#### DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 315 764 CS 212 145

AUTHOR Beach, Richard; Hynds, Susan

TITLE Research on the Learning and Teaching of Literature:

Selected Bibliography. Resource Series R.1.

INSTITUTION Center for the Learning and Teaching of Literature,

Albany, NY.

SPONS AGENCY National Endowment for the Arts, Washington, D.C.;

Office of Educational Research and Improvement (ED),

Washington, DC.

PUB DATE Apr 89
GRANT G008720278

NOTE 57p.

AVAILABLE FROM Center for the Learning and Teaching of Literature,

School of Education, 1400 Washington Ave., ED B-9, University at Albany, State University of New York,

Albany, NY 12222 (\$7.00).

PUB TYPE Reference Materials - Bibliographies (131)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC03 Plus Postage.

DESCRIPTORS Annotated Bibliographies; Discourse Analysis;

Educational Research; Elementary Secondary Education;

Higher Education; \*Literary Criticism; \*Literary
Genres; \*Literature Appreciation; \*Reader Response;

\*Reader Text Relationship; Reading Writing Relationship; Research Methodology; Sex

Differences

IDENTIFIERS Text Factors

#### ABSTRACT

Including only selections that have employed some systematic analysis of readers' responses to literary texts, this annotated bibliography lists 203 research studies. The selections date from 1970 through 1988. The bibliography is divided into sections on the following topics: (1) reader variables (subdivided into orientation, development, and gender variables); (2) text variables (listing studies on the influence of text); (3) response processes (subdivided into general, engagement, and interpretation responses); (4) instruction (listing studies on the influence of instruction); and (5) research methodology (listing studies on research methodology). (NKA)

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made

\* from the original document.



Research on the Learning and Teaching of Literature: Selected Bibliography

Richard Beach Susan Hynds

Center for the
Learning &
Teaching of Literature

University at Albany
State University of New York
School of Education
1400 Washington Avenue
Albany, New York 12222

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

Office of Educational Research and Improvemost

EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION OF NEER (ERIC)

- (1) This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization organization organization.
- Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality
- Foints of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OFRI position or policy.

# Research on the Learning and Teaching of Literature: Selected Bibliography

Richard Beach Susan Hynds

Center for the Learning and Teaching of Literature
University at Albany
State University of New York
1400 Washington Avenue, Albany, New York 12222

Resource Series R.1

**April 1989** 

Preparation of this report was supported in part by grant number G008720278, which is cosponsored by the U.S. Department of Education, Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI/ED), and by the National Endowment for the Arts (NEA). However, the opinions expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the position or policy of OERI/ED or NEA, and no official endorsement of either agency should be inferred.



# Center for the Learning and Teaching of Literature

The Center for the Learning and Teaching of Literature is a research and development center located at the University at Albany, State University of New York. The Center was established in 1987 with funds from the U.S. Department of Education, Office of Educational Research and Improvement, and from the National Endowment for the Arts. The Center's mission is to improve the teaching of content knowledge and critical-thinking strategies that contribute to literary understanding, particularly at the middle and high school levels.

Center-sponsored research falls into three broad areas: 1) surveys of current practice in the teaching of literature, including studies of both what is taught and how it is taught; 2) studies of alternative approaches to instruction and their effects on students' knowledge of literature and critical-thinking abilities; and 3) studies of alternative approaches to the assessment of literature achievement, including both classroom-based and larger-scale approaches to testing.

The Center also promotes good practice in the teaching of literature through conferences and seminars, through the development of computerized bibliographies on research and practice in the teaching of literature, and through publications that present the Center's own research and provide other resources for research and practice. To receive a list of current publications, please write to CLTL, School of Education, The University at Albany, 1400 Washington Avenue, Albany, NY 12222.

Director:

Arthur N. Applebee

Co-Directors:

Judith A. Langer

Alan C. Purves

Assistant Director:

Genevieve T. Bronk

Center Faculty:

Lil Brannon
Eugene Garber
Peter Johnston
C. H. Knoblauch
James Marshall
Arnulfo Ramirez
Wayne Ross
Sean Walmsley

Editorial Assistant:

Jennifer Jeffers



# Contents

Overview	1
Reader Variables	
1. Orientation	3
2. Development	12
3. Gender	24
Text Variab.	26
4. Studies on the Influence of Text	26
Response Processes	
5. Response Processes: General	31
6. Response Processes: Engagement	36
7. Response Processes: Interpretation	38
Instruction	
8. Studies on the Influence of Instruction	40
Research Methods	
9. Studies on Research Methodology	51



# Research on the Learning and Teaching of Literature: Selected Bibliography

Richard Beach University of Minnesota

Susan Hynds
Syracuse University

#### Overview

#### Criteria for Inclusion

In order to be included in this selected bibliography, the studies must have employed some systematic analysis of readers' responses to literary texts, even though, in some cases, that analysis was not empirical. We excluded reading comprehension research with literary texts in which the primary interest was determining comprehension. We have only included research published in English, thereby excluding a large body of research recently published in Europe, particularly in West and East Germany and in Hungary. The research also must have been completed after 1970.

#### Research Reviews

For a summary of research conducted prior to 1970, see Alan Purves and Richard Beach, Literature and the reader: Research on response to literature, reading interests, and the teaching of literature, Urbana, Ill: National Council of Teachers of English.

For summary reviews of later research see:

Applebee, A. (1977). The elements of response to a literary work: What we have learned. Research in the Teaching of English, 11, 255-271.

Beach, R., & Appleman, D. (1983). Reading strategies for expository and literary text types. In A. Purves and O. Niles (Eds.), <u>Becoming readers in a complex society</u>. Lighty-third Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Beach, R., & Hynds, S. (in press). Research on response to literature. In R. Barr, M. Kamil, P. Mosenthal, & P.D. Pearson (Eds.), <u>Handbook of Reading Research</u>, <u>Volume II</u>. White Plains, NY: Longman.

Cooper, C. (Ed.). (1985). Researching response to literature and the teaching of literature. Norwood, NJ: Ablex.

Galda, L. (1983). Research in response to literature. <u>Journal of Research and Development in Education 16</u>, 1-8.



Galda, L. (1982). Assessment: Response to Literature. In A. Berger & A.H. Robinson (Eds.) <u>Secondary School Reading</u>. Urbana, Ill: NCRE and ERIC/RCS.

Klemenz-Belgardt, E. (1981). American research on response to literature: The empirical studies. <u>Poetics</u>, <u>10</u>, 357-380.

#### Categories for Organization of the Research

We have organized this bibliography according to the following categories which we define at the beginning of each major section. All studies were categorized based on the primary focus of that study. In some cases, studies are categorized according to one additional secondary focus. At the end of each primary focus section, these secondary focus studies are cross referenced by authors' names.

#### Reader Variables

- 1. Orientation
- 2. Development
- 3. Gender

#### Text Variables

4. Studies on the influence of text

#### Response Processes

- 5. Response Processes: General
- 6. Response Processes: Engagement
- 7. Response Processes: Interpretation

#### Instruction

8. Studies on the Influence of Instruction

#### Research Methodology

9. Studies on Research Methodology



#### Reader Variables

These studies focus on characteristics of readers and/or the influences of reader characteristics on response. For purposes of this review these categories are defined as follows:

- 1. Orientation: The reader's stance, approach, personality, reading style, goals, values, beliefs, cultural influences, and knowledge.
- 2. Development: Studies which focus on differences among readers in terms of age, cognitive development and social-cognitive abilities.
- 3. Gender: Studies which focus on the influence of gender on response.

#### 1. Orientation

1.1 Banks, M. (1987). An analysis of nineteenth century black responses to <u>Uncle Tom's Cabin</u> as recorded in selected antebellum black newspapers: 1852-1855. (Doctoral dissertation, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts</u>, 47, 1852A-1853A.

This study examined the nature of blacks' published reactions to the novel <u>Uncle Tom's Cabin</u> appearing in black newspapers over a three-year period, from the novel's initial date of publication (1852) to 1855. While initial responses were positive, later responses were increasingly negative, expressing skepticism and anger about the inferior images of blacks as portrayed in the novel.

1.2 Beach, R. (1983). Attitudes, social conventions, and response to literature. <u>Journal of Research and Development in Education</u>, 16, 47-53.

This study examines the differences between high school and college students' attitudes toward literature teaching and the responses to a story portraying a literature teacher. Forty-five 11th grade students and 45 college preservice English education majors were administered the Gallo "Attitude Towards Poetry Teaching Scale" (1968). Students also rated the appropriateness of and responded to specific acts in a story portraying a relatively "traditional" literature teacher. Students' responses were clustered according to similarity of content. The high school students' had significantly more "traditional" scores on the attitude scale than the college students. Similarly, high school students responded more positively to more "traditional" teacher behaviors in the story than did the college students.

1.3 Beach, R. (1985). Discourse conventions and researching response to literary dialogue. In C. Cooper (Ed.), Researching response to literature and the teaching of literature. Norwood, NJ: Ablex.

This report discusses examples of readers' applications of knowledge of speech-act, social, and literary conventions to make inferences about characters' traits, beliefs, goais, knowledge, and plans from dialogue presented. It also reports the results of a study of 30 high school and 30 college students' inferences in response to 16 specific dialogue acts in a one-act comic play about marriage. Students' inferences were clustered according to those representing long-term versus immediate goals. College students' inferences were ranked significantly higher than high school students' inferences for 12 of 16 dialogue acts, a difference representing the college students' knowledge of marriage and comic conventions.



(i

1.4 Blake, R., & Lumm, A. (1986). Responding to poetry: High school students read poetry. English Journal, 75(2), 68-73.

This study was conducted to see how five untrained high school students responded to a new poem. The students were asked to read a new poem aloud, interpret it, and tape record that interpretation. The taped responses were analyzed to see how different readers approached problematic parts of the poem, and an in-depth analysis of one reader's response was conducted. Results suggest that rereading is essential in poetry understanding and that individuals respond differently to the same poem.

1.5 Bleich, D. (1986a). Cognitive stereoscopy and the study of language and literature. In B. Peterson (Ed.), Convergences. Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English.

Based on a theory of knowing texts as experiencing an intersubjective integration of different perspectives, this study asked teachers to retell and discuss a story. The responses are discussed in terms of the degree to which readers explored alternative perspectives and were aware of the influence of their own perspective on their responses. Analysis of two teachers' responses indicated that one teacher was concerned with the perspective defined in terms of power and the value of authority—a perspective she reflected on and questioned—while the other was concerned with the value of competence and duty, a perspective he accepted without self-reflection.

1.6 Cullinan, R., Harwood, K., & Galda, L. (1983). The reader and the story: Comprehension and response. <u>Journal of Research and Development in Education</u>, 16, 29-38.

This research studied the responses of fourth, sixth, and eighth grade students to two novels. Six students at each grade level were asked focused questions individually and in groups following the reading of each novel. The study suggested that there is a direct relationship between story preference and comprehension. Students expectations determined story comprehension and evaluation.

1.7 Culp, M. (1977). Case studies of the influence of literature on the attitudes, values, and behaviors of adolescents. Research in the Teaching of English, 11, 245-253.

This report presents case sindy analyses of the influence of reading literature on two college freshman students' attitudes, values, and behaviors: one who experienced a strong influence, and the other, minimal influence. Five students were selected for case studies from a larger pool of 158 students. Students were interviewed and completed a self-classification check list regarding their reading orientation (Shirley, 1966). Students most frequently cited influences on their attitudes in terms of self-mage, sensitivity to others, awareness of moral/ethical issues, and social problems. Students were most influenced by novels of their own choosing. Heavy readers who could involve themselves with texts were more likely to be influenced than light readers.

1.8 DeVries, J. (1973). A statistical analysis of undergraduate readers: Responses to selected characters in Shakespeare's <u>The Tempest</u>. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Illinois.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 34, 5906A.

The purpose of this study was to determine changes in readers' evaluative reactions as the readers moved through a play. One hundred college students applied seventeen, 15-point semantic differential scales to students' ratings of certain events; findings indicated that as the students read through the play their perception of characters increased in complexity. Students' primary interest shifted from a focus on plot in the beginning of the play to character interactions at the end of the play. Self-concept had little influence on ratings.



1.9 Dillon, U. (1982). Styles of reading. Poetics Today, 3, 77-88.

This study examines readers' responses to Faulkner's "A Rose for Emily," focusing particularly on how readers perceive the chronological sequence or "event chain" of the story. The study concludes that readers adopt these basic styles of reading: "Character-Action-Moral," "Digger for Secrets," and "Anthropologist." Results further indicate that readers understand life and literature in similar ways.

1.10 Faggiani, L. (1971). The relationship of attitude to response in the reading of a poem by ninth-grade students. (Doctoral dissertation, New York University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts</u>, 31,4004A-4005A.

Analysis of the relationship between ninth-grade students' scores on an attitude-towards-death scale and their responses to a poem about death indicated no significant relationship. Highly positive or highly negative attitudes towards death were related to the degree of involvement in the poem.

1.11 Gilman, I. (1986). Student responses to two literary passages and two paintings as they relate to the perception of stylistic complexity and the dimension of extraversion-introversion. (Doctoral dissertation, New York University.) <u>Dissertation & bstracts International</u>, 47, 1223A.

This study examined the relationships between students' introversion/extroversion as measured by the Eysenck Personality Inventory and perceived stylistic complexity of two literary passages and two paintings. One hundred forty-two students responded to two literary passages and two paintings using semantic differential pairs to measure perceived stylistic complexity, interest, and pleasure. Results indicated that students who assess verbal and visual artwork as stylistically complex are more likely to give lower pleasure rating than students assessing them as stylistically simple. Ambiverts and extroverts tend to be more similar to each other than to introverts in pleasure assessments of paintings. Analysis of four students' written response suggested that interest and pleasure are not meaningfully discriminated from general evaluation.

1.12 Gross, L. (1978). A study of the relationship between selected oral readings in sex-role oriented children's literature and the personal and social adjustment of the self-concept of children in grades one and three. (Doctoral dissertation, Rutgers University.) <u>Dissertations Abstracts International</u>, 38, 6668A.

This researcher explored the effect of gender in picture books on the self-concept level of first and third graders. The subjects were divided into three groups who were read one book a day for three weeks. Group one was read male-oriented books, group two was read female-oriented books, and group three was read books which were both male and female oriented. Pre- and post- test scores on the California Test of Personality showed that combination picture books were most positive for improving self-concept.

1.13 Hoffstaedter, P. (1987). Poetic text processing and its empirical investigation. <u>Poetics</u>, 16, 75-91.

This study examined the degree to which "poeticity" is a property of learned text-processing strategies rather than a property of text elements. Forty adults rated 29 texts (poems, passages from novels, and articles) according to the degree to which the texts were "poetic," noted words contributing to their ratings, and reformulated the text to make them less "poetic." Certain text properties—syntactical deviations and recurrences or parallelisms—consistently contributed to a sense of "poeticity." When the same 24 poems were presented to readers as selections in a poetry anthology or as passages from newspaper articles, there were significant differences



between the two contexts for "poeticity" ratings for 10 of the 24 poems, a mixed result. Case-study analyses of think-alouds of a native and non-native reader indicated that the non-native reader perceived text difficulty as contributing to a sense of "poeticity."

1.14 Holland, N. (1973). Poems in persons. New York: W.W. Norton.

This book explores the mind of the poet H.D. to reveal the relation between her poetic style and her total identity. The author then compares the personalities and experiences of two people reading a selected poem by H.D. The book explores the ways in which personal experiences can be shared and private readings become communal.

1.15 Holland, N. (1975). Five readers reading. New Haven: Vale.

This study used psychological tests and extensive interviews to explore the ways in which five readers responded to classic short stories. Results support a transactional theory of literary response, in which readers apprehend literary texts through their own personality styles, defenses, fantasies, adaptive structures, and identities.

1.16 Hunt, R. & Vipond, D. The reader, the text, the situation: Blocks and affordances in literary reading. Unpublished report, Department of Psychology, St. Thomas University, New Brunswick, Canada. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 284 298)

Analysis of college students' responses to John Updike's "A & P" indicated that the majority of the responses were negative. Content analysis of responses indicated that the negative evaluations were due to students' confusion over use of descriptive details and disapproval of the characters' behavior and the story resolution. These students may have read the story in terms of a "story-driven" orientation rather than a "point-driven" orientation. Those students who adopted a "point-driven" orientation were more likely to define the intentional use of descriptive details or characters' actions as contributing to understanding the point of the story.

1.17 Hunt, R., & Vipond, D. (1985). Crash-testing a transactional model of literary learning. Reader, 14, 23-39.

This report of three studies dealing with readers' orientations was based on analyses of one hour interviews employing "think-alouds" and retrospective questions.

In the first study, 12 undergraduates' and 12 faculty members' ratings of response statements indicate that undergraduates were significantly more likely to prefer a "story-driven" orientation (focusing on the enjoyment of the story) as compared to a "point-driven" orientation (reading in terms of the point).

The purpose of the second study was to determine students' ability to attend to "evaluations" signaling "tellability" or the point of a story (Labov, 1972). College students responded to two different versions of a story—the original with "evaluations" and a version with "evaluations" replaced. After each page, students were asked to list phrases that were most likely to "catch their eye"; students were most likely to list the "evaluations."

The third study determined the effects of reading stories from three different perspectives. Seventy college students were assigned to one of three different treatments involving responses to three stories—"information-driven": short-answer responses about details in the stories; "story-driven": short summary of the main events; and "point-driven": short summary of the main events and purpose of the story. Students responded to open-ended questions and response probes. Students in the "information-driven" group had significantly slower reading times than students in the other groups; students in the "point-driven" group were most likely to slow down in the final pages and were more likely to interpret than students in the other



groups.

1.18 Jacobsen, M. (1982). Looking for literary space: The willing suspension of disbelief revisited. Research in the <u>Teaching of English</u>, 16, 21-38.

This study compared the orientations of 26 college students in terms of their willingness to enter into the "world" or "potential space" of two short stories. Students were asked to describe their physical experiences of their "place" or "space" by visualizing their responses in diagrams and discussing those diagrams. Students varied in their willingness to suspend their disbelief or to apply their own experience, their lack of interest in the text, their difficulty with language, their lack of trust in the speaker, and their critical reaction to the attitudes implied by the text.

1.19 Kintgen, E. (1986). Expectations and processes in reading poetic narratives. <u>Empirical</u> Studies of the Arts, 4, 79-95.

This study analyzed two adult readers' oral taped responses to an experimental poem in terms of the influence of their expectations on their responses. Readers expected that poetry is unified, each part contributing to a coherent whole, that certain poetic devices are employed, and that a serious tone is employed. The degree to which readers' expectations were or were not satisfied shaped their evaluations and responses.

1.20 Kintgen, E., & Holland, N. (1984). Carlos reads a poem. College English, 44, 459-486.

This study focuses on the response and interpretation processes of one graduate student reader. The focal informant was given an "I-test" based on Kelly's personal construct theory and asked to respond to a poem. Results indicated that reading combines both communal and personal aspects, and that readers use communal resources to fulfill personal aims, choosing only those interpretive approaches to texts that serve their own needs, goals, and values.

1.21 Lee, S. (1985). Comparative responses to literature by Korean and American college students. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 47, 1635A.

Sixty Korean and 41 American college freshmen were asked to write responses to two stories, one from each culture. Analysis of responses using the Purves categories indicated that each group's response patterns remained the same whether the story was from their own culture or the second culture. Both groups responded most strongly in the category of perception. Koreans responded more frequently in engagement and Americans in evaluation, differences reflecting differences in cultural values.

1.22 Mauro, L. (1983). Personal constructs and response to literature: Case studies of adolescents reading about death. (Doctoral dissertation, Rutgers University.) <u>Dissertation</u> Abstracts International, 44, 2072A.

This study examines the influence of five adolescent subjects' personal constructs regarding death in their responses to selected literature about death and dying. Oral responses were analyzed according to implied personal constructs, Applebee's (1978) response modes, and use of evaluative response. The results revealed that each student's response was highly complex and personal. The diversity of readers' perceptions of death and dying, their expectations about texts, and their assumptions about the response process were all reflected in their response to the text. Evaluations of texts were related to the confirmation and disconfirmation of content, form, and readers' processing.

1.23 McConnell, M. (1983). The effect of literature exposure and writing practice on the original narrative writing of 2nd grade children. (Doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University.)



### Dissertation Abstracts International, 43, 2619A.

The effect of experience with literature and writing practice on original narrative writing of second graders was explored. The results revealed that those students with high literature exposure and frequent writing practice were correlated with high holistic ratings on their creative writing.

1.24 McCormick, K. (1987). Task representation in writing about literature. <u>Poetics</u>, <u>16</u>, 131-154.

This study discussed examples of "response statements" representing different cognitive and cultural representations of the response task. Students varied in their conception of strategies and goals appropriate for certain tasks. They also developed an awareness of the influence of cultural attitudes on their responses.

1.25 Meutsch, D. (1987). Cognitive processes in reading literary texts: The influence of context, goals, and situations. <u>Empirical Studies of the Arts</u>, 5, 115-135.

The purpose of this study was to determine the influence of stance and goals on readers' responses. Seventy-two college students were assigned to one of four groups in a 2 (stance: literary versus non-literary) x 2 (goal: summary versus interpretation) design. Students responded in a free-response mode to a report. Students adopting a literary stance made more literary elaborations, while students with a non-literary stance made more non-literary elaborations.

1.26 Noda, L. A. (1981). Literature and culture: Japanese and American reader responses to modern Japanese short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, New York University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 41, 4894A.

The differences in responses of adult Japanese readers to adult American readers were investigated in this case study. Modern Japanese short stories were read by both groups, and their responses were recorded in an interview. The results indicated that culture is an important factor in reader response.

1.27 Petrosky, A. (1976). The effects of reality perceptions and fantasy on response to literature: Two case studies. Research in the Teaching of English, 10, 239-258.

This study examined the influence of two ninth-grade students' personality orientations on their responses as determined by analysis of patterns in the responses to the Thematic Apperception Test and to various texts. One student's need to control was manifested in her reluctance to express her thoughts and feelings. In contrast, the other student's need to share and desire to explore were manifested in a willingness to express her thoughts and feelings.

1.28 Purves, A., Foshay, A., & Hansson, G. (1973). <u>Literature education in ten countries</u>. New York: John Wiley.

The purpose of this international assessment was to determine the degree to which 14- and 17-year-old students' response preferences, as determined by selecting 5 most preferred response options from 20 options representing different response types, varied across ten different countries and across different short stories. Students' responses varied across countries, with 17-year-olds being more consistent than 12-year-olds. Despite some consistencies across the different countries, students preferences varied across countries according to two basic continuums: emphasis on "content" versus "form," and an "impersonal" versus "personal" orientation, differences that reflected the particular response emphasis of the literature curriculums of each of those countries.



1.29 Ross, C. (1978). A comparative study of the responses made by grade eleven Vancouver students to Canadian and New Zealand poems. Research in the Teaching of English, 12, 297-306.

This study examined the influence of knowing the geographical setting of poetry on students' responses. Four hundred seventy-seven eleventh grade Canadian students listened to tapes of pairs of poems, one poem from Canada and the other from New Zealand. Half of the poems were labeled and half were not labeled regarding their setting. Students' written responses were categorized according to response types. Students' responses did not differ between Canadian and New Zealand poems.

1.30 Salvatori, M. (1983). Reading and writing a text. College English, 45 (7), 657-666.

This case-study analysis of a female college student's written responses sought to determine the relationship of that student's self-concept as a "writer" to her responses. Analysis of the student's writing over the period of a course indicated that the student shifted from an impersonal stance of "distancing" herself from a text to a stance of active engagement and reflection on the relationship between a text and her own life.

1.31 Shedd, P. (1976). The relationship between attitude of the reader towards women's changing role and response to literature which illuminates women's role. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 142 956)

The effects of attitude of the reader toward women's changing role on the reader's response to literature that illuminated women's role was explored. Six male and six female high school seniors with I.Q.'s of 120 or above were selected because half favored women's changing role and half did not. Students read and responded to four short stories: two short stories illuminated women's role and two short stories had no bearing on that issue. Results were obtained from quantitative data and qualitative analysis of individual interviews. Results revealed that readers who favored women's changing role made a significantly higher proportion of affective responses to the stories which dealt with that subject than did their peers, while the two groups did not differ in response to the neutral stories.

1.32 Somers, A. B. (1973). Responses of advanced and average readers in grades seven, nine, and eleven to two dissimilar short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, Florida State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 33, 4252A.

This study analyzed the responses of seventh, ninth, and eleventh grade students who were advanced and average readers. Students read short stories and produced written free responses to their readings. Purves (1968) categories were used to analyze responses. Results indicated that students primarily preferred the evaluative mode, but also were concerned with perception and interpretation of content, especially characters and events. Students rarely responded to form or technique, except to plot. Seventh grade students were more involved in the stories, and advanced readers made significantly more interpretations to theme oriented stories.

1.33 Svensson, C. (1985). The construction of poetic meaning: A cultural-developmental study of symbolic and non-symbolic strategies in the interpretation of contemporary poetry. Lund, Sweden: Liber Forlag.

The purpose of these two studies was to determine the relationship between readers' background knowledge of literature and their ability to interpret literature. In the first study, 72 subjects at ages 11, 14, and 18 completed questionnaires regarding their literary background: amount of story-telling in the home, amount of reading, and orientation in reading. Students



also responded to four poems and were interviewed about their inferences about the point of the poems and reasons for their inferences. Interview answers were categorized as "literal descriptive," "literal interpretive," "mixed literal/thematic," "thematic," "mixed literal/symbolic," and "symbolic." There was a significant relationship between background knowledge of literature and level of interpretation across age levels; age level was also significantly related to level of interpretation (see Svensson, 1987). The second study was designed to determine the influence of the typographical arrangement of poems on students' inferences about figurative and symbolic meanings. One hundred forty-four students at ages 11, 14, and 18 responded in writing to the original versions of poems and to poems rearranged into "prose." Differences in graphic arrangements affected the number of figurative and symbolic inferences, particularly in the older groups. The fact that graphic arrangement was significantly related for the 14-year-old group, but not for the 11-year-old group suggests an increasing knowledge of literary form.

1.34 Viehoff, R. (1986). How to construct a literary poem? Poetics, 15, 287-306.

This study deals with the ways in which readers manage their understanding of textual material. Sixteen subjects were tested individually while thinking aloud about unknown textual material. Results indicated that readers shifted the focus of attention from non-literary ("common") strategies to literary ones if and only if they felt free to refer to their past experience with literature. Results further underscore the idea that literary understanding is governed by established literary conventions.

1.35 Vipond, D., & Hunt, R. (1984). Point-driven understanding: Pragmatic and cognitive dimensions of literary reading. <u>Poetics</u>, 13, 261-277.

Using a modern short story, these authors illustrate the cognitive strategies associated with a "point-driven" orientation toward literary texts. These cognitive operations include coherence, narrative surface, and transactional strategies. The authors suggest a number of testable hypotheses about literary reading and suggest possible methods for testing them.

1.36 Werner, C. (1987). Responses of college readers with different cultural backgrounds to a short story. (Doctoral dissertation, Georgia State University, 1988.) <u>Dissertations Abstracts International</u>, 48, 2266-A.

College students in three ESL and three developmental reading classes wrote responses to a story. The majority of the responses were descriptive in nature rather than interpretative or evaluative. There were no differences in response types between students' responses in the ESL and developmental reading classes.

1.37 Wheeler, V. (1983). Field orientation as a predictor of reader response to literature. (Doctoral discortation, Illinois State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 44, 2756A.

This study analyzed the relationship between the field orientation of community college students as measured by the Group Embedded-Figures Test and their response to a short story. Subjects wrote essays in response to a short story; responses were categorized using the Purves (1968) categories. Subjects who were field independent and older tended to employ interpretation/evaluation responses. Subjects who were field dependent and younger tended to employ engagement-involvement/perception responses.

1.38 Wilson, R. R. (1976). In-depth book discussions of selected sixth graders: Response to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 36, 7195A.

This study explored the responses of eight sixth-grade students to books. Students participated in discussion groups. Their responses were gathered using a repertory grid and

10



 $I_{ij}$ 

categorized using the Squire (1964) categories Results indicated that discussions centered on recurrent themes of friendship, author's purpose, meaning of certain symbols, fantasy situations in realistic works, illustrations in one book, and unique characteristics of the character. The researcher also found that in-depth discussions seemed to generate interest in reading.

1.39 Wilson, J. R. (1965). Responses of college freshmen to three novels. <u>NCTE Research</u> Report No. 7. Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English.

This study was conducted to explore student responses to literature and the influence of classroom experiences on those responses. Each of 54 freshman English students read one of three novels, took notes while reading, and wrote their immediate reactions in class. After three discussion periods, they wrote follow-up reactions. This procedure was repeated with the other novels, resulting in 280 written reports. Responses were coded in seven categories: literary judgme, interpretational, narrational, associational, self-involvement, prescriptive, and miscellaneous. Case studies of nine students suggested that the students' ways of responding to literature were changed—both statistically and individually—by the study of that literature. Students made fewer literary judgments, more interpretations, fewer retellings, and fewer self-involvement responses. The study concluded by making a number of instructional suggestions.

\*See also: 2.9, 2.26, 3.4, 3.6, 3.9, 4.3, 4.14, 4.17, 5.4, 6.2, 7.5, 8.10,

#### 2. Development

2.1 Amigone, G. (1983). Apprehending a literary work of art: A comparative study of interventions into a poem by experienced and inexperienced readers. (Doctoral dissertation, State University of New York at Buffalo.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 44, 486A.

This study compared responses to Robert Lowell's "Skunk Hour" of ten inexperienced readers—students enrolled in a freshman literature class—with responses of five experienced readers with extensive backgrounds in literature. Readers gave holistic responses as well as reactions to preformulated responses in terms of whether the responses were "new" versus "familiar" or "works in my reading" versus "doesn't work."

Experienced readers were more likely to apply knowledge of scientific and biographical information and poetic devices and to conceive of the poem as a gestalt than were the inexperienced readers; the preformulated responses were helpful in stimulating response for the inexperienced readers.

2.2 Applebee, A. (1976). Children's construal of stories and related genres as measured with repertory grid techniques. Research in the Teaching of English, 10, 226-238.

The researcher studied 6-, 9-, and 16-year-olds' thinking about a variety of genres: short stories, television, comics, and film. Using a repertory grid technique, he found no differences due to genre, but did find developmental differences. Six-year-olds think a story really happened and tend to look at events rather than at the story as a whole plot sequence. Nine-year-olds perceive a story as "made-up" but want to see all endings as happy. Sixteen-year-olds become more tolerant of works which challenge the reader's views, move from concerns of readability to concerns with the complexity of adult books, and become more aware of the distance which they perceive between themselves and the work.

2.3 Applebee, A. (1978). A child's concept of story. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Based on a Piagetian model of development, analysis was conducted of 9-, 13-, and 17-year-olds' use of retelling, synopsis, summary, analysis, generalization, and evaluation in discussing stories. The 9- and 13-year-olds were more likely to employ retelling and synopsis, while 17-year-olds were more likely to employ analysis and generalization.

Analysis of the predominant method employed in evaluating the quality of a text indicated that 9-year-olds were significantly more likely to employ a "categoric" method; 13-year-olds were more likely to employ an "analytic" method than 9-year-olds; and 17-year-olds were more likely to employ a "generalizing" method than 13-year-olds.

Relative to different Piagetian stages, preoperational-stage readers characteristically responded in a narrative, retelling mode; concrete operational, a summarization, categorization mode; early formal operational, an analytic/identification mode; and late formal operational, a generalization/interpretation mode.

2.4 Beach, R. & Brunetti, G. (1976). Differences between high school and university students in their conceptions of literary characters. Research in the Teaching of English, 10, 259-268.

This research probed developmental differences between tenth graders and college students in how they conceptualized literary characters. An adjective checklist was used. Results revealed a significant difference due to age of student in conception of character. Younger students were more likely to project their self concept on to the character.



2.5 Beach, R., & Wendler, L. (1987). Developmental differences in response to a story. Research in the Teaching of English, 21, 286-97.

The purpose of this study was to determine the developmental differences between high school and college students' inferences about short story characters' acts, beliefs, and goals. Eighth-graders, 11th graders, college freshmen, and college juniors/seniors responded to specific acts in a story. Students' act, belief, and goal inferences were clustered according to similarity of content, resulting in composite categories for each answer. Ratings of these composite categories indicated that the college students were significantly more likely than the high school students to conceive of the action categories according to degree of focus on social or psychological beliefs as opposed to feelings, and to conceive of the goal categories, according to long-term as opposed to short-term goals.

2.6 Bennett, S. (1979). The relationship between adolescents' levels of moral development and their responses to short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 40, 34A.

The relationship between a reader's level of moral development and his preferred mode of response to literature was investigated. Subjects were 74 white, middle-class adolescent boys from a suburban high school in the San Francisco Bay Area. Students were classified for moral development using James Rest's Determining Issues Test. High or low moral reading had a significant effect on the mode of response. Principled level thinkers more often chose interpretive responses than did conventional thinkers.

2.7 Bunbury, R. (1985). Levels of response to literature. <u>Australian Journal of Reading</u>, 8, 220-228.

Sixty Australian 7-, 9-, and 11-year-old students were interviewed about responses to three different modes: poems, folk tales, and stories. The percentages of literal versus inferential responses were as follows: 7-year-olds: 73% and 19%; 9-year-olds: 61% and 29%; and 11-year-olds: 35% and 54%. While differences in literary mode had no effect on level of inference, the nature of the interviewer/student interaction did have an influence.

2.8 Crowhurst, M., & Kooy, M. (1986). The use of response journals in teaching the novel. Reading-Canada-Lecture, 3, 256-266.

Thirty-two ninth grade and 14 twelfth grade students responded in daily journal entries to novels. Journals were analyzed according to comments about structure, hypotheses, personal responses, and style. Ninth graders were more likely to respond to structure and less likely to respond to style than twelfth graders. There were no grade-level differences for hypotheses and personal responses.

2.9 Cullinan, B., Galda, L., & Harwood, K. (1983). The readers and the story: Comprehension and response. <u>Journal of Research and Development in Education</u>, 16, 9-22.

The purpose of this study was to examine the influence of developmental differences in prior knowledge of narrative conventions on children's responses to stories. Eighteen students in grades four, six, and eight were interviewed about their prior knowledge and responses to one of two fantasy novels; students also participated in small group discussions. Raters analyzed the responses according to students' stated and actual knowledge of story elements. Analysis of story recall using the Applebee categories (1978) indicated a steady progression with age from retelling/synopsis to summary and analysis. Fourth graders focused on literal aspects and simple messages; sixth graders, on some symbolic meanings and some thematic meanings; and eighth graders, on multiple meanings and implications for themselves. Students' expectations for story form influenced their story evaluations.

2.10 Fisher, R. (1985). A comparison of tenth grade students' discussion to adults' small group discussions in response to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Virginia Polytechnic Institute.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 47 (6), 2062A.

This study compared how the responses of tenth grade students in a discussion group compared to adults in a discussion group. Groups were divided by treatments: a reflective reading group which used highly structured, teacher-directed questions; the question group, which had no adult leader but chose questions from the list used by the reflective group; and a free discussion group, which participated in free discussions with no direction and no adult guide. Tape recordings were made of the discussion sessions and transcribed. Categories of analysis were comprehensiveness of discussion, length of responses, nature of inappropriateness, breadth of participation, and change of mind of a discussant. Responses were also categorized as factual, inferential, experiential, judgmental, miscellaneous, and appropriate or inappropriate. No clear patterns of change were found as a result of treatment, but students in free response groups offered responses that were categorically more like the responses of adults in their final free response.

2.11 Fusco, E. (1983). The relationship between children's level of cognitive development and their response to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Hofstra University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 45, 05A.

This study explored the relationship between students' cognitive level of development and their response to literature. Middle school students' oral and written responses in a group discussion about a book were recorded and students' scores analyzed using the SOLO response taxonomy. Three cognitive ability tests were gathered and compared to students' performances in the discussion group. Major findings indicated: 1) analyzing student responses to questions provided a developmental sequence of the characteristics of different cognitive levels; 2) students respond to questions that are matched to their cognitive level of development; 3) the students' cognitive level and not their age are related to the mean cognitive level of response; 4) in predicting a student's mean cognitive level, the most significant variables will be the mean cognitive level of the questions and the student's reading achievement.

2.12 Golden, J. (1978). A schema for analyzing response to literature applied to the responses of fifth and eighth graders to realistic and fantasy short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 39, 5996A. (ERIC Document ED 192306)

This study compared fifth and eighth graders' responses to two different genres of story, fantasy and realistic. Ten students at each level listened to the stories as they read along, and then gave answers to questions designed to elicit retelling, evaluation, and interpretation responses. Responses were analyzed by discourse level, cognitive operation, and reference pattern. Fifth graders were more likely to make expressive responses, while eighth graders made more interpretive responses. The realistic story evoked more identification responses, especially for fifth graders, while the fantasy story prompted eighth graders to connect their responses to other fantasy stories.

2.13 Hansson, G. (1973). Some types of research on response to literature. Research in the Teaching of English, 7, 260-284.

This study compared responses of readers with extensive versus little background knowledge of literature. "Experts" (scholars and literature teachers), university literature majors, and skilled workers completed 25 7-point bipolar scales at each of 12 points in a poem. The acrossgroup ratings were highly similar, suggesting that, despite differences in background, respondents shared similar evaluative orientations. The one area of difference was that more educated readers made more diversified judgments about formal qualities than did the less

educated readers.

2.14 Hansson, G. (1974). <u>Litteraturlasning i symasiet</u>. [Reading literature in the gymnasium]. Stockholm: Utbildnings-forlajet.

Secondary and college students applied 14 unipolar seven-point semantic-differential scales and written responses to six points in each of four poems commonly studied in Swedish schools. Despite variation in prior knowledge and age, students' ratings were highly similar, while written responses reflected sharper differences in the amount and content of interpretation. Older students were more likely to produce interpretations consistent with the "expected" interpretation than younger students, whose written responses varied more than those of older students. The investigator cautions that, in using written responses in developmental research, writing ability may be a confounding factor, a factor eliminated by the use of scales.

2.15 Hickman, J. (1980). Children's response to literature: What happens in the classroom. Language Arts, 57, 524-529.

This ethnographic study analyzed children's response to literature at various developmental stages and in a variety of natural classroom contexts. Ninety children aged 5 to 11 were observed during a four-month period. Data were collected on log sheets and then categorized into the following: listening behaviors, contact with books, acting on the impulse to share, oral responses, actions and drama, making things, and writing. Students' responses were compared according to age level differences; teacher strategies for influencing the classroom were categorized. Accessibility of a book was of primary importance in children's willingness to express their responses; teacher manipulation of the classroom had a strong influence on student response.

2.16 Hickman, J. (1983). Everything considered: Response to literature in an elementary school setting. <u>Journal of Research and Development in Education</u>, 16, 8-13.

This ethnographic study investigated the responses of elementary students in grades kindergarten through grade 6 to two children's books. Students' spontaneous responses as well as solicited verbal responses were analyzed. Children in kindergarten and first grade were most likely to employ non-verbal modes, facial expressions and pantomimes. Second and third graders were most likely to share and demonstrate their oral reading skills. Fourth and fifth graders were most likely to make references to art work, and to write about the books. Solicited responses were acquired by giving students a tape recorder and asking them to talk about their responses freely. All ages made evaluative statements and referred to illustrations. Younger students were most likely to employ partial retelling and summarizing than older readers.

2.17 Hynds, S. (1983). Interpersonal cognitive complexity as related to the character perceptions, literary response preferences, story comprehension, and literary attitudes of adolescent readers. (Doctoral dissertation, George Peabody College of Vanderbilt University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 43, 07.

This study investigated relationships between adolescents' levels of cognitive complexity and their levels of literary response. Eleventh graders completed a written response in reference to two peers and two characters in a short story. These written responses were analyzed to determine students' character complexity and cognitive complexity. Students also completed measures of story comprehension, interpretation, response preference, literary interest, and literary transfer used in the IEA study. The analysis showed that cognitive complexity is related to inferential comprehension but not literary comprehension. No significant differences on response preference appeared for any Purves category. Peer complexity and literary interest were predictors of character complexity. High complexity readers preferred responses dealing



with character motivation and comparison of literary works rather than engagement/involvement. There was a significant relationship between literary interest and cognitive complexity.

2.18 Hynds, S. (1985). Interpersonal cognitive complexity and the literary response processes of adolescent readers. Research in the Teaching of English, 19, 386-402.

This study examined the relationships between interpersonal cognitive complexity and adolescents' character impressions, story comprehension, response preferences, and literary attitudes. Eighty-three 11th grade students completed a cognitive complexity measure: a two-character role category questionnaire about a liked and a disliked peer. After reading a story, students completed a response preference measure and a comprehension test, as well as a reading interests/literary transfer inventory. Cognitive complexity was positively related to perceptions or character complexity. High complexity was related to higher inferential comprehension, interest in actions and motivations of characters and people, and relating the story to other stories.

2.19 Hynds, S. (1989). Bringing life to literature and literature to life: Social constructs and contexts of four adolescent readers. Research in the Teaching of English, 23, 30-61.

The purpose of this study was to examine social influences on the reading processes of four adolescent readers, as well as the relationship between factors of social cognition and these readers' responses to short stories. Four case study participants, all seniors in high school, were chosen from a group of 56 students in a suburban school. Results underscored the need for more varied and systematic assessments of reading competence, as well as an understanding of the interplay of competence, pragmatics, and volition in the likelihood that readers will bring social-cognitive processes to bear on reading.

2.20 Ice, M. (1983). A child's sense of story: A two year study. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Missouri - Columbia, 1984.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 44, 3001A.

This study examined children's emerging sense of story as it related to age and teacher's theoretical orientation. Seven children's oral storie: were analyzed at the beginning of first grade and at the end of second grade according to sources of story, narrative form, use of formal elements, number and kinds of characters, number of connectors between clauses, and number of T-units. Developmental changes were evidenced in source of story, stage of narrative form, formal elements, number and kinds of characters, and connections between clauses and T-units. Children's conceptions of story form varied considerably; children also varied in the pace of their development of story concept formation.

2.21 Jose, P., & Brewer, W. (1984). Development of story liking: Character identification, suspense, and outcome resolution. <u>Developmental Psychology</u>, 20, 911-924.

This study examined those reader and story factors contributing to story liking as varying by age. Forty-four second-, 64 fourth-, and 64 sixth-grade students rated four three-page suspense stories on ten affective scales. Similarity to character enhanced identification, which, in turn, was related to enhanced suspense. Younger readers preferred positive outcomes regardless of the character attributes: good or bad. Older children liked positive endings for good characters and negative endings for bad characters. Path analysis indicated that character identification, suspense, and liking of outcome all independently contributed to story liking.

2.22 Lehr, S. (1988). The child's developing sense of theme as a response to literature. Reading Research Quarterly, 23, 337-357.

This study examined developmental differences in children's thematic inferences based on



awareness of intertextual similarities in portrayal of themes in realistic and folktale books. Based on scores on a literature exposure inventory, 10 lowest- and 10 highest-scoring kindergarten, second-, and fourth-grade students listened to oral readings of three realistic and three folktale books, noted similarities in portrayal of themes, and inferred themes. Analysis of interview transcripts indicated that kindergarten children were able to identify thematic similarities for 80% of the realistic books and 35% of the folktales. There was a high correlation with ability to generate thematic statements: kindergarten children were more likely to summarize stories and to consider reactions to characters, while second- and fourth-grade children were more likely to analyze and make generalizations. Children's high level of inferences relative to previous research was attributed to the use of interviewing.

2.23 Liebman-Kleine, J. (1987). Reading Thomas Hardy's <u>The Mayor of Casterbridge</u>: Toward a problem-solving theory of reading literature. <u>Reader</u>, <u>17</u>, 13-28.

This report demonstrated the application of a problem-solving model of response to the author's own responses to a Hardy novel. In this model, "problems" are defined in terms of a violation of expectation, while "solutions" are derived from application of relevant prior knowledge.

2.24 Maloney, B. (1980). An examination of response to literature in relation to reading maturity. (Doctoral dissertation, Washington State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 41, 2034A.

This research explored the differences between mature and less mature tenth-grade readers responses to short stories as analyzed using the Purves categories as well as degree of transfer as determined by the Purves "transfer" inventory. Significant differences were found in response categories of mature compared to less mature readers. Mature readers were more likely to apply literature to everyday life situations.

2.25 Meek, M., et al. (1983). <u>Achieving literacy:</u> <u>Longitudinal case studies of adolescents learning to read</u>. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Case study analyses of British adolescents' responses indicated that students' knowledge of narrative conventions as implied by their story-telling ability was related to their understanding of stories. Prior "reading instruction" with basal readers had not prepared students to infer points of view, engage in perspective-taking, make predictions, or link episodes.

2.26 Mertz, M. P. (1973). Responses to literature among adolescents, English teachers, and college students: A comparative study. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 33, 6066A.

This study compared the responses of tenth-grade students, English teachers, and college students to short stories. A response form was used to gather responses, and Purves' categories were used as a basis of analysis. A significant difference in responses was seen between adults and adolescents. Economic status also affected response in that low SES readers used perception more often, while high SES readers used interpretation and evaluation.

2.27 Mikkelson, N. (1983, May). <u>Patterns of story devel ment in children's responses to literature</u>. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Canadian Council of Teachers of English Montreal, Canada. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 234 399)

This descriptive study analyzed how children aged seven to ten created stories after hearing a selection of folk tales. Students heard folk tales and then wrote and told their own stories. The analysis of the children's stories showed developmental differences in that younger children relied more on borrowing and recreating, while older children produced more blendings and



transformations. However, all children found ways to fuse traditional literary elements with material from their own experience.

2.28 Otto, B. (1984). Evidence of emergent reading behaviors in young children's interactions with favorite storybooks. (Doctoral dissertation, Northwestern University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 45, 08A.

The purpose of this study was to examine children's emergent reading abilities by contrasting assisted and independent storybook interactions prior to conventional reading. The subjects were children between the ages of two-and-a-half and five years, enrolled in a day care center. Twenty four children were interviewed in one study, and 17 in a second, two months later. For each study, six storybooks were introduced and used in the classroom for two weeks, following which each child's storybook interactions with a familiar adult examiner were audio and videotaped. Analysis of the assisted storybook interactions indicated that children's responses fell into five categories: 1) nonverbal response; 2) conversational response; 3) echolike response; 4) semantically equivalent response; 5) verbatim-like response. In nearly all assisted-independent combinations, children's responses gave evidence of higher levels of emergent reading ability when receiving assistance than when interacting independently. Children's responses during assisted and independent storybook interactions did not appear to occur randomly, but were based in the child's developing knowledge about written language and reading.

2.29 Parnell, G. (1984). Levels of aesthetic experience with literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Brigham Young University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 45, 06A.

This research project investigated the possibility of cognitive developmental structures underlying the aesthetic responses of children and adults to poetic literature. Children in Grades 3, 6, 9, 12, and college were interviewed as they discussed four well-known poems. The data indicated that based on relevance to the content and context of the poems and differing ability to see the poem from perspectives of others, it would be possible to discriminate several levels of response to the poems. These levels are suggestive of the developmental stages of Piaget and Kohlberg.

2.30 Perine, M. (1978). The response of sixth grade readers to selected children's literature with special reference to moral judgment. (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 39, 2729A.

The relationship between the literary responses and the moral responses of 11-year-old children to selected literary works was explored. The responses to the literary works which contained moral dilemmas were given in peer-group interactions. The Purves categories and Kohlberg moral stages were used to categorize responses. Results indicated that correlations between engagement/involvement, perception, and interpretation and stage three of moral judgments existed. Also, personal involvement in literature and reasoning stimulated moral judgment.

2.31 Petrosky, A. (1975). Individual and group responses of fourteen- and fifteen-year-olds to short stories, novels, poems, and Thematic Apperception Tests: Case studies based on Piagetian genetic epistemology and Freudian psychoanalytic ego psychology. (Doctoral dissertation, State University of New York at Buffalo.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 36, 852A.

Based on both Piaget's developmental stage model and Holland's model confidentity style" as reflecting personality needs and orientation, this study analyzed 14- and 15-year-olds' individual and group responses. Readers operating at an initial formal operations stage respond to surface, concrete aspects of texts, while those at the later stage are better able to interpret.



The degree to which students have the freedom to share and interact often shapes the quality of students' group responses.

2.32 Pillar, A. (1983). Aspects of moral judgment in response to fables. <u>Journal of Research</u> and <u>Development in Education</u>, <u>16</u>, 39-46.

This study examined developmental differences of 2nd-, 4th-, and 6th-grade students' judgments and reasons in response to questions about intentionality, relativism, and punishment as related to moral dilemmas in fables. Responses were scored as "immature" (constraint-oriented), "mixed," or "mature" (cooperation-oriented). There was a significant relationship between grade level and level of maturity of the responses, with the most significant occurring for responses to questions about punishment. Sixth graders responded at a more conventional level than did younger readers.

2.33 Pollock, J. C. (1973). A study of responses to short stories by selected groups of ninth graders, eleventh graders, and college freshmen. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Colorado at Boulder.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 33, 4224A.

This study compared ninth and eleventh graders and college-age students' written responses to short stories. Analysis of responses using the Purves categories indicated that the ninth graders produced the largest percentages of perception and evaluation, while eleventh graders produced more engagement responses. A positive correlation was found between total responses and interpretation; total responses and evaluation were negatively correlated.

2.34 Purves, A. (1975). Research in the teaching of literature. <u>Elementary English</u>, <u>52</u>, 463-466.

The developmental differences in the responses of elementary school children to short stories and poems are presented. Students in Grades 3 through 12 read the works and then participated in taped oral interviews. Results revealed developmental differences in that third grade students were concerned with the literal aspects of the work. Their evaluation was based on whether they liked or disliked a work. Fourth grade students put themselves into the roles of the characters and did more elaboration on their evaluations. Fifth grade students produced more thought units, more evaluations and personal reactions, and some evaluations dealing with formal aspects of the works. However, third, fourth, and fifth grade students all dealt primarily with literal aspects of the works in their reactions and evaluations. In sixth grade, students offered some interpretation in the form of questions about characters. In grades seven and eight, students gave an increased number of interpretation and their evaluations were concerned with meaning and understanding. Grades 8 and up began to look for hidden meaning. By Grade 12 students responded primarily with interpretation, and evaluation was related to meaning rather than engagement or evaluation of the works' evocative power.

2.35 Purves, A. (1981). Achievement reading and literature: The United States in international perspective. Urbana, Ill: National Council of Teachers of English.

This book presents the results from an international study of achievement and discusses responses of fourteen- and seventeen-year-old students in the United States. Results indicated the fourteen-year-olds made more diverse responses, and high achieving high school students use a moralistic interpretive pattern, but both are concerned with interpreting text and an emotional response to the text. A sex difference was discovered in that girls were more concerned with hidden meaning, theme, organization, the relation of form and content, and the work's success in involving them. They were not concerned with part-whole relationships, personal interpretation, identification, or moral lesson to be learned. Boys were more subjective in their responses than girls. Overall student achievement is correlated with patterns of response that look at significance of the work and which deal with emotion and particular implications of



the work. Students with high scores on transfer revealed a pattern of response of relating the characters to the reader's world, responding to the emotional impact of the work, and noting the vork's success in involving the reader. Also, thematic and moralistic patterns were learned and correspond with academically oriented teachers.

2.36 Rubin, S., & Gardner, H. (1985). Once upon a time: The development of sensitivity to story structure. In C. Cooper (Ed.), <u>Researching response to literature and the teaching of literature</u>. Norwood, NJ: Ablex.

This study compared children's ability to explain characters' actions and solve problems posed by the text across different age levels. Students in first, third, and sixth grade were read two different versions of a fairy tale: the complete version and a version in which the motivation was deleted. Students were asked to provide an ending, retell the story, and then, three days later, to give a delayed retelling. In contrast to younger children, sixth graders who were exposed to the original version were better able to supply more information about motivation on a delayed retelling than an immediate retelling, reflecting the sixth graders' superior knowledge of the fairy-tale schema. Older children were better able to solve the more complex, thematic problems posed by the stories and were better able to integrate endings with the stories than younger children.

2.37 Schlager, N. (1975). Developmental factors influencing children's responses to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Claremont Graduate School.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 35, 5136A.

The purpose of this study was to investigate characteristics other than literary ones which make a book acceptable or unacceptable to a child. Key concepts of child development from the works of Piaget, Erikson, and Anna Freud were examined in relation to the 7- to 12-year-old child. Results indicated that the deciding factor monitoring children's selection of books seemed to be the biological, cognitive, and affective developmental characteristics to which all human beings are subject, regardless of ethnicity or nationality.

2.38 Somers, A. (1973). Responses of advanced and average readers in grades seven, nine, and eleven to two dissimilar short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, Florida State University.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 33, 4252A.

This study compared seventh, ninth, and eleventh grade students' written responses to two stories varied according to a focus on action versus theme. Purves' categories were used to analyze responses. Results indicated that students primarily preferred the evaluative mode; they were more likely to employ perception and interpretation of content with action-oriented stories. Students rarely responded to form or technique, except to plot. Younger students were more involved in the stories, while older readers made significantly more interpretations to theme-oriented stories.

2.39 Sulzby, E. (1985). Children's emergent reading of favorite storybooks: A developmental study. Reading Research Quarterly, 20, 458-481.

This relearch, consisting of two studies, examined children's early reading attempts when asked to read to an adult in the context of the adult-child interaction. In the first study, transcripts of the interactions between 24 kindergarten children and an interviewer at the beginning and end of the year were content-analyzed according to the degree that the attempts were governed by print, by pictures with formed stories, by pictures without formed stories, and by refusals. The children demonstrated a significant increase over the period of a year. The second study, comparing age-differences in reading attempts of two-, three-, and four-year-olds using the same content analysis system employed in the first study, found some



increase in the degree to which children responded to print and responded with formed stories.

2.40 Sulzby, E., & Teale, W. (1987). Young children's storybook reading: Longitudinal study of parent-child interaction and children's independent functioning. Final Report to the Spencer Foundation. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan.

This report summarizes research on young children's storybook reading. Two separate studies analyzed: 1) eight families in San Antonio representing different classes and ethnic groups and 2) large groups of preschool and kindergarten children in Chicago. Analysis of voice tone patterns indicated that parent and child interact with similar tones during storybook reading. Listening to stories was related to learned ability to reproduce connected discourse.

The investigators posit the following generalizations: storybook reading was integral to family life and is a socially constructed activity; storybook reading interaction becomes internalized; language variation occurs in storybook reading; and children engage spontaneously in storybook reenactments.

2.41 Svensson, C. (1985). <u>The construction of poetic meaning: A cultural-developmental study of symbolic and non-symbolic strategies in the interpretation of contemporary poetry</u>. Lund, Sweden: Liber Forlag.

The purpose of these two studies was to determine the relationship between readers' background knowledge of literature and their ability to interpret literature. In the first study, 72 subjects at ages 11, 14, and 18 completed questionnaires regarding their literary background: amount of storytelling in the home, amount of reading, and orientation in reading. Students also responded to four poems and were interviewed about their inferences about the point of the poems and reasons for their inferences. Interview answers were categorized as "literal descriptive," "literal interpretive," "mixed literal/thematic," "thematic," "mixed literal/symbolic," and "symbolic." There was a significant chi-square relationship between background knowledge of literature and level of interpretation across age levels; age level was also significantly related to level of interpretation (see Svensson, 1987).

The second study was designed to determine the influence of the typographical arrangement of poems on students' inferences of figurative and symbolic meanings; 144 students at ages 11, 14, and 18 responded in writing to the original versions of poems and to poems rearranged into "prose." Differences in graphic arrangements affected the number of figurative and symbolic inferences, particularly in the older groups. The fact that graphic arrangement was significantly related for the 14-year-old group but not the 11-year-old group suggests an increasing knowledge of literary form.

2.42 Svensson, C. (1987). The construction of poetic meaning: A developmental study of symbolic and non-symbolic strategies in the interpretation of contemporary poetry. <u>Poetics</u>, <u>16</u>, 471-503.

Based on a social-constructivist model as opposed to a cognitive-stage model of aesthetic development, this study compared levels of responses to poetry. Seventy-two subjects at ages 11, 14, and 18 were interviewed about their inferences about the point of four poems and reasons for their inferences. Interview answers were categorized as "literal descriptive," "literal interpretive," "mixed literal/thematic," "thematic," "mixed literal/symbolic," and "symbolic." Forty-nine percent of the 18-year-olds, 22 percent of the 14-year-olds, and 14 percent of the 11-year-olds were classified as "thematic," "mixed literal/symbolic," and "symbolic." There was a significant chi-square relationship between age level and level of interpretation.

2.43 Thomson, J. (1987). Understanding teenager's reading. New York: Nichols.



This book reports on a research project devised to investigate what secondary students read, why they read or don't read, and how they go about reading. The research data consisted of the written questionnaires completed by a total of 1007 students in year 8 (13- and 14- yearolds) and year 10 (15- to 16- year-olds) attending two state high schools in Bathurst, NSW in 1978 and 1984. Transcripts of individual interviews with five percent of these students and written questionnaires completed by their English teachers revealed that "a colossal" amount of time was spent watching television or videos and considerable less time was spent reading The questionnaires completed by the English teachers revealed three main literature. difficulties experienced in teaching fiction: 1) distraction of television; 2) pupils' negative attitudes to reading; 3) pupils' reading abilities. The author devised a hierarchical and developmental model of reading based on student interviews and the theory of D.W. Harding. The process stages are: 1) unreflective interest in action; 2) empathizing; 3) analogizing; 4) reflecting on the significance of events (theme) and behavior (distanced evaluation of characters); 5) reviewing the whole work as the author's creation; 6) consciously considered relationship with the author, recognition of textual ideology, and understanding of self (identity theme) and of one's own reading processes. Process strategies correspond to process stages and are: 1a) rudimentary mental images (stereotypes from film and television); 1b) predicting what might happen next in the short term; 2c) mental images of affect; 2d) expectations about characters; 3e) drawing on the repertoire of personal experiences, making connections between characters and one's own life; 4f) generating expectations about alternative possible long-term outcomes; 4g) interrogating the text, filling in gaps; 4h) formulating puzzles, enigmas, accepting hermencutic challenges; 5i) drawing on literary and cultural repertoires; 5j) interrogating the text to match the author's representation with one's own; 5k) recognition of implied author; 6l) recognition of implied reader in the text; 6m) reflexiveness, leading to understanding of textual ideology, personal identity, and one's own reading processes.

2.44 Trimble, Calleigh, (1984). The relationship among fairy tales, ego development, grade level, and sex. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Alabama, 1988.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 45, 935A.

This study examined the effects of an instructional strategy for teaching fairy tales on the ego levels of children in Grades 1, 3, 5, and 7. The experimental groups were exposed to an instructional strategy on fairy tales designed to enhance ego development. Pre and post interviews and pre and post test scores on the Loevinger Sentence Completing Test Protocols were analyzed to determine changes in ego development. No significant differences were found between the experimental and control groups. However, a significant relationship between levels of ego development and sex was observed for Grades 3, 5 and 7, with girls scoring as more psychologically mature than boys. Significant relationships between the ego levels of students and their grade level were also indicated. A relationship also existed between specific responses of students and degrees of psychological maturity for grade and sex.

2.45 Vardell, S. (1983). Reading, writing, and mystery stories. English Journal, 72, 47-51.

This study compared sixth-, ninth-, and twelfth-grade students' responses to and use of story conventions in detective mystery stories. Students' responses to mystery stories were analyzed according to students' understanding of certain genre techniques. Students' use of the same techniques in their own written mystery stories was also analyzed. Older students were more likely to understand and employ characterization and story development techniques than younger students, reflecting their advanced understanding of the genre.

2.46 Weiger, M. L. (1978). Moral judgment in children: Their responses to children's literature examined against Piaget's stages of moral development. (Doctoral dissertation, Putgers University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 38, 4065A.



This study compared second-, fourth-, and sixth-grade students' responses to issues in children's literature as reflecting differences in their level of moral development. Three stories that were recommended for each particular grade were presented through audiovisual media; students responded through individual interviews and focused questions. Analysis of the data revealed that the stages of students' responses corresponded to Piaget's stages of moral judgment.

\*See also: 1.28, 1.32, 1.33, 2.1, 5.10, 8.9, 8.16, 8.18



#### 3. Gender

3.1 Ash, B. (1970). The construction of an instrument to measure some aspects of literary judgment and its use as a tool to investigate student responses to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Syracuse University.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 30, 5332A.

The investigator developed an instrument for measuring literary responses and judgment. One hundred eleventh graders were interviewed. The results showed that girls scored higher than boys. Eleven categories of response were found: guess, misreading, unsupported judgment, supported judgment, poetic preconception, isolated element, narrational, technical, irrelevant association, interpretation, and self-involvement.

3.2 Beaven, M. (1972). Responses of adolescents to feminine characters in literature. Research in the Teaching of English, 6, 48-68.

This study used a questionnaire to study how high school students responded to male and female literary characters. The results indicated that while girls identified with both sex roles, boys only identified with masculine sex roles.

3.3 Bleich, D. (1986). Gender interests in reading and language. In E. Flynn & P. Patriocinio (Eds.), Gender and Reading. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press.

This study analyzed four adult males' and four adult females' responses to Bronte, Dickinson, Melville, and Wordsworth. Readers did not differ according to the gender of the author or in their responses to poetry, but did differ in their responses to fiction. Males were more likely to focus on the narrative voice as rhetorically acting to affect the reader, while women focused more on entering and experiencing the world of the narrative.

In a second study, analysis of 50 male and 50 female college freshman students' retellings of Faulkner's "Barn Burning" indicated the males were more likely to objectively recount the text in order to "get the facts straight," while females were more likely to reflect on the experience with a story, focusing on understanding the character relationships.

3.4 Flynn, E. (1983). Gender and reading. College English, 45, 236-253.

This study considered the degree to which college students' adoption of a "submissive" versus "dominant" orientation varied according to gender differences. Analysis of 26 male and 26 female college students' written responses to stories by Joyce, Hemingway, and Woolf indicated that more students adopted a submissive orientation as reflected in uncertainty, frustration, use of summary retelling, and lack of critical distance. Male students, particularly in response to the Joyce and Hemingway stories, were more likely than females to adopt a dominant orientation as reflected in their imposition of their own attitudes and beliefs onto the stories.

3.5 Holland, N. (1977). Transactive teaching: Cordelia's death. College English, 39, 276-285.

Based on a psychoanalytical theory of response as reflecting fantasy/identity themes, this study compared the responses of five women and four men to <u>King Lear</u>. Male readers focused on the theme of the need to be in control. Women focused on the theme of conflict with a patriarchal culture.

3.6 Radway, J. (1984). Reading the romance: Women, patriarchy, and popular literature. Chap I Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

The purpose of this study was to determine reasons for the emotional and cultural appeal of



romance novels to women. Sixteen avid female readers were interviewed, and 42 readers completed questionnaires about their responses to romance novels. Readers preferred heroine types who were intelligent, attractive, moral, nurturing, and emotional; they disliked portrayals of violence and rape. They responded positively to instances in which the heroine transforms the male hero from an impersonal to a more personal character. From these responses, Radway explains the appeal of the romance novel as reflecting a cultural need for reinforcement of the women's own nurturing role within the context of a traditional, patriarchal society.

3.7 Shurden, K. (1976). An analysis of adolescent responses to female characters in literature widely read by students in secondary schools. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Tennessee.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 36, 6589A.

High school students' perceptions of female characters were analyzed. Students produced written ratings of characters they had read about. Results demonstrated that students' sex did not affect perception of character, and that characters had more unstereotypical than stereotypical qualities.

3.8 Tanner, L. (1977). Sex bias in children's response to literature. Language Arts, 54, 48-50.

This study examined the degree to which elementary students' evaluation of stories varied according to the author's gender. Fifty-six male and 41 female elementary students evaluated stories with male and female authors. Females gave more positive evaluations to male-authored stories than for female-authored stories; their positive evaluations were higher than male evaluations of stories by either gender.

3.9 Willinsky, J., & Hunniford, R. (1986). Reading the romance younger: The mirrors and fears of a preparatory literature. Reading-Canada-Lecture, 4, 16-31.

This study applied Radway's methods (see Radway, 1984) to analysis of adolescent females' responses to romance novels. The adolescents, like the older women in Radway's study, identified with the female heroines in terms of reinforcing the role model of the nurturing female.

\*See also: 1.12, 4.11, 6.3, 6.4



#### Text Variables

These studies explore the effects of literary selections, genres, and other text characteristics on readers' responses.

- 4. Studies on the Influence of Text
- 4.1 Angelotti, M. (1972). A comparison of elements in the written free responses of eighth graders to a junior novel and an adult novel. (Doctoral dissertation, Florida State University.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 33, 2603A.

This study examined the influence of a text's difficulty level on the written responses of 66 eighth graders to an adult novel (A Separate Peace) and 1 young adult novel (Tuned Out). Responses to the adult novel included more descriptions of the content, while responses to the young adult novel included more interpretative responses. Analysis of responses across four divisions of the novels—exposition, development, climax, and conclusion—indicated a steady increase in involvement, while evaluation decreased. Interpretation was more likely to increase in the young adult than in the adult novel.

4.2 Bazelak, L. (1974). A content analysis of tenth-grade students' responses to Black literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Syracuse University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 34, 6246A.

This study investigated the differences in the written free responses of tenth graders to short stories written by Black authors. The research found responses to fall into seven categories: literary judgment, literary interpretation, literary narrative, association, self-involvement, prescriptive judgment, and miscellaneous.

4.3 Bruner, J. (1986). Actual minds, possible worlds. Cambridge: Harvard UP.

Based on Todorov's theory of transformation of verb tense in narrative from time in the past to time unfolding, the study analyzed adult readers' retelling responses to Joyce's story, "Clay," which contains extensive use of such transformations. Analysis of the retellings indicated a similar use of transformations, defined as the reader's "subjunct vizing" of language which reflects a reader's adoption of the narrator's perspective.

4.4 Cornaby, B. (1974). A study of the influences of form on responses of twelfth-grade students in college preparatory classes to dissimilar novels, a short story, and a poem. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Washington.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 35, 4856A.

This study examined the influence of literary form and level of dogmatism on high school students' response to two novels, a story, and a poem. Responses to a more traditional novel (Crime and Punishment) were more content-oriented, while responses to a more modern novel (A Passage to India) were more form-oriented. There was no relationship between response and dogmatism as measured by the Rokeach Dogmatism Scale.

4.5 Cornaby, B. (1978). <u>Literature for gifted young adults and their response to that literature</u>. (ERIC Document ED 185550)

This study discusses variations in response by gifted high school seniors to four dissimilar literary selections: two structurally different novels, a free-verse poem, and a short story. Results showed that the form of literary selection influenced students' responses. When responding to dissimilar literary selections, approximately three-fourths of the students were inconsistent on the choices or response modes. The traditional novel elicited a structurally



oriented response mode, while the nontraditional novel elicited neither structure nor content orientation in responses.

4.6 Ericson, B.O. (1984). A descriptive study of the individual and group responses of three tenth-grade readers to two short stories and two textbook selections. (Doctoral dissertation, Syracuse University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 46, 388A.

A case study approach was used to describe and compare the oral responses of three tenth grade girls to two short stories and two textbook selections. They were interviewed to gain information about their family lives, interests, preferences for and experiences with reading, general expectations for fiction and exposition, and experiences with whole class and small group discussions. Tape recordings of individual and small group discussion following the readings provided data for analysis. The study indicated that 1) each girl had a preferred pattern of response to both short stories and textbook readings; 2) the purpose for reading informed all other general expectations for the text; 3) establishment of text-specific expectations was central to responses to short stories but not to textbook readings; 4) both types were evaluated according to expectations and knowledge of text form and content; 5) all three girls exhibited meta-response awareness and monitoring of their responses, and were sensitive to the response patterns of the other group members; 6) group discussions were beneficial.

4.7 Johnston, D. (1983). Gifted fifth and sixth graders' preferences and responses regarding contemporary or classic literature. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Washington.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 44, 126A.

Twenty gifted fifth- and sixth-grade students read contemporary and classic books paired for similarity over a ten week period and wrote responses which were analyzed using the Purves categories. There was a higher percentage of Perception responses for contemporary books. Males made more Perception responses, while females made more Engagement responses.

4.8 Jose, P. (1984). Story interestingness: Goal importance or goal attainment difficulty. (ERIC ED 243080)

This study tested the structural-affect theory that goal importance and the difficulty of attaining that goal are linked to story liking. First grade, third grade, and college students read narratives that varied in terms of the importance of the goal to be attained by the protagonist and the difficulty encountered in attaining that goal. Data from all age groups confirmed the theory. Adults also expected that the more important the goal, the harder it would be to attain.

4.9 McNamara, S. (1981). Responses of fourth- and seventh-grade students to satire as reflected in selected contemporary picture books. (Doctoral dissertation, Michigan State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 41, 2978A-2979A.

This descriptive study looked at the responses of 12 fourth-grade students and 12 seventh-grade students to picture books containing satire. The books were read aloud, and questionnaires were used to collect student responses. The results indicated that students do accept satire in the works they enjoy and respond to works of satire that they find humorous. Students also demonstrated that they were capable of responding in a critical in-depth manner beyond the literal level.

4.10 McNamara, S. (1984). Children respond to satire in picture books. <u>Reading Improvement</u>, 21, 303-323.

Twenty-four fourth and seventh grade students responded to a questionnaire about genre characteristics and preferences in response to oral readings of satiric picture books published after 1970. While students enjoyed the texts, they did not relate them to their own lives. They



did not comprehend sarcasm, ridicule, or social criticism. Seventh graders demonstrated more critical understanding of satiric techniques than did fourth graders.

4.11 Morrongiello, D. (1976). The effect of point of view upon attitude in response to literature. (ERIC Document ED 126530)

This study examined the influence of point of view on readers' attitudinal response. Based on differences in attitudes towards mental illness, tenth grade students were divided into positive, neutral, and negative groups. Analysis of written responses to a first person, a neutrally-narrated, and an editorially-narrated version of the same text portraying mental illness revealed that students with neutral attitudes responded most positively to first-person and least positively to the neutrally-narrated versions. Students with negative attitudes responded negatively to the first-person and positively to the neutrally-narrated versions.

4.12 Nicol, E. (1973). Student response to narrative technique in fiction. (Doctoral dissertation, Stanford University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 33, 6737A.

This study examined the degree to which high school students appreciate authors' use of literary techniques. One hundred sixty-five high school students read two short stories and evaluated the use of techniques by selecting from a list of comments. Students' selections were compared with professionals' critiques of the stories. Students preferred the simpler story, but their responses coincided with the critics' responses more with the difficult story. Students responded more to the immediately significant story aspects than to the more formal aspects.

4.13 Purves, A. (1981). Reading and literature: American achievement in international perspective. Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English.

This reanalysis of the American response preference data from the IEA assessment (Purves, 1973) indicated that 13- and 17-year olds response preferences varied according to story differences, with older students being more consistent across stories. Across different stories, responses involving hidden meaning, inferring a lesson, thematic importance, organization, and emotional responses, were consistently chosen, an orientation possibly reflecting the literary critical analysis orientation of American high school teachers. Females and higher SES students tended to adopt a more critical stance than males and lower SES students. Higher scorers on the literature a hievement test tended to focus more on critical understanding and the significance of a text. Students scoring high on transfer preferred to relate the text to their own world and to respond emotionally. The more students liked a text, the more they preferred to interpret that text.

4.14 Ross, C. (1978). A comparative study of the responses made by grade eleven Vancouver students to Canadian and New Zealand poems. Research in the Teaching of English, 12, 297-306.

This study examined the influence of knowing the geographical setting of poetry on students' responses. Four hundred seventy seven eleventh grade Canadian students listened to tapes of pairs of poems, one poem from Canada and the other from New Zealand. Half of the poems were labeled and half were not labeled regarding their setting. Students' written responses were categorized according to response types. Students' responses did not differ between Canadian and New Zealand poems that were not labeled. Responses did differ with labeled poems, with a significant chi-square relationship favoring the Canadian poems in amount of transfer, depth, and interpretation.

4.15 Short, K. (1986). Literacy as a collaborative experience: The Role of Intertextuality. In Niles, J., & Lalik, R. (Eds.), Thirty-fifth Yearbook of the National Reading Conference (pp.



227-332). Rochester, New York: National Reading Conference.

This ethnographic study explored first-grade students' use of intertextuality in response to literature. Results indicated that self-generation of intertextual ties and hypotheses is important to critical thinking and that learning should be a process of authorship, of constructing one's own stories by making connections with past stories.

4.16 Smith, L. (1984). Rereading: A response to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1985.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 45, 2382A.

The extent and nature of rereading activity among children was described. Six hundred and nineteen students completed survey forms which indicated the nature of their reading activity. Twenty four student were chosen at random from those students who indicated that they reread books and were then interviewed. Of books reread, realistic fiction was reread most often (52.1%), followed by fantasy and science fiction (24.9%), and nonfiction (11.1%). The most reread books were mentioned 74.7% of the time by female students, indicating that females were more likely to reread more popular books than were male students. Rereaders were more likely to have first heard about their favorite books from a friend than from a teacher, parent, film, or sibling. Answers to open-ended interview questions were categorized according to the Purves categories, with perception as the most common response. Students appeared reluctant to discuss a book beyond a quick answer and often that answer was a retelling of an event or events.

4.17 Studier, C. (1978). A comparison of the responses of fifth-grade students to modern fantasy and realistic fiction. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Georgia.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 39, 7201A-7202A.

This study examined the differences between responses to fantasy and realistic literature as they varied with reading ability. Eighty-nine fifth graders wrote free responses to two fantasy and two realistic-fiction books. Analysis of response types indicated that there was more retelling with the fantasy and more engagement and interpretation with the realistic fiction. Better readers made more evaluative responses to both forms than did poorer readers.

4.18 True, E. A. (1981). Responses of children to two sports stories, one recommended by adults and one non-recommended by adults. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 42, 2545A.

This research explored the responses of fifth-grade students to sports fiction books, one recommended by adult reviewers and one not recommended. Students produced written responses to unstructured and structured questions. Data were analyzed using the Purves categories. Results indicated that most student responses were in the perception category and that few were in the interpretive category.

4.19 Uffman, B. (1981). Responses of young children and adults to books with a lesson. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 42, 119A.

This study examined the influence of books determined to contain a moral lesson on elementary students' responses. Analysis of students' responses indicated that students do not consider the lesson to be an important influence on their response relative to other story elements.

4.20 White, V. (1973). An analysis of the responses of fifth-grade children to the characteristics of the heroes in four short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 34, 1781A.



This study examined fifth-grade students' responses to hero characteristics in four short stories. Data were collected in individual interviews and placed into three categories: literal, inferential, and evaluative. Most responses were literal; students responded more to heroes in physical danger than those not in physical danger.

4.21 Zaharias, J. (1986). The effects of genre and tone on undergraduate students' preferred patterns of response to two short stories and two poems. Research in the Teaching of English, 20, 56-68.

In order to determine the degree to which response preference varied by genre (story versus poetry) and tone (serious versus light-hearted), 166 college students applied the Response Preference Measure (Purves, 1981) to two poems and two stories. Both genre and tone had significant main effects on response preferences for engagement, description, interpretation, and evaluation, but there were also significant interaction effects. Students preferred descriptive responses in reaction to light-hearted texts and to poetry, while preferring engagement, interpretation, and evaluation responses in reaction to more serious texts; stories were more likely to elicit engagement responses than party.

4.22 Zipperer, F. J. (1985). A descriptive study of selected fifth- and eighth-grade students' involvement with futuristic science fiction. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Georgia.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 47, 111A.

This study examined involvement of 12 fifth- and eighth- grade readers with futuristic science fiction. Readers at both grade levels chose science fiction because of its predictive nature, its images of the future, its wide imaginative scope, and its scientific and technological content. Most readers preferred characters of their own age and sex, although sex of the character was mentioned less often by male readers. Settings preferred by eighth-grade readers covered a wider range of possibilities that those of fifth grade readers. Some readers perceived the authors as playful storymakers, while others perceived them to be using their writing to predict impending danger.

\*See also: 1.13, 2.13, 8.1, 8.36,



#### Response Processes

These studies focus on readers' responses. For purposes of this review, these studies are categorized as follows:

- 5. Response Processes: General. These studies focus on a variety of different response categories.
- 6. Response Processes: Engagement. These studies focus on the emotional, affective, and subjective experience with the text.
- 7. Response Processes: Interpretation. These studies focus on the reader's conceptual, interpretive, and analytic response to the text.
- 5. Response Processes: General
- 5.1 Cullinan, R., Harwood, K., & Galda, L. (1983). The reader and the story: Comprehension and response. <u>Journal of Research and Development in Education</u>, 16, 29-38.

This study examined the influence of interest and expectations on the responses of fourth, sixth, and eighth grade students to two novels. Six students at each grade level were asked focused questions individually and in groups following the reading of each novel. There was a direct relationship between interest and understanding.

5.2 de Beaugrande, R. (1985). Poetry and the ordinary reader: A study of immediate responses. Empirical Studies of the Arts, 3, 1-21.

This study examines the open-ended written responses of college students to a series of poems. The responses are discussed in terms of demonstrating a range of response strategies unique to responding to poetry: staging, hedging, citing, keyword associations, paraphrasing, normalizing, and generalizing. Examples of each of these strategies are provided.

5.3 de Beaugrande, R. (1987). The naive reader: Anarchy or self-reliance? <u>Empirical Studies</u> of the Arts, 5, 145-170.

Following classroom experiences in selecting and responding to poems without instruction in technical analysis, 42 college students responded in writing to three poems. Analysis of students' responses by amalgamating direct quotes into composite types demonstrated that, contrary to expectations that students' responses would be chaotic and uninformed, the students were able to make systematic and coherent inferences about the poems.

5.4 Dias, P. (1987). Making sense of poetry: Patterns in the process. Canadian Council of Teachers of English. Ottawa: Canada.

This study sets out to discover the ways in which adolescent readers respond to and make sense of their readings of poetry. The study's patterns of process are broken into three basic sections: approach, findings, and implications for classroom practice. The use of the Responding-Aloud Protocol is considered essential to the research and understanding of student reading patterns.



5.5 Galda, L. (1982). Assuming the spectator stance: An examination of the responses of three young readers. Research in the Teaching of English, 16, 1-20.

The researcher performed a case study investigation of three fifth-grade girls in their individual and group responses to two novels. Nine categories of response included: 1) personal statements about the reader; 2) personal statements about the work; 3) descriptive statements of the plot; 4) descriptive statements about aspects of the work; 5) interpretive statements about parts of the work; 6) interpretive statements about whole of the work; 7) evaluative statements about evocativeness of work; 8) evaluative statements about the construction of the work; 9) evaluative statements about the meaningfulness of the work. Findings indicated that for the three students, the primary response mode was evaluation. Each girl had her own style of response. Perspective and concept of story affect readers' ability to maintain spectator stance, which is required for mature literary judgment.

5.6 Kintgen, E. (1985). Studying the perception of poetry. In C. Cooper (Ed.). Researching response to literature and the teaching of literature. Norwood, NJ: Ablex.

Analysis of 18 graduate students' and 8 faculty members' oral taped responses to a poem generated a range of different processes involved in responding to poetry: comment/narrate, read/select/locate, focus on word/phonology/syntax/form, deduce/generalize/connect to, poem/nature/history/or literature, test/justify/qualify/specify/, interpret.

5.7 Martinez, M. F. (1983). Young children's verbal responses to literature in parent child storytime interactions. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Texas at Austin.) <u>Dissertation Abstract International</u>, 44, 1044A.

Case studies of four preschool children examined parent/child storytime interactions using the following categories: utterance, episode, topic, and non-story talk. While responses were primarily narrational, children's responses varied when listening to unfamiliar short stories. Children's response profiles were similar to response profiles of their parents.

5.8 Miall, D. (1985). The structure of response: A repertory grid study of a poem. Research in the Teaching of English, 19, 254-68.

This study examined clustering of readers' personal constructs as related to positive and negative evaluations of eight segments of a poem. Twenty-one college students responded to a Coleridge poem, "Frost at Midnight," using repertory grid rating scales based on bipolar adjectives. Students rated the poem's segments positively and negatively in an expected manner. Students responded more frequently to the negative aspects of the poem.

5.9 Miall, D. (1986). Authorizing the reader. English Quarterly, 19, 186-195.

Based on Kelly's theory of personal constructs as shaping emotional responses, this study examined one student's written responses in terms of quotations, emotions, constructs, and superordinate constructs. For each of three stages of response, the student began with emotions and moved towards personal constructs, from an intuitive to a more cognitive orientation.

5.10 National Assessment of Educational Progress. Reading, Thinking and Writing: Report of the National Assessment of Education Progress: Reading/Literature Assessment, 1979/80. Denver, CO: Educational Commission of the States, 1981. (For summaries, see also Petrosky, A., 1985, Reading achievement; and Galda, S. L., 1985, Assessment: Responses to literature. In A. Berger and H. A. Robinson (Eds.), Secondary school reading, Urbana, IL: National Conference on Research in English. For descriptions of the measures and criteria see W. Fagan, J. Jensen, and C. Cooper (Fds.), Measures for Research and Evaluation in the English Language Arts, Vol. 2, Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English, 1985.)



The purpose of the 1979/80 NAEP assessment of reading and literature was to determine students' reading interests and attitudes; differences in 9-, 13-, and 17-year-olds' ability to explain their engagement, interpretation, and evaluation responses; and their preferred response mode in essay responses as compared to similar tasks in the 1969/70 assessment.

Students' engagement, interpretation, and evaluation responses to poems and stories were analyzed using separate primary trait scoring systems. While 81% of 9-year-olds enjoy reading "very much," only 42% of 17-year-olds do. Fifty-three percent of 9-year olds and 33% of 17-year-olds read something daily; few 17-year-olds read more than an hour daily; in contrast, 61% watch more than an hour of television daily. Most would prefer to go to a movie rather than read a book.

Seventeen-year-olds were much better able to explain assertions about novels and characters on a multiple-choice test than in their essay responses. In evaluating poems and stories, most students listed vague assertions with little supporting evidence from the text; in their ability to cite support from their counterparts 17-year-olds declined on the 1969/70 assessment. The investigators attributed students' lack of problem-solving and critical thinking to an instructional focus on reading skills during the 1970s.

Students' overall essay response preference in reaction to four poems and one story were analyzed in terms of the primary response type represented according to the following categories: egocentric; retelling; emotional; personal-global; personal-analytic; evaluation; reference to other works, specific; analysis--superficial, analysis-elaborated; inferencing; and generalization. Students' primary response focus varied according to text; one poem evoked 71% inferencing, while another story, 67% personal-analytic responses. Retellings, evaluations, emotions, and inferencing were common across essays; there were few instances of egocentric, personal-global, references to other works, and analysis responses.

5.11 Newkirk, T. (1984). Looking for trouble: A way to unmask our readings. College English, 46, 756-766.

This study examined the types of difficulties college students experienced in understanding poems and their use of problem-solving strategies to cope with these difficulties. Analysis of college freshmen virting about aspects of poems that gave them difficulty yielded four types of difficulties: an unwillingness to explore meanings resulting in a premature cessation of inquiry, a difficulty comprehending word meanings, a resistance to the poem's implied attitudes, and an inability to connect the poem's images. Students who could cope with these difficulties demonstrated effective problem-solving strategies.

5.12 Nissel, M. (1987). The oral responses of three fourth graders to realistic fiction and fantasy. (Doctoral dissertation Fordham University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 48, 04A.

This case-study analysis of three fourth-grade females' oral responses to realistic and fantasy short stories generated a category system organized according to responses to characters ("evaluations: empathetic" and "evaluations: text-centered" versus "inferences: supported" and "inferences: unsupported"), events ("evaluations" versus "inferences") and themes asolated" versus "integrated"). The majority of the students' responses referred to character; of those responses, evaluations of characters were more frequent than inferences. Response types varied across student and story.

5.13 Rogers, T. (1988). Students as literary critics: The interpretive theories, processes, and experiences of ninth grade students. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Illinois.)



This research analyzed eight ninth-grade students think-aloud responses to short stories and critical paragraphs written about the stories according to the following categories: retelling, elaborating, engaging, questioning, hypothesizing, analyzing, drawing conclusions, generalizing, evaluating, monitoring, and miscellaneous. The sources of responses were also categorized as textual-structure, character, textual and extratextual, authorial, comparative, and personal. Results indicated that interpretations were primarily related to textual factors of structure and character. Students preferred critical paragraphs written from a personal viewpoint, but this did not surface in their own protocols. The majority of responses were in the analysis category followed by retelling and drawing conclusions. Students' think-aloud responses did not resemble their classroom responses because students believed they should "stick to the text" in the classroom.

5.14 Taylor, E. A. (1986). Young children's verbal responses to literature: An analysis of group and individual differences. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Texas at Austin.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 47, 1599A.

Four- and five-year-olds' individual and group oral responses during story reading were analyzed according to the following categories: contributing participant (teacher, child), form of talk (question, comment, answer), type of verbalizations (narrative, interpretive, evaluative, associative, predictive, informative, or elaborative), and focus of responses (title, setting, character, detail, event, language, or story). Children's type of focus of story talk differed according to whether students responded in a group setting or as individuals. Teachers' responses also differed significantly in type and focus. Both the situation in which a story was read and the teacher presenting the story influenced children's verbal responses.

5.15 Tsruta, D. (1978). Community college students' responses to selected ethnic poetry and mode of presentation. (Doctoral dissertation, Stanford University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 39, 09A.

This study examined written responses of students of various ethnic groups after they had read selected poems written by members of their own ethnic groups as well as poems written by members of ethnic groups other than their own. The results suggest that students did not reveal racial stereotyping in their responses to the three ethnic literatures, nor did the students reveal personal racial biases of their own.

5.16 Tutton, B. (1979). Response to short stories as related to interest among community college students. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 40, 3003A.

This study examined the relationship between college students' interest in short stories and the types and amount of responses. Correlations between interest ratings and analyses of type and amount of response indicated that degree of interest was positively correlated with amount and level of interpretation.

5.17 Wade-Maltais, J. (1981). Responses of community college readers to a short story when audience interpretations are not known. (Doctoral dissertation, University of California, Riverside.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 43, 01A.

This study examined whether, when no audience expectations were provided, responses of four groups of community college students to a short story would converge towards the text, regardless of the instructional approach or whether students' public responses would converge towards instruction while their private responses converged towards the text. Results indicated that instructional treatment groups showed a trend toward effects of teaching, while non-instruction treatment groups mainly responded in interpretation and evaluation categories.



\*See also: 1.19, 1.22, 1.25, 1.28, 1.34, 2.41, 2.43, 4.5, 4.21, 6.7, 8.3, 8.14, 8.21, 8.33, 8.39, 9.3, 9.9

## 6. Response Processes: Engagement

6.1 Chasser, C. (1977). How adolescents' affective responses to four short stories relate to the factors of age, sex, and intelligence. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Connecticut.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 38, 717A-718A.

This study examined the differences in engagement responses for 50 7th-, 9th-, and 12th-grade students to four stories. Responses were analyzed according to four types: judgment, sympathy, empathy/identification, and degree of involvement. Response types did not differ according to grade level or intelligence. Males expressed significantly less engagement than did females.

6.2 Golden, J., & Guthrie, J. (1986). Convergence and divergence in reader response to literature. Reading Research Quarterly, 21, 408-421.

This study examined the degree of convergence and divergence in high schools students' empathy with texts. Sixty-three ninth-grade students responded to pre-formulated responses representing readers' beliefs, empathy, events, and conflict. Students' ratings agreed more on ratings of beliefs and events, and varied more on empathy and conflict. Students who empathized with a certain character were more likely to identify the story conflict as pertaining to that character than were students who did not empathize with the character. Students' attitudes regarding mother/daughter relationships were related to the nature of their belief inferences.

6.3 Hansson, G. (1936). <u>Emotional processes engendered by poetry and prose reading.</u> Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell.

The purpose of this series of studies was to determine the relationship between specific test aspects in poetry and emotional reactions, in some cases in terms of gender differences. In one study, 28 female adult students rated a poem according to mood, activation, perception/appraisal, and stimulus-specific emotional reactions. There was a high significant correlation between perception/appraisal and stimulus-specific ratings.

In another study, 149 male and female adult readers responded to three different versions of the same poem: the original poem, a positive-tone version, and a negative-tone version. There were significant gender differences in ratings of specific feelings, but not in evaluations. Females were more affected by the poems; females who were unhappy before reading the negative-tone poems were even more unhappy after reading the poems than were males.

6.4 Kuehn, W. (1974). Self-actualization and engagement-involvement responses to literature among adolescents. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 34, 6947A.

This study analyzed the relationship between self- actualization and engagement/involvement with a literary work. Eleventh-grade students read three short stories and wrote responses categorized under the Purves categories. Results indicated that there was a correlation between engagement/involvement responses to a short story and self- actualization; this correlation was stronger with boys than girls.

6.5 Monseau, V. (1986). Young-adult literature and reader responses. A descriptive study. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan.) <u>Dissertion Abstracts International</u>, 47, 404A.

This study compares the reading logs of high school students and English teachers' responses



to four works of young-adult fiction. Participants kept reading logs of their responses; group discussions were recorded and transcribed. Readers' degree of engagement with literature strongly influenced evaluations of literary quality. Although student readers employed a more indirect approach and less sophisticated language than did their teachers, they responded to the same literary elements.

6.6 Nell, V. (1988). The psychology of reading for pleasure. Needs and gratifications. Reading Research Quarterly, 23, 6-40.

As one of five studies on characteristics of readers who read extensively for pleasure, this study examined the fantasy processes involved in pleasurable reading, particularly the degree to which reading involves visual imagery. Thirty-three adult readers were administered two personality inventories as well as rating scales about mood responses. Vividness of imagery ratings correlated positively (.47) with degree of involvement; most of the readers were introverts.

6.7 Purves, A. (1978). Using the IEA data bank for research in reading and response to literature. Research in the Teaching of English, 12, 289-296.

This report demonstrates possible uses for further analysis of computer data-bank results from the IEA reading/literature assessment. For example, the degree of liking of each of four stories correlated positively but moderately with understanding and judging of those stories. Students who liked the stories were more likely to select from the Response Preference Measure, these options: involvement, organization, and thematic/aesthetic aspects. Those who disliked the text were more likely to distance themselves, placing the text in the context of a genre or historical period.

6.8 Sadoski, M., & Goetz, E. (1985). Relationships between affect, imagery, and importance ratings for segments of a story. In J. Niles & R. Lalik (Eds.), <u>Issues in literacy: A research perspective</u>, 35th Yearbook of the National Reading Conference. Rochester, NY: National Reading Conference.

The study examined the relationships between emotional reactions and the relative importance of story segments and imagery. Three groups of 15 college students each read a story; one group rated story segments for importance; a second group, for visualness and memorability of imagery; and a third group, for degree of emotional reactions. Significant partial correlations controlling for paragraph length were found between imagery and affect (.37) and importance and affect (.75).

6.9 Sadoski, M., Goetz, E., & Kangiser, S. (1988). Imagination in story response: Relationships between imagery, affect, and structural importance. Reading Research Quarterly, 23, 320-336.

The purpose of this study was to examine the convergence and divergence in readers' imagery and emotional responses as related to perceptions of story episodes' importance in plot structure. Thirty-nine college students read three similar stories, rating paragraphs according to degree of mental imagery, evoked emotions, and importance to the overall story. They were also asked to explain reasons for their ratings of certain paragraphs in a free-response format. Imagery, affect, and importance ratings were moderately correlated. There was considerable agreement in the nature of imagery, feelings, and importance, while the most divergence occurred with imagery.

\*See also: 1.8, 2.22, 2.39, 4.1, 4.8, 8.28, 8.46, 8.47



## 7. Response Processes: Interpretation

7.1 Beach, R. (in press). The creative development of literary response: Readers' use of autobiographical responses to interpret stories. In S. Straw and D. Bogdan, (Eds.), <u>Beyond communication</u>: <u>Reading comprehension and criticism</u>. Portsmouth, NH: Boynton Cook.

This study examined the relationship between college students' autobiographical written journal responses and their level of interpretation of short stories. Journal entries and five short stories were analyzed according to the following categories: engaging, autobiographical, describing, interpreting, judging, and metacognitive responses. The level of interpretation of each entry and the degree of elaboration of autobiographical responses were determined using rating scales. The amount and the degree of elaboration of autobiographical responses were positively related to amount and level of interpretation, respectively.

7.2 Blake, R., & Lumm, A. (1986). Responding to poetry: High school students read poetry. English Journal, 75(2), 68-73.

This study analyzed five untrained high school students' responses to a poem. The students were asked to read a poem aloud and to tape record their interpretation. The taped responses were analyzed to determine differences in readers' approaches to problematic parts of the poem. Results indicated that rereading is essential to poetry understanding; individual readers respond differently to the same poem.

7.3 Harste, J. (1986). What it means to be strategic: Good readers as informants. Paper presented at the National Reading Conference, Austin, TX. (ERIC Document Reproduction No. ED 278980)

This descriptive study analyzed the content of graduate students' responses to a novel. The responses were made in a journal, written after reading each chapter of a novel. The results of analysis revealed that the majority of the reader's time is spent off the page making connections, recasting what she/he already knows, criticizing themselves and the author's performance, or applying what they have read to see what it says about life. The analysis also supports the view that the context of the reading situation affects the process of interpreting the content.

7.4 Hillocks, G., & Ludlow, L. (1984). A taxonomy of skills in reading and interpreting fiction. American Educational Research Journal, 21, 7-24.

The skills in the interpretation of fiction proposed in this paper are defined by seven item types. Four question sets, based on four different texts, were administered to between 77 and 127 students each. Results confirm experimentally the hierarchical and taxonomic nature of the item types.

7.5 Petrosky, A. (1981). From story to essay: Reading and writing. College Composition and Communication, 33, 19-36.

Based on a theory of interpretation as driven by the verification of persona needs and concerns, this study compared differences in the quality of college students' autobiographical written responses as related to their interpretation of novels. Students who were able to elaborate on the details of their autobiographical responses were more effective in applying their experience to interpret novels than were students who did not elaborate.



\*See also: 1.3, 1.16, 1.35, 2.3, 2.5, 2.14, 2.18, 2.22, 2.36, 2.42, 4.1, 8.2

## Instruction

- 8. Studies on the Influence of Instruction. These studies focus on the effects of the instructional context on readers' responses.
- 8. Studies on the Influence of Instruction
- 8.1 Ambrulevich, A.K. (1986). An analysis of the levels of thinking required by questions in selected literature anthologies for grades eight, nine, and ten. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Bridgeport.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 47, 769A.

This study analyzed the level of complexity of questions in selected literature textbooks for eighth, ninth, and tenth grades. Fifteen literature anthologies from five publishing houses provided a stratified random sample of short stories from which 180 questions were classified according to six major cognitive categories of Bloom's Taxonomy. The study found that white some questions fall within the higher half of the taxonomy (application and synthesis), most of the sample questions fall within the lowest categories of thinking (comprehension and knowledge).

8.2 Appleman, D. (1986). The effects of heuristically-based assignments on adolescents' responses to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 47, 11A.

The purpose of this study was to determine the effects of adding prewriting activities to the response assignment prompts employed in the 1979/80 NAEP literature assessment on students' level of interpretation. Two hundred thirteen 11th- and 12th- grade students were assigned to write essays in response to two poems and two stories using either the NAEP prompts or the NAEP prompts with additional prewriting. Students' essays were rated according to quality of interpretation. Differences in assignment prompt had a significant effect favoring the modified version for only one of the four essays. Across treatments, students' ratings were significantly higher for writing about short stories than for writing about poems.

8.3 Beach, R. (1972). The literary response process of college students while reading and discussing three poems. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Illinois.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 34, 656A.

This study compared the effects of three different pre-discussion activities on 36 upperclass English majors' group discussion responses to poems. Following the reading of a poem, students either taped a free association response, wrote a free association response, or had no assignment. Discussion groups in which students employed the free association used more interpretations and less digression than did discussion groups with students who did not prepare for the discussion. Free association responses resulted in more engagement and autobiographical responses, while written responses resulted in more interpretive responses.

8.4 Calder, J. (1984). The effects of story structure instruction on third-graders' concept of story, reading comprehension, response to literature, and written composition. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Washington.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 46, 387A.

This study examined the juality of third graders' responses to stories by comparing the influence of instruction using activities based on concrete incidents from the stories to that using activities based on abstract themes derived from the stories. Concrete activities resulted in greater gains in students' concept of story, response to literature, and quality of narrative writing.



8.5 Casey, J. (1978). The affective responses of adolescents to a poem read in three different classroom situations of reading: Teacher-directed class discussion, self-directed small group discussion, and private reading. (Doctoral dissertation, Rutgers University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 39, 6491A.

This study compared secondary students' response types in response to a poem in three different contexts: teacher-directed class discussion, self-directed small group discussion, and private reading. Response types differed significantly across contexts. There were more divergent responses in group discussions and private reading than in teacher-direction discussions.

8.6 Colvin-Murphy, C. (1987). Eleventh graders' critical comprehension of poetry through written response. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nebraska at Lincoln, 1988.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 48, 1718A.

The purpose of this study was to determine the influence of extended writing on response. Eighty-five 11th graders responded to two poems within one of three treatment groups: extended writing involving guided responses to poems, restricted writing involving short answer responses, and discussion. Pre- and post-test written responses to poems were holistically rated for quality and degree of engagement. Treatment had a significant effect for both ratings favoring the extended writing group, particularly for degree of engagement.

8.7 Coss, D. (1983). The responses of selected groups to social, objective, and affective theories of literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Southern Illinois University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 43, 2318A.

Freshmen/sophomores, juniors/s niors, masters' and doctoral students responded to a poem as well as to statements about the poem and statements that represented social, objective, and affective theories of literature. The preferred response statements about the poem were objective, while the preferred statements about critical theory were affective. There was a significant positive correlation between the affective and the social statement ratings. The higher the grade level, the more the objective theory was preferred.

8.8 Doerr, D. (1980). A study of two teaching methods emphasizing the responses to literature of junior college students. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 40, 4451A.

The influence of two teaching methods on college students' written responses to short stories was studied. One group was instructed in subjective responses based on David Bleich's (1975) method of literary understanding and one group received training on the Purves categories. Results revealed that the affective group improved significantly more on a Personal Orientation Inventory and also preferred this teaching method more than did students in the Purves group.

8.9 Fisher, R. (1985). A comparison of tenth grade students' small group discussions to adults' small group discussions in response to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Virginia Polytechnic Institute, 1986.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 47, 2062A.

This study compared tenth-grade students and adults responding in discussion groups. Groups were also divided by treatments: a reflective reading group which used highly structured, leader-directed questions; a question group, which had no leader but chose questions from the list used by the reflective group; and a free discussion group, which participated in free discussions with no direction and no leader. Discussion transcripts were analyzed according to comprehensiveness of discussion, length of responses, nature of inappropriateness, breadth of participation, and change of mind of a discussant. Responses were also categorized as factual, inferential, experiential, judgmental, miscellaneous, and appropriate or inappropriate. No clear



patterns of change were found as a result of treatment, but students in free-response groups offered responses that were categorically more like the responses of adults in their final free response.

8.10 Folta, B. (1981). Effects of three approaches to teaching poetry to sixth grade students. Research in the Teaching of English, 15, 149-161.

This study compared the effects of three instructional treatments for cuing sixth graders' attention to metaphor in poetry: teachers modeling their own verbal cuing, use of slides to focus on poetic images plus teacher modeling, and use of poets providing instruction. These treatments were compared with a control receiving no instruction in poetry. Three intact classes were randomly assigned to each of the treatments and control; students received instruction over an eight day period with 24 poems. Pre- and post-test measures consisted of Form A and Form B respectively of the ETS "A Look at Literature" test. The results favored instruction involving media and/or poets over the teacher only or the control instruction.

8.11 Graup, L. (1985). Response to literature: Student generated questions and collaborative learning as related to comprehension. (Doctoral dissertation, Hofstra University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 47, 482A.

This study examined the effects of collaborative learning and student-generated questions on sixth graders' understanding and interpretation of literature. Thirty-two sixth-grade students were placed into four groups: discussion group with instruction in inferential question generation, discussion group without question instruction, individual response with inferential question instruction, and individual response without question instruction. Students read literary texts, generated questions, and wrote essays. The findings indicated that discussion groups resulted in better comprehension than did individual responses. Students who received instruction produced significantly more inferential and fewer literal and total questions. Students who received instruction in question generation produced a greater number of interpretive responses in their essays.

8.12 Grimme, D. (1970). The responses of college freshmen to lyric poetry. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Northern Colorado, 1971.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 31, 4004-4005A.

This study compared the effects of instruction in three methods: structural analysis; an experiential, reflective approach; and a limited instructional approach on college freshmen students' responses to poetry. The structural analysis approach resulted in more use of a combination of perception and interpretation responses, while the experiential approach resulted in more use of interpretation supported by personal references. Students in the experiential approach had significantly more positive attitudes towards literature than did students in the other two groups.

8.13 Harris, L. (1982). A description of the extent to which affective engagement with literature takes place using three different classroom strategies: Teacher-directed lecture-discussion, self-directed small group, and creative drama exercises. (Doctoral dissertation, Rutgers University, 1983.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 44, 411A.

This study questioned the effect of three different classroom strategies: teacher-directed lecture/discussion, self-directed small group, and creative drama exercise on 60 tenth graders' responses to three different texts. Analysis of the data revealed that while there was a significant treatment effect on students' cognitive responses, there was no significant treatment effect on affective responses.

8.14 Haug, F. (1975). Young children's responses to literature. (Doctoral dissertation,



42 💪

University of Minnesota.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 35, 4859A.

This research examined how an introduction before presenting a story to first graders affects their response to a realistic and a make-believe story. The introduction was designed to emphasize different categories of response to literature. The students' responses were collected in an individual oral interview and categorized in the following categories: engagement-involvement, perception, interpretation, evaluation, retelling, and other. The findings indicated that there were few differences due to treatment; there were no differences in response due to sex or type of story.

8.15 Heil, C. (1974). A describin and analysis of the role of the teacher's response while teaching a short story. (Doctor dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1975.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 35, 7771A.

The purpose of this study was to determine certain consistent patterns of response types in teachers' and students' classroom responses. Analysis of eight secondary-school teachers teaching a short story yielded two distinct, different patterns. Teachers focused either on engagement/involvement responses, resulting in a wide variety of student response; or they focused on perception/interpretation responses, resulting in a more focused student response.

8.16 Hickman, J. (1980). Children's response to literature: What happens in the classroom. Language Arts, 57, 524-529.

This ethnographic study analyzed children's response to literature at various developmental stages and in a variety of natural classroom contexts. Ninety children aged five to eleven were observed during a four-month period. Data were collected on log sheets and then categorized into the following: 1) listening behaviors; 2) contact with books; 3) acting on the impulse to share; 4) oral responses; 5) actions and drama; 6) making things; 7) writing. Examples of students' responses were compared according to age-level differences, and teacher strategies of manipulating contextual settings were categorized. Major findings were that accessibility of a book was of primary importance in children's willingness to express any response to it at all, and that the most powerful features of classroom context were the teacher's manipulations of text.

8.17 Hickman, J. (1981). A new perspective on response to literature: Research in an elementary school setting. Research in the Teaching of English, 15, 343-354.

This ethnographic analysis of three elementary-school classes over a four-month period examined various response events involving listening, contact with books, sharing, oral responses, drama, art work, and writing. The degree to which these events occurred varied according to the students' language and cognitive development, the social conventions operating in the classroom, and the teacher's influence.

8.18 Hickman, J. (1983). Everything considered: Response to literature in an elementary school setting. <u>Jou val of research and development in Education</u>, <u>16</u> (3), 8-13.

This researcher investigated the responses of elementary students in grades kindergarten through six to two children's books. The participant-observer presented reading material to the children and studied their reactions. Students' spontaneous responses as well as solicited verbal responses were analyzed. Developmental differences emerged in spontaneous responses. Children in kindergarten and first grade used non-verbal modes, facial expressions, and pantomimes. Second and third graders would share and demonstrate their skill in reading. Students in fourth and fifth grades would read aloud, make casual references to art work, and write about the books. Solicited responses were acquired by giving students a tape recorder and asking them to talk about their responses freely. All ages made evaluative statements and



referred to illustrations. Partial retelling and summarizing were common, but students in fourth and fifth grades did not do as much of that kind of response as did younger children.

8.19 Hill, S. (1985). Children's individual responses and literary conferences in the elementary school. The Reading Teacher, 38, 382-386.

This study examined students' responses in the context of a literature-based reading program for a one year period. Student/teacher book conferences for four students in a fifth/sixth grade classroom were analyzed. Analysis of transcripts indicated four major categories: recall of story content, literary analysis, personal responses, and guidance/miscellaneous. The three better readers focused more on analysis and responses, while the poorer readers focused on recall of content.

8.20 Hillocks, G. (1989). Literary texts in classrooms. In P.W. Jackson & S. Haroutunian-Gordon (Eds.). 88th Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education.

Contrastive case studies of two highly experienced expert teachers indicate that they have radically different assumptions about their students and effective teaching; the case studies show remarkably different levels of engagement, response, and understanding on the part of the students.

8.21 Jackson, J. (1980). Reading poetry in high school: An experimental study of response. (Doctoral dissertation, Indiana University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 41, 139A.

This study examined the effects of teacher and peer interaction on response. One hundred ninety two 10th grade students were randomly assigned to respond to two poems in one of three conditions: teacher-led discussion, peer-discussion groups, or individually. After participating in the groups, students were interviewed. Of the four Purves categories employed in the interview analysis, the groups differed only on perception and evaluation responses for one poem. Low-, middle-, and high- ability groups differed significantly on engagement, perception, and interpretation.

8.22 Lennox, W., Small, J., & Ker 1g, B. (1978). An experiment in teaching poetry to high school boys. Research in the Teach 4 of English, 12, 307-320.

This study analyzed the effects of experiential/informal poetry instruction versus more conventional instruction on written responses to poetry. One class of 11th grade students received the former, while another class received the latter. Analysis of pre- and post-test essay responses to poetry according to fluency and overall quality favored the experiential group over the control for both fluency and quality.

8.23 Lucking, R. (1976). A study of the effects of a hierarchically-ordered questioning technique on adolescents' responses to short stories. Research in the Teaching of English, 10, 269-274.

The effect of questioning techniques on students' responses was analyzed. Tenth-grade students' responses to questions were analyzed using the Purves categories. The type of question asked had a significant effect on response. Hierarchically ordered questions led to significantly broader, more interpretational responses, and produced a more positive attitude toward reading than did non-hierarchical questions.

8.24 Major, A. (1975). The relationship of a teacher characteristic to student written response to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Kentucky.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 36, 3548A.



This study questioned the relationship between college students' written responses to literature and the teachers' intellectual disposition. I.A. Richards' categories of response were used to analyze student responses. Results suggested that teachers with a high preference for complexity and a tolerance for ambiguity made a positive contribution to students' ability to interpret literature.

8.25 Marlow, D. (1983). How directed discussions and nondirected discussions affect tenth grade students' responses to four selected short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, Georgia State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 44 2433A.

This study compared 69 tenth-grade male students' and 60 tenth-grade female students' discussion responses to four short stories. Teachers alternated between directed and non-directed discussions in presenting the stories. Sex differences did not significantly affect the overall patterns of responses of males and females in those discussions.

8.26 Marshall, J. (1987). The effects of writing on students' understanding of literary texts. Research in the Teaching of English, 21, 30-63.

This study examined the long-range effects of different approaches to writing about texts on students' ability to interpret. Observation of students in three 11th-grade classes for three and a half months indicated that their teacher employed a relatively academic, analytic approach with less attention to personal, aesthetic responses. Students in these classes were then assigned to one of four treatments: restricted (short answer responses), extended: personal-analytic, extended: formal-analytic, or no writing. Students employed these approaches in writing about a series of stories; composing-aloud protocols elicited before and during writing were also analyzed.

Post-test answers and essays were analyzed in terms of length, response type, and rated level of interpretation. Students in the extended treatments wrote more, were more likely to employ analytic operations, and had a significantly higher level of interpretation than did students in the restricted treatment. Students in the formal-analytic treatment had a significantly higher level of generalization than did students in other groups. Students in the no-writing group did as well as students in the restricted group.

8.27 Martinez, M. (1983). Young children's verbal responses to literature in parent child storytime interactions. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Texas at Austin.) <u>Dissertation Abstract International</u>, 44, 1044A.

This case study of four preschool children explored the verbal responses of children during parent child storytime interactions. The categories: 1) utterance; 2) episode; 3) topic; and 4) non-story talk were used to measure the children's responses to the stories. The findings revealed that there was a quantitative difference in story talk across subjects. Responses were primarily narrational, but also demonstrated a broad range that was similar across children. Children's form and focus of responses were varied when children listened to unfamiliar short stories. While children primarily talked to share reactions and seek information, their response profiles were similar to those of their parent.

8.28 McClure, A. (1985). Children's responses to poetry in a supportive literary context. (Doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University, 1986.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 46, 2603A.

This ethnographic study focused on children's responses to and writing of portry in an intermediate elementary school classroom. Due to positive teacher strategies, students evinced a wide range of relatively complex responses. Over time, students developed more varied preferences and an understanding of various elements of poetry.



8.29 McCurdy, S. H. (1976). A study of relationships between goals for the teaching of literature and teachers' attitudes towards the major categories of written student responses to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Florida State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 36, 4995A.

This study investigated English teachers' attitudes towards students' written responses to literature. The essay responses were analyzed using the Purves categories; a survey questionnaire was used to identify the preferences of teachers toward the four categories. The findings indicated that, overall, teachers preferred interpretation as a response; evaluation was the least desired response.

8.30 McGreal, S. (1976). Teacher questioning behavior during classroom discussion of short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Illinois.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 37, 2798A-2799A.

This study examined the relationships between teachers' questions posed during instruction, question preferences, and students' responses. Analysis of the response types represented by questions and student responses for three teachers each at grades 8, 10, and 12 indicated a positive but moderate correlation between type of questions asked and type of students' responses, particularly at the eighth grade.

8.31 McPhail, I. (1979). A study of response to literature across three social interaction patterns. Reading Improvement, 16, 55-61.

This study compared differences in responses of five third- grade students in three kinds of discussion groups: adult-dominated, peer-dominated, and adult-student balanced. The structure of the social interaction pattern was related to the degree of participation, with students participating more in peer-dominated groups.

8.32 Mertz, M. (1972). Responses to literature among adolescents, English teachers, and college students. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1973.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 33, 6066A.

This study compared the types of written responses employed by 52 English teachers, 52 college preservice English teachers, and 160 10th graders in response to three short stories. There were significant differences among the groups in the types of responses employed, with teachers employing a significantly higher percentage of interpretation responses.

8.33 Michalak, D. (1977). The effect of instruction in literature on high school students' preferred ways of responding. (Doctoral dissertation, State University of New York at Buffalo.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 37, 4829A.

This study examined the effect of a teacher's preferred response style on high school students' response to short storics. The IEA response-preference measure was used as a pre/post test measure to determine the effects of teacher style on changes in student responses. Students preferred interpretation responses; the teacher's style had a significant effect on changes in students' response preferences, with students adopting the teacher's style.

8.34 Morrow, L. (1988). Young children's responses to one-to-one story readings in school settings. Reading Research Quarterly, 23, 89-107.

This study examined differences in the effects of repeatedly reading aloud the same versus different books on low-SES pre-school students' comments and questions. Seventy-nine students in three urban day-care centers were randomly assigned to one of three treatment



groups: a treatment involving reading a different book a week for ten weeks, a treatment involving repeated readings of three different books, and a treatment involving reading-readiness activities. Transcripts of students oral responses were analyzed according to type: number of questions and comments; focus on story structure; meaning; print; illustration. Also, there were subcategories within each of these categories. Students in reading-aloud groups showed significant increases in the number and complexity of questions and comments. Students in the repeated-reading group made more interpretative responses and responses focusing on print and story structure than did the students who listened to different books.

8.35 Peters, W., & Blues, A. (1978). Teacher intellectual disposition as it relates to student openness in written response to literature. Research in the Teaching of English, 12, 127-136.

This study demonstrated that college students of professors who scored high on the Complexity Scale of the Omnibus Personality Inventory (a test of tolerance for ambiguity and uncertainty) tended to make fewer "misinterpretations" (based on I.A. Richards' four categories) than did students of professors who scored low on the same test. The researchers concluded that different interpretation styles were the result of differences in teaching.

8.36 Purves, A., Foshay, A., & Hansson, G. (1973). <u>Literature education in ten countries</u>. New York: John Wiley.

The purpose of this international assessment was to determine the degree to which 14- and 17-year-old students' response preferences, as determined by selecting 5 most preferred response options from 20 options representing different response types, varied across ten different countries and across different short stories. Students responses varied across countries, with 17-year-olds being more consistent than 12-year-olds. Despite some consistencies across the different countries, students' preferences varied across countries according to two basic continuums: emphasis on content versus form, and impersonal versus personal orientation. These differences reflect the particular response emphasis of the literature curriculums of each of those countries.

8.37 Rapport, R. (1982) Reader-initiated response to self-selected literature compared with teacher-initiated responses to teacher-selected literature. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 44, 413A.

This study explored the differences in student responses to the works of Marguerite Henry as reflected in letters written to the author. One group of letters was written freely by children on their own, and one group of letters was written to fulfill a class assignment. The letters were analyzed according to letter-writing style, degree of requests for facts and information, types of response, and perception of Henry as author or human being. Letters from children writing on their own included more personal information and more questions than did letters from children assigned to write. Assigned letters contained more retellings and evaluations on a literal, simplistic level. Both groups focused primarily on characters, and both related their emotional reactions to Henry's books.

8.38 Reamy, R. (1979). A study of the differential responses to three modes of presentation of poetry as exhibited in the writings of high sclool juniors. (Doctoral dissertation, University of South Carolina, 1978.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 39, 6053A.

This study was designed to investigate the effectiveness of three specified modes of teaching poetry (audio-visual, lecture, and socio-psychological) and the kinds of written responses obtained from eleventh-grade students for each method of presentation. Responses were categorized according to the scheme developed by Squire. Results indicated significant differences between the types of student responses and teaching method employed.



8.39 Roser, N., & Martinez, M. (1985). Roles adults play in preschoolers' response to literature. <u>Language Arts</u>, 62, 485-490.

The purpose of this study was to examine preschool children's responses to stories during storytime in home and in schools as influenced by the nature of the adult-child interactions. Four- and five-year-old students listened and responded to ten stories read three times each by teachers; four child/parent home interactions were also examined over a ten month period. Transcripts were analyzed according to the types and focus of talk about stories. Children asked more questions in school than in home settings. Children tended to employ those responses modeled by the teacher or parent within a teacher/student group or parent/child pair. Adults functioned in three different roles: co-responders, informers/monitors, and directors.

8.40 Sabo, F. (1980). Students' self-selected reading choices after being exposed to oral reading and a discussion of Purves' four categories of response to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 41, 2533A.

This study explored the effects of genre (fiction and non-fiction) and question type on third- and fourth- grade students' responses and reading interests. Question types for discussion were developed using the Purves categories; certain classes were then exposed to only certain types of questions. Students recorded all the books they read for six weeks and also completed written responses to hearing and discussing books that were read aloud in class. Engagement/involvement and evaluation question types produced the most amount of reading done by the students at both grade levels. The least amount of reading was produced by those students exposed to literary perception questions at both grade levels. Seventy percent of the questions teachers employed were of a literal level. Older students enjoyed hearing stories read to them more than did younger students. The study concluded that students were motivated to read if they were read to and if discussions focused on engagement/involvement and evaluation.

8.41 Spor, M. (1986). The effect of four methods of response to literature on reading comprehension. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1987.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 48, 92A.

This study explored the effect of mode of response in instructional study on students' comprehension of literature. Eighth grade students produced written free responses, written focused responses, oral free responses, and oral focused responses to short stories. Analysis of responses revealed that written response groups had significantly higher comprehension of the stories as indicated by post-test scores. There were no different effects on comprehension, however, between students who gave free and focused responses.

8.42 Story, D. (1978). A study of fifth graders' verbal responses to selected illustrations in children's books before and after a guided study of three styles of art and illustrated fairy tales. (Doctoral dissertation, Michigan State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 39, 660A.

This study examined the effect of training first-grade students in styles of art on their verbal responses to story illustrations. Data were gathered through individual interview and categorized as stylistic, emotional, or evaluative. Instruction did affect response to art, in that the group that received training had higher gain scores in verbal expression content. Both groups rejected expressionistic style over cartoon and representational sigles, and both groups preferred to discuss content rather than style.

8.43 Sullivan, K. (1974). The effects of response pattern analysis on the content of high school students' written responses to short stories. (Doctoral dissertation, State University of



New York at Buffalo.) Dissertation Abstracts International, 35, 3701A.

This study examined the effects of instruction in the use of the Purves categories on high school students' responses. Analysis of students' written essays after receiving instruction indicated that, after a three-month period, students who received the instruction were employing a wider range of response types than were control group students.

8.44 Sulzby, E., & Teale, W. (1987). Young children's storybook reading: Longitudinal study of parent-child interaction and children's independent functioning. Final Report to The Spencer Foundation. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan.

This report summarizes research on young children's storybook reading with eight families in San Antonio representing different classes and ethnic groups, and large groups of preschool and kindergarten children in Chicago. Analysis of voice tone patterns indicated that parent and child interact with similar tones during storybook reading. Listening to stories was related to learned ability to reproduce connected discourse. The investigators posit the following generalizations: storybook reading was integral to family afe and is a socially constructed activity; storybooks change over time; storybook reading interaction becomes internalized; language variation occurs in storybook reading; and, children engage spontaneously in storybook reenactments.

8.45 Van De Weghe, R. (1988). Making and remaking meaning: Developing literary responses through purposeful, informal writing. English Quarterly, 20, 38-51.

This study examined students' uses of informal writing to enhance their understanding of texts. Analysis of 70 college students' informal reading logs indicated that students used logs to generate hypotheses, infer new insights, cope with difficulties of understanding, define analogies, and discover meaningful problems.

8.46 Vipond, D., and Hunt, R. (in press). Literary processing and responses as transactions: Evidence for the contribution of reading, texts, and situations. In D. Meutsch & R. Vieho. f (Eds.). Comprehension of literary discourse: Interdisciplinary approaches. Berlin. Bruyter.

The purpose of this study was to determine the influence of a framing technique designed to enhance students' engagement by providing them with a purpose for reading and responding. College students in an experimental group were given a letter purported to be written by someone recommending the story (to be read) to another reader and illuminating the writer's own life. Students receiving the framing had a significantly higher degree of engagement than control group students not receiving any framing.

8.47 Vipond, D., Hunt, R., & Wheeler L. (1987). Social reading and literary engagement. Reading Research and Instruction, 26, 151-161.

This study examined the degree to which reading aloud a text in a purposeful, socially meaningful context enhances engagement with the text. Sixty-eight college stud nts were asked to read a story aloud to an audience in a manner that communicated the story's intentions. Students in a nonsocial context read the story aloud to themselves in order to prepare for a comprehension test. After completing the stories, students rated statements regarding their engagement. The reading-aloud was analyzed for instances of hiscues. Students in the social reading context made more attempts to convey the point of the story than did students in the non-social contexts, but the former were less engaged. There was no relationship between miscues and engagement. The investigators argue that reading aloud—a common school practice—may actually reduce engagement.

8.48 Walker, K. (1979). Variables related to the literary response style preferences of high



school English teachers. (Doctoral dissertation, George Peabody College, 1980.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 41, 213A.

Twelve 9th/10th grade and 12 11th/12th grade teachers wrote model responses to a short story and led classroom discussions. They also rank-ordered the importance of response categories for writing about literature and discussions. There were no differences in responses according to the teachers' grade level. Across levels, there were significantly higher uses of perception/interpretation responses than engagement/evaluation. Teachers employed more perception responses than indicated by their rankings of response preferences. Inservice instruction in the teachers' use of responses and students' positive attitude towards literature were positively related to use of engagement and negatively related to use of perception responses.

8.49 Webb, A. J. (1980). Introducing the transactive paradigm for literary response into the high school literature program: A study of the effects on curriculum, teachers, and students. (ERIC Document Number ED 203322.)

A year long holistic study was conducted to determine the effects of using a transactive methodology which focused on the students' involvement with the text, and non-directive teaching strategies involving public conversation, private conversation, and free association. Responses of 93 students in four tenth-grade English classes receiving this instruction are compared with responses of 98 students in four English classes who received traditional literary instruction. There was no significant difference in reading achievement between the two groups. However, transfer was significantly improved in the experimental classes; attitude toward literature also improved in experimental classes.

8.50 Wilson, R. R. (1976). In-depth book discussions of selected sixth graders: Response to literature. (Doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 36, 7195A.

This study explored the small-group discussion responses of eight sixth-grade students to novels. Their responses were gathered using a repertory grid and categorized using the Squire categories. Discussions centered on recurrent themes of friendship, author's purpose, meaning of certain symbols, fantasy situations in realistic works, and characters' unique characteristics.

8.51 Yocom, J. (1987). Children's responses to literature read aloud in the classroom. (Doctoral dissertation, The Ohio State University, 1988.) <u>Dissertation Abstracts International</u>, 48, 2300A.

The purpose of this one-year ethnographic study was to analyze second graders' responses to teacher and parent read alouds in school and in the home. Five categories of responses emerged from transcriptions of events and observations: linking, explaining, and responses to characters, to their own world, and to illustrations. Analysis of parents' questionnaire responses regarding reactions in the home was hampered by parents' difficulty in describing students' responses.

\*See also: 1.38, 1.39, 2.10, 2.40, 2.44



## Research Methods

- 9. Studies on Research Methodology: These studies validate methods of analyzing literary response.
- 9. Studies on Research Methodology
- 9.1 Cooper, C., & Michalak, D. (1981). A note on determining response styles in research on response to literature. Research in the Teaching of English, 15, 163-169.

This essay argues that the most valid measure for determining an individual's preferred mode of response is essay analysis. Response Preference Measure and statement analysis are not viewed as valid measures.

9.2 Dias, P. (1986). Researching response to poetry--Part II: What happens when they read a poem. English Quarterly, 19, 9-21.

The report demonstrates the application of a responding-aloud analysis technique involving oral think-aloud responses to re-readings and questions about a text to one 16-year-old student's responses to a poem. Responses are discussed in terms of different re-readings and personal evaluations of the poem.

9.3 Lester, N. (1982). A system for analyzing characters' values in literary texts. Research in the Teaching of English, 16, 321-338.

The purpose of this study was to determine the validity of a content-analysis system for analyzing characters' values as implied by specific linguistic cues. Using the system, a judge analyzed characters in seven stories to determine specific value attributes for each character. Responses of four adult readers were consistent with the results of the analysis. However, due to the intensity of readers' emotional reactions to instances in which characters' values conflicted with their own, readers often failed to explore reasons for characters' behaviors.

9.4 MacLean, M. (1986). A framework for analyzing reader-text interactions. <u>Journal of</u> Research and Development in Education, 19, 17-21.

This researcher conducted a descriptive study which explored the responses of three adult readers to six expository texts. Filmore's levels of envisionment and Galda's categories were used to analyze oral think-alouds in response to a rational cloze exercise completed after reading each text. Three categories of readers were explained. The text-bound reader placed emphasis on the text and related little prior knowledge to the text. The equal reader referred to the text and prior knowledge equally and summarized the text to integrate prior knowledge and the text. The reader-bound reader was led more by prior knowledge than by the text and only loosely connected his/her comments to the text. This study exemplified how readers have different patterns of reader-text interactions.

9.5 Morris, E. (1976). Critique of a short story: An application of the elements of writing about a literary work. Research in the Teaching of English, 10, 157-175.

This report discusses the application of the Purves categories to determine variation in secondary students' written responses to a short story. The report also discusses pedagogical implications for use of the Purves categories as a basis for classroom discussion.

9.6 Odell, L., & Cooper, C. (1976). Describing response to works of fiction. Research in the Teaching of Linglish, 10, 203-225.



This report demonstrates the application of both the Purves categories and a set of categories for analyzing intellectual strategies as derived from tagmemics: focus; contrast; classification; change; and reference to time sequence, logical sequence, and physical context. The two category systems were applied to one 11th grader's written responses to three novels. Analysis using the Purves categories indicated that the student responded most frequently with descriptive responses, followed by engagement and interpretative responses. Analysis of students' use of intellectual strategies indicated that students only employed a limited set of potential strategies.

9.7 Zaharias, J., & Mertz, M. (1983). Identifying and validating the constituents of literary response through a modification of the response preference measure. Research in the Teaching of English, 17, 231-241.

The principal purpose of this study was to determine the low-inference constituents of literary response. Data were obtained from 166 college undergraduates enrolled in nine introductory literature courses. A stimulus condition consisting of six dissimilar short stories and poems was devised. After reading each literary work, subjects were asked to complete a modified version of the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement's Response Preference Measure. To determine empirically the constituents of literary response, subjects' ratings for each item for all six forms of the Response Preference Measure were jointly subjected to the principal-axis method. common factor analysis. The following four factors were interpreted and labeled: personal statement, descriptive response, interpretive response, and evaluative response.

\*See also: 5.8, 5.10, 5.12

