

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 271 537

UD 024 996

AUTHOR Connelly, F. Michael; Clandinin, D. Jean
TITLE The Role of Teachers' Personal Practical Knowledge in Effecting Board Policy. Volume III: Teachers' Personal Practical Knowledge.

INSTITUTION Ontario Inst. for Studies in Education, Toronto.
SPONS AGENCY National Inst. of Education (ED), Washington, DC.; Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, Ottawa (Ontario).

PUB DATE 84
GRANT 410-80-0688-X1; NIE-G-81-0020
NOTE 82p.; For the other volumes in this series, see UD 024 994-997.
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC04 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Administrative Policy; Administrator Attitudes; Administrator Role; *Educational Administration; *Educational Change; Educational Policy; *Educational Practices; Elementary Education; Foreign Countries; *School Policy; Teacher Attitudes; Teacher Responsibility; *Theory Practice Relationship; Urban Education

IDENTIFIERS Toronto Board of Education ON; Toronto Public Schools ON

ABSTRACT

Teachers' utilization of personal practical knowledge in effecting school reform was analyzed in a three-year project in a Toronto inner city elementary school. The major unit of study was the school, investigated through the eyes of people responsible for school policy. The study, presented in four volumes, focused on the school board's Race Relations Policy and Inner-city Language Development Policy. Participant observers noted the activities of the principal, teachers, and one teacher in particular to determine the key factors affecting their practice in school and classroom. Then these practices were explained in terms of the staff's personal knowledge. This third volume, which contains four chapters, deals specifically with the concept of personal practical knowledge, a concept introduced in Chapter 7 (continuing from chapter 6 in volume 2). Chapter 8 describes the strong influence of the notion of image as a personal knowledge construct on practice in connection with one teacher's image of the classroom. Chapters 9 and 10 elaborate on this in connection with the principal's image of the community., The function of rituals and personal philosophies, and the concept of narrative unity broadened to include cultural and personal narratives are also discussed. (MCK)

 * Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
 * from the original document. *

RESEARCH SUPPORT

Funding was provided by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRCC), and by the National Institute of Education (NIE) through its grants for research on knowledge use and school improvement. NIE provided primary funding for the first two years of the project. During that time, the SSHRCC provided auxiliary support for areas not adequately covered by the National Institute of Education. The third year of the project has been fully supported by SSHRCC.

The major contributions of the SSHRCC for the first two years were support for graduate assistants, additional computer and word processing assistance, temporary secretarial assistance and travel to and from project schools. Graduate assistants have been involved in seven principal project activities. These included the drafting of papers, interviewing participants, analysis of board documents, participant observation at board-level meetings, participant observation in the school, computer entry of data, and development of computer methodologies for handling textual data. Details are provided in Chapter 2 in the section on project staffing.

SSHRCC is providing additional funding to support the continuation of this study (Grant #410-83-1235).

The Principal Investigators and Project Staff of this study gratefully acknowledge the funding received from the National Institute of Education and from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. This report reflects the views of the authors and not necessarily those of the granting agencies.

GENERAL INTRODUCTION

This study develops the concept of teachers' personal practical knowledge through a three-year project undertaken in a Toronto inner-city elementary school. Using the method of participant observation, researchers carefully noted the practices of the school principal and teachers, focussing on one teacher in particular, to determine the key factors affecting their practice in school and classroom.

The central purpose of the study is to deepen our understanding of the practice of education by illuminating the actions of practitioners. What teachers and principals do in their schools is explained in terms of their personal practical knowledge, a concept that includes the associated notions of image, narrative unity, ritual, and rhythm. These notions arose out of the researchers' close interaction with school practitioners over the period of study. The results of the project have important implications, not only for an understanding of practice, but also for an insight into how practitioners view school board policy and how they go about implementing it.

This report is organized into four volumes with a combined total of thirteen chapters. Volume I, entitled *Problem, Method and Guiding Conception*, contains four chapters. Chapter 1 provides an overview of the study, Chapter 2 gives a detailed summary of its activities, and Chapter 3 provides an account of its methodology. Chapter 4 presents an analysis of the various "images" people have of the relationship between theory and practice, and draws on the researchers' experiences in the present study to show how the images held by board and school personnel influenced its shape and direction.

Volume II, *Development and Implementation of a Race Relations Policy by the Toronto Board of Education*, deals with the specific policy selected for purposes of this study -- the Race Relations Policy. A history of the development of the policy is given in Chapter 5, along with an analysis and discussion of the concept of race that emerged during the process of development. Chapter 6 presents a detailed account of the implementation of the policy, describing the activities of the Race Relations Committee and interpreting its work as an agent of policy implementation. As well, the chapter describes the actions taken by board officials to ensure that the policy was reflected in the curriculum materials used in classrooms.

Volume III, *Personal Practical Knowledge*, develops the central concept of the study and introduces several associated concepts. Chapter 7 introduces the notion of personal practical knowledge, built up through close observation and interpretation of events in the inner-city school under study. Various associated concepts -- image, narrative unity, and ritual -- are

subsequently introduced to help explain their actions. The notion of image as a personal knowledge construct exerting a powerful influence on practice is developed in Chapter 8 in connection with one teacher's image of the classroom, and further elaborated in Chapters 9 and 10 in connection with the principal's image of community. Chapter 9 also discusses the function of rituals and personal philosophies in school practice, and Chapter 10 develops the concept of narrative unity as a way of giving an account of a principal's school practices. The concept of narrative unity is then broadened to include cultural narratives, which provide a context for personal narratives. These notions are used to shed light on the relationship between school and community.

Volume IV, *Personal Practical Knowledge and Ethnic Relations*, begins with an account of the Board's Race Relations Policy as it is put into practice in the school under study, using the perspective of personal practical knowledge (Chapter 11). Chapter 12 shows how personal and cultural narratives are expressed through cycles and rhythms, which find their place in the interaction of these narratives. Cycles are shown to have an affinity to the broader societal context, and rhythms to the personal world of the individual. The role of cycles and rhythms in modulating school and community relations is described. Finally, Chapter 13 summarizes personal practical knowledge as the way that practitioners "know" their school and classroom and the determining influence on how they deal with matters such as race and ethnic relations. The chapter closes with recommendations for using the knowledge gained in this study to enrich classroom practice.

CONTENTS OF REPORT

VOLUME I: PROBLEM, METHOD AND GUIDING CONCEPTION

- Chapter 1 Overview
- Chapter 2 Summary of Project Activities
- Chapter 3 Methodology
- Chapter 4 Images of the Relationship of Theory and Practice

VOLUME II: DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF A RACE RELATIONS POLICY BY TORONTO BOARD OF EDUCATION

- Chapter 5 Development of the Race Relations Policy of the Toronto Board of Education
- Chapter 6 Implementation of the Race Relations Policy

VOLUME III: PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE

- Chapter 7 The Concept of Personal Practical Knowledge
- Chapter 8 Personal Practical Knowledge: A Study of Teachers' Classroom Images
- Chapter 9 Personal Philosophy, Ritual and Image: Coping with a Community Issue
- Chapter 10 Image and Narrative Unity: Concepts of Community and School-Community Relations

**VOLUME IV: PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE AND RACE
RELATIONS**

- Chapter 11 The Policy in the School**
- Chapter 12 Calendars, Cycles, Habits and
Rhythms: The Celebration of
Different Cultural Traditions**
- Chapter 13 The Teachers' Ways of Knowing the
Classroom: Relevance for Teaching
for Cultural Understanding**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We are most indebted to the staff of Bay Street School who worked with us for a period of more than three years on this research project. Without their willing participation in it, this study would not have been possible.

We would also like to thank members of our Reference Committee and express our appreciation for their involvement in the study:

- Dr. E. Wright, Director of Research for the Toronto Board of Education
- Dr. Ouida Wright, Assistant Superintendent of Curriculum, Toronto Board of Education
- Mr. John Bates, Toronto Board of Education
- Mr. Tony Sousa, Race Relations Advisor, Toronto Board of Education
- Bay Street School Participants: Phil Bingham, Stephanie Winters, Ellen Bodnar, Cynthia Smith, Grace Anderson (all pseudonyms)

The research team has varied in number over the course of the study. The contributions of the following members are particularly noted:

- Esther Enns, for her participation in the Race Relations Sub-Committee meetings and for her analysis of the work of the Race Relations Committee, presented in Chapter 6.
- Dr. Siaka Kroma, for his analysis of the Concept of Race in the Race Relations Policy, presented in Chapter 5.
- Mr. Jim Kormos, for his analysis of the History of the Race Relations Policy, presented in Chapter 5.
- Mr. Claus Wittmack, for his participation in the project.
- Miss J. Whyte, for her participation in project activities and for her analysis of the curriculum materials, presented in Chapter 6.
- Dr. Miriam Ben-Peretz, for her advice and counsel on the project.

We would also like to acknowledge especially the assistance of Mrs. Rita O'Brien in keeping project staff on task throughout the study. Without her careful organization and assistance to all project members, the project would have been considerably less successful. Her assistance in working with the research staff in setting up the word processing and computer system is gratefully acknowledged. We would also like to express our appreciation to Mrs. Margaret Heather, Mrs. Betty Martyn, Mr. Mark Belaiche and Mrs. Brenda Mignardi for their secretarial assistance.

The contribution of Mr. Frank Quinlan as editor of this report is also acknowledged.

The contribution of some of our consulting staff must be especially acknowledged. We

extend our appreciation to the following:

- Dr. J. J. Schwab, Professor Emeritus, University of Chicago.
- Dr. Mark Johnson, Philosophy Department, University of Southern Illinois at Carbondale.
- Dr. Freema Elbaz, Israel.
- Dr. Elliot Eisner, Stanford University.
- Dr. David Hunt, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education.
- Dr. Bruce Joyce, San Francisco State University.

There were many other consultants who worked with us on this project. They have all been important in helping us work out our notions of Personal Practical Knowledge.

F.M.C.

D.J.C.

Table of Contents

7. THE CONCEPT OF PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE	1
7.1. INTRODUCTION	1
7.2. CLARIFYING THE CONCEPT	2
7.2.1. <i>What We Mean by "Personal"</i>	2
7.2.2. <i>What We Mean by "Knowledge"</i>	2
7.3. RELATED CONCEPTS	3
8. PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE: A STUDY OF TEACHERS' CLASSROOM IMAGES	7
8.1. STARTING POINT AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	7
8.2. PURPOSES OF THE STUDY	7
8.3. METHODOLOGY	8
8.4. THE NATURE OF IMAGE	11
8.5. STEPHANIE'S IMAGE OF "CLASSROOM AS HOME"	13
8.5.1. <i>Image as a Link between Personal/Private and Educational/Professional Experience</i>	13
8.5.2. <i>The Moral Dimension of Image</i>	17
8.5.3. <i>The Emotional Colouring of Image</i>	19
8.5.4. <i>Expression of The Image</i>	21
8.6. SUMMARY: THE CONCEPT OF IMAGE	22
8.6.1. <i>The Moral Dimension</i>	22
8.6.2. <i>The Emotional Dimension</i>	23
8.6.3. <i>The Personal and Professional Dimension</i>	23
8.6.4. <i>The Origin of Image in Experience</i>	23
8.6.5. <i>The Verbal Expression of Images</i>	25
8.6.6. <i>Expression of Images in Practice</i>	25
8.7. CONCLUSION	26
8.8. REFERENCES	28
9. PERSONAL PHILOSOPHY, RITUAL AND IMAGE: COPING WITH A COMMUNITY ISSUE	30
9.1. THEORETICAL EXPRESSION OF PERSONAL PHILOSOPHY	30
9.2. THE PHILOSOPHY AS RITUAL IN A RITUALISTIC CONTEXT	32
9.2.1. <i>The Philosophy</i>	32
9.2.2. <i>The Ritualized Context</i>	35
9.3. PHIL'S PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE	38
9.3.1. <i>Experience to Image</i>	39
9.4. EXPRESSIONS OF PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE	48
9.5. USING BAY STREET SCHOOL TO CONCEPTUALIZE PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE	49
9.6. REFERENCES	50

10. IMAGE AND NARRATIVE UNITY: CONCEPTS OF COMMUNITY AND SCHOOL-COMMUNITY RELATIONS	51
10.1. THE COMMUNITY FESTIVAL VS THE FRIENDS OF BAY STREET BALL	51
10.2. THE FESTIVAL AS AN EXPRESSION OF AN IMAGE OF COMMUNITY	54
10.3. NARRATIVE UNITY	57
10.4. NARRATIVE UNITY AND IMAGE LINKED	58
10.5. THE NARRATIVE BEGINS	60
10.6. PHIL'S NARRATIVE AND HIS IMAGE OF COMMUNITY	63
10.7. THE LEARNING COMMUNITY AS AN ASPECT OF THE IMAGE OF COMMUNITY	65
10.8. A RETURN TO THE SCHOOL COMMUNITY CRISIS	67
10.9. PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE AND THE STUDY OF SCHOOLING	68
10.10. REFERENCES	71

Chapter 7
THE CONCEPT OF PERSONAL PRACTICAL
KNOWLEDGE

7.1. INTRODUCTION

The research described in this volume is part of a long-term study of personal practical knowledge in school settings. It looks at school practices from a fresh perspective and develops new terms -- a new language, if you will -- to explain what principals do in their schools and what teachers do in their classrooms. This perspective is described as "personal" in the sense that the actions of school practitioners flow from their individual personalities and personal experience. The terms we employ reflect this perspective.

In this study we take the position that teaching practices consist of "knowing actions." What teachers do in the process of instructing their pupils springs from their own knowledge and experience as much as, or perhaps more than, from policy directives and curriculum guidelines. Teaching actions are also the origin of personal practical knowledge, as teachers continually adapt their methods and approaches on the basis of classroom experiences.

Thus practitioners imbue action with knowledge, and knowledge with passion, as people who care about what they do. Action and knowledge are united in the practitioner. In our account of the interplay of knowledge and action, we focus on the practitioner as a *person who acts* -- hence our term, personal practical knowledge.

7.2. CLARIFYING THE CONCEPT

Virtually everything we have to say is based upon the notion of personal practical knowledge. The term is both so commonplace and so complex that without clarification at the outset, it will be misunderstood. The words most in need of clarification are "personal" and knowledge." In order to ensure that they are understood as used in this term, we need first to state as clearly as possible what they do *not* mean. Both words could be easily misinterpreted in two ways.

7.2.1. What We Mean by "Personal"

First, we do not mean by "personal" something apart from the society and circumstances in which an individual lives. On the contrary, we are merely emphasizing, as against Marxism and some other views, that in addition to the long sweep of tradition and the embodying structure of a culture and society, there is an individual factor which helped to constitute a person's character.

Nor does "personal" define the knowledge as privately owned, secret to the individual. In many respects, as we shall try to make clear, it is private but need not remain so. It is knowledge which can be discovered both in the actions of the person and under some circumstances by discourse or conversation.

When we use the word "personal" to define knowledge, we mean that the knowledge participates in, is imbued with, all that goes to make up a person. That is, it is not such "impersonal" knowledge as two times two equals four. It is, rather, a knowledge which has grown out of circumstances, actions, and experiences which themselves had affective content or emotional significance for the individual.

7.2.2. What We Mean by " Knowledge"

The word "knowledge" could also be misunderstood. First, the phrase "personal knowledge" could be taken to refer to intellectual possessions, of immediate access to the person and expressible in language, either common or technical. Although personal knowledge does have the sense of an accessible possession when it takes the form of a person's speech about himself, we mean

much more by the phrase. We mean it to include other intellectual events *and* bodily actions. Action, and the passion that characterizes it, are part of what we mean by personal knowledge. Indeed action, broadly conceived to include intellectual acts and self-exploration, is all we have to go on as researchers. When we see an action we see personal knowledge at work. Very frequently this is knowledge that the practitioner cannot readily express nor fully understand. He or she may not even be aware that it is being applied.

Second, "personal knowledge" could be taken to mean truths. This is not necessarily the case. In the light of parts of one's past (whether personal, social, or traditional), a person may completely misinterpret events or situations that occur later on. Their personal knowledge may then be quite untrue. People have convictions arising from experience that differ markedly from those of others undergoing similar events. These convictions lead to actions which are sometimes successes and sometimes failures.

What we mean by knowledge is the body of convictions and meanings, conscious or unconscious, which have arisen from experience, intimate, social and traditional, and which are expressed in a person's actions. We use the term "expression" to describe a quality of knowledge rather than in its common usage as an application or translation of knowledge.

The concept of personal practical knowledge is of knowledge as experiential, value-laden, purposeful and oriented to practice. Personal practical knowledge is viewed as tentative, subject to change and transient, rather than something fixed, objective and unchanging.

7.3. RELATED CONCEPTS

In Chapter 8, we develop the concept of image as part of personal practical knowledge (Clandinin, 1983). The key actors in this chapter are Aileen and Stephanie, two primary grade teachers. Image is conceptualized as a kind of knowledge embodied in a person and connected with the individual's past, present and future. Image draws both the past and the future into a personally meaningful fabric of experience. It reaches into the past, gathering up the threads of experience, and into the future, creating new threads as situations are experienced and new situations anticipated from the perspective of the image.

Chapters 9 and 10 develop the concepts of "personal philosophy", "ritual", "image" and "narrative unity" as part of personal practical knowledge. The key actor in these chapters is Phil Bingham, Bay Street School's principal. Chapter 9 on "Personal Philosophy, Ritual and Image" (Connelly and Clandinin, 1982) gives an account of Phil's "personal philosophy" and its expression in his "making" of the school environment and in his professional development activities with staff. Many of the actions he undertakes to foster these practices are carried out in association with verbal expressions of the philosophy. Characteristically, he structures the environment to enhance his purposes. The expression of Phil's personal philosophy takes on the character of a "ritual" with its attendant characteristic of revealing hidden and deep meaning. For Phil, this meaning is connected to his imagery, an imagery constructed out of his thirty or so years of school experience and, in particular, his experience as principal of Lundbreck School, an innovative school with language and community characteristics similar to those of Bay Street School. In Chapter 9, we give an account of what we call the "Lundbreck School image," an image we saw as central in Phil's personal practical knowledge.

In Chapter 10 on "Image and Narrative Unity" (Clandinin and Connelly, 1983), we deepened both our understanding of the principal's personal practical knowledge and our theoretical understanding. We explored the principal's practices in light of a personal image of community. This image of community was expressed in activities planned by the staff, in relationships with the school community, and in the learning community established for children. We traced the experiential origins of the imagery in the narrative unity of Phil's life. Image and narrative unity were developed as terms to account for personal experience. This form of personal practical knowledge, the image of community, is in our view, one crystallization of the narrative unity of Phil's life. These two terms, image and narrative unity, allow us to deal with experience in a concrete way, and in addition, to show how experience is reflected in the minded practices of schooling.

It is important that our notion of image as part of personal practical knowledge not be confused with the notion of image as a "concept" and as a propositional knowledge term. If this occurred, it could easily be argued that the term "image" as we use it adds little of substance, since standard views on

the concept of image and of related events, concepts and propositions treat the same thing, namely, a form of conceptual knowledge. Our interest, however, lies not with propositions and concepts about practice, but rather in the imaginative processes by which meaningful and useful patterns are generated in minded practice. Propositional knowledge in our domain refers only to concepts of, and their relations to, practice. But minded practice involves more than this. It involves the calling forth of images from a history, a narrative of experience, so that the "image" becomes available to guide us in making sense of future situations. Images are within experience rather than only in the words which specify their conceptual status. As we use the term, images are embodied and enacted. Their embodiment entails emotions, morality and aesthetics -- affective, personally felt and believed meanings that exert a powerful effect on individual actions. It is because of this that we refer to "minded" practice.

Our thinking follows that of Lakoff and Johnson (1980), one a linguist and the other a philosopher, who, in introducing readers to their perspective on metaphor, write that:

We found that we shared, also, a sense that the dominant views on meaning in Western philosophy and linguistics are inadequate -- that "meaning" in these traditions has very little to do with what people find meaningful in their lives (Lakoff and Johnson, 1980, p. ix).

Consistent with the approach of Lakoff and Johnson to language theory, and that of MacIntyre to moral philosophy, we seek to give an account of what is meaningful in a person's life in the context of classroom practice. Polanyi, in his "inquiry into the nature and justification of knowledge" put the matter this way:

I want to establish an alternative ideal of knowledge, quite generally. ...I regard knowing as an active comprehension of the things known, an action that requires skill... Such is the personal participation of the knower in acts of understanding (Polanyi, 1958, p. vii)

While Polanyi's focus was on the cognitive act of understanding, our focus is on action, specifically classroom action. A teaching act, because it is a minded practice in the sense described, is also an act of understanding. It is an act of "personal participation" and not one of detached application of concepts and propositions.

This brief summary of our study of personal practical knowledge indicates that our work is interpretive, not descriptive. Our interest in the personal biographical origins of school practices distinguishes it from a sociological interpretation in which teachers' and childrens' acts are examined in terms of their social environments. Although we consider action in terms of personal history, we do not treat our interpretations and those of society as in opposition but rather as complementary. From our point of view, individual narratives are embedded in more general cultural and historical narratives. As MacIntyre writes:

I am born with a past; and to try to cut myself off from that past, in the individualistic mode, is to deform my present relationships. The possession of an historical identity and the possession of a social identity coincide. (MacIntyre, 1981, p.205)

Phil, for example, lives out his narrative in an island community with its own history and culture, of which Phil is a part. Similarly, the ethnic communities of Bay Street School have cultural traditions in which the school children's and their parents' individual histories are embedded. Our interest is in interpreting the significance of these cultural traditions in terms of personal narrative history.

Chapter 8

PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE: A STUDY OF TEACHERS' CLASSROOM IMAGES

8.1. STARTING POINT AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This chapter reports the results of a two-year intensive case study of two teachers' classrooms conducted by J. Clandinin. Its starting point, as Chapter 7 has explained, is the assumption that teachers develop and use a special kind of knowledge, which we call "personal practical knowledge." This knowledge is neither theoretical, in the sense of theories of learning, teaching and curriculum, nor merely practical, in the sense of knowing children. Teachers' special knowledge is composed of both kinds of knowledge, blended by the personal background and characteristics of the teacher and expressed in particular situations.

This chapter presents a conceptualization of teacher "image" as a component of personal practical knowledge and a central construct for understanding teacher's knowledge. The chapter argues that classroom practices are "minded" expressions of teachers' images.

8.2. PURPOSES OF THE STUDY

The case study, which forms part of the larger study, has two research purposes, one theoretical (1) and one practical (2). The first part of each purpose is general, the second specific.

1. To develop a person-centered language and perspective for accounting for school practices, including those of school practitioners.

To offer a conceptualization of image as a central construct for understanding teachers' personal practical knowledge and for linking such knowledge to past experience and to current practical expressions.

2. To report the results of a two-year study in two teachers' classrooms and in so doing to explain their practices in terms of their personal practical knowledge.

To identify the specific images in each teacher's personal practical knowledge and to show how these images make sense of their classroom actions.

8.3. METHODOLOGY

The conception of personal practical knowledge advanced in this research has been developed through dialectic methodologies (Clandinin, 1983). These methodologies have also been employed in the present case study. The choice of qualitative methods is justified in part by the dialectical relationships that characterize the interdependence of researcher and researched. As researcher, I cannot enter a teacher's classroom as a neutral observer and try to give an account of her reality. I enter into the research process as a person with my own personal practical knowledge. The research process is a dialectical one characterized by Dwyer (1979) as "a particular form of social action that creates dialectical confrontations and produces intersubjective meaning" (p. 211). The meaning created in the process of working together in the classroom, of offering interpretations and of talking together is a shared one. Neither teacher nor researcher emerges unchanged.

Intensive dialectical relationships with two teachers were established over more than a year of participant observation and interviews. The study focussed on these teachers in their classroom reality -- coping with students, parents, other staff, principal, and consultants and with program demands -- for to understand the teachers' personal practical knowledge, one needs to understand how they work in their classrooms.

Accounts of developing interpretations were offered to the teachers over the study period. These accounts were written from the perspective of my personal practical knowledge, enriched by my reading in theoretical literature. The interpretations of teacher's personal practical knowledge advanced in the chapter have not been made from the perspective of a theoretical framework. It is from the perspective of my personal practical knowledge that I develop constructs to give an account of my intimate, detailed understanding of the two teachers in the study.

The construct of image developed in this study is an interpretation, in Polanyi's terms (1958), derived from my personal practical knowledge rich with my own images and enriched both by theoretical readings and a detailed understanding of the two teachers.

Two primary teachers, Aileen and Stephanie, participated in the study. Aileen is an Early Childhood Education teacher with twelve years' experience in kindergarten to grade three classes. During the research period, she taught Junior and Senior kindergarten in a traditional elementary school and was the only teacher on the staff using what she calls a "play-based" approach to teaching. Stephanie is an elementary school teacher with twelve years of experience in two inner-city schools. During the research period she taught a split Grade 1 and 2 class in the first year and a Grade 1 class in the second.

Participant observation methodology was used in both classrooms. I worked in Stephanie's classroom for three half-days per week from April, 1981 to June, 1981 and from September to February, 1982, and in Aileen's classroom for the equivalent of one full week in February and March, 1982. There were two formal interviews with each participant: March and June, 1980 with Aileen and June, 1981 and January, 1982 with Stephanie. Final interpretive accounts were presented to the participants in November, 1982.

In each classroom I took an active role as a teacher assistant and colleague. I became more deeply involved in Stephanie's class and took a more central role in planning sessions, in discussions of student progress, and in taking responsibility for class projects. (This chapter focusses primarily on Stephanie; for a full account of my work with both teachers, see Clandinin, 1983.)

My involvement with students precluded note-taking during school visits. After school, usually the same day, events were reconstructed in field notes. Dictaphone notes were made and entered into a DEC-10 computer using a Digital word processor. The principal topics on which notes were made were student activities, discussions with the teacher, observations of the teacher's activities, projects completed, the physical appearance of the classroom and my own activities. My notes attempted to give a complete account, recording as much detail as could be remembered.

The interviews held with each teacher were unstructured and open-ended. These were taped and later transcribed and computer-entered. Transcripts were shared with the teachers to give them an opportunity to correct and modify the data.

Field note and interview data were initially divided into content units, coded by brief descriptive phrases. This initial interpretive process was enriched by a 'theoretical memo' process (Glaser and Strauss, 1967), in which preliminary interpretations and comments about segments of the data were written as I analysed field notes and interview results. After initial analysis, the data, which now included raw data, descriptive phrases and theoretical memos, were reread in order to identify practices which seemed "minded" by what I speculated were images.

Preliminary interpretive accounts were prepared and shared with teachers. These not only provided feedback on my interpretation of classroom activities and interviews but also advanced tentative conceptualizations of image grounded in my interpretation of events. The accounts attempted to capture the personal practical knowledge of each teacher by detailing her images and their expression in minded practices in both classroom and interviews. These accounts also described my participation in the classroom and offered tentative ideas on the concept of image for consideration by the teachers.

The teachers responded to the interpretive accounts in further interviews. Their responses provided insight into their imagery and its expression in practice. Two interpretive accounts were prepared for each teacher, one preliminary and one final. The data collection, analysis, and preparation of the first interpretive accounts were carried out about the same time.

8.4. THE NATURE OF IMAGE

In my work with Aileen and Stephanie, I came to understand their past experience as it could be seen to crystallize in the form of their imagery and as their imagery was expressed in practice. Some things about each teacher stand out as individual marks or features. In Aileen's classroom, as the children filed past her at dismissal time, she reached out and touched each child's shoulder, said goodnight and then said the child's name. Her dismissal practice was remarkable, distinctive to Aileen. In Stephanie's room, the elaborate, ever-changing door displays were distinctive to her. I have come to view these and other practices as expressions of images held by Aileen and Stephanie, images that are part of their personal practical knowledge.

Although the accounts are of two individual, distinctive persons, the structure of how and of what I can give an account is the same. I give accounts, in general, of practices, experiences, images and relationships while acknowledging the particular practices, experiences, images and relationships of each individual. I talk about Stephanie and Aileen as individuals but also about teachers in general. My key construct for relating the specific and the general, the practical and the theoretical, is the image.

This section provides a conceptualization of the nature of image through an examination of what I call Stephanie's "classroom as home" image. Through the analysis, the dimensions of the construct of image become apparent. The major dimensions of image are briefly described, and then Stephanie's "classroom as home" image is analysed.

In coming to understand images as the coalescence of experience, I had to deal with emotion, for in every expression of an image, emotion was apparent. Aileen's image of the child's face (I.A.2) is not a neutral image. It touches her profoundly. Similarly, moral aspects became apparent. In the expression of what I term Stephanie's "high school math" image (I.A.2), a moral colouring is evident. For Stephanie, the image is a negative one, since the experience was judged to be bad. The image now functions for her as a guide to 'better' teaching.

To find both emotion and morality in experience is unremarkable.

Dewey (1934) describes emotion as "the moving and cementing force" in experience. Emotion is for Dewey what "provides unity in and through the varied parts of an experience" (Dewey, 1934, p.42). Morality can equally be seen as part of experience, although perhaps a less obvious part. We might imagine that, in Aileen's experience with the child who "would come up and just want to share his plasticene or something and...we'd say we don't have time ..." (A.O. 2, 9), moral issues would not be immediately apparent. It was in thinking about her experience that moral issues emerged, "and really that's so bad" (A.O., 2, 9). She judged herself on the critical moral issue of hurting another person, and this moral dimension coloured the image of the "child's face as haunting." (I.A.2)

In my work with Stephanie and Aileen, I gradually understood emotion and morality as dimensions of images. Both the emotional and the moral colourings of an image were keys to understanding how a person's experience coalesces in images. The emotional and moral dimensions of image were seen as the glue which binds together the educational and personal, private sides of an individual's life. Just as Dewey linked the home and the school in the experience of the child, image is a link between a person's professional life and his or her personal life.

8.5. STEPHANIE'S IMAGE OF "CLASSROOM AS HOME"

8.5.1. Image as a Link between Personal/Private and Educational/Professional Experience

What I call Stephanie's image of "classroom as home" highlights the link between her educational and personal private life. The image as it emerged in the field note and interview data captures, in its origin and function, aspects of both Stephanie's personal and professional experience. In talking about her teaching, Stephanie speaks of her classroom as a home, "you know but that idea of the home well it's a home. I mean...my idea of how a home should be." (S.W., 2, 64). In the verbal expression of the image, both personal and educational aspects of her life are captured; the image draws together both home and classroom. The image will be examined below from the perspective of its origin and functions.

The image is rooted in Stephanie's experience: in her professional experience, "so this really I guess starts right back from my early years as the big thing was to get that sense of environment" (S.W., 2, 65); in her professional training, "that's the big thing there which education always tried to do and it was there in all different, all different parts of the bureaucracy" (S.W., 2, 62); in her own school experience, "and I think it did a lot of harm in those years" (S.W., 2, 62); and in her private life, "like when I say home this would be my idea, is a group of people interacting together and cooperating together" (S.W., 2, 62). There are, then, four areas, professional experience and training and personal schooling and home experience, in which the image is rooted. Let us look first at the origin of the image in her personal private life.

Stephanie holds a view of herself as a child and as a student who was "always different" and who was marching to "another beat" (S.W., 2, 38). She described her own school experiences as a "packaging" experience and felt that those who did not fit the package were "scattered by the side" by the educational system (S.W., 2, 13). She describes herself as one of the ones who didn't fit the package and was "left out" (S.W., 2, 13).

A sense emerged from the transcripts that she has experienced a home such as the one she wants in her classroom, a place where "people cooperate

and interact together" (S.W., 2, 66). No clear sense of where or in what manner she participated in such a home emerged. She describes the emotional and social attributes of the home as a place where people can interact and cooperate but where each person has his/her own space and each is "free to march to their own drummer" (S.W., 2, 38). Two other aspects of the "home" emerge: a home is to be full of treasured things and it is to be a "living area" (S.W., 2, 66). The "classroom as home" image is, thus, rooted in her personal school and home experiences.

But the image also has its roots in her professional experience. In Teacher's College, she again felt out of step--out of step with the way the student teachers were being taught, that is, as "mini-models where you had to model the, the style of the teacher" (S.W., 2, 56) but equally out of step with what and how they were to teach "so I came liberal" (S.W., 1, 45).

Not until Stephanie had her own class did she begin to feel "in step". She underwent what she called "a metamorphosis" (S.W., 2, 40) after she began teaching. In her classroom she was able to create a space in which she felt "in step". She spent then, as she continues to do now, long hours creating an environment in which she and the students could feel comfortable and cared for, in short, a home environment.

In its origin then, the image links Stephanie's professional and personal life. Let us turn now to an examination of how the image functions to link her professional and personal life.

The image was expressed in a number of classroom events recorded in my field notes. an instance of one such series of events occurred in the spring. Stephanie had wanted to work with me on a "planting" unit very early in our work together. Initially I didn't understand its importance as anything more than a science unit in the program. At the time I saw it as a random choice and thought it could have been any other unit. However, I now see the choice as minded, in part, by the "classroom as home" image. The link the image provides between her personal private life and her educational life is especially important in coming to understand how the image functions within her personal practical knowledge.

To many people and particularly to Stephanie, a home should have a garden or at least growing things. Her emphasis on a "living" (S.W., 2, 66) component of the home image suggests that importance, as does her choice of her personal home, an old house she is renovating in an inner-city neighborhood. To be able to grow things is important to Stephanie. Her interest in the planting and growing activities serves functions in both her personal and professional life. On one side, the planting activities contribute to the 'home in the classroom'. The bean plants, the garden, the avocado and the geranium (I.A.2) contributed to the home-like classroom. At one point Stephanie resisted my suggestion that the students take their plants home before the end of the year because she felt the plants added to the classroom environment.

However, the planting activities at school were also a way for her to try out something for her personal life. With the success of our activities at school, Stephanie took her new-found skills home. She planted the bathtub she had in her front yard with geraniums and, in her backyard, grew a garden complete with vegetables and pumpkins for Hallowe'en (I.A.1 and 2). The classroom home thus became a testing ground for her personal home.

The effect on both home and school of the image expressed in action is dramatic. Elements in both are transformed. School subject matter is selected and organized in a particular way; the classroom atmosphere is changed; inner-city students are given new experiences; Stephanie sees herself as a resource to other teachers interested in planting and seeks out staff members interested in similar activities. Her home life is enriched as new hobbies develop and the physical appearance of her personal environment is enhanced.

The image can also be seen expressed in Stephanie's minded practices around the rhythm of the school year. She responds to the cycle of events or major celebrations in mainstream Canadian society, events like Hallowe'en, Christmas and Easter, events celebrated by many people in their homes, with family traditions and rituals. This cycle of events can be seen as a rhythm of the school year in Stephanie's classroom (I.A.1). The ways in which Stephanie approaches each event are minded, in part, by the "classroom as home" image. For example, at Hallowe'en she transformed the classroom: she devoted her

weekend to decorating it; she made Hallowe'en activities a priority for both her own and my activities, superseding what I wanted to do (read a story) in favour of making the room more homelike by setting up tables with tablecloths and napkins. The central focus for the celebration moved from her private home to the classroom home. One function of the "classroom as home" image was as a link between Stephanie's personal and professional life. As the image was expressed in action, for example, in the planting unit, new forms of expression were added. Stephanie's home, both classroom and personal, became places where plants flourished.

The expressions of the image both in verbal communication and in classroom practices are, of course, always in the present, and its origin is always in the past. As the image finds new forms of expression in practice, however, it reaches back into the past and reorders both professional and personal experiences. For example, one expression of the "classroom as home" image was in the baking and cooking Stephanie suggested I do with the children in the classroom. These activities were a new expression of the image. We might imagine that Stephanie came to see earlier baking activities with students, for example, making potato latkes during the school Festival of Lights (Field notes, December 16, 1981), as important in creating a home atmosphere. Similarly, we might imagine that previous baking related experiences in her private life could be seen as important in creating Stephanie's personal home.

The image points the way to future expressions both in Stephanie's personal and professional life. For example, Stephanie told me in a conversation "that once you have taught kindergarten or been in the primary, any grade level within the primary is not too much of a challenge" (Field notes, September 10, 1981). If Stephanie were to teach in another grade or in another subject area, such as English as a Second Language (an area into which she would like to move) the "classroom as home" image would find expression in new settings. In future situations in both her personal and professional life, the image would still be expressed in what she did. It would be marked by an emphasis on the environment, her interactions with others, and the importance of creating a space where each participant would be free to march to his or her own drummer.

In the temporal aspect of the image, insight is gained into how image as a knowledge component is related to the phenomenal world and to future knowledge. New situations are experienced from the perspective of the image as a part of personal practical knowledge; teaching in a different level or in a different area are interpreted from Stephanie's perspective of the "classroom as home" image. New situations in her personal life, such as planning for another holiday celebration, can also be interpreted as experienced from the perspective of the image. New knowledge can be added as previous experience is reordered and shaped by expressions of the imagery. Stephanie can be seen as gaining knowledge of herself as a person able to grow plants successfully as a result of the expression of the "classroom as home" image in her school planting practices.

To understand the image as a link between Stephanie's personal and educational life does not give an adequate account of the concept. In addition, the image has an emotional and moral colouring, derived in part from the experiences from which it originates. The moral and emotional components of experience are like magnets which draw together experience into an image. The moral and emotional dimensions of image are now examined, along with their role in linking the individual's personal and professional lives.

8.5.2. The Moral Dimension of Image

In Stephanie's verbal expression of the image, a sense of its moral colouring emerged. The image is not neutral; a classroom *should* be like a home and both classroom and home *should* have certain features. There is, then, in her verbal expression of the image a "should" and a "should not" character. A sense of the possibility of "better" or "worse" action emerges. For Stephanie, the better action allowed her "to live here" (S.W., 2, 65) and allowed her "to treat people as individuals and humans" (S.W., 2, 63).

As the image was expressed in her practices, a sense of its moral dimension emerged as well. For example, the party Stephanie held in her classroom to mark the departure of some of her students in September (I.A.2) has been seen as an expression of the "classroom as home" image. The party was an exceptional gesture, such as one might make to mark the departure of

friends from one's home. In the expression of the image, there was a better and a worse way to handle their departure. Stephanie could have chosen to act differently. We might imagine alternative expressions of the classroom as home image in this instance. But not to mark their departure by an expression appropriate to that of persons leaving her home would not have been the 'right' thing to do.

The moral colouring of the image provides Stephanie with a judgmental standard for her practices. The standard is unique to Stephanie. When practices are discordant, the moral colouring of the image highlights the discordancy. In my work with Stephanie, this was evident when I took action or attempted to take action that conflicted with an expression of her imagery in practice. For example, I suggested that we have the children take home the growing bean plants when I felt the students' experience was complete. Stephanie resisted my suggestion as she felt the plants were continuing to add to the "classroom as home" environment (I.A.2). As the image was expressed in practice, the appropriate environment was an important element of the expression. My interference created a discordant note and Stephanie acted to stop my plan.

The moral colouring of the "classroom as home" image emerges in part from Stephanie's judgment of her school experience as a "packaging experience" (S.W., 2, 13) in which she was hurt. The image takes on the moral shadings of her judgment of the experience as bad, and from this experience she derives a standard of judgment of her own practices. Similarly, her experiences of herself as a child who was marching to a different drummer, failed to fit into the standard mold, and eventually came to see herself as "slow" and not able to "see things properly in a perspective" (S.W., 2, 38) contribute to the moral colourings of the "classroom as home" image. Her judgment of her own experiences contributes to her standard of judgment for her own practices.

In an interpretive account of Stephanie, I characterized her within a governing framework of relationships. This theme illustrates how the moral colouring of Stephanie's "classroom as home" image can be seen to emerge from its origins in experiences in which Stephanie is in relationship with another person and in which she judges herself within the relationship. The

experiences appear to be ones in which the critical moral issue of hurting is involved. My account of Stephanie's experience parallels Gilligan's (1982) account of women's moral development: "It is in their care and concern for others that women have both judged themselves and been judged." (Gilligan, 1982, p.165).

Gilligan highlights the importance for coming to understand women within a framework of relationships. To understand Stephanie's image of "classroom as home", one must look at the aspects of the originating experiences that bear on relationships, and the resulting moral colouring of the image. Stephanie's struggle in her early teaching experiences had been noted earlier. It was a struggle to see herself as a worthwhile person after her earlier experiences in both school and professional training in which she saw herself as hurt. Through what Stephanie termed her "metamorphosis" she came to see herself as a person worthy of care and among those persons whom she considered it "moral" not to hurt.

Her earlier experiences were seen as negative, and while she doesn't judge herself as wrong within her relationships, she now has a standard for judging herself in her relationships with others both in school and outside it. The image of "classroom as home" became a nucleus around which significant elements of her experience, complete with moral colouring, were attracted and shaped. The moral colouring can thus be seen to be derived from significant elements of her home, school, professional training and teaching experiences.

8.5.3. The Emotional Colouring of Image

The image of classroom as home is a deeply held one. As the image emerged in our second interview, Stephanie tried to reject it... "you know but that idea of the home, well it's a home. I mean, it's or a way, my idea of how a home should be, maybe that was a wrong word to use, maybe or a community, I should have just called it..." (S.W., 2, 64). But after briefly exploring the possibility of rejecting it, she returned to affirm the image of "classroom as home", an image deeply rooted in her personal practical knowledge.

The words used to convey her meaning were chosen to convey the emotional dimensions of the image. She talked about "the closeness" (S.W., 2,

62); the relational aspects, "interacting" and "cooperating" (S.W., 2, 64); and "the living" aspects of being with others (S.W., 2, 65). In its verbal expression there seemed little doubt that there was an emotional colouring to the image.

This colouring derives from Stephanie's experiences. As noted above, Dewey (1934, p.42) viewed emotion as "the moving and cementing force" in an experience. Emotion "selects what is congruous and dyes what is selected with its colour, thereby giving qualitative unity to materials externally disparate and dissimilar. It thus provides unity in and through the varied parts of an experience." The experiences in which Stephanie's image of "classroom as home" can be seen to be rooted make real Dewey's view of emotion in experience. Stephanie showed genuine emotion in her verbal expression of the experiences of her home, school, professional training and teaching. She described her school experiences with words loaded with emotion, like "bitter" (S.W., 2, 17), "terrible" (S.W., 2, 17), and "desperately unhappy" (S.W., 2, 38). The "metamorphosis" (S.W., 2, 40) she underwent in her early years of teaching was described as allowing her "to get the confidence" (S.W., 2, 41) to "give of herself" (S.W., 2, 40). The emotion inherent in each experience could be seen, in Dewey's terms, as "the moving and cementing force" colouring the image of "classroom as home":

The image does not draw its emotional colouring from one watershed event or experience, to use Britton's term. Images can, however, originate and gain both moral and emotional colouring from a watershed experience, defined as a turning point or pivotal experience that alters a person's view of experiences. Aileen's image of "the child's face" (I.A.2) could be seen as an image springing from such an experience.

The image of classroom as home, however, originates, in several of Stephanie's experiences. Perhaps, however, if we look at experience as Gendlin (1962) does in his discussion of felt experience as "multiple, non-numerical", it becomes clearer that even in the notion of one watershed experience there are multiple experiences. Gendlin writes,

Any experienced meaning will be differentiable into countless experienced meanings, each of which, because it is a meaning, will again be differentiable into countless meanings. Therefore, there is one experience, or an experience, or a meaning only, if one takes into

account that it must already have been specified, selected, created as an experience. Apart from this specification, it is always multiple. Experiencing is multiple, non-numerical. (Gendlin, 1962, p.152).

8.5.4. Expression of The Image

Yet for an image such as Stephanie's "classroom as home" there remains a difficulty. What was the impetus that caused it to form? The image was formed during her "metamorphosis", her struggle to view herself as a worthwhile person. She came then to see the importance of environment, of relationship with children, and of herself as worthy of care. The image came to be expressed in action, in her practices, both personal and teaching, long before it was given verbal expression. It may have been in the interviews with me that Stephanie first translated the image into words.

Verbal expression is just one form of expression of imagery and, for Stephanie, it may not have been the most comfortable form. Einstein talked about the translation of images into words in the following way: "The words or the language do not seem to play any role in my mechanism of thought. The physical entities which seem to serve as elements in thoughts are certain signs and more or less clear images which can be voluntarily reproduced and combined..." (Einstein in Hadamard, 1945, p.142). Einstein was speaking of a different situation and of images with different content but the translation of images into words seems remarkably like Stephanie's translation of the "classroom as home" image with its disparate elements into words in our interview. Stephanie struggled to give an adequate verbal expression, tried one, rejected it and settled on the classroom being a home. In her choice of metaphor she chose one with a fairly public meaning. We often say a place is homelike or homey when we want to convey a notion of warmth or coziness. For Stephanie, however, the verbal expression is filled with her own private experiences coloured by emotion and moral dimensions. My response to it is filled by my own images of home and of the classroom. But to understand the verbal expression of Stephanie's image in its depth and significance as part of her personal practical knowledge, I must be able to understand its moral and emotional dimensions, for they provide the link between Stephanie's personal private life and her educational life.

8.6. SUMMARY: THE CONCEPT OF IMAGE

The concept of image is frequently used in the social science literature. However, my use of the concept as a component of personal practical knowledge assumes its meaning within this framework. Image is not viewed as a therapeutic tool as, for example, it is used in the psychological literature (Assagioli, 1965; Progoff, 1975), nor as a standard for instructional purposes in the way Howard (1982) develops the notion for music instruction. Rather, image, as described in Chapter 7 and earlier in this chapter, is a kind of knowledge, embodied in a person and connected with the individual's past, present and future.

This section summarizes the moral, emotional, and personal and professional dimensions of the construct of image. The origin of image in the coalescence of diverse experience is discussed, and the expression of images verbally and/or in classroom practices is summarized. Examples from the images of the two teachers are used to illustrate the dimensions.

8.6.1. The Moral Dimension

The teachers' images were morally active in their practical and verbal expression. They suggested actions that were good and bad, better and worse. In Stephanie's image of her "high school math" experience, for example, the moral dimension is evident. Stephanie judged the experience a wrong one for her. This moral dimension provides her with a judgmental standard for her own practices; she does not "want to put any other person into that terrible situation" (S.W., 2, 17). The moral dimension of image is rooted in how the person views herself both within relationships and in the larger social context. The study shows how the math experience, which now functions as a classroom image, is intimately connected with what Stephanie views as proper relations among members of a family and among students and teacher.

8.6.2. The Emotional Dimension

The teachers' images had emotional content in their practical and verbal expression. For example, Stephanie's image of her "high school math experience" had a strong emotional dimension, expressed in her choice of words such as "terrible ones" and "worst class". Similarly, Aileen's image of "myself as an island" isolated from supportive colleagues has an emotional dimension. Her words used to express the image are feeling words such as "totally alone", "a frustration" and "terribly, terribly stifled". The study argues that the emotion in the experiences which gave rise to the image is carried forward in the images constructed out of these experiences. Aileen's feeling of isolation in the image of herself as an island grows out of the experience of developing a play-based kindergarten program that was not supported by other staff members.

8.6.3. The Personal and Professional Dimension

The construct of image was shown to link a teacher's personal and professional experience. For example, Aileen's image of the "classroom as a mini-society of cooperation" has its origin in Aileen's personal experiences of what a society is and in her "basic feeling of dignity for people" (A.O., 2, 12). The image also has origins in her professional experiences of working with children, "and that's a mini-society because the basis for the rules is they understand why it's there to begin with" (A.O., 2, 13). It was expressed in how Aileen organizes her classroom, how she encourages children to relate to each other, and how she relates to them. The image as expressed in her classroom practices contributes to her relationships with the children and ultimately to the quality of their education. In turn, this image contributes to Aileen's relationships in her private life.

8.6.4. The Origin of Image in Experience

The central idea of the research is that teachers' classroom images grow out of their experience, both private and professional. They are a kind of coalescence of experience, with moral, emotional and personal overtones reflecting the quality of the experiences on which they are based. Just as each image is specific to a particular teacher, the experiences on which the image is based and the way it is related to them are also specific to one teacher.

Some experiences have a "watershed" character (cf. section 5.3) and form vivid detailed visual images. Aileen's image of one child's face is illustrative. She now views her experience with this child as a turning point in her teaching, frequently calling his face to mind when confronted with other children's problems. The image has a copy-sense impression. This child's face and Aileen's relationship to the child form the core experience around which the image has developed. Stephanie's image of her high school math is similarly rooted in one watershed experience. In her case, however, while the image is strongly emotional, it contains less visual detail. Her image is more generalized than Aileen's but is still influential in Stephanie's practices.

Other equally powerful images are less directly linked to specific events in the teachers' lives. These images are formed from many diverse experiences over a long period of time. Their formation occurs in processes similar to those described by Dewey in his notion of the "continuity of experience" (1938) and by MacIntyre in his notion of the "narrative unity of life" (1981).

Some of the images linked to experience in this narrative sense assume a metaphorical quality. Aileen's image of "language is the key" is illustrative. For Aileen, language is the central cognitive, substantive and social theme around which her classroom is organized. This is evident in her play-based kindergarten program, justified by her in terms of children's language development; in her graduate study in a combined Early Childhood and Language Education program; and in her tendency to equate children's cognitive development with their language development. Her phrase "language is the key" expresses metaphorically her deep sense of the importance of language in her teaching. Images of this kind take on the quality of Lakoff and Johnson's "metaphors we live by" (1980).

Other images exhibit the same quality as "language is the key" but retain more of the specifics associated with images connected to watershed experiences. Stephanie's image of "the classroom as home" provides a good example. Unlike Aileen, who often asserts that "language is the key", Stephanie only infrequently refers to the classroom as a home. Yet in the organization of classroom activities, in the interpersonal relationships she establishes with students, in the daily opening and closing class routines, and

in her curriculum planning around annual cycles of school events, Stephanie is clearly living out her image of a home. The specificity of this image is seen in the organization of her own home life and in her cultural traditions. Images with this metaphoric quality have a "real analogy" sense, like that described by Black (1962).

8.6.5. The Verbal Expression of Images

Teachers may express images verbally and/or in their classroom practices. Some of the images studied were frequently expressed verbally, for example, Aileen's images of "language is the key" and of "myself as an island". Whenever discussion turned to the purposes of instruction or to her professional role in the school, she used these images to explain herself.

Other images were not expressed verbally, for example, Stephanie's image of herself as "maker". She did, however, readily agree to this interpretation of her practice, which showed how she taught language arts through the making of books, pictures and models. What I have called an image of "making" is part of the image of "classroom as home" which is more deeply embedded in her life. Occasionally, Stephanie referred to the classroom as home, and discussed classroom management with the children in terms of what was proper to the running of a home.

In general, the verbal expression of an image tends to function metaphorically in situations where the teacher is explaining herself to another. These expressions of images represent "personal theories" of oneself. In this sense, images allow teachers to generalize on their experience and to offer theoretical accounts of what they do, much in the way of Hunt's (1976) notion of "teachers as their own best theorists."

8.6.6. Expression of Images in Practice

Teachers are not often called upon to put terms on their actions. Talking about what they do is not a necessary part of their practice. However, an interesting (and unanticipated) benefit of this study was the value teachers placed on the opportunity to read, discuss, and reflect on interpretations of their work.

Since the central focus of the research was to understand practice, all of the images described were built up out of field notes made in classrooms. It was from reflection on practice that this study's concept of classroom image grew. The images are essentially images of practice. In the two instances where my first insight into the images came through words, e.g., Aileen's "language is the key" and "myself as an island" images, I sought confirmation and expression of its meaning in classroom events.

The account of Stephanie's "maker" image, an image expressed only in practice, grew out of repeated observations and was tested at the verbal level in the interpretive accounts to which Stephanie responded. At most, the verbal aspect showed up in practice in Stephanie's directions to students to "show me" rather than "tell me". One of the implications of this method of studying images is that they are not merely mental constructs to be expressed; they are embodied in action. When we see practice, we see embodied images (Johnson, 1983).

8.7. CONCLUSION

There is a dialectic between the two purposes of the study: (a) the practical understanding of the two teachers and (b) the theoretical notions of personal practical knowledge, particularly image, as a language and perspective for inquiry. The theoretical ideas are based on the classroom data and, in turn, enrich our understanding of the teachers.

The conceptualization of image developed in this study contributes to a *theoretical* understanding of the nature of personal knowledge that differs from that usually thought of when we consider the problem of knowledge (Polanyi, 1958). Personal knowledge is emotional and moral, intimately connected with our personal and professional narratives. It is not something which has an independent and objective existence apart from our personal histories. Finally, it is evident from the discussion of the verbal and practical expressions of images that personal knowledge need not be clearly articulated and logically definable in order to exert a powerful influence in teachers' lives.

This research has at least two practical consequences. One is that with the concept of personal practical knowledge as a language and perspective for

viewing school practices, we assume a stance which credits and values teachers' knowledge. A second is the forming of a different notion about the improvement of schools, a notion that builds on the knowledge of teachers by working with them rather than on or against them.

8.8. REFERENCES

- Assagioli, R. *Psychosynthesis*. Middlesex, England: Harmondsworth, 1965.
- Black, M. *Models and metaphors*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1962.
- Connelly, F.M. and Ben-Peretz, M. Teachers' roles in the using and doing of research and curriculum development. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 1980, 12, 95-107.
- Dewey, J. *Experience and education*. New York: Collier Books, 1938.
- Dewey, J. *Art as experience*. New York: Capricorn Books, 1934.
- Dwyer, K. The dialogic of ethnology. *Dialectical Anthropology*, 1979, 4, 205-224.
- Elbaz, F. *Teacher thinking: A study of practical knowledge*. London: Croom Helm, 1983.
- Fullan, M. and Pomfret, A. Research on curriculum and instruction. *Review of Educational Research*, 1977, 47, 2, 335-397.
- Gendlin, E.T. *Experiencing and the creation of meaning*. New York: The Free Press of Lenncoe, 1962.
- Gilligan, C. *In a different voice*. Boston: Harvard University Press, 1982.
- Glaser, B.G. and Strauss, A.L. *The discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1967.
- Hadamard, J. *The psychology of invention in the mathematical field*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1945.
- Howard, V.A. *Artistry: The work of artists*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1982.
- Hunt, D. Teachers are psychologists, too: On the application of psychology to education. *Canadian Psychological Review*, 1976, 17, 3, 210-218.
- Johnson, M. Personal communication, 1983.
- Lakoff, G. and Johnson, M. *Metaphors we live by*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1980.
- Lortie, D.C. *Schoolteacher: A sociological study*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1975.
- MacIntyre, A. *After virtue. A study in moral theory*. London: Gerald Duckworth & Co. Ltd., 1981.

Polanyi, M. *Personal knowledge*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1958.

Progoff, I. *At a journal workshop*. New York: Dialogue House Library, 1975.

Sarason, S.B. *The culture of the school and the problem of change*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1982.

Schon, D.A. *The reflective practitioner*. New York: Basic Books, Inc. Publishers, 1983.

Bracketed material (I.A.2, etc.) refers to coded field note, interview and interpretive account material.

Chapter 9

PERSONAL PHILOSOPHY, RITUAL AND IMAGE:
COPING WITH A COMMUNITY ISSUE

This chapter develops the concepts of "personal philosophy" and "ritual" as parts of personal practical knowledge, through an account of Phil Bingham, principal of Bay Street School.

9.1. THEORETICAL EXPRESSION OF PERSONAL PHILOSOPHY

As noted in Chapter 3, "Methodology", we became involved in Bay Street School on an intensive basis beginning in April, 1981. As we wrote the first draft of this chapter (March, 1982), the school had just survived a crisis which threatened the job of the principal, challenged the tenets of the "developing philosophy" and caused each teacher to whom we talked to question his or her professional life.

Now consider the following scene, on February 19, 1982, two days after a meeting which brought the school crisis to a head and resulted in a reduction of tension. The staff is away from the school in relaxed surroundings at the city's Harbourfront for a full Professional Development Day. The teachers are seated on chairs or on comfortable floor cushions arranged in a semi-circle. Charts depicting the aims and goals of Bay Street as a Language Project school are displayed on room dividers. Phil Bingham, the principal, is standing at the open end of the semi-circle beside an overhead projector and screen as the meeting breaks up and teachers move to get their morning coffee. Phil had just completed one and a half hours of one-way presentation, labelled by a teacher as "jug to mug", summarizing the six points of his personal philosophy and explaining how it relates to his expectations of staff working in his school.

The teachers sat quietly through the session with bodily attitudes characterized by Stephanie's head-nodding confirmation. This sign of

sympathetic response puzzled us, since we knew that most teachers had seen the overhead presentation of the Language Project school aims and everyone had heard Phil's philosophy. Even more puzzling was the fact that Phil had chosen to make this sort of presentation, one which he knew was familiar to the teachers, one which bore only remotely on the crisis through which all those present had just passed, and one which departed widely from the agenda we had discussed a few days earlier. We therefore attempted to elucidate Phil's presentation and the teachers' response to it in order to show how they might reveal personal imagery and its ritualistic expression.

Our first thought was that he was tired. The Professional Development Day came at the end of two weeks of meetings and consultations with school staff, administrative staff and community representatives -- all of which culminated in the crucial meeting of February 17th. This had been a stressful time for Phil and, exhausted, with the crisis behind him and little time to plan something new, perhaps he had simply pulled an existing package from the shelf.

Partially, but only partially, this accounts for his actions. (Phil later told one of us he had been pleased just to get through.) If we rested our account at this point, we would trivialize the meaning of the situation, for we have come to see that his actions are minded. In this particular case, Phil both *reconfirms* his commitment and *invites* a similar reconfirmation from established staff, and extends an offer of participation to new staff. The expression of his philosophy, with its attendant reconfirmation and invitation functions, constitutes a ritual.

Taken by itself, a theoretic statement of philosophy such as Phil's could be seen as mere "pie in the sky" and, if one has heard it often, one could well feel exasperation. Our own reaction to Phil's philosophy when we first heard it last April was one of wonderment. One of us called it a "warm fuzzy". In response to the statement, taken out of context as it was for us on that first occasion, one can do little more than nod in agreement or shake one's head in disagreement. However, if one thinks of the ritualistic expression of the philosophy, occurring in a physically structured environment and accompanied by specific gestures of body and speech, as minded bodily knowledge; and, if one regards the ritual as expressing and reconfirming the personal knowledge of

the speaker as one way a community can participate in a common practice, then the expression of the philosophy in a Professional Development Day takes on new meaning. It points to a kind of practical knowledge obtained and shared in joint action.

Readers may recognize our meaning by reflecting on their own experience of what we call minded bodily knowledge. For example, in a religious ritual, the body movements of rising, kneeling and praying are expressions of religious meaning. Often the body anticipates the actions to be taken. Consider also a teacher's bodily movements, such as head nodding, eye movement and hand gestures as he or she stands in front of the class. These constitute minded bodily knowledge of teaching. In both the religion and teaching examples, the expressions are personal and may exhibit individual features.

If one thinks of the principal's ritual as arising from personal knowledge, we may imagine, depending on its depth, that an account of practice will entail aspects of his private life. The central story in this chapter is to trace Phil's statement of a philosophy through his experience to his personal practical knowledge, particularly his imagery, and to show how this knowledge is expressed in reform at Bay Street School.

9.2. THE PHILOSOPHY AS RITUAL IN A RITUALISTIC CONTEXT

9.2.1. The Philosophy

The theoretical expression of Phil's personal knowledge in the form of a "philosophy" is easily presented because of its brevity and directness. The context in which the philosophy is presented is considered by Phil to be important: the Professional Development Day described above represents Phil's notion of an appropriate setting. Likewise, this philosophy is best presented to our readers in context; we have, accordingly, chosen to present it as it appeared to one of us, reflected in our field notes on the morning of the presentation. The notes are followed by a paragraph designed to give the reader a sense of the significance Phil attaches to the philosophy. Our field notes read as follows:

I arrived at the school about 8:50. I walked in and went down to the office.

I then caught the bus down to Harbourfront. There was considerable joking about the bus going to Florida, a reference to a "spring break" trip for teachers which had, by now, gained a "reputation."

When we arrived at Harbourfront and went up to the Loft, there was just some time to get coffee.

I sat with Ellen for the morning session.

Phil started the session by saying "thank you." He had put up the overhead that said "Bay Street Today For Our Children Tomorrow." With that overhead on the screen, he drew our attention to the automobiles passing on the Gardiner Expressway. They gave the illusion of being on the roof of the building. He said something about bringing children down and getting their impressions of what they thought it looked like.

He then said that he hoped that they would be able to relax today. He made a comment about them belonging together, working together to fulfill the mandates of the Board of Education and the Ministry of Education. He said that the Bay Street staff was "here today for our children tomorrow."

He said that he had gone through what he planned to do that morning with about 300 people at Open House but that the staff had missed it.

He started out by saying that he tried to base most of his planning and thinking on a set of guidelines. He made reference to them being "a set of fundamentals" that he took from E. C. Kelly in his book "In Defence of Youth." He said he found the book at a used book store when he was working with Hill Street (an alternative school) kids in the sixties. He started out with a blank overhead and wrote the following points on it as he discussed them. He said that the following were his fundamentals for survival:

- 1. the importance of other people;*
- 2. communication;*
- 3. in a loving relationship or atmosphere (he said they could translate loving for caring);*
- 4. a workable concept of self;*
- 5. having the freedom to function (which Phil says stands for responsible action and interaction);*

6. *creativity (having the ability and the right). He said this is what we, as teachers, are trying to do with kids.*

(Each point in the philosophy is repeated as each new point is introduced so that by the time the sixth point is raised a long sentence containing the previous five points is stated.)

He said that "these fundamentals are in my mind when I work with you." He said it doesn't always work but that he does get satisfaction from trying to make them work. He then made an apology to those who have already heard it. (He was going to use the same overheads that he had used down in the cafeteria at the Open House).

He said that what he was going to present today is what "I've been working on for the past 3 years at Bay Street School" and that he "felt that things were really moving in that direction."

The philosophy could easily be ignored following a "barebones" reading of the six points. In the context presented here, however, one is inclined to query its meaning more deeply, since it was presented with obvious sincerity, and with a sense of being a personal prescription directing Phil's relationship to the staff. It was also used to orient teachers to a full day of professional development. Still, a first-time hearer of the philosophy who was also an outsider to the school could easily miss its significance. Had we not heard Phil repeatedly refer to "my philosophy" and recount it in detail or in part on numerous occasions since our first interview with him on April 15th, 1981, when we were introduced to the school, we would probably have dismissed it, as noted above, as a "warm fuzzy". But the philosophy is used when Phil is groping to give an account of himself. He used it to introduce himself to us and us to the school; he used it when he introduced himself and the Language Project to the teachers; and he used it again when he did the same thing for the community. The philosophy is not trotted out to fill in time but it is used in situations where a central understanding of the man, and the school whose "ethos" he believes he is structuring, is called for.

9.2.2. The Ritualized Context

The meaning conveyed upon, and by, this ritualized philosophy is a function of its assertion-context, its concrete basis in existing and intended school settings, and its origin in Phil's personal practical knowledge, grounded in his experience.

9.2.2.1 The Assertion-Context. Meaning is conferred on Phil's statement of philosophy by the context in which it is asserted. We view the context as composed of two elements: (a) its significance as an occasion for calling forth a central understanding of the man, and (b) its physical environment. These contextual elements operate intellectually and are no mere window dressing in our effort to grasp the meaning of the philosophy. These two elements are described below.

First, the philosophy is always stated, in our observation, on occasions where Phil is giving an account of *himself*. We have never observed it used as the basis for defending a plan or action, nor in dialogue or debate. Rather, it appears when Phil is before an audience and deems it important that the audience understand him and what he stands for. The occasion may be called forth by the audience, as it was in our April 15th, 1981 interview with Phil and later in his presentation to the community; or it may arise when Phil decides that it is pedagogically important for his audience, as in his presentation at the Professional Development Day and in staff meetings. Both the significance of these settings and the intention to convey an important personal message are easily recognized by members of the audience. The stage is set, therefore, for them to wonder what is "in behind" the statement and, as we have done during our time at Bay Street School, try to fill in the meanings left unstated. The significance of the setting therefore contributes to the personal authority of the speaker.

We may take this sense of authority in its trivial sense and simply trust ourselves to him. This, of course, is the most that can be expected for the first-time hearer, such as a new teacher. The ritual setting serves to bind the novice teacher to the authority of the principal and to make the new teacher a member of the community (since the novice will see that the other teachers recognize the speech as a community ritual). The basis for the authority, of

course, is Phil's personal knowledge, his "philosophy". We describe this in section 3, on Phil's personal practical knowledge.

The second element of the assertion context is the physical environment. Phil is careful to present his ritualized statement of the philosophy in particular surroundings. As we shall see later, that the character of the physical environment is a crucial expression of Phil's personal practical knowledge. He strives to create a certain kind of environment for the school as a whole, for visitations to the school, and for community meetings.

Our first visit to Bay Street School provided little insight into the significance of the environment. There was a kind of shabbiness and dourness about the halls, with a few spots of brightness. (Since then, the dourness has almost completely been transformed.) The first clue to the significance of environment for Phil came in our April 15th, 1981 meeting, in which he said he wanted an occasion to discuss school philosophy with the whole staff in the coming September. We had offered meeting rooms at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education but he had declined in favour of Harbourfront. Our notes are as follows:

Mick said he thought there was more teacher almost all senior school staffs leaving. The junior school stays the same.

We had a discussion about Phil's philosophy. He recited 4 or 5 points, Kelly's philosophy - one had to do with being closer to the earth. Somewhere in this discussion Mick asked if teachers were in early in the fall. Phil said he did not know but would like to have time together. Mick offered O.I.S.E. facilities but Phil said they use pillow rooms at Harbourfront. They want to set up their own pillow room. Phil sketched out how he wanted to have a weekend retreat so people could discuss school philosophy. Grace has a copy of the school philosophy document. We are welcome to see.

Readers have already seen how this plan worked out on February 19th, 1982. The reference to the comfortable, informal Harbourfront setting had been no mere passing remark. Phil did not want a formal, cold, academic setting. The environment mattered.

9.2.2.2 Concrete Grounding of "My Philosophy" in Existing and Intended School Settings. A detailed account of the connection between the physical environment and Phil's philosophy would constitute a paper in itself. We wish

only to point out that the ritualized expression of the philosophy in a particular setting conditions its reception and reflects a school environment compatible with the personal knowledge underlying the expression. Our field notes indicate that Phil would like a pillow room at Bay Street School. Phil was already proud of the pleasant staff room that had been created from uninviting surroundings. In a highly symbolic gesture, when we left his office to be introduced to staff, he took us directly to Cynthia, who was supervising the construction of a large mural. Our notes show that:

Phil gathered together a camera to take pictures. He first of all took us to Cynthia's location where she was supervising a mural that was being prepared by some gifted kids and an artist who appears to be paid by the Board to do this.

This mural was later transferred to a prominent spot in the entrance hall and is now a focal point in the hallways. It is no accident, in our opinion, that this was the first place in the school shown to us by Phil. The construction of the mural and its intended placement on the wall was a clear-cut physical expression of his personal philosophy, and showing it to us was a direct way for him to express this philosophy.

This expression continued during our tour, which ended in our being deposited in our "homes", the library and a classroom. Our notes read as follows:

We spent some time with Cynthia and the artist. Then Phil walked Mick and Cynthia to the library and me to Stephanie's room.

Phil made comments as we walked. He pointed out the new lights in the senior school hallways. There had been only a single row of lights before. He said they had had the senior school hallways and lockers painted. The lockers are always a mess. He pointed out there was no work displayed in the senior school and no use was made of the hallways for students. There was a student working on a hallway bench and Phil said he has insisted that work be sent with students when they are sent out of the classroom. We stopped at the glass doors in the hallway and he said they have had a vandalism problem with the glass doors. We went through the doors and into the junior school. Phil said he was very pleased with the work displayed in the junior school. There was, according to Phil, a totally different atmosphere here.

Phil took me to Stephanie's room. Introduced me - took two pictures - said "you look like you're set" and vanished.

Every inch of Stephanie's room is full.

Our final observation on the importance of physical environment in Phil's philosophy is to draw the reader's attention to the last line in the field note. Cynthia and Stephanie are both "makers". They are people who fill their space with colourful displays of children's work. Although we did not know it at the time, our seeing Stephanie's room as "full" was a view of a minded product, striking in its expression of Phil's personal knowledge. The account which links this observation to Stephanie's personal practical knowledge has been written by Clandinin (1983), and is summarized in Chapter 8 of this report.

9.3. PHIL'S PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE

When Phil refers to "my philosophy" and on other occasions, presents it as a six-point sentence, the two are not synonymous. The six points constitute a theoretical expression of practical meaning. Personal theoretical statements, however, are torn from the reality to which they refer and only partially and selectively account for it. Polanyi (1958), in writing about the articulation of personal meaning, draws attention to the ultimate ineffability of personal knowledge. Polanyi gives examples, drawn from his earlier medical career, to show that a novice diagnostician will, even with comprehensive physiological knowledge combined with diagnostic rules, be unable to make sense of a set of symptoms. With repeated tutelage he gains the necessary diagnostic expertise, but he still cannot account for it in a scientific way that would permit him to convey the skill to other novices. Polanyi introduces the notion of "subsidiary awareness" to account for the submersion of telling instance and detail below the level of consciousness in the interests of focussing attention on diagnosis. If, in fact, one were to pay attention to information in subsidiary awareness, focal attention would be lost, a feature frequently noticed in doctoral students in their efforts to define a problem. Phil's ritualized expression of his philosophy is a sign pointing to a rich store of personal knowledge, most of which is unavailable to Phil for purposes of verbal expression. It is what he refers to as "my philosophy" and, in its complete professional expression, the school "ethos".

We would not go so far as Polanyi and label this subsidiary awareness as wholly inaccessible. We propose to speak of it in terms of images, rules, principles and metaphors, specifically, in this chapter in terms of the "Lundbreck Street School" image. (Phil had served formerly as principal of this school.) On the other hand, it is obviously impossible for the holder of the image to recall the full range of experience from which it developed. Researchers such as ourselves could not be expected to grasp it wholly either.

To understand the ritualized expression of the philosophy and its intended meaning, we focus on the personal imagery underlying the expression. This focus yields three points of interest. The first is that the meaning of the ritual originates in the speaker's personal practical knowledge. Second, the speaker himself cannot be expected to render a complete theoretical accounting of his personal practical knowledge. (There may be wisdom, however, in reducing personal knowledge to statements of theoretical practical knowledge, such as Phil's "six points", that may be ritualized, thereby serving the inviting and reconfirmation functions described earlier.) Third, the researcher, through tracing elements in the speaker's experience, can arrive at a partial understanding of the latter's personal practical knowledge.

9.3.1. Experience to Image

9.3.1.1 Epistemological Order vs. Methodological Order. Both the ritualized theoretical expression of Phil's philosophy and its expression as "my philosophy" are grounded in experience. The order in which we present our account of these two forms of expression, however, may leave the reader with a false impression of the relationship among the elements we wish to portray. Our method is to reconstruct personal practical knowledge through the links between its expression and accounts of experience. We move from expressions of personal practical knowledge to its embodiment in experience when, for someone like Phil, experience suffuses and creates both. We have begun with theoretical practical knowledge and various minded expressions in the school, represented by the Professional Development Day and our tour through the school, and we make a transition to personal practical knowledge. This is not the epistemological order which we wish to reconstruct; it is merely our methodological order.

9.3.1.2 Phil's Reference to Experience. Phil had been under fire ever since we entered the school. The crisis meeting of February 17, 1981, had a precursor several months earlier. In a conversation with Phil on June 4, 1981, following events which had led to a community meeting with obvious threats to Phil's job and to the direction in which the school was going, Phil pointed out that he had been through it before. We frequently wondered how he coped with the intense pressure. Our notes provide the answer in his terms; he had experienced it before at Lundbreck Street School and he had been successful. According to our notes:

He said that he was very tired but that he had managed to sleep before the meeting. He indicated that both Robert and Elizabeth (the vice-principals) had been very upset. They hadn't slept the night before and they were both "distraught". Phil said that he has been through situations before like this and his feeling is that he doesn't mind if he fails, he wants to have the problem solved and if he is not the best one to solve it then he should go somewhere else where he will be able to solve a problem. (Or he may have said where he will be able to do something). He made some comment about his philosophy at that time and that he could be philosophical about all of this. He also said that he is only three years away from retirement but said that if they tried to make him quit, (or fire him I think he said), then he would fight.

It is interesting to note that Phil described his own handling of the situation, and his interpretation of the contrast between himself and his vice-principals, as a function of his experience. There is a sense that doing it once makes it easier to do it the second time, the kind of thing that we commonly refer to when we say "I have been through it before". But there is more to it than that. He sees himself as being "philosophical" about it. Again, we might imagine that this is a kind of "what-will-be-will-be" resignation, but the fact that "being philosophical" was connected in conversation to Phil's philosophy and experience makes it a way of living out his philosophy; it is not simply an attitude of resignation.

The experience that he refers to was a similar crisis situation at Lundbreck Street School. We shall argue that "being philosophical" in the crisis constitutes a living out, with personal authority, of his personal practical knowledge, i.e., the imagery created as a result of the Lundbreck Street School experience. This knowledge confers the authority that allows Phil to cope with confidence in the current school situation. It is also the basis for his expressed authority with his staff when the philosophy is ritualistically expressed.

9.3.1.3 The Lundbreck Street School Image. It would be presumptuous of us to think that the personal practical knowledge of a man three years from retirement could be summarized in an account of his experience in one school. It cannot. We do think, however, that at least for Phil, and perhaps in general, personal practical knowledge grows and takes shape in a more or less coherent fashion. It is no mere collection of all of one's experiences. In this we concur with the moral philosopher MacIntyre (1981), who speaks of the narrative unity of a person's life. Hence, we believe that a more thorough accounting of Phil's personal practical knowledge would still show that the Lundbreck Street School experience was a kind of nucleus for significant elements in his experience. In this sense, the Lundbreck Street School image reaches deep into the past.

9.3.1.4 Components of the Image. Phil was formerly principal at Lundbreck Street School. Bay Street and Lundbreck Street are analogous in Phil's mind. This is reflected in our field notes in the statement, "Phil described that it was much the same thing here". This expression of the image is, then, one of analogy. The analogy is "real" in that key components are the same. Readers will be able to spot some of these in the field notes scattered throughout this section. The following list, in no particular order, is the set identified by us.

1. **Community Confrontation:** This item constitutes two points, the existence of community and the aspect of confrontation. In both schools there have been crisis meetings with the community. In both, the community is viewed as divided into those for and those against the school.
2. **Elected Officials:** In both schools an alderman or trustee played a key role in the community confrontation.
3. **Parents:** In both schools parents are the key agents in the community and parent-school relations are dynamic and encouraged to be so.
4. **The Press:** In both schools the press is viewed as used in the confrontation.
5. **Central Administration:** In both schools the central administration, local superintendents and area superintendents, play a role.

6. Program: In Lundbreck Street School an open plan replaces a traditional plan and in Bay Street School something similar occurs through the language project.
7. Students: In both schools, Phil's public arguments on behalf of the school's programs are presented in terms of the children. Policies, such as the language project, are justified in a similar way.
8. Phil as Reformer: Phil views both schools as having problems which he can solve.
9. Teachers: In both schools, teachers are autonomous within the framework of Phil's philosophy.
10. Vice-Principals: In both schools, vice-principals are seen as being in training under Phil's guidance, i.e. "The Bingham experience."

An account of each of these structural items, if properly developed, would constitute an entire paper. For instance, the notion of community and its links to concepts of race and to the implementation of the Race Relations Policy is rich in detail. Exploration of this notion would reveal insights not only into holding an image of community but also into how it is expressed in school affairs. Tracing this line of thought would reveal how the policy on race relations blends into Phil's personal practical knowledge crystallized in the Lundbreck Street School image and how its expression in school affairs is shaped by his personal practical knowledge. Likewise, there is a fascinating story to tell on the pedagogical function performed by the imagery in the education of vice-principals, the teaching staff and, indeed, participating researchers. Our listing of the analogous components of the image greatly simplifies the meaning that we might ultimately assign to it. The list does, however, offer *prima facie* evidence that the image is a potentially powerful element influencing Bay Street School practices.

9.3.1.5 Forms of the Image. It is our position that the form taken by the Lundbreck Street image in our interpretation results from the situations in which we see it expressed in Bay Street School. This construction of the form is, furthermore, a function of the specific aspects of Bay Street School selected by us as evidential. In this chapter, we have drawn attention to issues of crisis and reform in the school, and hence we view the Lundbreck Street School image as one of school reform within a context of crisis. Indeed, the crisis was uppermost in our mind as we drafted this chapter in early spring, 1982, because

the events were recent. But we might have focussed on the philosophy and belief system, in which case the form would be more inward-looking and constitute what we might call "commitment to self." We have, in fact, begun to outline our thoughts on the notion of personal practical knowledge as universal, arguing that, counter to many writings on the theory of the practical, personal knowledge subsumes situational knowledge. It has a universal dimension for the person holding the knowledge, and so the person's commitment is to the personal practical knowledge and not to the situation. Such a focus plays down the emphasis on reform found in this chapter.

Likewise, we might have focussed on the pedagogical relations between the principal and his staff and on the concept of "discussion" in practice referred to earlier. We would, accordingly, have given an account of the role of personal practical knowledge in pedagogical and in practical reasoning terms. Readers may imagine other possibilities. Our purpose in drawing attention to the influence of our focus on the form of the imagery is to ensure that readers understand the epistemological status we assign to the claims made about personal practical knowledge. They must be understood in terms of our dialectical relationship with the events in question. We now turn to a sketch of the image.

9.3.1.6 An Image of Reform in a Situation of Crisis.

Program Change. Program change is central to the reform orientation of the Lundbreck Street School image. In a June 4th, 1981 field note, we wrote:

He said he was involved at Lundbreck Street School where they tore down a traditional old school and in its place put up an open plan school.

The event to which Phil refers took place when there was much discussion in Ontario about open plan schooling. Thus, his terms undoubtedly reflect popular educational terminology. But it is significant that in recollecting this event, Phil viewed it in terms of extremes, from traditional to open plan. In his mind, what happened at Lundbreck Street School was not a modest reform but the "tearing down" of one system and its replacement it with another.

The terms chosen to describe that reform are ones that fit comfortably with Phil's view of himself as a person. He would, we think, be aghast if labelled a "traditionalist", professionally or personally. He is known, as one teacher said, as "a fighter"--against the traditional and for what he believes is forward-looking. His dress and manner are casual. He wears a soft, maroon velour sweater on occasions when warmth and intimacy are called for, such as meetings with parents and children, and Professional Development Days like the one at Harbourfront. He wears sports jackets and a tie on more "formal" occasions.

Phil has two homes, but talks more about his Toronto Island home. The Island, a short distance from the mainland, is the home of a small number of residents who commute to the city by ferry. The Island has a strong sense of community and, like Lundbreck Street School, is under attack by politicians and citizens' groups who want the homes removed to free the space for recreational parkland. Phil's image of a change to "open plan" is laden, we believe, with meaning derived from private life. The structural and situational similarities between his public and private life convey emotional and substantive meaning upon the Lundbreck Street image of program reform.

Program and Children's Experience. Program, for Phil, comes down to children's experience. As the following field note reveals, Phil's concept of "promotions meetings" and matching students with teachers is an expression of his philosophy. He sees the concept as having been established in Lundbreck Street School.

I then asked if I would be able to sit in on a promotions meeting. Phil sees his promotion meetings as a continuation of his philosophy. He wants to match students with teachers and takes a concern with the individual student and his placement. He likes to see that these placements are flexible and that they could go on all year. He mentioned, for example, that if a placement seemed wrong on October 6th then that's when the transfer to another class should be made. He had worked out many of these promotion ideas at Lundbreck Street School. Phil saw the way it had been done that is, by putting all the As, Bs, Cs and Ds into different groups as being contrary to his philosophy.

The emphasis on children as the focus of program is tied to another significant experience, that of the Hill Street School (an alternative school) referred to in an earlier field note. The connection between Hill Street and

Lundbreck Street, and the connection to the matching of teacher and student, are evident in the following field note:

Mick asked if Phil had been involved in the alternative schools. As it turned out, about the time that Phil was involved with Lundbreck School, he had started Hill Street. He said at that point he had been working with a Frank Burns as one of his teachers and they had set up something close to what Hunt calls his matching models. Frank had taken the course with Hunt and recognized what Phil was trying to do as being in that mode. Anyway he gave up being principal of Hill Street School to go on with what he was doing at Lundbreck Street.

Although we have not explored the links between Lundbreck Street School and Hill Street, they are apparently close since one school was given up in favour of the other. No doubt, Hill Street plays a major role in Phil's personal practical knowledge since this school was one of the earliest, and probably the best known, alternative school in Ontario. Our expectation is that Hill Street would constitute either another specific image in Phil's personal practical knowledge or a vital part of the Lundbreck Street School image.

It is, perhaps, not surprising that Phil thinks of his view of children as the focus of attention in community crises. When the school's program is explained to visitors, and especially parents, the explanation is usually in terms of children. Reform plays a key role, since community resistance is viewed as a misunderstanding of the school's intentions for the children. This view of children as the focal point of community crisis is evident in the following field note; the reference is to "being in trouble" in Lundbreck Street School.

He made some comment about "being in trouble" and talked about being seen "playing marbles on the carpet." The community apparently saw him as "playing alleys" with the kids. An aspiring alderman or trustee got involved with the parents and, without Phil's knowledge, organized the parents into a huge parent meeting. Phil said that most of the people in that group were from (province X). He had received a phone call from The Telegram asking when the meeting was to be held and that was what had tipped him off. Apparently the superintendent and area superintendent attended the meeting.

The Lundbreck Street School image is particularly powerful as an image of reform in Bay Street School, since the situation had the emotional tension of a crisis as well as a positive resolution through Phil's maintenance of a

commitment to his beliefs. There is no sense in our discussions so far that he modified his purposes or outlook on children as a result of the community difficulties at Lundbreck Street School; and we have remarked on several occasions that he has not modified his views in the face of strong pressure from an important part of the community of Bay Street School -- the Chinese community. The significance of this point is underlined by the fact that one of the key community demands on Bay Street is for more rigorous discipline of the children. Phil's response to this, and to a teacher committee concerned with hall supervision, is, in effect, not to budge. He maintains an unmoving commitment to children. The story is an eventful one, filled with community petitions, a special study conducted by the superintendent's office, community meetings, school cabinet and staff meetings, and deliberations of the hall duty committee.

The Community Conceived as Two Groups. Phil's image of success at Lundbreck Street School contains, as well, the idea of the community as divided into groups favouring and opposing the school's program. According to the imagery, the supportive group of parents helps convince the critics that the school's program is in aid of their children. The relationship between the two groups is seen in the following field note.

It was about this time that Robert came into our meeting and Phil just went on with the story. There was, I guess, a small group of people who Phil called _____ . The other parents in the community eventually talked down both the trustee and the parents who were complaining. That meeting had ended up with everyone talking to everyone and eventually understanding what the program at Lundbreck School was about. Phil described that it was much the same thing here. He said that "perception is one thing, people want to change back to what they are safe with." He described this as the inner city dilemma; everyone has to be able to live with it, including the school. He, at that point, said something about "the damn fine job they were doing."

The expression of the "two-community" element of the image is a powerful one at Bay Street School. At a particular school cabinet meeting, for example, the members were considering ways to present the school to the trustees and parents. Part of the discussion revolved around ways of "getting out" school supporters on the night of the crisis meeting. Phil, while encouraging this, did so in a lukewarm and cautionary way. Following the

meeting, he confided that he did not want to pit one part of the community against another, thereby rupturing relations within it. This point is of some significance for Phil since it was confirmed in conversation with Robert, the vice-principal, the next day.

Properly told, that story would reveal, we believe, that personal commitment overrides strategy in Phil's personal practical knowledge. He is not prepared to go to any lengths to get his views across, but gains confidence from his personal practical knowledge. This is an aspect of the "personal commitment" form of the image noted in section 9.3.1.5.

9.3.1.7 Solutions to Crises in the Pursuit of Reform. By way of summary, we may note that Phil's sense of direction and his confidence in the face of conflict at Bay Street School reflect the combination of two key features: his personal practical knowledge of children and of the community, and his Lundbreck Street School image of success. Community critics are won over through seeing expressions of Phil's personal practical knowledge in the work of the school, and they are won over, in part, by a supportive group of parents. In this way major program reform involves students, staff and members of the community. The education of children becomes, for parents, an education in how to view their children and in the conduct of school-community relations.

9.3.1.8 Personal Depth of the Image. Jennings (1982) used the notion of "depth" to point to the significance one may attach to religious ritual. This notion is valuable in our account of personal practical knowledge since the imagery we describe, as derived from our accounts of professional life, is, we believe, intimately connected at its core to Phil's private life. We have not even begun to explore this connection directly, and will only hint at it here. Clandinin (1983) has written such an account of Stephanie, the grade 1 teacher with whom she worked. Part of this account is presented in Chapter 8 of this report.

The reader will recall our account of Phil's home on Toronto Island. We believe his image of himself as a person and his views of his relations with others, with theory, and with the community are all a part of his personal practical knowledge. The living out of the Lundbreck Street School image in Bay Street School is, in deep respects, a living out of his personal life. The

image has a peculiar professional structure because it is a school image and because its components, as we listed them, are school components. But we think their shape and the meaning they carry, expressed in Bay Street School, are derived from private life. Likewise, we imagine that in its private expressions Phil's personal practical knowledge is given meaning by his professional life. To make an obvious point, if Phil retires in three years he is Phil Bingham with a lifetime of experience, of which Bay Street School and Lundbreck Street School are important, recent parts. Common sense alone would lead us to conclude that his retirement life would reflect, in some important and deep way, his professional life. The two are interwoven in personal practical knowledge.

9.4. EXPRESSIONS OF PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE

This chapter began with the assumption that its proper conclusion would be an account of the expressions of Phil's personal practical knowledge (the Lundbreck Street School image) in the life of Bay Street School. On the way, we have given numerous instances and illustrations of this expression, along with an account of its expression in the school's physical environment. However, we have not set these expressions forth in a way that would properly complete the account. The meaning one assigns to personal practical knowledge is conveyed in part by an account of its expression. Although we have shown how personal practical knowledge is expressed in practice, we have not described its reflection in enough detail to help the reader better understand the imagery. The following paragraph outlines such an account.

We would return to the ritualistic theoretical expression of the philosophy and give an account of its reconfirmation and invitation functions. We would give accounts of other semi-ritualized situations, such as school cabinet meetings, opening exercises, and crises, and of the expression of the philosophy in the making of things. The next step would be an account of the adaptations and modifications of personal practical knowledge as realized in different actions and products. Finally, we would draw attention to the dynamics of the interaction of Phil's personal practical knowledge with others, and to the consequences of our account of personal practical knowledge to the understanding of the introduction to the school of new, theoretical knowledge in the form of board policy.

9.5. USING BAY STREET SCHOOL TO CONCEPTUALIZE PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE

This chapter has focussed on the development of constructs to account for Bay Street School practices and practitioners. A more general purpose has been to develop a language for understanding the origin, character and uses of personal practical knowledge. In particular, the chapter revolves around the principal's "personal philosophy", accounted for in terms of "rituals" and "makings" found throughout the school. The principal's personal philosophy was supported by communication in interview and other school settings, and provided a rich opportunity to explore the notion of image as a personal knowledge construct operating in the life of the principal.

This inquiry into Phil's imagery touched on central experiences in his work with the staff and students as a school community, in his work with community groups, in his private life in the Island community, and in Hill Street School. We began to outline Phil's image of community and, in Chapter 10, will develop the notion of image as based on the narrative unity of his personal and professional life. Following Clandinin's work with Stephanie (Clandinin, 1983), we shall focus more directly on the emotive and moral features of image and consider how morality and emotion pervade school practices.

9.6. REFERENCES

- Clandinin, D.J. *A Conceptualization of image as a component of teacher personal practical knowledge*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Toronto, 1983.
- Connelly, M. *Research at the firing line, carping, conceptualization, and an action proposal*. Paper presented at the meeting of the Canadian Society for Studies in Education, Montreal, June, 1980.
- Elbaz, F. *Teacher thinking: A Study of practical knowledge*. London: Croom Helm, and New York: Nichols Publishing Company, 1983.
- Hunt, D.E. How to be your own best theorist. *Theory into Practice*. 1980, 19, 287-293.
- Jennings, T.W. On ritual knowledge. *Journal of Religion*, 1982, 62, 2, 111-127.
- McKeon, R. Philosophy and action. *Ethics*, 62, 2, 79-100.
- MacIntyre, A. *After Virtue*. South Bend, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 1981.
- Polanyi, M. *Personal knowledge: Towards a post-critical philosophy*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1958.
- Schwab, J. The practical 4: Something for curriculum professors to do. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 1983, 13, 3 (in press).
- Young, R.E. The epistemic discourse of teachers: An ethnographic study. *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 1981, 2, 122-144.

Chapter 10

IMAGE AND NARRATIVE UNITY: CONCEPTS OF COMMUNITY AND SCHOOL-COMMUNITY RELATIONS

This chapter develops the concept of narrative unity as part of personal practical knowledge, and relates it to the concept of image developed earlier. The practices of Phil Bingham, Bay Street School's principal, are explained in light of his image of community, and the origins of the imagery are traced through the narrative unity of his life. Both image and narrative unity are viewed as terms for coming to grips with experience.

10.1. THE COMMUNITY FESTIVAL VS THE FRIENDS OF BAY STREET BALL

The stage is set in this chapter by an evening staff meeting on February 22, 1983. As you read our field notes, bear in mind Phil's commitment to staff initiative. This is a man who has told his staff that he wanted them "to create new things that would fit the goals and plans...a place for individualism and responsibility" (Notes to file, February 22, 1983). Phil repeats such messages not only in staff and cabinet meetings but with individuals as well. In addition, he displays staff and student initiative by reporting on them positively in meetings, by showing visitors the results of creative activities, and by posting staff work in the school halls.

But watch what happens at the staff meeting to the plans of three teachers for a Friends of Bay Street Ball. The tension at work in this setting and, theoretically, in our notion of Phil's personal practical knowledge as expressed in his practices, is the starting point for developing our notion of narrative unity as the life history context for Phil's image of community.

We begin our account by reproducing selected field notes taken at the

meeting at which the ideas of the Community Festival and of the Friends of Bay Street Ball were first presented:

Dorothy then said that she wanted to say something about Bay Street's first annual Friendship Ball. Phil, I think, had introduced her by saying Dorothy wanted to take a couple of minutes to say something about this. Dorothy responded by saying, "Why am I always timed?" She said that they needed dollars for computers. She said something about a ball. There was lots of joking and going on about it being a dance. She said they planned to hold it in Silver Springs Court, the nearby community center, and that they would get interested people together and plan it. She said they planned to have it at the end of May, or close to June, and they would sell tickets. She said the people who had agreed to help organize it were Charles, Susan, and herself. She said that's all we have and she wondered if anyone else was interested (Notes to file, February 22, 1983).

Our reaction as researchers was that Phil would like this proposal. He was always anxious to earn money for the school, to encourage the staff to work together, and, most important, to involve the community. But instead of offering enthusiastic support, he raised questions.

He asked how much money they were hoping to raise and Dorothy replied, "oodles". Phil asked, "How much is an 'oodle'?"

Susan tried to initiate some enthusiasm for the idea.

Susan said that she thought they would be having the friends of Bay Street School and that's what they would call their ball. She said that they wanted to have a profit margin and they hadn't worked it out yet but they would be charging \$15.00 per head, with food.

Phil continued to raise doubts and finally ended discussion by unexpectedly mentioning a festival and by saying he would talk to them later.

Phil said he thought it was feasible and he wanted to talk to them about May and June. He said it was not about the dollars but the ways of doing it. He said he liked the 'Friendship' idea but he was concerned about the festival. He suggested that maybe they tie the Ball to Sesqui (a city celebration) and that he would like to talk to them about it.

The meeting went on to other items and the topic of the Friends of Bay Street Ball did not arise again. The Festival Phil referred to, however, took place on Saturday, June 4, 1983. It was a day-long event on the school grounds. It involved the police, the press, community groups and agencies, and people from

all parts of the community. There were games, a rummage sale, a bazaar, food, dancing and a stage show. The Festival began in early afternoon and lasted into the evening with the dance. Most of the school staff, including the three proponents of the Friends of Bay Street Ball, were active participants.

The tension created by the teachers' proposal to hold a Ball, and its eventual replacement by a community Festival, although resolved without apparent conflict, was nonetheless real. On the face of it, the Festival and Ball might not appear greatly different. Both involve the school; both involve the community; and both are fund-raising events. Phil, however, is clearly supporting one and not the other. What reasons can be given for this?

When we look at Phil's action in terms of his personal knowledge and its expression in practice, we and our readers are surprised. In his response to the friends of Bay Street Ball, he is not encouraging staff initiative; he is resisting an idea that would bring the community (and funds) into the school, and he does not allow for shared decision-making. With our theoretical understanding of Phil's personal practical knowledge--his images and their school expressions--we are confronted with what appears to be a contradiction.

One interpretation of our theoretical situation is that we are confronted with events which Marxists and critical theorists look for, and call, "contradiction". They would say that Phil's actions typify the actions of those in power who, while they espouse democratic decision-making, in practice use the powers of their office to obtain their own ends. As MacIntyre says in writing of Marx, "He wishes to present the narrative of human social life in a way that will be compatible with the view of that life as law-governed and predictable in a particular way" (MacIntyre, 1981, p. 200).

But, for us, this contradiction is a sign that we must dig for deeper meaning in Phil's action. George Spindler, an ethnographer, notes that when you are surprised at an action or practice, you have pierced another layer of meaning. In a similar way, we search for deeper meaning when confronted with a practice that seems contradictory. Unlike some social theorists, we believe that human action is not best understood as law-governed and that it is difficult, if not impossible in most situations, to predict actions based on a knowledge of the social structure and participants' roles in it. While we draw a

distinction between individuals and the roles they play, we do not separate one from the other, giving preeminence to role. What is preeminent is the continuity embodied in a person.

Nor can our work be interpreted as the analysis of human action in terms of simple components. The sociological tradition of analyzing discourse and other forms of action into smaller units of meaning for the person is not our method. All analyses, in our view, take place in the context of the unity of a person's life. Precisely because we are concerned with personal knowledge as defined, we believe there is a much more dynamic and "person-bound" interaction of individual and society than is reflected in traditional sociological inquiry. Every person is composed of what might be called "uneasy cohesions" of various parts of his or her own past and present. From the interaction of these parts emerges a kind of continuity for which we use the term "narrative unity".

At the staff meeting, then, we anticipated a favourable reaction from Phil to the suggestion for the Friends of Bay Street Ball. When he did not react as expected, we tried to understand his response in terms of the Lundbreck School image and its expression in school rituals and the school environment, and came up with an apparent contradiction. When we dug deeper in a search for the narrative unity which would give meaning to the events of the staff meeting, we found ourselves trying to make sense of Phil's image of community. This, in fact, is where we left Chapter 9. Our inquiry into his imagery provided us with insights into deeper historical strands in his life. The following section further describes the staff meeting and gives an account of the image of community at work. It also tries to show how what occurred reveals an underlying narrative unity which gives meaning to Phil's apparently contradictory actions at the meeting.

10.2. THE FESTIVAL AS AN EXPRESSION OF AN IMAGE OF COMMUNITY

Clues to the deeper image of community which subsumes the Lundbreck School image are found later in the same staff meeting. The Festival, it turns out, grew out of Phil's participation in a local community advisory committee,

the Pincher Creek Park Advisory Committee. We had, in fact, known about this committee for two years since our arrival in the school. Pincher Creek Park, a high-rise housing development close to Bay Street School, supplies about one-third of Bay Street's pupils. The Committee, however, extends beyond the housing development and is composed of members from community agencies throughout the Bay Street area, representatives from community groups not resident in the Park, the business community and even the police. When called on by a staff member to say more about the Festival, our notes show that Phil made reference to the Park and the Advisory Committee.

He said they (The Advisory Committee) have been very concerned about the 'bad' press they have had and wondered why they can't see the good side. Phil said that on 'your behalf, meaning on behalf of the school', he sits on the Pincher Creek Park Advisory Committee. He said the people there wanted to know how they could change their image. They said something about the police only coming in on a crisis. They have decided they wanted to have a festival in the Spring that would have both the police and the press involved and they would have a street dance here. The band would be the "Copper Tones", the police band. (Notes to file, February 22, 1983).

Our notes go on to indicate that Phil even has in mind involving Silver Springs Court, the proposed site of the Friends of Bay Street Ball. Phil tells the staff that "Don Smith of Silver Springs Court is drawing in their resources".

Our interpretation of these events undergoes a subtle but important transition as we read the section of the field notes in which Phil distinguishes between Bay Street School doing something in the community and Bay Street being part of and contributing to the community.

He said that Bay Street School is part of this community too. He then said it would be good to have a multicultural festival in the school yard and have Portuguese dancers and it would be a fund raising event as well. He said something about the multicultural restaurant and they would have ideas too. He then said, "I did this once before at Okotoks School and we made \$1,900." He said Dorothy had been involved in that and it had been amazing and it had been a multicultural festival and for that they didn't have a street dance. With a street dance the bar could make, say, \$2,000. (Notes to file, February 22, 1983).

This transition, upon reflection, has striking consequences for subsequent school actions and convincingly establishes a new and deeper context for coming to understand Phil's personal practical knowledge. The

activity that takes place on June 4th differs in several ways from that originally suggested. It takes place in a different location (the school grounds rather than Silver Springs Court); the participants are community members including the school staff rather than school staff only; and the roles each group plays and the purposes served are different. The primary role of the school staff has shifted from contributing to the school to contributing to the community, even though they still obtain the same modest proximate end--a kitty of funds for school use. But the essential purpose of the activity is given meaning within the context of problems identified by the Pincher Creek Park Advisory Committee, i.e., "bad press", the "good things happening", and the "image" they wish to create of their community.

On one level one might say that Phil is simply being a good administrator in pointing out that his plan will yield money for the school, perhaps \$1900. One might even say that he is acting as a "power-broker" by using his office to get his way. But this view would trivialize the events. The clue to their meaning can be found in Phil's earlier experience at Okotoks School, an inner-city school where he was heavily involved in community activities. Phil is building on prior experience and living out the unity in his life dominated by an image of community.

Before pursuing the narrative unity out of which the image of community develops, we wish to point out that while the ideas (community and individual) are simple, the perspective on the events and their relationship is subtle and powerful. It is not merely that the Ball and Festival are competing actions, with one winning out; these actions are expressions of fundamentally different imagery based on fundamentally different narrative unities. For the teachers proposing the Ball, the image of school and service to it ranks supreme in their purposes and motivation. For Phil, an image of service to the community and of the school as serving community purposes ranks supreme. We do not propose to enter into moral considerations of what education and the role of the teacher ought to be in our society. Our intent is, rather, to understand the minded practices of our participants in terms of their personal practical knowledge.

With these events fresh in our minds, we shall now "flash back" to the

narrative of Phil's life, the context for the origins and development of his community imagery.

10.3. NARRATIVE UNITY

To understand the narrative unity of an individual's life we shall first examine the concept of narrative unity as developed by MacIntyre (1981). We then turn to an account of our work on personal practical knowledge, as it both enriches the concept of narrative unity and forms the basis of our exploration of Phil's image of community.

MacIntyre (1981) develops "a concept of selfhood, a concept of self whose unity resides in the unity of a narrative which links birth to life to death as narrative beginning to middle to end" (p. 191). For MacIntyre, the concept of self has two requirements.

On the one hand, I am what I may justifiably be taken by others to be in the course of living out a story that runs from my birth to my own death; I am the subject of a history that is my own and no one else's, that has its own peculiar meaning...The other aspect of narrative selfhood is correlative: I am not only accountable, I am one who can always ask others for an account, who can put others to the question. I am part of their story, as they are part of mine. The narrative of any one life is part of an interlocking narrative (MacIntyre, 1981, 202-203).

In his account of the requirements of narrative selfhood, MacIntyre puts forward the notion of interlocking narratives. One's life is, according to MacIntyre, always in relation to, or embedded in, other narratives; no narrative unfolds apart from others. But these narratives, each unfolding in relation to others, have a history. MacIntyre treats the historical aspect of narrative unity in the following way. In linking the narrative unity of the individual's life to his past, MacIntyre introduces the concept of communities in which the individual is embedded.

For the story of my life is always embedded in the story of those communities from which I derive my identity. I am born with a past: and to try to cut myself off from that past, in the individualist mode, is to deform my present relationships (MacIntyre, 1981, p. 205).

MacIntyre clarifies this idea as follows:

the narrative phenomenon of embedding is crucial: the history of a

practice in our time is generally and characteristically embedded in and made intelligible in terms of the larger and longer history of the tradition through which the practice in its present form was conveyed to us; the history of each of our own lives is generally and characteristically embedded in and made intelligible in terms of the larger and longer histories of a number of traditions (MacIntyre, 1981, p. 207).

MacIntyre's account of narrative unity introduces several dimensions that are useful in helping us think about our work on personal practical knowledge. This concept facilitates our understanding of the unity which we perceive in an individual's life. What we mean by "unity" in this phrase is simply the union in a particular person, in a particular time and place, of all that he has been and undergone in his own past and in the past of the tradition which helped to shape him. Narrative unity displays neither logical consistency nor factual homogeneity. On the contrary, the narratives both of novels and biographies, including autobiographies, involve events or circumstances which refuse to cohere with the personal knowledge derived by an individual from past events or circumstances. There are, then, conflicts and tensions which punctuate and colour the rest of his or her life. Individual lives thus embody continuities of conflict.

10.4. NARRATIVE UNITY AND IMAGE LINKED

Our inquiry into personal practical knowledge conceptualized in terms of experience has so far led us to two principal notions, those of image and narrative unity. We explored image as a summative form of experience, a way people collect experience in meaningful and effective ways for coping with their practical situations. Following MacIntyre, we explored narrative unity as a continuum within a person's experience, a unity which rendered life experiences meaningful. It is clear that in our thinking, image and narrative unity are terms for coming to grips with experience. Indeed, in one sense they are terms for adding special meaning to the more general and undifferentiated term "experience".

But they are not synonymous terms. Readers are reminded that we came to their use in different ways: the notion of image developed in our work on personal practical knowledge is a special term serving the purposes of our inquiry; narrative unity is a term borrowed from the moral philosopher,

MacIntyre. Our inquiry begins in practice with the purpose of developing a language and perspective useful in accounting for it. Our general question is, "How can we make sense of classroom practices we see from the point of view of the practitioner?" MacIntyre, on the other hand, begins with practical difficulties he sees in moral theory. His question is, "How can I give an account, in general, of moral thought that places the moral thinker at the centre?" Beginning with detailed long-term observation of classroom practices we trace, for a person, the experiential history which makes sense of his or her actions, and we use the notion of image to give this account. Beginning with the limitations of depersonalized moral theory, MacIntyre develops the notion of narrative unity to give an account of moral experience. But the notion of experience which underlies our notion of image and MacIntyre's notion of narrative unity is essentially the same. Thus, "images" and "narrative unity" are two ways, from different perspectives, of talking about the same phenomena.

The terms, do not, however, describe exactly the same thing. Readers of Chapter 8 will recall that we sensed our notion of image was incomplete as a way of accounting for practice and that we had developed notions such as "relationship" to fill this gap. We now see that experience creates the narrative unity out of which the images are formed when evoked by practical situations. The more or less undifferentiated life experience we call "narrative unity" is expressed in a powerful personal knowledge form, called "image", triggered by the need to act in particular situations. For this reason, personal practical knowledge, particularly image, is mostly unseen, and varies from day to day since the uniqueness of situations calls forth particular versions of it. Personal practical knowledge appears only in action. It may be seen most clearly in crisis situations or situations of contradiction. At such moments the threads woven into one's narrative unity can be seen drawn together into an image for coping with an anomalous situation.

As we turn our attention again to Phil and the image of community, we remind our readers of our own epistemology. We began, in this chapter and in our thinking, with apparent contradictions observed at the staff meeting. In working from these through the personal knowledge account, we were compelled to develop a construct to account for the underlying unity in Phil's action. Our inquiry did not begin with a search for narrative unity in his life.

These insights into image and narrative unity provide us with the means to explore image of community as an expression of the narrative unity of his life. The threads of the narrative are found in Phil's childhood and school experiences in inner-city Toronto; in his experiences on Toronto Island as a child and as an adult; in his first teaching experience in the Island School and in his later experiences at Okotoks School and Lundbreck School. Phil's personal narrative is embedded within the cultural and historical narratives of his immigration to Toronto as the son of Irish parents; the Toronto school board; inner-city Toronto schools; and more generally, Ontario education. These threads contribute to the image, allow us to see how it is based on the narrative unity of Phil's life, and help us understand Phil's practices in Bay Street School as expressions of his image of community.

10.5. THE NARRATIVE BEGINS

Phil immigrated to Toronto with his parents from Ireland as a small child. The family settled some fifty years ago in an area of Toronto that would be hardly recognizable to the inner-city youngsters who now live there. It was not far from the present Bay Street School, and in fact, the high school experience of which Phil speaks could have been in the high school to which students living in the Bay Street area would have gone.

The first home his parents bought, however, was on Toronto Island, in a small community that still exists today, a short ferry ride from downtown Toronto. Even before Phil and his family had a home on the Island, they spent their summers and weekends there as day visitors. The Island had drawn Phil's parents to it from their first arrival in Toronto because, for them, it was a reminder of Ireland. The Island was a constant in Phil's life as his parents moved from one rental accommodation to another.

Phil attended high school on the mainland in a school with a large Jewish population. One of Phil's most often-told stories about his high school experience is recorded in our field notes.

He gave us a personal anecdote about his own experience as a student in a largely Jewish school. He had been sent to school in short pants. He and another boy in short pants were caught by older students who put them in a blanket. Phil had escaped while the other boy was

trapped. He went home saying he was never going to go back to that school again. He said he understood about being a member of a minority group but he said he didn't look like a minority. He said you understood if you've had the experience (Notes to file, April 15th, 1981 and modified November 23, 1983).

For Phil, his most constant community was not the part of Toronto where he and his parents lived and in which he went to school. His community was the one defined by Toronto Island. This community, we feel, plays a significant role in his narrative and is central to the image of community at work in Bay Street School. What are the characteristics of this community that make it so important in the unity of his life and form the central core of his image?

We cannot know the island that Phil knew as a child. Still, many of its features remain. Indeed, the Island residents struggle to maintain their way of life against city and provincial governments and other groups wanting to convert the community to parkland. The Island is geographically small. Since there are no cars, the ferry dock provides a common meeting ground as residents walk to and from it to catch the early morning or late afternoon ferry. The community, always small, now has fewer than 250 homes. In Phil's youth, the community faced the problems faced by all rural communities, such as the need for fire and police protection. Security was then, and remains still, a community responsibility. Neighbours watched each others' homes. The people who now live on the Island are a mixture of old-timers and newcomers, mostly young professionals and artists. In Phil's youth the residents were also a mixed group. They could have been, as Phil's parents were, immigrants buying their first home or they could have been people who already had a home in Toronto and lived on the Island during the summer. The Island had a small elementary school administered by the Toronto Board of Education. Its pupils tended to come from different ethnic backgrounds and, in the early days, exhibited a broad economic cross-section.

Readers familiar with small, semi-closed communities will sense the difference between such a community and those where the boundaries are unclear, where neighbours may not know each other and where there is reasonably clear stratification along economic and cultural lines. Such readers will sense the influence a small community has over one's outlooks on such matters as "community spirit", the role of social activities in the community, and the place of the school in the community.

John Dewey conceived of the community as an organic entity. A community, for Dewey, was a kind of organism, an entity with characteristics which were no mere sum of its parts. Just as a heart serves the circulatory function of an organism, so the school serves the educational functions of the community. This is how it is in the Island community--an organic entity to which its residents, and their institutions of school, fire control, and self-policing, contribute.

Phil's first teaching job was in that Island School. He both lived in the community and taught in its school. We first learned this in a June, 1981 lunch discussion and at the time paid little attention, except to note it of general interest:

Somewhere in the discussion, I think it was in connection with the fact that Phil had taught at the island school for a couple of years, we talked about where he lived. Phil has a place on the island that he keeps open year-round. He lives most of the year-round, however, in Agincourt and really only moves out to the island in the summer. We again talked about mutual acquaintances in the Atkinsons. (Notes to file, June 16, 1981)

We began to appreciate the significance of the note about the time we were completing the first Bay Street Paper, Chapter 9. The three of us were speaking to a group of administrators on July 14th, 1983, and Phil commented that the Island School was his first teaching assignment. In response to our remarks that he was a community-oriented principal, he said, "It all goes back to my family and to my early life on the island." (Notes to file, July 14, 1983). He went on to say that "The Island School was a real community school".

In these observations Phil, unprompted, is pointing to significant events in his own life that he believes contributed to the way he thinks about schooling. For him, as in our interpretation, what he is and does in Bay Street School is part of a narrative with origins in the Island. He is living out and continuing to tell his story at the same time.

Phil left the Island School and moved into the mainland schools of the Toronto Board for the next 25 or so years of his teaching career. He became, in short order, an assistant principal and a principal. As his career progressed, he moved from school to school. We cannot, of course, document his experiences in

each one. Of particular significance were his experiences at two inner-city schools, Okotoks and Lundbreck, and an alternative high school, Hill Street. The two inner-city schools were noted as community-oriented, Okotoks School serving the community as a day-care center and Lundbreck School as described in Chapter 9. Hill Street School is still noted in newspaper and school board promotion materials for its use and involvement of community resources.

When we first met Phil, his reputation was twofold. Our field notes record both features of the reputation.

We again related the story about Phil being an exemplary inner city principal. We had heard it at a Phi Delta Kappa meeting. (Notes to File, June 16, 1981)

Earlier Phil had commented on Grace's report that she had met someone who had said Phil was a real community principal. (Notes to File, April 20, 1983).

His reputation as a community principal and as an exemplary inner-city principal provides the two main themes in his narrative. But they are both given meaning in ways we could not have begun to understand when we first heard about them. Their meaning emerges from an understanding of the narrative unity of Phil's life and in particular, the way it has crystallized into the image of community. We return to the February 22nd staff meeting to offer an account of Phil's actions in the lights of our understanding of this image.

10.6. PHIL'S NARRATIVE AND HIS IMAGE OF COMMUNITY

The image of community takes on new meaning when interpreted in the light of the narrative. Our notion of it has grown by viewing it from the perspective of Phil's history rather than from the situation at the staff meeting. We are now able to examine, in still more depth, the originally puzzling observation that Phil did not support his teachers at the meeting.

One of the first effects of paying attention to narrative unity, to the Island community and its place in Phil's narrative, is to lend significance and credibility to interpretations already offered. We sense more deeply the importance, for Phil, of Bay Street School becoming a part of the community during the conceiving, planning, and execution of the Festival. We sense why it

was important that the Festival not be the school's but rather the community's. We sense the significance of the community event taking place on the school grounds rather than the school event taking place on community grounds (Silver Springs Court).

This added significance is not all that the narrative adds to our interpretation. We are led to a re-interpretation when we come to view the image of community as one of organic unity in which the school serves and performs functions for the community. It is not that Phil does not believe the school itself should be conceived as a community. He does. The following is typical of the way Phil talks about the school:

Phil talked for a few moments about the importance of establishing a community feeling among the faculty and then moving out into establishing a positive school community relationship. (Notes to file, May 15th, 1981).

Indeed, he had worked hard to establish a congenial environment within the school and a sense of community among the staff. Numerous items could be mentioned, such as a school-supported staff bus trip to Florida in the holidays, cosy pot-luck lunches, food served at evening staff meetings, support for a school radio station, establishment of a communications committee within the school, exchange visits by students and staff among all the grades in the school, and school tours for all staff. Furthermore, the community crisis referred to in Chapter 9 strengthened the school's sense of cohesiveness.

But this crisis, so significant in the course of events in the school, signified that the school as a community is a limited expression of the image. When the staff in formal and informal meetings discussed ways of responding to the crisis, Phil cautioned them against sharpening the boundaries between school and community and between ethnic groups within the community. Although the most likely reaction to the crisis was to see the school as an embattled unit that needed to identify clearly what it stood for, Phil encouraged the staff to continue with their home visits and to telephone students' parents. He counselled teachers to encourage the various ethnic groups to participate in the school-community committee and other school activities. One revealing incident occurred at a public meeting where a trustee organized the community participants into ethnic groups, ostensibly for

translation purposes. Phil was displeased since he felt this isolated groups rather than encouraged them to feel part of the same community.

We are led to the view that, for Phil, focussing on the school separates it from the community, and is therefore something he would oppose. He opposed this view when the school was in the crisis situation in 1981 and again at the February 1983 staff meeting.

To sum up, Phil uses every opportunity to encourage a sense of community in the school, for example, in his support for the year-end school community picnics sponsored by the school and to which staff, students and parents are invited. But Phil creates opportunities when he can, as he did with the Festival, to express the image fully by making the larger community central and the school an organ serving it.

10.7. THE LEARNING COMMUNITY AS AN ASPECT OF THE IMAGE OF COMMUNITY

So far, our account of Phil's image of community has considered personal and administrative threads in Phil's narrative. We have focussed on his home on the Island and on his administrative role in community-school activities. Using the insights gained in this narrative, we now shift our focus to educational matters. In particular, we wish to explore what the image of community means for the education of a child at Bay Street School. To begin, we pick up an earlier thread noted in section 5, where Phil remarks on his student experience as an outsider.

Phil did not attend school on the Island but in inner-city Toronto. His anecdote about short pants is not the only one that Phil recounts to illustrate his feeling of being different from his peers. He experienced the school as an outsider but from the security of his "personal community", a community established for Phil by his parents who knew "who they were and how they fit into the community." (Notes to file, November 23, 1983).

We use the term "personal community" in the sense developed by Henry (1963). According to Henry, a person is born into a personal community, "a group of intimates to which he is linked for life by tradition" (p. 147). This

personal community may be more or less stable in one's life. For example, Henry points out that in a primitive culture stability is high and the people to which one is linked at birth are intimates for life. There is little need for the individual to search for additional community members. Without this stability, Henry points out, an individual searches for and has to develop other intimates as members of his personal community. Imagine, for example, an inner-city environment with a large transient population such as the population surrounding Bay Street School.

Phil senses the particular importance of personal community for the children of such families. The idea that children should have a sense of personal community is clearly expressed in an address to Bay Street School parents. His description of what we call a learning community is one which fosters a personal community for the children. Above all, learning communities are personal communities, places where the bonds of intimacy are strong. He says:

The school environment should be warm, friendly, pleasant and secure. He said that the environment should be this way for the children, for you, and for the teachers. He said that the environment should promote mutual trust; must make users feel welcome and feel that they belong; that every student should participate in creating and maintaining that environment and that there should be many places to display accomplishments of every child. Every child should have recognition. He made reference to the fact that they could see that tonight in the hallways. He said that every student is a part of the school environment. (Notes to file, October 27, 1981).

The emphasis on a warm and supportive environment, reflected in these field notes, colours virtually all of his statements and actions on the curriculum. Even though Bay Street is a Language Project school, highly visible to the Board of Education and the press because of its location and project status. Phil will never define the purposes of the school merely in terms of content learning. For example, in a conversation with a teacher in June, 1981, Phil indicated that his view of reading was that:

You provide the environment and make the kids feel good about reading and that is the setting in which they will learn. (Notes to file, June 1st, 1981).

When we think of Phil and his early school years, we see that his own experience of schooling, captured in the anecdote of the short pants, is not the

one he thinks children should have. His notion of what a child's education ought to be is tied to his life, both personal and professional, on the Island. The narrative of his life unites two elements: the boy who enjoyed his childhood freedom in the Island community and attended an inner-city school, and the Island resident serving as principal of an inner-city school.

When we bring this insight to bear on Phil's philosophy and practice of education in Bay Street School, we see the image of community expressed in all manner of attempts to create learning communities for children. He strives to bring the child's learning community into harmony with the child's personal community; the first should be found in the second. Equally, a child's learning community should be found in his personal community. In this sense, the child's school is not separated from his community; both social growth and learning are unified in the child's developing narrative.

10.8. A RETURN TO THE SCHOOL COMMUNITY CRISIS

As Chapter 9 described, however, this principal, while living out an image of community in his school practices, faced a community crisis. How can it be that Phil's deeply felt notion of community resulted in confrontation with the school community? The answer is that the crisis had to do primarily with how children were treated in school. The issues of discipline, homework, and skill levels were, for one group of parents, particularly the Chinese, the nub of their conflict with the school. There is a tension between their ideas of children's learning and those contained in Phil's notion of a personal learning community. These parents say that children should have more homework; Phil, while not denying a place for homework, says children should be free to explore their neighbourhood and to get to know their families after school. These same parents say that teachers should be masters in the classroom, whereas Phil says they should create personal communities for the children--child to child, child to teacher, parent to child and teacher. The parents wanted strict discipline whereas Phil rid the school of the "discipline bench" outside his office and encouraged teachers to make children responsible for their own actions in the classroom.

This tension can be explained by different views of schooling, embedded

in the different historical and cultural narratives of the participants. These differences apply equally to the staff and parents within the community. One could not reasonably expect the absence of tension, given our perspective of the narrative unity out of which personal knowledge is crystallized and out of which one's moral sense of what an education should be is expressed. This tension in no way reflects shortcomings in any of the participants. They have their own narrative histories, their personal knowledge, and their own expressions of it.

Phil recognizes the tension and the dilemma it poses. In the midst of one of the crises he had this to say:

He said that perception is one thing, people want to change back to what they are safe with. He described this as the inner-city dilemma. Everyone has to be able to live with it, including the school. (Notes to file, June 4th, 1981).

10.9. PERSONAL PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE AND THE STUDY OF SCHOOLING

We leave the narrative of Phil's life to consider the significance of this work for inquiry into schooling. From the point of view of our inquiry, there is a dialectic at work between our contributions to a practical understanding of Bay Street School and to our theoretical notions of personal practical knowledge as a language and perspective for inquiry.

On the practical side, we gain insight into selected events in Bay Street School, in particular those surrounding its principal, Phil Bingham. We have come to see more clearly what it means when he urges staff and others to create a community school at Bay Street. A community school for Phil is not the common garden variety so often discussed by school boards and ministries of education. It is, rather, one like that envisaged by John Dewey: a community which is an organic entity and for which the school performs educational functions. It is a school where children experience a learning community, and where it is united with their personal community. These insights into Phil's personal knowledge help us understand the tension in the dialogue within the school and between the school and its parental communities. We deepen our understanding of the tension between the two proposals, for the Festival and the Ball, and of the tensions during the community crisis of 1981.

On the theoretical side, we have adopted the position that actions are knowing actions, or to use our term, "minded practices". When we see school-community crises, and when we see a difference of opinion between principal and staff, we treat these as differences in ways of knowing. Furthermore, we accept this knowing without offering judgement on its appropriateness. We treat this personal practical knowledge as a crystallization of the narrative unity of the person's life, as principal, teacher, or parent.

Methodologically, these understandings were gained in the practice of inquiry. Our focus on community, for example, did not occur to us early in our research. It was not until we had absorbed long hours in the school and had reflected on our observations as recorded in the field notes that this notion began to take shape in our minds. From the viewpoint of methodology, it is significant that the most meaningful and ultimately transparent events appear to be those embodying contradictions: a community-oriented principal and his school in conflict with the community, and a principal devoted to staff development deflecting a staff proposal.

Our general theoretical purpose has been to develop a language for and give credence to a particular perspective for viewing school practices. This chapter has expanded the notion of image and developed the idea of narrative unity. These two terms allow us to deal in a concrete way with experience, show how it is reflected in the minded practices of schooling, and contribute to a language of personal practical knowledge.

The particular image discussed is also of general interest. Phil's image of community, while unique to him, heightens our awareness of how we might think of a community school. Thus, even in this particular sense, the images described are potentially powerful generic constructs.

Earlier in the chapter, we took pains to discriminate our work from work that interprets school events primarily in terms of social norms and structures. Lest readers take this discrimination as a rejection of the role of social structure, we wish to point out that our interpretation is not solely in terms of personal history. Our account of the community crisis hinted at this when it drew attention to the different narratives lived out by different individuals. These individual narratives are themselves embedded in more general cultural

and historical narratives. Thus, the Island community has its own history and culture of which Phil is a part, and the Chinese community of Bay Street School has cultural traditions and norms in which the Chinese parents, individual narratives are embedded.

One of the ways that we see these historical and cultural narratives of teachers, parents and students expressed in schooling is through what we term "cycles" and "rhythms". Significant events such as the celebration of the Chinese New Year in Bay Street School and the festivities marking traditional school holidays lead us to an understanding of rhythms and cycles as part of personal narrative and as important in understanding personal practical knowledge in minded practices. We shall explore them in Chapter 12.

10.10. REFERENCES

- Assagioli, R. *Psychosynthesis*. Middlesex, England: Harmondsworth, 1965.
- Clandinin, D. Jean. *A conceptualization of image as a component of teacher personal practical knowledge in primary school teachers' reading and language programs*. Doctoral dissertation, University of Toronto, 1983.
- Clandinin, D.J. and Connelly, F.M. *Personal practical knowledge at Bay Street School: Image, Ritual and Personal Philosophy*, 1981
- Connelly, F.M. *A conceptualization of the interface between teachers' practical knowledge and theoretical knowledge in effecting board policy*. Proposal submitted to the National Institute of Education grants for research on knowledge use and school improvement, May, 1980.
- Connelly, F.M. & Clandinin D.J. *Personal Practical Knowledge at Bay Street School, Working Paper*, 1983.
- Eisner, Elliot W. *The educational imagination: On the design and evaluation of school programs*. New York: Macmillan Publishing Co., Inc., 1979.
- Dewey, J. *Experience and education*. New York: Collier Books, 1938.
- Dewey, J. *Art as experience*. New York: Capricorn Books, 1939.
- Henry, Jules. *Culture against man*. New York: Random House, 1963.
- Howard, V.A. *Artistry: The work of artists*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1982.
- MacIntyre, A. *After virtue: A study in moral theory*. London: Gerald Duckworth & Co. Ltd., 1981.
- McKeon, R. Philosophy and action. *Ethics*, 1952, 62, 2, 79-100.
- Progoff, I. *At a journal workshop*. New York: Dialogue House Library, 1975.
- Schwab, J.J. *College curriculum and student protest*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1969.
- Schwab, J.J. Learning community. *The Great Ideas Today*. Chicago: Encyclopedia Britannica, 1976.