

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 327 446

SO 030 326

AUTHOR Zinsser, Judith P.
 TITLE Comparative History of the Nations of the Western Hemisphere (Teacher's Guide for the International Baccalaureate History of the Americas).
 INSTITUTION United Nations International School, New York, N.Y.
 PUB DATE Jun 89
 NOTE 32p.
 PUB TYPE Guides - Classroom Use - Guides (For Teachers) (052)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
 DESCRIPTORS Comparative Analysis; Course Content; *Course Descriptions; Course Organization; Curriculum Development; Foreign Countries; Higher Education; *History Instruction; Instructional Materials; Latin American History; North American History; Secondary Education; Social Studies; Teaching Guides; Teaching Methods
 IDENTIFIERS Central America; North America; South America; *Western Hemisphere

ABSTRACT

A guide to teaching a course on the history of the nations of the Western Hemisphere is presented. The Western Hemisphere is one of the regions offered in the International Baccalaureate examination category of history; the International Baccalaureate is offered by the United Nations International School. The guide is divided into five sections: (1) general introduction; (2) an approach to the course; (3) basic texts; (4) suggestions for units; and (5) additional materials for teachers and students. High school history and social studies teachers might benefit from the guide's suggestions for units and recommendation of basic texts in this subject area. (DB)

 * Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
 * from the original document. *

ED327446

COMPARATIVE HISTORY OF THE NATIONS OF THE WESTERN HEMISPHERE
(Teacher's Guide for International Baccalaureate History of
the Americas)

Judith P. Zinsser
United Nations International School

New York, N. Y.
June, 1989

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

This document has been reproduced as
received from the person or organization
originating it
 Minor changes have been made to improve
reproduction quality

• Points of view or opinions stated in this docu-
ment do not necessarily represent official
OERI position or policy

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

JUDITH P
ZINSSER

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

SO 030 326

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- I. GENERAL INTRODUCTION
 - A. General Considerations
 - B. The Examinations
 - C. The Acquisition of Historical Skills

- II. AN APPROACH TO THE COURSE
 - A. The Two-Year Sequence
 - B. Content Choices
 - C. Skills Choices

- III. BASIC TEXTS

- IV. SUGGESTIONS FOR UNITS
 - A. Contact and Conquest: the Meeting of the American and European Cultures
 - B. Colonial Institutions at their Height c.1730/1750
 - C. Revolution and the Collapse of the Imperial Systems 1776/1808
 - D. The New Americans and the Evolution of Political Institutions in the Nineteenth Century
 - E. The New Americans and the Industrial Age
 - F. The World in 1920
 - G. Economic and Social Problems and their Solutions in the Inter-War Period
 - H. Revolutionary Change in the Post-War World 1945-1965
 - I. Foreign Policy of the Nations of the Western Hemisphere
 - J. Key National and International Choices: 1965 to the Present

- V. ADDITIONAL MATERIAL FOR TEACHERS AND STUDENTS
 - A. Periodicals
 - B. Specialized Guides and Texts
 - C. Film and Video Distributors

I. GENERAL INTRODUCTION

A. General Considerations

The Americas is one of the regions offered in the International Baccalaureate examination category of History. Like studies of Africa, Asia and Europe, this history of the nations of the Western Hemisphere provides students with a dual perspective: a chronological study in depth of one region of the world, and a broad, comparative analysis of many countries' responses to the forces and personalities of the twentieth century.

Unlike the other regional studies, however, the history of the Americas offers unique challenges to teachers and students. No secondary schools and few universities offer comparative studies of even two parts of the hemisphere, let alone attempt an understanding and analysis of the whole area: Canada, the Caribbean, Latin America and the United States. No ready-made comparative texts remain in print. Traditional historical and pedagogical sources look to national not multinational questions and answers. It is for this reason that this guide was written.

When using this guide, readers should keep two caveats in mind: (1) the periodisation, the analytical approaches, student activities, and readings are suggestions, not mandatory prescriptions or guarantees of success on the examinations; (2) the focus of the course described is on North America, with particular emphasis on the United States.

Readers should also take encouragement from this guide.

Those who choose this region and work to implement this syllabus will find that they are in the mainstream of curriculum development. For this comparative history of the nations of the Western Hemisphere fulfills the grandest dreams of those who advocate a multi-cultural, or pluralistic, approach to secondary education. Most recently in the report of the Bradley Commission, Building a History Curriculum: Guidelines for Teaching History in Schools, and in the work of the National Commission on Social Studies in the Schools, the significance of teaching national history in a world-wide context has been emphasized. Local and state mandates from California, Florida and New York, require the integration of Canadian, Caribbean and Latin American history. Similar studies and official directives have caused the rethinking of history education in Canada and Mexico.

Study of the Americas fulfills these criteria. It meets national requirements, yet goes beyond national history. It allows students to appreciate their own cultural heritage, not in isolation, but in the broad context of the experiences of the peoples of the whole Hemisphere.

In addition, the Americas introduces students to history as a discipline and to the historian's methods. By its very nature, the study obliges them to go beyond simple narrative; it necessitates comparison and analysis. It is not the history of one country, but of the ways in which the histories of many nations have been intertwined and interacted. The disparate development of the institutions and cultures of the various

regions, and their differing political, social and economic responses raise original questions of causation. Ideally, at the end of the two-year course students have learned of their national heritage, become aware of the international context in which they live, encountered the major issues of the contemporary world, and acquired greater understanding of the work of the historian and the historical process.

B. The Examinations

As with other Higher Level History choices the student's mark is determined by four different pieces of work.

(1) Guided Coursework: This constitutes 20% of the final mark and is to be undertaken at some point during the two years of study. (Often it is done in the second year when students have more command of the material and their skills.) The teacher designs and supervises Guided Coursework as one of the regular units of the course. It can be an independent research and writing project on a subject chosen by the student, similar to a short university term paper. It can be part of a topic assigned by the teacher; for example, a study of Native Americans in a unit on Minorities in the Twentieth Century. To fulfill the requirements of Guided Coursework, the student must complete both an oral and written component. The oral presentation could be a speech, a debate, a panel discussion. The teacher evaluates and marks Guided Coursework. (Guided Coursework differentiates the IB from other external examination systems such as the Advanced

Placement tests offered in the United States.)

(2 & 3) Paper I and Paper II: These each constitute 20% (a total of 40%) of the mark and are externally evaluated examinations written at the end of the course of study. They focus on topics in twentieth-century world history which are described in the History Subject Guide.

For Paper I students demonstrate their knowledge by analyzing a set of document extracts on one of two designated world history topics. (See the Subject Guide and IBO Bulletin for descriptions of the specific aspects of the topics to be studied for Paper I.) Questions test students' understanding of the meaning and context of the documents, their ability to evaluate the documents as evidence, and to extrapolate from them in order to make historical generalizations. (The Subject Guide contains "Specimen Questions" and a description of the Criteria of Assessment.)

For Paper II students demonstrate their knowledge by writing two essays on any two of ten world history topics. Topics may be chosen for their relevance to the Americas, on the basis of current interest, or because of previous course work. They may be the same topics as those studied for Paper I. In writing on one or another topic students are expected to have knowledge of specific cases and to be able to use examples from their own and one other region. There are no multiple choice questions.

(4) Paper III: This constitutes 40% of the mark and is an externally evaluated examination written at the end of the course of study. Students demonstrate their knowledge by writing three

essays. (See the Subject Guide for the Criteria of Assessment.) Unlike Papers I and II, Paper III concentrates exclusively on the history of the region with the emphasis on comparison and analysis of historical phenomena in two or three countries. There are also questions that deal with only one or another part of the Hemisphere. Approximately half of the twenty questions are on the period before 1870, approximately half are on the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries. There are no multiple choice questions.

C. The Acquisition of Historical Skills

As with the other history options, the Americas course entails the mastery of skills necessary for work in the discipline at the university level. Students are expected to go beyond the simple learning of facts to an appreciation of history as a distinctive form of inquiry using methods from both the Humanities and the Social Sciences. Thus, students in their Guided Coursework and on the examination papers are evaluated on their ability to research independently, to select and interpret information, to analyse events, and to present their ideas clearly and logically in written and oral form.

The IB envisages a wide range of skills being utilized in the course. In researching independent or assigned topics students should use secondary sources critically, be able to evaluate the historian's evidence, and assess the significance of the many facts presented to them. With primary sources, they should be able to understand the author's meaning, appreciate the

context, identify the author's perspective, and speculate on the significance of the document.

On the IB examinations and subsequently in university students will most often demonstrate their abilities in history by writing an essay. To give students opportunities to practice the variety of skills this requires, the essay is recommended as the preferred method of evaluation for the Americas course. The Criteria of Assessment in the History Subject Guide speak of the ability to go from narrative to analysis; and of the presentation and organization of that analysis as a clear and logically developed view of the events. Thus, a successful student essay would have an opening paragraph introducing the main idea (topic/argument/thesis), followed by sections that explain and expand upon the argument -- a sequence of paragraphs with transitions maintaining the continuity of the thesis. Relevant evidence would substantiate each point and show the student's critical use of research materials. Conclusions, rather than repeating the initial idea, place the discussion in a broader context. A conclusion might demonstrate more general understanding of historical causes and effects, suggest comparisons, or speculate on long term consequences.

Oral exercises reinforce these essay skills. Classes can provide opportunities for students to experience formal discourse and debate and to practice the oral presentation of a view of events. Such practice also prepares students for the oral component of the Guided Coursework. The IB recommends that one unit of each semester have as its method of evaluation an oral

report, participation in a panel discussion, a "role play" (an especially effective way to encourage students to discuss issues from different perspectives), or some other oral exercise.

Although the content requirements of the Americas course may seem overwhelming at first, teachers should also plan to set aside class time for the mechanics of essay writing. Ideally, such discussions should be held in small groups; one half of the class working in the library while the other meets, for example. In small, informal groups, students can formulate essay questions and analytical answers, talk about how to organize their ideas, decide on appropriate evidence. They can edit each other's drafts, suggest techniques that helped them, warn of practices that hindered them. Reading aloud from their finished essays and discussing exemplary papers can often help them see the absence of any thesis or argument, breaks in logic, the need for substantiation. By simply explaining what they did mean to classmates, students can learn to express their ideas more coherently. They can apply this understanding to perfecting the style and clarity of their spoken and written language. Classes like these can accomplish more than long pages of teacher comments, and often give the students the sense of mastery that comes from taking their own thinking and writing seriously.

Some students in the Americas course may choose to do their Extended Essay in History. This 4-5,000 word research paper is required of full diploma candidates. (See IBO General Guide and History Subject Guide for specific descriptions of the requirement.) Teachers may wish the whole class to do some sort

of independent research essay, similar to the kind of essay they will have to do in university history course. As an Extended Essay or in some modified form, such an exercise gives students another opportunity to use their historical skills. They must define a topic and learn to identify bibliography. They will have to develop some effective method of note-taking. They will encounter the problems of dealing with primary source materials, the conflicting views of different secondary sources. They will have to formulate an analytical question. They will have to select and organize information in order to present their answer. At its best, the research essay, whether as an Extended Essay or as part of classwork, gives students a sense of the challenge, frustration and excitement of being an historian.

II. AN APPROACH TO THE COURSE

A. The Two-Year Sequence

The most common approaches to the course are:

- (1) comparative chronological study of the region over two years, incorporating world history topics for Papers I and II in the second year;
- (2) regional history in one year and world history topics for Papers I and II in another year (sequence of years varies).

The choice of approach may be influenced by many practical considerations. Students may have to take other external examinations in a set year of their high school education: the Advanced Placement United States History Exam, or provincial

examinations in Canada, for example. Staffing may limit course offerings. Minimum class sizes may necessitate combining IB and regular students.

The syllabus presented here uses the first approach and fulfills United States history requirements. (It is compatible with topics needed for the United States Advanced Placement examination.) The units are chronological and comparative over the two years of study.

Year I: history of the region from the European conquest at the end of the fifteenth century to the outbreak of World War I;

Year II: history of the region in the twentieth century with units expanded to cover the topics chosen for Papers I and II (e.g. Foreign Policy of the Nations of the Western Hemisphere can include "The Establishment and Work of International Organizations,"; Economic and Social Problems and their Solutions in the Inter-War Period and Revolutionary Change in the Post-War World 1945-1965 can include material for "The Rise and Rule of Single-Party States").

B. Content Choices

Even without any other requirements or considerations, it would be impossible to cover the entire program outlined in the IB History Subject Guide. No student is expected to know the whole 500 years of hemispheric history, or to have considered all

ten of the world history topics. Rather, teachers are expected to make choices. Teachers should select some periods and aspects for in-depth study. They should feel confident that the breadth of a truly multinational history --the underlying IB goal-- comes with emphasis on comparison and the identification of cross-cultural analytical themes. In addition, teachers should take time to include topics which are not part of the traditional political and economic focus of the IB program; women's history, for example. The best IB courses will be those that not only prepare students for the examinations, but also give them a full and challenging history program.

C. Skills Choices

The units suggested in this guide last four to eight weeks (the longer units are divided into two parts). Each unit focuses on a major comparative or analytical question which often becomes the essay or test question used at the end of the unit to evaluate the student's understanding. An effort has been made to phrase these questions in an open-ended way so that all students may formulate satisfactory answers. Those with less experience give a simple response, the more sophisticated explore more intricate explanations.

Class time is used therefore to teach approaches to analysis, to help students understand the processes of historical thinking. Together they work to select the significant ideas and information from their reading. They learn to categorize facts, to set up a comparison, to identify and delineate types of

historical causes. Lectures are rare and tend to come at the beginning of units to highlight the broad patterns students will encounter, to preview the comparative and analytical explanations they will be asked to consider.

Also to facilitate these lessons in historical thinking, the essay questions assigned to the students follow a sequence. They become more complex as the semester progresses. The sequence repeats in each of the two years. Thus, students begin writing descriptive narrative in the first unit, make comparisons in the second, and explore cause and effect in the third. Subsequent units can require a combination of approaches, e.g. comparison and explanation of causation.

Parallel to the analytical sequence, there is an effort to create a sequence of skills. Short, weekly assignments ask them to develop a note-taking style, to use geographical and statistical information, to outline, to learn to read primary sources. Essays of 1200-1300 words every three or four weeks, and formal oral exercises once a semester require them to formulate a view of events, to plan a logical progression of paragraphs, to use evidence to substantiate their ideas. Ideally, by the end of the course, the student should be functioning independently: able to research, to make analytical judgments and to compose an essay or extended oral argument.

Succeeding in the examinations requires skills that may seem unrelated to the reasoned sequences described in this guide. No one wants "to teach to an exam," yet, practical realities suggest that students need time to review and time to learn techniques of

"examsmanship." First of all, at least two weeks of class and assignment time must be set aside for review. This is particularly necessary if the course has been taught in disconnected segments, for example: Canadian and United States history in one semester, Latin American in another, and twentieth-century world history topics in yet another. However gifted the students, they will not be able to make connections between what they have studied, all the writing and talking they have done, and the IB examinations.

Second, they need to be shown past examination papers. In fact, questions from previous years may have been used by the teacher for their unit tests and internal examinations. They are always surprised and pleased to learn that they have already written actual IB questions. Then, teachers and students must acknowledge that no one can prepare everything. Students, like teachers, must select from the syllabus. They need to identify which periods and topics they feel confident about. They should make date sheets and outlines, and create whatever aids help them to retain ideas and information for use in timed-tests.

Third, they have to think about how to approach the examination questions, how to take them apart to insure that they cover all aspects. They should write practice papers. They need to imagine "worst cases," and what to do when the question they prepared is not there. This is the time to reassure them that they have learned enormous amounts of information and can find relevant ways to demonstrate this to the examiners.

Although teachers may not see their students' examination

papers, they can learn about their students' performance from the marks awarded and from the Chief Examiners Report on all examination papers. At a fee and by special request, the IB will authorise a "School Report," a detailed analysis of one school's examination answers in a particular subject. Schools new to the IB should consider making such a request as the report can be helpful and reassuring in a teacher's first years in the program.

III. BASIC TEXTS

The following books have proved to be useful resources:

Bailey, Thomas A. and David M. Kennedy, The American Spirit. DC Heath, 1987 ed., Vols. I-II.

Bennett, Paul W. and Cornelius J. Jaenen eds., Emerging Identities: Selected Problems and Interpretations in Canadian History. Prentice-Hall Canada Inc., 1986, 2 Vols. (Pre-Confederation and Confederation)

Cook, Ramsey, Canada: A Modern Study. Irwin Books (a division of General Publishing), 1977.

Galeano, Eduardo, Memory of Fire trans. Cedric Belfrage. Pantheon Books, 1985-88, 3 Vols. (Genesis, Faces & Masks, Century of the Wind)

Hofstadter, Richard, American Political Tradition. Vintage Books, 1989 ed.

Keen, Benjamin, ed., Latin American Civilization: History and Society, 1492 to the Present. Westview Press, 1986 ed.

Keen, Benjamin and Mark Wasserman, A History of Latin America. Houghton Mifflin, 1987 ed.

Chudacoff, Howard P. and Paul D. Escott, David M. Katzman, Mary Beth Norton, Thoas G. Paterson, William M. Tuttle Jr., A People and a Nation: a History of the United States. Houghton Mifflin, 1987 ed.

IV. SUGGESTIONS FOR UNITS

A. Contact and Conquest: the Meeting of the American and European Cultures

Students can do their research and writing for the unit from the American perspective:

study of the geographical features of the region, 20th century conflict between physical and political geography, the obstacles to intra-regional communications and cooperation

research and write an "Almanac of the Americas on the Eve of Conquest" describing the environment and the political, economic, social and religious systems of the principal cultures encountered by the Europeans: Arawaks/Caribes, Aztecs, Incas, Iroquois.

Class discussion and reading can be from the European perspective:

Why did Europeans embark on voyages of discovery?
Who went?
Why were they able to conquer the Arawaks and Caribes?
How did they retain control of the Aztec and Inca empires?
Why were they unable to defeat the Iroquois Confederacy until 1763?

Having completed their Almanac, students can consider the larger issue: the significance of the Conquest and the long-term effects both within the Hemisphere and for the Atlantic community.

B. Colonial Institutions at their Height c. 1730/1750

The principal essay and the focus of class discussions can be on the same question: a comparison of the colonial systems - the Spanish and/or Portuguese with the French and/or English. Discussions should be used to challenge stereotypes and to facilitate selection and organization of facts for the comparative essay. For example, by identifying:

the shift from military to bureaucratic control
the fate of the indigenous peoples
the theories of empire in relation to the real process of decision-making
trade regulations including their effect on the mother country
labour systems (including enslavement) and the

evolution of social classes ¹
the role of the churches

Having completed the comparison, class discussion can focus on a broader question:

Which was more significant in the creation of colonial institutions, the experiences and memories brought from Europe or the environment and the indigenous cultures that the Europeans found in the Western Hemisphere?

C. Revolution and the Collapse of the Imperial Systems 1776/1808

The principal focus for the unit can be a comparison of the various aspects of the revolutions for independence that swept through the Hemisphere, leaving only a few areas under European control at the end of the 1820's. Assignments and discussions can be divided into two parts:

(1) THE REVOLUTION IN BRITISH NORTH AMERICA

Sample essay topics:

Why did they rebel? Consider different historians interpretations: political, ideological, economic and social causes ²

Why did the British Caribbean and Canada not rebel?
the Loyalist position
the role of Massachusetts and Virginia as the oldest colonies
the significance of Thomas Paine's Common Sense

Class discussion and readings can highlight for future comparison:

the adverse reactions of the British Atlantic colonists to imperial reform
the different perspective of the colonists and their rulers, shown for example in the Declaration of Independence (including the English Bill of Rights, the doctrines of the Enlightenment)
the colonists' ability to act in unison after 1774

¹ Useful additional resource for this and subsequent units: Vincent Bakpetu Thompson, The Making of the Africa Diaspora in the Americas 1441-1900 (Longman Inc., 1987).

² Useful additional class resource: Edmund S. Morgan, The Birth of the Republic 1763-89 (The University of Chicago Press, 1977).

naw definitions of citizenship and the omissions
the military aspects of the revolt and the role of
outside aid

(2) THE REVOLUTIONS IN LATIN AMERICA ³

This second part of the unit can be organized into oral reports. Four groups of students speak on the revolutions in the four Viceroyalties of Latin America. Each student in the group considers a different type of cause, e.g. political, economic. A fifth group of students reports on why Brazil did not rebel, yet gained its independence.

Class discussion and readings identify common themes:

- the causes of the Haitian revolution; reasons for success (internal vs. external factors); impact elsewhere in the Hemisphere
- the Spanish and Portuguese colonists' reactions to imperial reform
- effects of the Enlightenment and the French Revolution (including the Declaration of the Rights of Man and Citizen)
- differences between revolts of 1808 and 1814
- splintering of the independence movement (political, economic, social and racial conflicts)
- the significance of the leaders
- the military aspects of the revolt and the role of outside aid

Sample comparative question to evaluate the unit:

Compare the causes, course and effects of the independence revolutions in the Western Hemisphere.

D. The New Americans and the Evolution of Political Institutions in the Nineteenth Century

The unit falls naturally into two parts each with its own questions for reading, discussion, comparison and analysis. One focuses on the formation of new governments in the United States and Latin America, the other on the tensions created by regional and cultural differences in the United States and Canada.

(1) UNITED STATES AND LATIN AMERICA AFTER THEIR REVOLUTIONS

Reading and discussion of:

³ Useful additional class text: Richard Graham, Independence in Latin America: A Comparative Approach (Knopf, 1972).

the effects of the independence revolutions
the structure of the new governments (definitions of
purpose, function and powers then and in the 20th
century)
disparate evolution and function of political parties
relations between the central and regional authority
role of the executive and emergence of the caudillo⁴
peaceful vs. forceful transfers of power
definitions of rights and who shall have them

Sample essay topics:

comparison of constitutions; circumstances of their
writing, purpose and structure, longevity
comparison of caudillos with US presidents (e.g. Rosas and
Santa Anna with Jackson)
analysis of the role of the executive and legislative
branches in the solution of post-revolutionary
problems
analysis of the changes in the definition of government
and the role of the executive (e.g. Washington and
Jackson, Rosas and Sarmiento, Santa Anna and Juarez)

(2) UNITED STATES AND CANADA IN THE 1860'S

Class discussions and readings focus on the principal question of
this era: What unites regions? What divides them?

Sample essay topics:

nature of enslavement in different parts of the
Hemisphere and its effects (including manumission
and abolition)
expansion to the west and the role of the frontier in the
history of the Hemisphere
the nature of political compromise: When was it
possible? What made it impossible?
the rights of the cultural/regional minority within
a political system based on majority rule
Canada's ability to unite despite its regional
differences and separate cultures vs. the US'
inability to avoid civil war

E. The New Americans and the Industrial Age

This unit on the development of the nineteenth-century economic
and social institutions of the Hemisphere can be divided into two

⁴ Useful additional resource for this and following unit:
David Bushnell and Neill Macaulay, The Emergence of Latin America
in the Nineteenth Century (Oxford University Press, 1988).

parts, one focussing on the changing circumstances and the creation of the institutions, the other on the responses to those changes.

(1) UNITED STATES AND LATIN AMERICA: ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL CHANGES

Class discussion, reading and sample essay topics:

Why industrialization and the export of manufactured goods became the pattern for the US while development of primary agricultural and mineral production and the importation of capital and manufactured goods became the pattern in Latin America?

Why relatively spontaneous industrialization in one region and neo-colonialism in another?

How do nations acquire a dominant or dependent economic role in the world market?

women's contributions to the creation of the new institutions, changes in roles and rights ⁵

contributions of racial, ethnic and national minorities to transformation of economies, their access to rights and opportunities ⁶

As an introduction to the second part of the unit the students can debate the larger issue: Industrialisation, good or bad?

(2) RESPONSES TO INJUSTICES AND INEQUITIES OF NINETEENTH CENTURY CHANGES

Class discussion, readings and sample essay topics:

comparison of the social and political theories of the second half of the 19th century (Marxism, Evolutionary Socialism, Social Darwinism, Positivism, Christian Democracy, Feminism, Populism, Progressivism);

effectiveness of the various reform movements in the Hemisphere (goals, successes, failures)

Why social revolution in Mexico and not in the US?

the coincidence of social revolutions in the first two decades of the 20th century (comparison of preconditions, ideology, leaders and outcomes in

⁵ Exercises in family history successfully illustrate the changes over time in the lives of women and men and can be used in this unit to introduce students to the techniques of oral history.

⁶ Useful additional class text: Frank B. Linderman, Pretty Shield: Medicine Woman of the Crows (University of Nebraska Press, 1974).

Mexico, China and Russia)

F. The World in 1925

A variety of approaches are possible with this unit to introduce the twentieth century. For this and subsequent units topics for Papers I, II and III can be coordinated.

Class discussion, reading and sample essay topics:

"Almanac for the Year 1925" with countries chosen from within the Hemisphere and/or outside of it (e.g. Argentina, Canada, Germany, Great Britain, Japan, Mexico, US)⁷

causes, practices and effects of World War I: compare the motives of the US and Europe; analyse which countries gained the most; compare effects of war (e.g. use demographic materials to illustrate changes caused or occasioned by the War in Argentina, Canada, Germany, Japan and the US)

comparison of alternative visions of the past and future through in-depth analysis of primary sources (e.g. Wilson's Fourteen Points and the League of Nations; Lenin's State and Revolution and the dictatorship of the proletariat; Margaret Sanger's Woman and the New Race and population control: the Mexican Constitution of 1917 and government control of natural resources)

G. Economic and Social Problems and their Solutions in the Inter-War Period

Economic dislocation and collapse dominated the 1930's in all parts of the world. Study of events in Europe and the Americas complement each other and give students examples of the major political and economic ideologies and institutions of the twentieth century (e.g. dictatorship and the corporate state, representative government and free-market economy, one-party state and socialism).

Class discussions and readings can cover both regions:

European post-war problems including reparations, the German collapse of 1923 and the world-wide depression
European responses to political and economic problems
Italian and German Fascism; Stalin's Five-Year Plans

⁷ Useful additional class text for this and subsequent units: Thomas E. Skidmore and Peter H. Smith, Modern Latin America (Oxford University Press, 1989)

nature of the Depression in the Western Hemisphere and use of European and indigenous models in the search for solutions (ways of measuring relative success or failure of programs from quantitative data) changing expectations of government's role in economy and uses of executive power

Sample essay topics for the Western Hemisphere (with opportunities for historiographical discussions):

comparison of the economic and social problems and solutions of Brazil and the United States (examples could be broadened to include Italy, USSR and Germany) analysis of the changing role of the executive (e.g. Vargas and Roosevelt)

H. Revolutionary Change in the Post-War World 1945-1965

Students may do this unit in the context of the Western Hemisphere or expand it to include topics for Papers I and II. They would then consider revolutions outside of the Western Hemisphere occasioned by the weakening and dissolution of the European colonial empires. ⁸

(1) THE WESTERN HEMISPHERE

Class discussion and readings:

causes of revolution in Latin America 1945-1965
role of the leaders, of the elites, of ideology, and of economic and social conditions in causing revolutions
outcome of revolutions: relationship between goals and realities
role of the US in revolutions in Latin America
Populism and the nature of mass movements (e.g. Peron in Argentina)

Sample essay topics:

Why was there revolution in Guatemala, Bolivia and Cuba, and how were the revolutions different in causes and results?
Why revolution in Bolivia and Cuba and not in Argentina?

(2) WORLD-WIDE CONTEXT

Sample essay topics (questions can be expanded into a unit suitable for Guided Coursework):

⁸ Useful additional resource: Eric Wolf, Peasant Wars of the Twentieth Century (Harper & Row Publishers, 1973)

How did "new" nations gain their independence? Once independent what were their principal strengths and weaknesses, successes and continuing problems?

Why the coincidence of revolutions in Africa, Asia and Latin America after 1945?

Does the man make the times or the times the man?

(Consider from the following: Castro, Ho Chi Minh, Mao Zedong, Nasser, Nehru, Nkrumah, Nyerere, Peron, Senghor, Sukarno)

I. Foreign Policy of the Nations of the Western Hemisphere

By studying foreign policy in one unit (and not in separate segments at appropriate chronological points), students can better identify continuities, changes, and aberrations in policy and action as nations move from the late eighteenth century into the last decade of the twentieth century.⁹ This survey approach can also be used to highlight topics for Papers I and II.

Class discussion and readings can concentrate on the evolution of United States foreign policy. The topics listed offer opportunities for an historiographical approach, and many can be expanded into units suitable for Guided Coursework.

contradictory nature of US policies from the 1790's to 1990's (ideology vs. economic and national security motives)

expansion by purchase and invasion (of Canada, Indian nations, Mexico and Spanish territories)

territorial expansion of Canada and the US contrasted with splintering of nations in Central and South America

US interventions in the Caribbean and Latin America in the 20th century role of OAS

idealism of Wilson's 14 Points, Roosevelt's Four Freedoms Cold War beginnings, Marshall Plan, Alliance for Progress, Johnson and Nixon Doctrines

US interventions world-wide since 1945

US and the United Nations; role of international organisations in the settlement and prevention of conflicts¹⁰

Sample essay question for the Western Hemisphere:

⁹ Useful additional class text: John G. Stoessinger, Why Nations Go to War (St. Martin's Press, 1986).

¹⁰ Useful additional resource: A. Leroy Bennett, International Organizations: Principles and Issues (Prentice-Hall, 1988).

From 1865 to the present which was the most important in the determination of United States foreign policy: ideology, economic interests or national security?

Sample oral reports in a world-wide context:

Reports on the theme of: "Conflicts of the Post-War World." Students research from a wide selection of armed incidents and share their findings with the class. Discussion focuses on the following questions: What caused the war, dispute, conflict? What was the style of fighting, the role of outside powers, the measurement of victory? How was the war, conflict or dispute settled?

With the addition of an essay comparing three conflicts this would be suitable for Guided Coursework.

J. 1965 to the Present: the Key Choices

The multiplicity of possible topics for the modern era allows the incorporation of material for Papers I and II. The following approach divides the unit into two parts, one concerned with questions relating to political stability, the other with questions relating to economic development. Many could be expanded into studies appropriate for Guided Coursework.

(1) POLITICAL STABILITY 1965 TO THE PRESENT

Sample essay topics (examples from the Western Hemisphere are in parenthesis):

- the relationship between social equality, economic equity and political stability (Mexico)
- the role of military and civilian elites: How do they exercise power? What actions of theirs occasion disorder? How do they maintain political stability? (Argentina, Brazil)
- the types of discontent that occasion forceful transfers of power (Central America, Chile) ¹¹
- the modern single-party state as a means to solve the problems of society; Have they been more or less effective than the traditional multi-party civil libertarian systems? Why? Why not? (Cuba)
- the contradictions between mass democracy and the rights of ethnic and racial minorities, the rights of indigenous peoples, the rights of women; the effects of those contradictions on political

¹¹ Useful additional class text: Joan Didion, Salvador (Washington Square Press, 1983).

stability (Canada, US)¹²
the role of historical traditions and institutionalised
groups in the maintenance of political stability: At
what price?

(2) ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Sample topics for panels: students research three countries
as the basis for their analysis. With the addition of a
comparative essay this becomes a unit suitable for Guided
Coursework.

The Role of the Countryside: food vs. commercial crops;
agricultural production vs. full employment; agribusiness
and modernisation, the "green revolution" vs. land
reform; cooperative vs. private enterprise; how goods
are distributed and marketed and the inequities

The Role of the Cities: patterns of growth of cities;
city vs. countryside in allocation of resources,
transportation networks, population distribution,
quality of life, educational opportunities, income
distribution; access of different social, economic,
ethnic, racial and gender groups to education, employment
and a higher standard of living

Technology and Development: uses of technology in a
developing economy, what is "appropriate technology";
relationship between high production levels and full
employment; control of technology from foreign sources
(control of patents and machinery); access to
technological education and skilled jobs by national,
economic, social, ethnic, racial and gender
groups; consequences of technology on balance of
payments, balance of trade (e.g. fuel imports);
contributions of developing economies to world-wide
pollution and depletion of resources

Industry and Manufacturing: industry vs. manufacturing
(capital vs. consumer goods); obstacles to developing
industry and manufacturing; effect on other sectors with
government policy of "modernisation" in terms of
allocation of resources, (capital, technology, population
distribution), effect on prices and wages; sources of
capital and distribution of profits; relative efficacy of
free-market vs. state controlled or mixed economy;
development of internal and external markets; relationship

¹² Useful additional resources and class texts for both
parts of this unit: Georgina Ashworth ed. CHANGE: International
Reports: Women and Society, a series of pamphlets on women in
different parts of the world. Each speaks not only of women's
experience, but also of some key political or economic questions,
for example: "Military Ideology and the Dissolution of Democracy
Women in Chile," "Economic Development and Women's Place: Women
in Singapore," "The New Soviet Woman: Model or Myth?"

between industrialisation and overall economic and social goals of the country
Economic Development and the World Economy: the theory of dependency (relations between developing and developed nations); role of transnational corporations, the "trickle down" theory and realities"; role of international organisations (e.g. World Bank, International Monetary Fund, United Nations agencies) vs. unilateral alliances and aid programs (e.g. AID); efforts to alter patterns by cooperation between suppliers of primary products, between nations in a region, through international organisations (NIEO, North-South dialogues) and the obstacles encountered

Throughout the unit, discussions and readings can consider specific examples from the Hemisphere which raise questions about both the political and economic aspects of the era:

- US efforts to bring about economic and social change, and to control the executive (Great Society and Watergate)
- Quebecois in Canada and the movement for constitutional reform
- causes of the Chilean coup in 1972: external vs. internal forces
- dependency theories and common fallacies about developing countries
- the varieties of land reform and industrialisation in the Hemisphere; relative successes and failures
- capitalism, corporatism and socialism as alternative modes of development
- role of transnationals in developing and developed countries
- political, social and cultural role of religion in the Hemisphere
- discussion of the concept of progress: alternative definitions, goals vs. realities, advantages and liabilities
- formulation of an original development plan for a nation (including political and economic circumstances, resources, goals, obstacles and constraints)

V. ADDITIONAL MATERIALS FOR TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

A. Periodicals

A number of periodicals often include material of special relevance to a comparative historical approach and to the history of the Americas: Current History (Philadelphia, Pa.); Latin American Research Review (Latin American Studies Association, University of New Mexico, Albuquerque, N. Mex.); The History Teacher (The Society for History Education, California State University at Long Beach); World History Bulletin (World History Association, Papillio, Nebr.).

The following articles may be of particular interest:

Axtell, James, "A North American Perspective for Colonial History," The History Teacher, Vol. XII, no. 4 (August, 1979), pp. 549-562.

Describes the advantages of a comparative and interdisciplinary approach to this period.

Curtin, Philip D. "Depth, Span, and Relevance," American Historical Review, Vol. 89, no. 1 (February, 1984), pp. 1-9.

In an effort to reformulate the introductory history course, he asks: How we come to be as we are? How the world has come to be as it is? How and why do societies change over time? He advocates the comparative approach to find the answers.

Degler, Carl N., "In Pursuit of an American History," American Historical Review, Vol. 92, no. 1 (February, 1984), pp. 1-12.

He advocates a comparative framework for United States history to better answer the question: What does it mean to be a citizen of the United States?

Grew, Raymond, "The Case for Comparing Histories," American Historical Review, Vol. 85, no. 4 (October, 1980), pp. 763-778.

He surveys the types of comparison possible, the underlying premises, and the advantages of the comparative approach.

Hennessy, Alistair, "America and the Americas," History Today (February, 1984), pp. 16-24.

He gives a justification and rationale for a study of the whole Hemisphere using the example of the frontiers and the effects of environment.

Higginbotham, Don, "The Uses and Abuses of Comparative History," Latin American Research Review, Vol. XIII, no. 3 (1978), pp. 238-245.

Reviewing a collection of papers on the independence revolutions in Mexico and the United States, he gives a case study in comparison.

Iriye, Akira, "The Internationalization of History," American Historical Review, Vol. 94, no. 1 (February, 1989), pp.1-10.

This is a reasoned explanation for the study of international history by a specialist on Asia.

Mörner, Magnus and Julia Fawaz de Vinuela, John D. French, "Comparative Approaches to Latin American History," Latin American Research Review, Vol. XVII, no. 3 (1982), pp. 55-89.

They discuss the use of comparison in the social sciences and survey much of the existing work including Klein on the slave trade, Hennessy on frontiers.

B. Specialized Guides and Books (By Region)

WORLD-WIDE

Problems in American Civilization, Problems in European Civilization (series). DC Heath.

The Organization of American Historians, Restoring Women to History: Teaching Packets for Integrating Women's History into Courses on Africa, Asia, Latin America, the Caribbean and the Middle East. (Available through OAH in Bloomington, Ind.)

Reese, Lyn and Jean Wilkinson, eds. Women in the World: Annotated History Resources for the Secondary Student. Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1987.

Reilly, Kevin, ed. World History: Selected Reading Lists and Course Outlines from American [United States] Colleges and Universities. Marcus Wiener Publishers, Inc., 1987.

Ashworth, Georgina, ed. CHANGE: International Reports: Women and Society. (A pamphlet series on countries in the Americas, Africa, Asia, the Middle East and Europe available at PO Box 824, London SE24 9JS)

Bennett, A. Leroy, International Organizations: Principles and Issues. Prentice-Hall, 1988 ed.

Burns, Edward McNall and Philip Lee Ralph, World Civilizations: Their History and Culture. WW Norton & Company, Inc., 1984 ed.

Howarth, Tony, Twentieth Century History: the World Since 1900. Longman Group Ltd., 1979.

Stoessinger, John G., Why Nations Go to War. St. Martin Press, 1986.

Snyder, Louis L., ed. Fifty Major Documents of the Twentieth Century. Anvil, 1979 ed.

Thompson, Vincent Bakpetu, The Making of the African Diaspora in the Americas 1441-1900. Longman Inc., 1987.

Wolf, Eric, Peasant Wars of the Twentieth Century. Harper & Row Publishers, 1973.

CANADA

Center for Study of Canada, SUNY-Plattsburgh, The Canadian Studies Teaching Strategies and Resource Guide for Use at the Secondary Level. 1989 (This guide and a free newsletter are available from the Center, 133 Court St., Plattsburgh, NY 12901)

Bennett, Paul W. and Nick Brune, Cornelius J. Jaenen, Alan Skeoch, Canada: A North American Nation. McGraw-Hill Ryerson Ltd., 1989. (A comparative textbook)

Francis, R. Douglas and Donald B. Smith eds. Readings in Canadian History: Pre-Confederation and Post-Confederation. Holt, Rinehart Winston of Canada, Ltd., 1982.

McNaught, Kenneth, The Pelican History of Canada. Penguin Books, 1982.

Prentice, Alison, et.al. Canadian Women: A History. Harcourt, Brace of Canada, 1988.

THE CARIBBEAN

Claypole, William, and John Robottom, Caribbean Story: Foundations and The Inheritors. Longman Group, Ltd., 1981.

Ellis, Pat, ed. Women of the Caribbean. Humanities Press International, Inc., 1986.

Knight, Franklin W. and Colin A. Palmer, The Modern Caribbean. The University of North Carolina Press, 1989.

LATIN AMERICA

Henderson, James D., "An Annotated List of Videotapes and Films Useful in the Teaching of Latin American History," Newsletter of the Conference on Latin American History, Vol. 23, no. 2 (October, 1987), pp. 12-14.

Stoner, K. Lynn, "Directions in Latin American Women's History, 1977-1985," Latin American Research Review, Vol. XII, no. 2 (1989).

Bushnell, David and Neill Macaulay, The Emergence of Latin America in the Nineteenth Century. Oxford University Press, 1988.

Bromley, Rosemary D.F. and Ray Bromley, South American Development: A Geographical Introduction. Cambridge University Press, 1988 ed.

Didion, Joan, Salvador. Washington Square Press, 1983.

Graham, Richard, Independence in Latin America: A Comparative Approach. Knopf, 1972.

Hahner, June E., Women in Latin American History. Latin America Series no. 51, UCLA Latin America Center, 1980.

Petras, James F. ed., Latin America: Bankers, Generals and the Struggle for Social Justice. Rowman & Littlefield, 1986.

Scobie, James R. ed., Latin American Histories. Oxford University Press (separate volumes on Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, the Caribbean, Central America, Chile, Cuba, Mexico, Venezuela and Peru).

Skidmore, Thomas E., and Peter H. Smith, Modern Latin America. Oxford University Press, 1989 ed.

UNITED STATES

Lerner, Gerda, Teaching Women's History. American Historical Association, 1981.

Bailey Thomas A., and David M. Kennedy, The American Pageant. D.C. Heath, 1987 ed.

Heffner, Richard D. ed., A Documentary History of the United States. New American Library, 1985 ed.

Hymowitz, Carol and Michaela Weissman, A History of Women in America. Bantam, 1981.

Linderman, Frank B., Pretty Shield: Medicine Woman of the Crows. University of Nebraska Press, 1974.

Morgan, Edmund S., The Birth of the Republic 1763-89. The University of Chicago Press, 1977.

Zinn, Howard, The Twentieth Century: A People's History. Harper & Row, 1984.

D. Film and Video Distributors

The following distributors have films and/or videos of particular interest to the study of the Americas:

Canadian Consulate General (212) 586-2400
Public Affairs Office
1251 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10020

Filmakers Library (212) 355-6545
133 E. 58th St.
New York, NY 10022

First Run Features (212) 243-0600
153 Waverly Place
New York, NY 10014

First Run/Icarus Films (212) 674-3375
200 Park Avenue South, Suite 1319
New York, NY 10003

National Film Board of Canada (212) 586-5131
1251 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10020

New Day Films (201) 628-9111
22 Riverview Drive
Wayne, NJ 07470

New Yorker Films (212) 247-6110
16 W. 61st St.
New York, NY 10023

The Cinema Guild (212) 246-5522
1697 Broadway
New York, NY 10019

United Nations (212) 754-1234
Radio and Visual Services Division
Office of Public Information
New York, NY 10017

UNICEF-TV Room A-6106 (212) 754-1234 ext. 2035
United Nations, New York 10017

Women Make Movies, Inc. (212) 925-0606
225 Lafayette St. #212
New York, NY 10012

Zenger Video (800) 421-4246
10200 Jefferson Blvd., Room 96
PO Box 802
Culver City, CA 90232-0802