical, sport, game performances)

800 Literature & rhetoric

810 American literature in English

813 Fiction

820 English & Old English literatures

823 English fiction

840 Literatures of Romance languages

843 French fiction

900 Geography and history

940 General history of Europe

Dewey 303 is Title 16[rec 20] Brought to light F1436  
Dewey 791 is Title 66[rec 250] Alien...  
Dewey 813 is Title 133[rec 117] Love shots  
Dewey 813 is Title 148[rec 125] The silver metal lover  
Dewey 813 is Title 135[rec 295] Elfquest PS3566  
Dewey 813 is Title 2[rec 5] Thieves World... PS3551  
Dewey 823 is Title 61[rec 278] Great expectations  
Dewey 843 is Title 30[rec 298] The hunting party  
Dewey 940 is Title 162[rec 198] Maus...  
Dewey 940 is Title 162[rec 195] Maus... D 810

Dewey numbers are not usually given to fiction with the exception of literature. Only 24.4% of the graphic novel records received a Dewey number. Of these records, 21.1% were for "Comic books, strips, etc.". This leaves only 3.3% of the records in a Dewey classification that addresses the content, rather than the form.

There are two interpretations for the 75.6% of the records without a Dewey number. The first is that graphic novels are considered fiction and are not assigned a number. The second,

and more likely is that many libraries classify in LC and not in Dewey. Dewey libraries are more likely to be smaller and public and often do not have the funds to catalog on OCLC.

One solution would be for Dewey to add a special subdivision to 741.5 for graphic novels which would allow them to be shelved together. Graphic novels are often quite slim, which leaves little spine space for a classification number. Putting them in fiction will require a number to be put in oversize shelving since many are larger than traditional fiction hardcovers.

TABLE 9 Other Form		
	Number of Records	Percent
YES	127	42.5%
NO	172	57.5%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

The graphic novel can be conceived and created as one single work though many have a prior history in another form. A cataloger should transcribe this history for the material to be cataloged, but many graphic novels lack bibliographic information.<sup>1</sup> The "Marvel Graphic Novel" series, with over 40 different titles published often illustrates this lack.<sup>2</sup> All four examples are either based on or continue a comic book title. For example, Title 33 is considered to be the prologue for the successful "The New Mutants" comic book. Title 157 is designed to fit between two issues of the comic book "Dazzler". This is not information available on the item or catalog record.

In terms of publishing history we see that; the graphic novel can be an adaptation of a book or movie<sup>3</sup>, be originally published as a multivolume work (comic book mini-series)<sup>4</sup>, be a  
-----

<sup>1</sup>.Table 9 resulted from information from the OCLC catalog record as well as other sources. Consider at least 42.5% of the records have a prior history in another form.

<sup>2</sup>.i.e. Titles 33,97,157,165, etc.

<sup>3</sup>.i.e. Title 95, The call of the wild or Title 50, Willow: the official comics....

<sup>4</sup>.i.e. Title 60, Black Orchid or Title 112, Batman : the dark knight returns.

reprint of a few issues of a comic book<sup>1</sup>, or for each episode of the graphic novel being published as a serialization in a magazine<sup>2</sup>.

Ideally, each cataloging record should give this background. In practical terms, this means entries in the NOTES with subsequent added entries. The lack of indexes for graphic novels leaves the cataloging record as a vital source of information regarding the history of the graphic novel.

A look at Title 173, Conan of the Isles underscores some of the problems. Conan was created by Robert E. Howard, who committed suicide after writing 17 Conan stories. Conan's immense popularity brought many other authors to continue the Conan saga. One is Conan of the Isles by L. Sprague DeCamp and Lin Carter which was adapted into two issues of the comic book Conan the barbarian (1982?). This was reprinted as a "Marvel Graphic Novel". In order to effectively catalog it, the cataloger added two 500 fields: "Featuring the character created by Robert E. Howard." and "Adapted from the novel Conan of the isles by L. Sprague DeCamp and Lin Carter." in order to give added entries. The patron now knows that the graphic novel is based on the book. The graphic novel has no mention of its earlier existence as part of Conan the barbarian in the graphic novel itself.

-----

1.i.e. Title 173, Conan of the isles.

2.i.e. Title 58, Barbarella or Title 120, Moebius: the collected fantasies....

TABLE 10 "Graphic Novel" mentioned in ...		
	Number of Records	Percent
TITLE	2	2.4%
NOTES	10	11.8%
SERIES	76	89.4%
TOTAL	85	103.6% <sup>1</sup>

Authors, publishers and catalogers are interested in bringing out the form of the work. This allows the buyer or patron to find it easier. Since graphic novels are an emerging form, one would expect the word "graphic novel" to be prominent. Publishers can indicate this by title, jacket blurbs or series titles. Catalogers can indicate this by notes or subject headings.

There are 299 graphic novel records in this paper, of these, only 85 have the word "graphic novels" in the OCLC record. Title 6, Robotech, the graphic novel and Title 182, The Southern Knights graphic novel are the only records with "graphic novel" in the titles. Title 6 is based on an immensely popular Japanese animated TV show which spun off into American takeoffs. The graphic novel is considered a prologue to the TV show and takeoffs. Title 182, which reprints the comic book, has an OCLC 500 field note in order to bring out a cover title. The word "graphic novel" appears seven times in the cover, blurb, and -----

<sup>1</sup>."graphic novels" appeared in both Title & Notes for one record and in Notes & Series for two records.

forward of the book.<sup>1</sup> Later reprints, Title 181, change the title to Early days of the Southern Knights and eventually drops using "graphic novels" in describing itself.

There are ten records that have the word "graphic novel" in a 5xx OCLC field(Notes). The notes, in part, are; "a color compilation of the first 3 Thieves World graphic novels", "a badger graphic novel", "graphic novels based on...", "at head of title ... graphic novel", "on cover : 'The ... graphic novel'", "'... computer generated graphic novel'--cover", "First Graphic novel". Four of the records are DLC generated. This does help to bring out the form of the work. Without a legitimate subject heading for graphic novels inclusion of the term in a 5xx field would significantly help in the accuracy of the cataloging record.

There are 76 uses of the term in series statements. The most prolific series is Marvel Graphic Novel. Unfortunately for catalogers and readers, this series is not always known for heavy use of forwards, blurbs, biographies, CIP, provenance or other useful items. The series has published over 40 titles. Many other comic book publishers are printing their own graphic novel series, however, without knowing the name of the series, retrieval is difficult. Boolean searching of series names is not possible with all on line catalogues.

As of now, the evidence is that the word "graphic novel" is more likely to be listed in series instead of in title or notes.

-----  
<sup>1</sup>. Henry Vogel & Butch Guice, The Southern Knights, the graphic novel (New York , N.Y. : Fictioneer, 1986).

TABLE 11 Number of Subject Headings		
Number of SH	Number of Records	Percent
0	188	62.9%
1	73	24.4%
2	26	8.7%
3	7	2.3%
4	2	.7%
5	0	.0%
6	3	1.0%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 11A Number of Subject Headings not visual in type <sup>1</sup>		
Number of SH not visual	Number of Records	Percent
0	89	80.2%
1	10	9.0%
2	8	7.2%
3	3	2.7%
4	1	.9%
TOTAL	111	100.0%

-----  
<sup>1</sup>.i.e. does not have "Comic books, strips, etc.".

TABLE 11B Number of Subject Headings When F in M/F/B is 1(fiction)		
Number of SH not visual	Number of Records	Percent
0	132	69.8%
1	43	22.8%
2	11	5.8%
3	2	1.1%
4	1	.5%
TOTAL	189	100.0%

See Table 4 for a fuller explanation of M/F/B.

6 Subject Headings: Title 16[rec 20] Brought to light  
6 Subject Headings: Title 16[rec 21] Brought to light  
6 Subject Headings: Title 46[rec 50] Conquering armies  
4 Subject Headings: Title 50[rec 45] Willow...  
4 Subject Headings: Title 158[rec 280] Moby Dick

The Library of Congress does not assign many subject headings to works of fiction. This can be evidence that graphic novels are considered fiction since 62.9% of the records do not have subject headings. There are 172 subject headings with 77.3% of them having "Comic books, strips, etc". This drops to 43.6% if the work is considered fiction.<sup>1</sup> Only 22.7% of the subject headings do not have "Comic books, strips, etc".

Along with the classification number, this is an overworked designation. "Comic books, strips, etc." is simply too broad a subject heading. Graphic novels need a "Graphic novel" subject heading. There is strong precedence for creating a form based  
-----

<sup>1</sup>.Table 11B.

subject heading of this type.

Fotonovelas are a form of the novel. As Scott puts it;

Fotonovelas are an important medium in Latin America, as well as in France and the rest of Mediterranean Europe and North Africa. Fotonovelas appear and are produced similarly to comic books, except the word balloons are pasted on photographs rather than included in drawings. Actors and actresses can build reputations by appearing in fotonovelas, and it is not uncommon for popular singers or other celebrities to appear as guest stars.<sup>1</sup>

The legitimacy of the form has caused the Library of Congress to adopt it as a subject heading

**Fotonovela** (May Subd Geog)  
UF Fotoromanzo  
Photo novels  
Photoroman  
BT Comic books, strips, etc.  
Popular literature  
Stories without words<sup>2</sup>

A similar subject heading for graphic novels might look something like this;

**Graphic novels** (May Subd Geog)  
UF Comic book novels  
BT Comic books, strips, etc.  
Popular literature  
Stories without words

This will allow a subject heading for graphic novels considered fiction by the cataloger. Otherwise its use as a free-floating subdivision would be more appropriate.

---

<sup>1</sup>. Scott, Comics Librarianship, 113.

<sup>2</sup>. Library of Congress Subject Headings 13th ed.

TABLE 12 Total number of people responsible		
Number Responsible	Number of Records	Percent
0	1	.3%
1	66	22.1%
2	81	27.1%
3	65	21.7%
4	37	12.4%
5	23	7.7%
6	10	3.3%
7	10	3.3%
8	2	.7%
9	3	1.0%
10	0	0.0%
11	0	0.0%
12	1	.3%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 13 Are all "role's" indicated		
	Number of Records	Percent
YES	173	57.9%
NO	126	42.1%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

TABLE 14 Total number of people traced		
Number Traced	Number of Records	Percent
0	1	.3%
1	86	28.8%
2	120	40.1%
3	69	23.1%
4	18	6.0%
5	4	1.3%
6	0	0.0%
7	1	.3%
TOTAL	299	100.0%

There are 871 people responsible for the 299 records. This is an average of 2.9 people mentioned in each cataloging record. The number traced (main entry and added entries) drops to only 632 individuals. This leads to only 2.1 people traced per record.

Some catalogers only put in the statement of responsibility those entries that will receive added entries. Any look at the graphic novels indicates that this is occurring to some degree with many of the cataloging records. Title 112, Batman: the dark knight returns has eighteen individuals playing different roles. One record lists six individuals and traces five. Three records list five individuals and traces one, three or four respectively. One record lists three individuals and traces three.

Roles are important. An artist contributes more to the work than a letterer or an inker. Cataloging records that do not list the roles for each individual make interpreting the record harder. Table 13 indicates that 42.1% of the records either have no roles listed or leave out some. If AACR2 increases the number of roles that should be traced, cataloging records with the fuller lists will be easier to modify if retrospective cataloging takes place.

TABLE 15 Mentioned in record, but not traced		
	Number of Records	Percent
Orig. Author	7	6.7%
Writer	3	2.9%
Artist	42	40.4%
Letterer	41	39.4%
Editor	25	24.0%
Translator	34	32.7%
Other	38	36.5%
TOTAL	104	182.6%

Many records have more than one role not traced.

Table 15 is based on questions #20-#26 of the coding form.

Orig. Author stands for Original Author of the work the graphic novel is based on. AACR2 rule 21.12

Writer includes Writer/Adapter AACR2 rule 21.30C

Artist includes Colorist/illustrator/painter/artist Rule 21.30K2

Letterer includes Calligrapher/letterer

Other stands for a role not listed above

AACR2 rules regarding "works that are modifications of other works" are Rule 21.9-21.23. Rule 21.9 keeps the same main entry if "... the modification is an updating, rearrangement, abridgment, or revision where the original person or body is still represented as being responsible". Rule 21.10 has the main entry under the adapter. This has the same effect as Rule 21.16A which has the main entry under the adapter if an "Art work" is adapted from one medium to another. Rule 21.11 has the main entry under author if a work is illustrated. Rule 21.24 says that in collaborative efforts between an artist and a writer,

rather than an artist's illustration of a writer's text, main entry is under the one named first.

To summarize, there should be added entries for the original author, writer and artist. A number of graphic novels use the term "illustrator" instead of artist. Rule 21.30K2 makes added entries for illustrators only if "the illustrations occupy half or more of the item" or "the illustrations are considered to be an important feature of the work". The illustrations in most if not all graphic novels consist of more than half the item and are an indispensable part of the form.

Translators would not be traced in many graphic novels according to rule 21.30K1. Editors receive added entries except for editors of a series (rule 21.30D). The expected outcome for Table 15 would be that original author, writer and artist would be heavily traced. The large number of artists not traced came as a surprise. A closer role of the coding name of "Artist's" has a role of "Colorist/Color" that received few added entries. There are 42 records in "Artist" with 36 of them belong to "Colorist". This leaves eight records or 7.7% of the illustrators, painters, or artists without added entries.

Some of the roles in the "Other" list are; cover, introduction, as told to, assistant, designer, with special thanks, art director, creator, creator of character, based on series created by, production assistant, a cura de, film by, title designer, Stan Lee presents..., commentary, afterwards, etc. Even in a less cluttered medium, some of these roles would still not get an added entry.

Graphic novels suffer several barriers to person added entries. The statement of responsibility and notes in the OCLC record is often edited from the graphic novel. Added entries are not made for all of the individuals in the statement of responsibility and roles that are not expressly mentioned in AACR2 are often ignored.

On line systems allow an expansion of access points. A separate catalog card does not have to be produced for each added entry. Even if extra added entries are not made for the plethora of roles, listing people and roles in the statement of responsibility of the notes allows boolean searching. Therefore, a cataloging record for OCLC should be as complete as possible; member libraries can always delete information for their on line systems.

TABLE 16  
Holdings records

Holdings on OCLC	Number of Records	Percent	Total Holdings	Percent
1	78	26.1%	78	2.3%
2	59	19.7%	118	3.4%
3	41	13.7%	123	3.6%
4	21	7.0%	84	2.5%
5	16	5.4%	80	2.3%
6	14	4.7%	84	2.5%
7	6	2.0%	42	1.2%
8	2	.7%	16	.5%
9	4	1.3%	36	1.0%
10	4	1.3%	40	1.2%
11	1	.3%	11	.3%
12	1	.3%	12	.4%
13	5	1.7%	65	1.9%
14	2	.7%	28	.8%
15	1	.3%	15	.4%
16	2	.7%	32	.9%
17	3	1.0%	51	1.5%
18	4	1.3%	72	2.1%
20	2	.7%	40	1.2%
23	3	1.0%	69	2.0%
24	1	.3%	24	.7%
25	2	.7%	50	1.5%
28	1	.3%	28	.8%
30	1	.3%	30	.9%
31	1	.3%	31	.9%
32	3	1.0%	69	2.8%
33	1	0.3%	33	1.0%
35	1	.3%	35	1.1%
36	1	.3%	36	1.1%
37	2	.7%	74	2.2%
38	2	.7%	76	2.2%
39	1	1.3%	39	1.1%
40	1	1.3%	40	1.1%
50	1	.3%	50	1.5%
57	1	.3%	57	1.7%
64	1	.3%	64	1.9%
73	1	.3%	73	2.1%
75	1	.3%	75	2.2%
76	1	.3%	76	2.2%
118	1	.3%	118	3.5%
138	1	.3%	138	4.0%
139	1	.3%	139	4.1%
147	1	.3%	147	4.3%
150	1	.3%	150	4.4%
641	1	.3%	641	18.8%
TOTAL	299	100.0%	3416	100.0%

There are a total of 3416 holding records for only 191 titles. This is impressive when considering that graphic novels are mostly works of fiction, are similar in looks to comic books, and are not always easy to catalog correctly. The six graphic novels with individual record holdings of over 100 are:

Title 162[rec 195]	<u>Maus...</u>	641 holdings
Title 112[rec 202]	<u>Batman: the dark ...</u>	150 holdings
Title 20[rec 272]	<u>The man of steel</u>	147 holdings
Title 113[rec 99]	<u>Batman: year one</u>	139 holdings
Title 135[rec 295]	<u>Elfquest</u>	138 holdings
Title 189[rec 190]	<u>Steven King's creepshow</u>	118 holdings

Maus... has the most holdings. It is also the most talked about graphic novel in literary circles. Batman: the dark knight returns revived and changed the treatment of Batman by DC comics. The man of steel continues the saga of Superman. Elfquest along with Cerebus and Teenage mutant ninja turtles launched the publishing of black and white comics. Steven King is one of the more popular and bankable authors publishing in fiction.

Since the OCLC records were downloaded, the holding records must be growing. The list and ranking of the records can therefore change. Cataloging records on OCLC are subject to revision and change. This is true of member records as well as DLC copy.

## CONCLUSION

Graphic novels are a blending of words and art. The illustrations in a graphic novel bear the same relationship to the text that a film carries to its screenplay. A concise definition that satisfies all conditions is as probable as a definition of the novel that fits all cases. The forces that restrict comic books and other related formats in the United States is waning. The increasingly international aspect of OCLC will result in more overseas cataloging of graphic novels.

There are several conclusions that can be drawn from the graphic novels in this study.

- 1) Many are considered fiction.<sup>1</sup>
- 2) They are not automatically considered juvenile works.<sup>2</sup>
- 3) At least 24.4% are translations.<sup>3</sup>
- 4) Most are classed with comic books, many by author.<sup>4</sup>
- 5) At least 42.5% existed as an earlier, other format.<sup>5</sup>
- 6) "Graphic novel" appears in 28% of the records, mostly in a series statement.<sup>6</sup>

-----

1. Table 4.
2. Table 5.
3. Table 6.
4. Table 7.
5. Table 9.
6. Table 10.

- 7) Only 37.1% of the records have subject headings, most for "Comic books, strips, etc."<sup>1</sup>
- 8) Cataloging records list on average 2.9 people per record but trace only 2.1 people per record.<sup>2</sup>
- 9) Added entries are often provided for roles listed in AACR2, but often are not provided for roles not listed.<sup>3</sup>

This is an indication that there are inconsistencies in the cataloging of graphic novels. In order to standardize the records, a number of recommendations can be made on the cataloging of graphic novels.

- 1) **chiefly ill.** should be used in the physical description field.
- 2) A subject heading **Graphic Novels** should be used locally until the Library of Congress adopts one.
- 3) Libraries might want to class graphic novels together in a local addendum to "Comic books, strips, etc." or in a special section of fiction books, but it is not likely that the Library of Congress will.
- 3) More individuals and roles should be listed in the statement of responsibility or notes.

The main recommendation is the use of a **Graphic Novel** subject heading, based on the similar subject heading **Fotonovelas**. It should be a Form subject heading only in the absence of other subject headings, otherwise its use as a Free-Floating subdivision would be more appropriate. Failing that, include graphic novels in the notes.

-----

1. Table 11 and Table 11A.
2. Table 12 and Table 14.
3. Table 15.

## APPENDIX

### GRAPHIC NOVEL TITLES USED FOR ANALYSIS

All titles are from Bowling Green State University's locally assigned subject heading of "Graphic Novels". The list was obtained in October of 1990. These titles were then searched against OCLC records and downloaded. There are 191 titles, with 299 OCLC records. Different OCLC records for the same title can have variant main entries or other inconsistencies. For this reason, the format mostly follows BGSU's main entry.

There are more graphic novels than the 191 searched here, however BGSU has the largest known list compiled using a single definition.

#### FORMAT of record

Title number  
Main Entry (OCLC 100 tag)  
Title (OCLC 245 tag)  
Record number/OCLC number (all records from OCLC Books  
Format unless otherwise indicated)

---

001

Aragones, Sergio  
The Death of Groo  
001/18107740

002

Asprin, Rober -  
Thieves' World graphics  
002/12420420  
003/13215151  
004/16679046  
005/12555172  
006/16679028  
007/15790879  
286/13817634 SERIES RECORD

003

Bagge, Peter  
The Best of Neat Stuff  
008/19617961

004

Baker, Kyle  
Through the Looking Glass  
009/21115846

005

Baron, Mike  
Hexbreaker  
010/18424135

006

Baron, Mike  
Robotech, The Graphic Novel  
237/14928262

007

Baron, Mike  
The World of Ginger Fox  
011/16470978

008

Barr, Mike W.  
Batman, son of the Demon  
014/18107744

009

Barreiro, Ricardo  
Moving Fortress  
012/20075578

010

Bates, Cary  
Nightwings: a graphic adaptation  
013/13668016

011

Beautemps, Andre  
Michael Logan  
254/17281150

012

-----  
Beowulf  
215/11084125

013

Bilal, Enki  
The Woman Trap  
015/19096863  
016/22069302

.

014

Bloch, Robert, 1917-  
Hell on Earth  
211/12869114  
212/13794064

015  
Boucq, Francois  
Pioneers of the human adventure  
017/21129448  
018/17179750  
019/20973505

016  
-----  
Brought to light  
020/18741555  
021/22227602

017  
Brunner, Frank  
Frank Brunner's Seven Samuroid  
022/12151608

018  
Busch, Jeffrey  
Rip Van Winkle  
283/22447206

019  
Byrne, John  
The Earth Stealers  
023/18062384

020  
Byrne, John  
The Man of Steel  
270/14262465  
271/17614286  
272/17399178

021  
Caza  
Escape from suburbia  
238/16931291

022  
Charlier, Jean-Michel  
Bluberry's secret  
027/20653187

023  
Charlier, Jean-Michel  
The Man With the Silver star  
239/11503105

024  
Charlier, Jean-Michel  
A Yankee named Bluberry  
024/13011502  
025/21565961  
026/15843126

025  
Charyn, Jerome  
The Magician's wife  
028/18286450  
029/18260965  
030/17181617

026  
Chaykin, Howard  
Blackhawk  
031/17868778

027  
Chaykin, Howard  
The swords of heaven  
217/6176819

028  
Chaykin, Howard  
Time<sup>2</sup>, the epiphany  
032/15546925

029  
Chaykin, Howard  
Time<sup>2</sup>, the satisfaction of Black Mariah  
033/18326261

030  
Christin, Pierre  
The hunting party  
298/21415441  
299/11638840

031  
Christin, Pierre  
The Ranks of the Black Order  
034/20493787  
035/11638654

032  
Claremont, Christopher  
Marada the she-wolf  
036/13410047

033  
Claremont, Chris  
The new mutants  
242/11511396

034  
Claremont, Chris  
Stan Lee presents the Uncanny X-Men: Days of Future Past  
037/20653173

035  
Claremont, Chris  
X-Men : God loves, man kills  
245/11511344

036  
Cockrum, Dave, 1943-  
The Futurians  
219/11488608  
220/17884394

037  
Colon, Ernie  
The Medusa chain: a graphic novel  
232/11726737  
233/11511453

038  
Corben, Richard  
Richard Corben's Never Where  
191/4059624  
192/11854611

039  
Cover, Arthur Byron  
Space Clusters  
038/14636571

040  
-----  
Crossroads  
039/18397170

041  
Cunningham, Dennis  
Tales from the plague  
040/15554094

042  
DeFalco, Tom  
The saga of the alien costume  
041/18980095

043  
DeMatteis, J. M.  
Doctor Strange--Into Shamballa  
042/14470739

044  
DeMatteis, J. M.  
Greenberg the Vampire  
043/13104300

045  
DeMatteis, J. M.  
Moonshadow  
044/20625879

046  
Dionnet  
Conquering Armies  
249/4473275

047  
Drake, Stan  
The Million dolar hit  
226/11688981  
227/18436387

048  
Drake, Stan  
One, two, three... die!  
225/10352721

049  
Duffy, Jo  
The Punisher in assassin's Guild  
048/19478800

050  
Duffy, Jo  
Willow: the official comics...  
045/18517897  
046/18118301  
047/18883562

051  
Dumas  
L'heritier de Rochemont  
049/20106501

052  
Durand, Rene, 1948-  
Operation chisteras  
050/18660615

053  
Eastman, Kevin B.  
Teenage Mutant ninja turtles  
051/15309328

054

Eisner, Will

A Contract With God

169/11450019

170/11560301

171/11486195

172/11450840

173/11450823

174/11419701

175/14155521

176/05376616

177/16527630

178/20695642

179/11450828

055

Eisner, Will

Will Eisner's The Dreamer

235/15554328

056

Feiffer, Jules

Feiffer, the collected works

052/21170225

053/22170584

057

Ferrer, Miguel

The dreamwalker

054/21170218

058

Forest, Jean Claude

Barbarella

180/9787387

181/2793748

182/19297317

183/13203880

184/17724940

059

Forest, Jean Claude

Barbarella, the moon child

185/4824213

186/5961742

187/15922130

060

Gaiman, Neil

Black Orchid

287/20666804 SERIES RECORD

061  
Geary, Rick  
Great Expectations  
278/21217951

062  
Geary, Rick  
Wuthering Heights  
284/22447193

063  
Gerber, Steve, 1947  
Void indigo  
224/11488634

064  
Glanzman, Sam  
A sailor's story  
055/18038947

065  
Goines, Donald, 1937-1974  
Daddy Cool  
230/12685086

066  
Goodwin, Archie  
Alien: the illustrated story  
250/5216143

067  
Grant, Steven, 1953-  
The Count of Monte Cristo  
285/21888022

068  
Grant, Steven, 1953-  
Hamlet  
281/21923421

069  
Grant, Steven, 1953-  
The Island of Dr. Moreau  
282/22447231

070  
Grant, Steven  
Twilight Man  
059/20575682

071  
Grell, Mike  
Green Arrow: the longbow hunters  
057/17288213  
058/20495553

072  
Hamme, Van, 1939  
Thorgal, the archers  
056/15163300

073  
Hampton, Scott  
Pigeons from hell  
060/20173468

074  
Harras, Bob  
Nick Fury vs. S.H.I.E.L.D.  
061/20666692

075  
Hedden, Rich  
Framed  
062/19488118

076  
Herman  
The survivors  
223/11429764  
253/17281146

077  
Homer  
Ulysses  
246/4635859  
247/18056353  
248/15782017

078  
Hudnall, James D.  
Lex Luthor: the unauthorized biography  
063/20534211

079  
Ibarrola, Jose  
Orphee: d'apres l'opera de Claudio Monteverdi  
252/17281144

080  
Jacobs, Edgar P.  
The Time Trap  
064/20625907  
065/20666707  
066/20678085  
067/17743752

081  
 Janson, Klaus  
 Frost and Fire  
 068/13702553

082  
 Jippes, Daan  
 Who Framed Roger Rabbit  
 069/19694207

083  
 Jodorowsky, Alexandro  
 The Incal  
 070/19048156  
 071/11652965  
 072/11652952

084  
 Jones, Bruce  
 Arena  
 073/20443939

085  
 Jones, Bruce  
 Silverheels  
 074/18039030

086  
 Jones, Bruce  
 Somerset Holmes  
 075/16569891  
 076/20702893

087  
 Kirby, Jack  
 The Hunger Dogs  
 193/11853762

088  
 Kirby, Jack  
 La Legion de la terreur  
 077/10585738

089  
 Kozure Okami  
 Lone wolf and cub  
 079/19738371  
 288/17052067 SERIES RECORD

090  
 Lawrence, Don  
 Storm  
 255/17281160  
 256/18040439

091  
Layton, Bob  
Hercules, prince of power  
078/18660467

092  
Lee, Elaine  
Starstruck: the Luckless, the abandoned and the forsaked  
080/12810094

093  
Leloup, Roger  
The Three suns of Vina  
081/21170261  
082/22485582

094  
Lob, Jacques  
Candice at sea  
083/4618729

095  
London, Jack, 1876-1916  
The Call of the Wild  
279/22192388

096  
McGregor, Don  
Detectives Inc. in a remembrance of threatening green  
188/7150927

097  
McGregor, Don  
Killraven, Warrior of the worlds  
243/11510543

098  
McKie, Angus  
So beautiful and so dangerous  
084/5881968

099  
Maggin, Elliot S.  
Star raiders  
209/11973345  
210/10587817

100  
Magnus, Gunter Hugo  
Necron  
274/21129468

101  
Manara, Milo  
An author in search of six characters  
085/20666767  
086/20839624

102  
Mantlo, Bill  
Cloak and Dagger in Predator and prey  
088/21117870

103  
Mantlo, Bill  
Swords of the Swashbucklers  
087/172811

104  
Marx, Christy  
The sisterhood of steel  
089/18107820

105  
Mattotti, Lorenzo  
Fires  
097/18285223

106  
Mezieres, J. C.  
Ambassador of the Shadows  
090/9956966

107  
Mezieres, J. C.  
Heroes of the Equinox  
091/11501323  
092/19458694

108  
Mezieres, J. C.  
Les oiseaux du maitre  
093/17743728  
094/17281168

109  
Mezieres, J. C.  
World without stars  
095/10327235  
096/19458684

110  
Michelinie, David  
The Aladdin effect  
244/12496090

111  
Michelinie, David  
Revenge of the living monolith  
098/12534696

112  
Miller, Frank  
Batman : The dark knight returns  
199/14203785  
200/20023605  
201/21157578  
202/15058354  
203/17230592

113  
Miller, Frank  
Batman: year one  
099/18827514  
100/17759045

114  
Miller, Frank  
Daredevil in Love and War  
101/18624565  
102/14989028

115  
Miller, Frank  
Daredevil--Born Again  
273/17614369

116  
Miller, Frank  
Frank Miller's Ronin  
103/16931743  
104/17466069

117  
Mills, Pat  
Metalzoic  
105/13727684

118  
Moebius, 1938-  
Heavy Metal presents Moebius  
207/9043362

119  
Moebius, 1938-  
The magic crystal  
106/21927466  
289/20666778 SERIES FORMAT

120  
Moebius, 1938-  
Moebius: the collected fantasies of Jean Giraud  
208/17637607

121  
Moorcock, Michael  
Michael Moorcock's Elrick, the dreaming city  
213/12020092  
214/9063946

122  
Moore, Alan, 1951-  
Batman: the killing joke  
107/19353535

123  
Motter, Dean  
The prisoner  
290/20551740 SERIES FORMAT

124  
Munoz, Jose  
Joe's bar  
108/17614097

125  
Muth, Jon J.  
Dracula, a symphony in moonlight and nightmares  
228/17842093  
229/16307597

126  
Nedaud  
Zorro in old California  
109/18286466  
110/18193383

127  
-----  
Night music  
240/12401319  
291/7018084 SERIES RECORD

128  
Nocenti, Ann  
The Inhumans  
111/18980120

129  
Nocenti, Ann  
Somewhere strange  
112/18980139

130  
Oliphant, David  
Solarman, the beginning  
113/6323647

131  
O'Neil, Dennis, 193 -  
Batman: The official comic adaptation of the Warner Bros....  
114/20277341

132  
O'Neil, Dennis, 1939-  
The 1941 Shadow: Hitler's astrologer  
115/18262532  
116/20296135

133  
Paringaux, Philippe  
Love shots  
117/19244689

134  
Pini, Wendy  
Beauty and the Beast: portrait of love  
118/20211825

135  
Pini, Wendy  
Elfquest  
292/15494075  
293/15494103  
294/15494120  
295/7573020  
296/19606232  
297/15703444

136  
Ploog, Michael  
The Adventures of Tom Sawyer  
276/22146164

137  
Pohl, Frederik  
The merchants of Venus  
216/13713050

138  
Potter, Greg  
Me & Joe Priest  
120/12639920

139  
Potts, Carl  
The Alien Legion-- A Grey Day to Die  
119/14983408

140  
Potts, Carl  
The Last of the Dragons  
121/20584876

141  
Powell, Martin  
Scarlet in gaslight  
122/21129352

142  
Pratt, Hugo  
Les Celtiques  
268/7359737  
269/22471223

143  
Pratt, Hugo  
Corto Maltese  
258/19689600  
259/12891899  
260/20584924  
261/16693096  
262/14983314  
263/14470191  
264/14983218

144  
Pratt, Hugo  
Corto Maltese en Siberie  
265/11853591  
266/17057821  
267/19474626

145  
Pratt, Hugo  
Sgt. Kirk  
257/17281165

146  
Putney, Susan K.  
The amazing Spider-Man in Hooky  
123/13754900

147  
Randall, Ron  
Trekker  
124/19479155

148  
Robbins, Trina  
The silver metal lover  
125/11754774

149  
Rogers, Marshall  
Demon with a glass hand  
126/16307565

150  
Russell, P. Craig  
Ariane and Bluebeard  
127/20604803

151  
Russell, P. Craig  
Scarlet Letter  
275/21426907

152  
Saenz, Mike  
Iron Man: crash  
128/20666729  
129/20525873

153  
Shanower, Eric  
The enchanted apples of Oz  
130/14339276

154  
Shanower, Eric  
The forgotten forest of Oz  
131/19414981

155  
Shanower, Eric  
The ice king of Oz  
132/18039212

156  
Shanower, Eric  
The secret island of Oz  
133/16931660

157  
Shooter, Jim  
Dazzler, the movie  
134/17281175

158  
Sienkiewicz, Bill  
Moby Dick  
280/21420070

159  
Simonson, Walter  
Star Slammers  
221/11510424

160  
Skeates, Steve  
Warlords  
135/14636626

161  
Snyder, John K.  
Dr. Jekyll & Mr. Hyde  
277/21868827

162  
Spiegelman, Art  
Maus; a survivor's tale  
195/13524314  
196/17775342  
197/21302303  
198/20866056

163  
Starlin, Jim  
Batman: a death in the family  
136/19237680

164  
Starlin, Jim  
Batman: the cult  
137/20666666  
138/21335992

165  
Starlin, Jim  
The Death of Captain Marvel  
241/10161242

166  
Starlin, Jim  
Dreadstar  
222/11511507

167  
Starlin, Jim  
Gilgamesh II  
139/20666794

168  
Starlin, Jim  
The Incredible Hulk and the Thing in the big change  
251/17281142

169  
Stenstrum, James  
Sherlock Holmes: Sir Arthur Conan Doyle's a Study in Scarlet  
140/20604839

170  
Steranko, 1938-  
Red Tide : a Chandler novel  
194/4278988

171  
Stevens, Alec  
The sinners  
141/20604777

172  
Stevens, Dave  
The Rocketeer: an album  
142/12755508  
143/16523833  
144/19928758

173  
Thomas, Roy  
Conan of the isles  
145/19493624

174  
Thomas, Roy  
The Dragonlance saga  
146/18081648  
147/18811844  
148/19245191

175  
Thorne, Frank  
Ghita of Alizarr  
149/12729929  
150/15543732

176  
Torres, Daniel, 1958-  
Triton: the adventures of Rocco Vargas  
151/18070588  
152/14941223

177  
Trillo, Carlos  
Alvar Mayor, death and silver  
153/20432258  
154/20584863

178  
Truman, Timothy  
Time Beavers  
155/12226848

179  
Vance, W.(William)  
Where the Indian walks  
156/21129414

180  
Veitch, Rick  
Heartburst  
231/11501268

181  
Vogel, Henry  
Early days of the Southern Knights  
157/20584903  
158/15580472  
159/18262502  
160/18262529  
161/19781971  
162/18937437  
163/19917008

182  
Vogel, Henry  
The southern Knights graphic novel  
164/14927917

183  
Wagner, Matt  
Grendel : Devil by the deed  
204/16525297  
205/14993900

184  
Wagner, Matt  
Grendel : The devil inside  
206/21201433

185  
Waldron, Lamar, 1954-  
Lightrunner: an epic science fiction adventure  
234/9682248

186  
Wildey, Doug  
Rio  
165/16925914

187  
Wilson, Colin, 1949-  
Rael: Into the Shadow of the Sun  
166/17996062  
167/20188819

188  
Wilson, Ron  
Super boxers  
218/10587724

189  
Wrightson, Berni  
Stephen King's creepshow  
189/11962045  
190/8682546

190  
Zelenetz, Alan  
Kull: the vale of shadow  
168/21129394

191  
Zelenetz, Alan  
The raven banner: a tale of Asgard  
236/12019871

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

NOTE: Some articles from the vertical files at Ohio State University did not have complete citations.

Beahm, George. "Graphic Novels: Comics, Magazines, or Books?" Publishers Weekly November 6, 1987: 22.

Berman, Sanford, ed. Cataloging Special Materials: Critiques and Innovations. Phoenix, Arizona: Oryx Press, 1986.

Bodian, Nat G. Bodian's Publishing Desk Reference: A Comprehensive Dictionary of Practices and Techniques for Book and Journal Marketing and Bookselling. Phoenix: Oryx Press, 1988.

Condon, Garret. "Graphic Novels Appeal to New Generation of Comic-Book Readers." [Vertical file at OSU]

Dreifus, Claudia. "An Interview with Art Spiegelman." Progressive November 1989: 34-37.

DeCandido, Keith R. A. "Picture This: Graphic Novels in Libraries." Library Journal March 15, 1990: 50-55.

Devreux, Anne Shapiro. "Biff Wham Bam!: Call it Bandes Dessinee or Graphic Novel, it's the Newest Belgian Winner!" Belgian American Trade Review : 18-21. [Vertical file at OSU]

Dorrell, Larry D. "Why Comic Books?" School Library Journal Nov. 87: 30-32

Du Mars, Roger Dean. "The Comic Book Grows Up, Graphic Novels: Not Just Kid Stuff." Christian Science Monitor December 28, 1988: [Vertical file at OSU]

Eisner, Will. Comics & Sequential Art. Tamarac, Florida: Poorhouse Press, 1985.

Gopnik, Adam. "Comics and Catastrophe." New Republic June 22, 1987: 29-34.

"Growing Up into 'Graphic Novels'." The New York Times January 31, 1988: [Vertical file at OSU]

Hoffman, Frank. "Comic books in Libraries, Archives and Media Centers." Serials Librarian 16 (1/2) 1989: 167-198.

Levine, Art. "Comic Books are Winning New Respect." U.S. News and World Report Sept 21, 1987:69.

- Levine, Beth. "Graphic Novels: The Latest Word in Illustrated Books." Publishers Weekly May 22, 1987: 45-47.
- Lovece, Frank. "Carnal Comics." Genesis May 1989: 70-73.
- Miller, Frank. Batman : The Dark Knight Returns New York, NY : Warner Books, 1986. ISBN 0-446-38505-0
- Myers, George Jr. "Graphic Novels Return." [Vertical file at OSU]
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Rough & Randy: Comics for Adults Nothing to Laugh About." [Vertical file at OSU]
- Nicholls, Peter, ed. The science fiction encyclopedia Garden City, NY : Doubleday, 1979. 672.
- "Out of the Ghetto, Into the Mainstream." The New York Times January 31, 1988: [Vertical file at OSU]
- Prescott, Peter S. and Ray Sawhill. "The Comic Book (Gulp!) Grows Up." Newsweek January 18, 1988: 70-71.
- Richler, Mordecai. "Batman at Midlife: Or, the Funnies Grow Up." The New York Times Book Review May 3, 1987: 35.
- Schwartz, John. "Comic Books Grow Up." Newsweek on Campus October 1987: 38-40.
- Scott, Randall. Comics Librarianship: a handbook. Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 1990.
- Sinberg, Stan. "Comic Relief." Daily News : 3-4.[Vertical file at OSU]
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Holy Toledo! Comic Books Have Grown Up." The Plain Dealer Magazine June 17, 1990: 12-13.
- Spiegelman, Art. "Maus & Man." Village Voice June 6, 1989: 20-22.
- Thompson, Don. "The spawn of the son of M.C. Gaines." The comic-book book 290-317.
- Towle, Lisa H. "What's New in The Comic Book Business." The New York Times January 31, 1988: [Vertical file at OSU]
- Walker, Gregory. "Comics and Graphic Novels." Booklist April 1, 1989: 1370-1374.
- Wertham, Fredric. Seduction of the Innocent. New York: Rinehart, 1954.

## Computer Citations/CD-Rom Citations

Amazing Heroes. Stamford, CT: Zam, OCLC #7616065.

The Comics Buyer's Guide. Iola, WI: Krause Publications, OCLC #9185196.

The Comics Journal. Bethel, CT: The Comics Journal, OCLC #4521305.

Fauvel, Marie-Louise. "L'Aventure D'Une Ecriture: La Bande Dessinee D'essai." (Ph.D. diss., University of Wisconsin, 1989) [French Text] 200, Dialog, Dissertation Abstracts International, #01100712.

Holman, Curtis Lehner. "Reinventing the Wheel: A Multi-Perspective Analysis of Alan Moore and Dave Gibbon's Graphic Novel 'Watchmen'." (M.A. diss., University of Georgia, 1989), Dialog, Dissertation Abstracts International, #01099187.

Moore, Alan & Dave Gibbons ill. & letterer, John Higgins colorist. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1986. OCLC #15063233.

\_\_\_\_\_. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #17257135.

\_\_\_\_\_. Watchmen. New York: DC Comics, 1987. OCLC #18203911.

\_\_\_\_\_. Watchmen. New York: Warner books, 1987. OCLC #17301724.

Spiegelman, Art. Maus: A Survivor's Tale. New York: Pantheon Books, 1986. OCLC #13524314.

\_\_\_\_\_. Maus: A Survivor's Tale. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1987. OCLC #17775342.

\_\_\_\_\_. Maus: A Survivor's Tale. London: Deutsch, 1987. OCLC #21302303.

\_\_\_\_\_. Maus: Racconto di un Sopravvissuto. Milano: Rizzoli. 1989. OCLC #20866056.

## Catalogues/Price guides

Classic DC Graphic Novels Catalog. Canada: Diamond Comic Distributors, 1989.

Direct Currents. #30. New York: DC Comics, June 1990

Eclipse Books. Forestville, CA: Eclipse Books, 1989.

The Fantasy Collection. May 1990.

Mail Order Catalog. Spring/Summer 1990. Princeton, WI: Kitchen Sink Press.

Overstreet, Robert M. Official Overstreet Comic Book Price Guide. 18th ed. New York: House of Collectibles, 1988.

The Premium Specialty Collection. October 1990.