DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 263 405 CE 042 933

AUTHOR Reubens, Beatrice G.
TITLE Adult Education and Training in Western European Countries.
INSTITUTION National Commission for Employment Policy (DOL), Washington, D.C.
REPORT NO RR-86-02
PUB DATE Jan 86
NOTE 51p.
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC03 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Access to Education; *Adult Counseling; *Adult Education; Adult Educators; Adult Learning; Adult Literacy; Agency Cooperation; Disabilities; Educational Certificates; *Educational Cooperation; Educational Finance; Educational Practices; Federal Aid; Females; Foreign Countries; Illiteracy; Industrial Training; Information Sources; Inplant Programs; Institutional Cooperation; Job Training; Models; *Staff Development; Standards; Student Certification; Teacher Education; *Teaching Methods; Unemployment; Womens Education
IDENTIFIERS *Europe (West); United States

ABSTRACT

No single system or model of adult education and training describes the actual situation in the countries of Western Europe. Considerable variability exists from nation to nation in regard to scope, characteristics, organization, and financing. The countries, however, share an interest in the deliberate expansion of all phases of adult education. In contrast to the United States, Western European countries divide education and training responsibilities between separate national agencies, exhibit more government promotion and support for adult education, and have publicly sponsored vocational training for adults that is more permanently established, better organized and financed, more able to teach a large range of skills, and is more widely used by the labor force. Despite these general differences, many general and specific approaches in Western European countries offer potentially useful leads for U.S. policymakers. Policies and practices that seem particularly pertinent to U.S. concerns fall into seven areas: (1) providing wider access to adults; (2) targeting on special problems and groups; (3) information, counseling, and supervision of standards; (4) staffing, training, learning methods, and accreditation; (5) breaking down institutional rigidities and divisions of authority; (6) financing public adult education and training; and (7) increasing the training offered by employers. (YLB)

ADULT EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN WESTERN EUROPEAN COUNTRIES

by

Dr. Beatrice G. Reubens

January 1986 RR-86-02

RESEARCH REPORT SERIES
NATIONAL COMMISSION
FOR EMPLOYMENT POLICY
1522 K STREET, N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005

This paper was prepared by Dr. Beatrice G. Reubens. The study was supported by a contract with the National Commission for Employment Policy. Researchers undertaking studies for the National Commission for Employment Policy are encouraged to freely express their own opinions. The views and opinions expressed herein are solely those of the author, and do not necessarily reflect the official opinions or position of the National Commission for Employment Policy.

Executive Summary

1. Western European countries share an interest in the deliberate expansion of adult education and training as a societalconcern beyond the benefits to the individuals concerned. The prevailing systems vary greatly in regard to the scope, characteristics, organization, and financing of adult education and training. No attempt is made here to describe comprehensively the individual national systems; rather, illustrative examples are cited without regard to their typicality.

2. The international organizations (UNESCO, EC, ILO, the Council of Europe, and OECD) have stimulated the development of adult education and training. National or sub-national legislation has established and funded adult eduction in many European countries. Adult training usually is created through separate actions. European countries agree that adult education and training goes beyond the acquisition by adults of credentials they did not obtain in youth, although this is included in the definition. In most countries, adults are defined as age 18 and over. The European Communities have been discussing age 25 as the lower limit, due to youth employment programs that extend to age 25.

3. The main forms of adult education and training are: general education without certification; basic education for immigrants and natives; courses leading todiplomas, certificates, etc.; vocational skill training for the unemployed or potentially unemployed; vocational skill training for employed adults; education and training for specific roles, such as trade union officials. Participation in adult education and training is by self-selection, designation by employers, or selection by authorities on the basis of targeting of programs.

4. Differences in how individuals enter adult education and training are crucial to the achievement of the twin goals of expanding the total number participating and assuring a disproportionate participation by those with the least adequate education in youth. Selection by employers and self-selection tend to result in an overrepresentation of males, the higher occupational and salary levels, and those with an above average earlier level of education. Targeted programs and courses offered by trade unions cater to those with average education or less, but they are not the best vehicles for a general expansion of participation.

5. Since the 1960s, adult education and training in Western European countries has shown the following trends: an emphasis on both training and education and a recognition of their complementarity and interdependence; a shift toward serving those in the labor force, especially the unemployed; a concern with adult education and training measures that anticipate and prevent unemployment; offers of education and training during working

hours, with compensation and protection of job rights; and outreach and targeting on disadvantaged groups.

6. Adult education and training have been established through legislation at the national, state, or local level, collective bargaining agreements, actions of voluntary organizations, internal decisions by firms, and specially created organizations. A wide array of public, not-for-profit and private organizations dispense adult education and training in Western European countries, although some are engaged in it only incidentally and some confine their offer to their members or employees. Government at various levels plays a significant role in legislating, financing, organizing, supporting, and regulating adult education.

7. Measures to Widen Access. Efforts to increase the participation rate of adults in available education and training courses and offers of new courses have dealt with the barriers identified in a large number of Western European countries. Admission, attendance, and examination or assessment requirements have been adjusted to favor those with little formal education. New methods of learning have been introduced, stressing non-classroom settings, use of television and radio instruction, brief courses and flexible hours, and various forms of open and distance learning. In Scandinavia, the small, local study group is widely used in adult education.

8. The needs of employed persons are particularly addressed by Paid Educational Leave, compensated time off from work for a specific period in order to study or train in a subject chosen by the individual and not necessarily related to the job. In its ideal form, paid educational leave includes protection of job rights and guarantee of all fringe and social benefits associated with work, but all plans do not provide these. Because of this and other deterrents, to date the participation in paid educational leave has been disappointing in all Western European countries. Many interesting models have been developed, however, and this approach holds promise for the future.

9. Most governments in Western Europe offer study grants, without a means test, to adult education enrollees, while training courses for the unemployed and others pay generous allowances, usually below prior earnings, but above unemployment insurance benefits. The West German use of unemployment fund surpluses to finance training of unemployed and employed persons proved a heavy drain that required grants from the Federal treasury when unemployment rates rose in the late 1970s.

10. Targeting on Special Groups. Programs have been established in many countries to educate disadvantaged adults, whether they are native or foreign-born illiterates in the country's language, low educational attainers, physically, mentally, or socially

handicapped, or females in and out of the labor force. In addition, most Western European countries have a permanent system of public training centers, nationally financed and directed, with local variations according to need. Serving all of the unemployed or non-employed, not just the disadvantaged, public training courses may also be offered at other institutions or may be purchased from private or public enterprises with the necessary training capacity. Recently, a more market-oriented and cost-effective approach has been inroduced into the public training center concept in several European countries.

11. Western European countries also have initiated training and education programs to prevent or delay unemployment among employed workers in danger of losing their jobs. Together with development plans, mobility allowances, and measures to encourage new industries, these efforts have limited the number of displaced workers and given those who lost their jobs more time to adjust. More fundamental efforts to build an adult education/training base in times of high employment so that unemployment can be avoided or minimized have not been successful in those countries that instituted programs in the 1960s. Defects in the programs, lack of sufficient scale, and the severity of the unemployment with its attendant stagnant employment growth impeded the preventive approach. Large crisis programs were required, just at the time that the funds for them dried up.

12. Information, Counseling, Standards. Potential users of adult education and training facilities rarely feel that they receive adequate information or counseling about the opportunities available. Efforts at the local level to provide comprehensive information on a nearby area's facilities have been found to be more effective, especially among the disadvantaged, than use of the general media. Information and counseling through peer groups, such as work councils in the firm or trade unions, or neighborhood organizations, appears to reach more people with low motivation or education. Outreach efforts also have been productive. Adequate supervision of the content and quality of the courses offered by commercial institutions, whose fees are often partly or wholly reimbursed by the government, is an important safeguard in some Western European countries.

13. Staffing, Training, Accreditation. Some countries have special courses for teachers of adults and different requirements and expectations of such teachers, in order to accommodate the differences in adults' learning pace and study habits. Teaching methods stress student participation, peer and self-assessment, self-starting, individual study, negotiated curricula, and learning without teachers. Credit toward diplomas or degrees may be given for courses with untraditional length, content, or location.

14. Institutional Rigidities and Divisions of Authority. European countries in which training is a national responsibility and education is a local power have a particular problem of coordination. Coordinating bodies, shared facilities, and comprehensive programs for youths and adults in a community are among the methods used to overcome the divisions of authority.

15. Increasing Employer Training. A few Western European countries have adopted public measures to stimulate the private sector to offer more and better training to their own employees. In part, the motive is to shift a greater financial and programmatic responsibility for training to the firms. A levy-grant system, such as Great Britain had until recently, collects sums from employers and redistributes them to firms offering approved training; training boards or a similar device are responsible for administration. A training tax, defined as the difference between a firm's actual expenditures on training and a stipulated percentage of payroll, has been used as the incentive by the French government and is being studied in other countries.

16. Lessons for the United States. American legislative and financial support of adult education is far less developed than in the Western European countries, in part because of the strong American belief in the private responsibility for personal advancement and in part because American adult education enrolls as high or a higher percentage of the adult population as do several European countries with a much larger public support system. There is, however, considerable room to increase the American participation rate in adult education and, particularly, to enlarge the access of the educationally disadvantaged. If American public policy should move in the direction of supporting an expansion of adult education, many of the financial supports to institutions and individuals described in this report would be appropriate. Some of the arrangements concerning courses and learning also are useful to American planners, although the U.S. has been quite innovative along these lines in existing adult education.

17. Publicly sponsored vocational training for adults is more permanently established, better organized and financed, more able to teach a range of skills, and more widely utilized by the labor force in most Western European countries than in the United States. If American public policy were to move in the direction of providing public training systems to a larger spectrum of the unemployed and non-employed, many of the European systems would repay careful examination as to financing, organization, and operations. The use of unemployment fund reserves to finance the training of persons otherwise claiming unemployment benefits is a feasible program, is properly controlled.

18. The methods by which some Western European goverments influence the quantity and quality of the training offered by firms to their own employees give useful leads for U.S. policy. In most Western European countries employers have less responsibility for providing and financing remedial and basic education of their workers than American employers appear to have, largely because the public training systems are able to furnish these services.

19. European experience indicates that even well planned and extended systems of adult education and training cannot ensure that crisis interventions will not be required. A permanent, adaptable, and well-financed system for dealing with the needs of the unemployed remains a necessity due to inevitable and unforeseeable changes in the levels and requirements of jobs.

Table of Contents

Introduction

This review of adult education and training in Western European countries does not attempt to present a comprehensive description of the systems of individual countries. The discussion is organized according to the subjects chosen for emphasis in the report on adult education and training in the United States prepared for NCEP by John F. Corrozi. Therefore, the provisions and practices of individual European countries that are cited should be taken as illustrative only and not as typical or ideal.

No single system or model of adult education and training describes the actual situation in the countries of Western Europe. Indeed, there is considerable variability from nation tonation in regard tothe scope, characteristics, organization, and financing of adult education training. Northern European countries, especially the Scandinavian nations, tend to have the most wide-ranging public programs of adult education and training, as well as the most consistent and generous financial support from central governments. In the south of Europe, program development has been more spotty, unevenly effective, and diversely administered and financed. What these countries share is an interest in the deliberate expansion of all phases of adult education/training as "a vital social, societal concern," transcending "individual advantage or benefit." (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, p. 246; CEDEFOP, 1980, 1984a, 1984b) The embodiment of this view is found in the guidelines for adult education laid down by the Swedish Parliament in 1975:

> To bridge educational gaps and thereby promote greater equality and social justice.
>
> To enhance the ability of adults to understand, critically scrutinize and participate in cultural, social and political life, therey contributing towards the development of democratic society.
>
> To educate adults for various duties, to contribute towards the transformation of working life and to help achieve full employment, thereby promoting development and progress in society.
>
> To cater to the desires of adults for wider educational opportunities and to enable them to supplement the ducation received in early years. (Sweden, 1983, p. 1).

Underpinning all of the above is an emphasis on service to the priority groups of disadvantaged. For the 1980s, seen as a period of rapid and sweeping change, the tasks of adult education are restated as:

> A strengthening of core competence.
>
> Provision of necessary formal educational competence and credentials.
>
> Improvement of vocational qualifications by further training.
>
> Increased cultural understanding and perception of identity and community. (Sweden, 1984b, pp. 1-3).

Adult education and training in Western Europe have been evolving and changing. The origins in Northern Europe in the 19th century may be traced to the short period of education in childhood and the resulting mass illiteracy. Voluntary organizations were the chief source of adult education for a long time. It was only after World War II that adult education and training came together as an area of public concern. During the economic recovery period of the 1950s, improved productivity of workers became an objective of adult education in Western Europe. In the 1060s, the great expansion of education for youth created adverse reactions to "front loading", or the concentration of education on youth. A pervasive faith in the economic, social, and personal benefits of education, a conviction that lifelong learning was required, and an economic strength based on full employment set the scene for many Western European countries to innovate in adult education and training.

The economic downturn in the mid-1970s and the subsequent prolonged recession created doubts about the powers of education, slowed the implementation of many of the earlier reforms, and turned attention tothe preservation of jobs, aid to the unemployed, and the problems of youth about to enter a stagnant labor market. In the 1980s, technological literacy may take primacy as a goal of adult education and training. (CEDEFOP, 1980, pp. 98-101; Council of Europe, 1980, pp. 4-5; Manger, 1984; Vocational Training, September 1982, p. 1).

The international organizations have encouraged the development of adult education and training. In the post-war period, recurrent education (also known as lifelong, permanent, or continuing education), was a repeated theme of papers and

meetings of UNESCO, the ED, the Council of Europe, and the OECD.[1]

More specifically, the ILO,[2] after years of discussion, adopted both a Convention and a Recommendation on paid educational leave in 1974.[2]

National or state legislation has established and funded adult education in many European countries. Each country has its own definition of adult education and training and most distinguish in practice between education and training. The European Community describes adult education and training as "a concept in search of a common definition". (Vocational Training, Sept. 1982, p. 1). This uncertainty about the definition probably arises from confusion about the objectives of adult education and training, the multiplicity of promoters of initiatives, and the great diversity of education and training institutions and courses. Nevertheless, European countries agree that adult education and training are not simply the continuation in adulthood of previous formal schooling, although all include in adult education and training the special opportunities for adults to acquire academic credentials that they missed in youth.

Adult education and training begin after the completion of basic schooling and/or initial vocational training (e.g.,

---

[1]UNESCO, the United Nations Educational, Social and Cultural Organization, located in Paris, has world-wide participation of national governments and representation from national Departments of Education. The ED, European Community, centered in Brussels, has the powers of a sovereign state on subjects over which member countries have transferred powers or agreed to abide by EC decisions; some aspects of educational policy are included. Ten countries are currently members: F.R.Germany, France, United Kingdom, Italy, Belgium, the Netherlands, Luxembourg, Ireland, Denmark, and Greece; Spain and Portugal will soon join. The Council of Europe, located in Strasbourg, France, through its Council for Cultureal Cooperation, organizes meetings of Ministers of Education of European countries and conducts projects on education. The OECD, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, has headquarters in Paris where various divisions of the Secretariat have conducted international meetings and research on education involving 24 member countries in Europe, North America, and Oceania.

[2]The ILO, International Labor Office, based in Geneva, is a world-wide organization in which national representatives of governments, employers' associations and trade union organizations jointly determine policy on a large number of issues related to labor. Governments that sign ILO Conventions are obligated to implement their provisions.

apprenticeship), a period in the labor force, or work in the home. In most countries, 18 years of age designates adulthood, but it may be as low as 16. Adults tend to be divided explicitly or implicitly into at least three age groups: under 25, prime age (25 to 45 or 50), and older workers. Because those under 25 have been regarded as youth both in unemployment data or in programs to alleviate unemployment, the EC is moving toward a definition of adulthood that recognizes 25 as the lower limit. (CEDEFOP, 1984a, 1, p. 3).

Most countries would agree with a recent Danish assessment that "there is a vast profusion of courses available to adults, packaged for the most part as consumer goods in a way that resembles a veritable supermarket offer." (Vocational Training, Sept. 1982, p. 28). The full breadth of activities encompassed by the term "adult education and training" is beyond the present capacity of any country to organize, regulate and finance in a thoroughly coherent fashion. To some extent, however, every country exhibits each of the following types of activity:

1. General education without certification, including languages, arts, crafts, current political and civics issues, recreational and creative courses, personal development, education for parental and family responsibilities, etc.

2. Basic education in literacy and numeracy, for immigrants and for natives with deficient early education.

3. Education in academic subjects to qualify for training or to obtain a specific academic qualification, diploma, etc.

4. Vocational skill training for unemployed adults or those in danger of becoming unemployed.

5. Vocational skill training for persons employed in the private or public sectors.

6. Training and education for specific roles, such as trade union officials, members of Works Councils, or members of Codetermination Boards.

Three types of participation in adult education and training can be identified in connection with the six types of adult education and training listed above. Self-selection is characteristic of participants in types 1 and 3. Designation by employers pertains to type 5. Selection by authorities through targeting applies to types 2 and 4 and, in part, to type 3; type 6 is a special case of a targeted program.

These differences in how individuals come to participate in

adult education and training are crucial to the achievement of the twin goals of expanding the total number participating and assuring disproportionately heavy participation by the groups whose education during youth was least adequate. Evidence from a large number of countries indicates that participants in adult education and training who are selected by private sector employers show an overrepresentation of males, the higher occupational and salary levels, and those whose education in youth reached a higher than average level. (Wittwer, 1982; KAFU, 1983, pp. 12-14; von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977; ILO, 1979, pp. 43, 155; BW, 1981, no. 11/12; NU A, 1979, pp. 352, 356; Vocational Training, Sept. 1982, pp. 30, 31, 41). Similar, if less extensive, information on employees in the public sector (governmental and quasi-governmental organizations) suggests the same conclusion. (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, pp. 231232).

A conference in the Scandinavian countries on adult training in firms concluded that there were several valid reasons why "people with only a rudimentary education are largely ignored." (NU A, 1979, p. 361).

> For one thing, it is more expensive for companies to devote extra resources to employees with a minimum education. From the corporate point of view the return is more immediate if training is given to people who already have a certain level of basic education. For another thing, people with a minimum education have little motivation for commencing a long period of supplementary education - on account of their lack of basic proficiencies they find it more difficult than others to derive benefit from such education, and they see little chance of corporate promotion. The group of Nordic experts responsible for this report believes that this factor should be given more attention in future discussions on education in working life. An extraordinary effort must be made on behalf of those with short basic education.
>
> At the same time it should be stressed that responsibility for this cannot simply be imposed upon the employer. A clear-cut distribution of responsibility is missing today. In future planning of education in working life it will be necessary to share responsibility between government, trade unions and industry. (NU A, 1979, p. 36).

Self-selection, in which individuals decide on their own to enter adult education and training, results in only slightly less bias toward those with above average educational attainment in youth. The introduction of paid educational leave has had little impact on the unequal distribution which is highly correlated with prior education, occupational status, and income. (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977; Sweden, 1983, pp. 5-11; Sweden, 1977, pp. 1314; BW, no. 1, 1973, p. 9; *bmbw, 1975, pp. 12-13;

Lenhardt, 1978; Degen and Nuissl, 1984, pp. 47-49, 105-106).

Surveys in France, Norway, Finland, and Sweden of workers' attitudes toward education and training offered through the firm reveal common themes among unskilled blue collar workers, the group least likely to participate: the belief in a limited potential for advancement, skepticism about the usefulness of training, and the fear of return to "school," with failure as a likely outcome. (NU A, 1979, pp. 357-359; France, 1976; CEDEFOP, 1983, no. 6). If employer indifference or opposition also was sensed, the worker's decision would be settled negatively without further consideration. (NU A, 1979, pp. 355-357; BW, no. 12, 1976, pp. 94-95).

The targeted adult education and training programs offer the best opportunity to counter the underirable tendency of adult training and education to perpetuate and exacerbate the inequality in educational attainment established in youth. (KAFU, 1983, pp. 10-12). Education conducted by trade unions also favors those with average education or less. The challenge to adult education and training, thus far unsuccessfully met in Western European countries, is to devise and operate programs that expand total enrollments, meet the needs of diverse groups, the economy, and society, and, at the same time, cater so heavily to the disadvantaged groups in and out of the labor force as to rectify pre-existing inequalities in attainment and access.

Historically, adult education in Europe began with voluntary organizations offering general education directed toward the entire adult population and concentrated in leisure hours. Since the 1960s the chief trends have been:

-- an emphasis on both training and education and recognition of their complementarity and interdependence.

-- a shift to serving those in the labor force, especially the unemployed.

-- a concern with education and training measures that anticipate and prevent unemployment.

-- education and training during working hours, with compensation.

-- targeting and outreach to disadvantaged groups.

Adult education and training are established through a variety of arrangements: legislation at national, state, or local level; collective bargaining agreements; decisions by voluntary organizations; internal action of employers; or

specially created organizations of a public or private character. Thus, adult education and training are dispensed by a wide array of independent public, not-for-profit, and private organizations, some of which engage in education and training only as an ancillary activity and some of which cater only to their own members.

In Sweden, a country which has recognized and organized adult education and training effectively and in which over one-third of adults participate in one or more courses annually, the following organizations, partly or entirely publicly funded, are dispensers of adult education and training, apart from the regular educational system. (Sweden, 1977, p. 1; Swedish Institute, 1978, 1982).

1. Folk high schools (residential schools for adults).

2. Voluntary Educational Associations, representing popular movements, such as temperance, cooperatives, or trade unions, organized through local branches and offering short courses.

3. A system of municipal adult education offering the full range of education through upper secondary.

4. Two national schools for adults, chiefly for those unable to attend municipal education.

5. Special courses in institutions of higher education.

6. Public libraries and teaching-aid centers.

7. Radio and Television Courses and Correspondence Schools.

8. Labor market training courses in training centers and other locations, sponsored by the National Labor Market Board, through county and local offices.

9. In-service and other education and training offered to their own employees by national, county, and municipal government agencies, employing over one-fourth of the work force.

10. Courses for staff and elected officials offered by the training departments of the Association of Local Authorities and the Federation of County Councils.

11. Courses sponsored by individual firms, employer federations, and trade associations. Several joint employer-employee bodies sponsor training, including training of shop stewards.

12. Extensive education and training for officials and members of trade unions and trade union federations. (LO, 1979).

13. Education and training provided by the armed forces.

Although a multiplicity of organizations delivers services in Western European countries, government at the national level plays a significant role in legislating, financing, organizing, supporting, and regulating adult education and training. Varying from an overwhelming role in Scandinavia to a much less visible presence in Ireland or Italy, national governments also are supplemented or replaced by lower levels of government to a different extent in each country.

Among the Western European countries, those with a central, rather than a federal, form of goverment tend to show a more concerted public role at the national level. However, some central governments have deliberately surrendered functions to the regions, as in Italy and Belgium. Even in the centralized type of government, it is common that education and training responsibilities are divided between separate national agencies.

In comparison to the United States, the presence and activities of government are conspicuously greater in Western European countries. European concern about making legislative provision for adult education and training, along with offers of institutional financial support and financial aid to participants, arises from several sources. In part, it is due to a recent and rapid increase in the years of education attained by the youth cohorts who, for the first time, show substantial proportions completing secondary education. By contrast, in the United States, completion of high school has been common among adults of all ages for some time. As a result of compulsory extensions of education and voluntary staying-on by youth in the European countries, a generation gap has opened in educational attainment that leaves adults in a disadvantaged position. One reaction is to attempt a better balance by providing and financing adult education.

Less government promotion and support for adult education in the U.S. than in most Western European countries may result from the fact that American adult education enrolls as high or a higher percentage of the relevant population as do several countries having much greater public effort on behalf of adult education. A belief in the private responsibility for personal advancement also is more widely accepted in the United States than in Europe.

The case in regard to the public training of adults is somewhat different. Europeans have been far more concerned than

Americans about the potential employment impacts of technological change and international trade developments, in part because European employment growth has been stagnant for ten years, in part because there is less geographical occupational mobility of the labor force in most European countries, and, in part, because European governments are expected to play an active role in minimizing and equitably distributing the burdens of economic change. (Marger, 1984; Council of Europe, 1982; CEDEFOP, 1980, 1984a; MSC, 1983; KAFU, 1983).

For these reasons, publicly sponsored vocational training for adults in Western European countries is more permanently established, better organized and financed, more able to teach a large range of skills, and much more widely utilized by the labor force than is the case with the effort in the United States. On the other hand, the amount and quality of training offered to adult employees by U.S. firms, a poorly documented subject, does not appear to be inferior to that in the Western European countries which have utilized incentives or taxes.

Despite the general differences suggested above between the United States and the Western European countries in regard to adult education and training, many general and specific approaches in Western European countries offer potentially useful leads for U.S. policymakers. This paper reviews Western European policies and practices that seem particularly pertinent to U.S. concerns, dividing the subject into seven sections:

1. Providing Wider Access to Adults
2. Targeting on Special Problems and Groups
3. Information, Counseling, and Supervision of Standards
4. Staffing, Training, Learning Methods, and Accreditation
5. Breaking Down Institutional Rigidities and Divisions of Authority
6. Financing Public Adult Education and Training
7. Increasing the Training Offered by Employers

1. Providing Wider Access to Adults

Analysis in several countries points to identical constraints on the access of substantial parts of the adult population to existing adult educational and training opportunities. The entry, attendance, and assessment requirements may be a deterrent. Fear of failure may discourage those who were unsuccessful in school earlier. Institutions may be too distant

for convenient travel by adults having irregular work schedules or other responsibilities. Unpopular teaching styles and methods, adverse local variations in the availability of subjects, or a mismatch of local offerings with the desires of potential students may discourage participation. Adults may not be able to study for the number of hours per day and number of weeks per year prescribed by the institution and they may not be able to study during the hours the institution operates.

Employer or worker indifference to study during working hours is a potent force, since Western European workers on average devote a tiny fraction of their leisure time to education and would not increase it if they had more leisure. (New Society, March 29, 1973). Personal circumstances, such as child care, household responsibilities, or health may be barriers to participation. Finally, the costs of adult education and training, out-of-pocket and foregone income, may be barriers. (Council of Europe, 1982, pp. 172-176). The material that follows illustrates one or more of these problems and offers examples of the solutions.

Changing the Admission Requirements

Swedish higher education began to loosen up in the 1950s when there was a limited waiver of the admission requirement of a matriculation certificate from upper secondary school, based on tests (studentexamen). However, it was not until the deliberate efforts in the 1970s that adults began to attend universities in great numbers. The reform of higher education in 1977 has permitted a person 25 years or older who has at least four years of occupational experience to fulfill the admission requirement, regardless of formal school attainment, but provided that knowledge is demonstrated at upper secondary standard in selected subjects. Curricula reforms incorporated many short and vocationally oriented courses, permitting part-time study and limited programs. More universities were established. Through the setting of quotas for different groups of applicants and a system of ranking applicants by work experience and other criteria as well as school marks, eligibility was widened for the higher education programs with limited admissions, e.g., dentistry. By 1978, 50 percent of students were over 25. Changes in the rules in 1982 favored those completing upper secondary school, to redress the balance slightly. But adults remain a major force in Sweden's higher education. (Marklund and Bergendal, 1979, pp. 35-46).

New Ways of Learning

Much copied in other countries, the Open University in Great Britain was opened in 1971 with almost all costs covered by the national government. It offered higher education to persons who lacked the qualifications required to enter the normal higher

education system and it facilitated participation by being based on correspondence study packages, supplemented by radio and television lectures, written homework assignments to be returned for marking, a network of regional offices and local study centers, and summer school programs in various parts of the country. Although conceived as a second chance for underprivileged persons, the Open University, receiving far more applications than it had places, was heavily sought by those who already had considerable education, mainly school teachers. Females were no more heavily represented than in traditional universities. Recently, applications have fallen as fees have risen without offsetting sources of funds for those unable to pay the costs. In 1983, for the first time since 1971, the 25,000 places were not all taken and some courses had no applicants.

Some broadening of the purposes and activities of the Open University occurred subsequent to a 1976 report by a Committee on Continuing Education. Among the new activities are tailor-made in-home courses for private companies and the Women in Technology Program, sponsored by the MSC (Manpower Services Commission).[3] Designed to prepare women with previous careers in the engineering industry (manufacture of motor vehicles, machinery, etc.) for reentry to work while they are at home, the program broadens and updates their technical knowledge, promotes confidence, and gives skills in career planning. Another innovation is the Open Business School which uses the same methods as the Open University, but caters primarily to employed middle managers whose companies are unable to afford the cost in fees and absence from work of a residential course taking two to three weeks. No entry qualifications are expected. (New Society, 1973; Employment News, July 1984; CEDEFOP News, 1981-841 Evans and Bennett, 1983, p. B101).

One of the main initiatives in the MSC's recent plan to

---

[3]The British Manpower Services Commission, established in 1974 by the Employment and Training Act of 1973, is responsible for the operation of public training and employment programs. The MSC is separate from government but accountable to the Secretary of State for Scotland, and the Secretary of State for Whales. The ten policy setting members of the MSC, serving a term of three years, consists of a chairman selected by government, three members appointed after consultation with the Trades Union Congress, three after consultation with the Confederation of British Industry, two after consultation with local authority associations, and one with professional education interests. The Committees for Scotland and Whales advise the MSC on programs for their areas. The multi-partite, quasi-public MSC is similar to the Swedish National Labor Market Board and the German Employment Office (Bundesanstalt fur Arbeit).

develop adult training is the Open Tech program. Aimed at adults who are training for or updating technical or supervisory skills, Open Tech is organized by specific occupations and is designed for those who find it difficult to attend traditional courses because of their work schedules. Open Tech provides a variety of methods of open and distance learning, flexible learning times and styles, and diverse materials and settings. There are no formal entrance qualifications for participants. Rather than establish new institutions, the Open Tech program features "drop-in centers" and utilizes accredited educational and public training centers, as well as industry training centers and private companies' facilities. Other existing institutions are being funded by MSC to organize national specialist centers that will provide courses and materials directly to students and the educational and training establishments.

Employers are expected to pay the full fees for employees who participate in Open Tech, but others may need to borrow; a loan fund is under discussion by MSC. The role of the MSC is catalyst and stimulator, rather than provider of courses, with the result that financial and other resources in addition to those of the MSC have been mobilized. It is a principle of Open Tech that each project should become self-supporting after a fixed period or initial support by the MSC. (Employment Gazette; Employment News; CEDEFOP News).

Local Initiatives

An alternative to distance learning is to create very small study units located conveniently, including at the workplace. This form is particularly suited to informal study or remedial education, as in Swedish Study Circles. Small, local study circles have been a predominent part of adult education. They are organized by the popular movements such as the trade unions, political parties, religious groups, the temperance movement, and consumer and producer cooperatives. Responding to the desires of members and featuring activities as well as study and discussion, the circles' programs concentrate on aesthetic subjects, such as music, arts, and crafts, as well as political, social, economic and environmental issues of concern to citizens, and subjects sponsored by trade unions.

These voluntary associations have been aided by government subsidies since 1947, with special subsidies for outreach activities at workplaces and in housing areas to reach the handicapped, immigrants, housewives, and educationally deficient. To be eligible for basic subsidy since 1981, a study circle must have at least 5 and no more than 20 participants and meet for at least 15 hours over a four week period. Smaller groups are permitted for shiftworkers, handicapped persons, or patients in hospitals. (Sundqvist, 1982; Swedish Institute, 1982, 1978; Johansson, 1973; Council of Europe, 1982, p. 127;

Sweden, 1977, pp. 3-5).

Municipal adult education in Sweden also illustrates widened access. In 1967, the Swedish Parliament made it the responsibility of the municipal authorities, which already were responsible for education through upper secondary level, to provide adults with the same educational opportunities as youth in order to narrow the generation gap in educational attainment. As in all education, national funding assists the municipalities. To facilitate the attendance of adults at day and evening classes, which require a minimum number of enrollees, the minicipal adult schools in some communities provide child care services. No tuition fees or other charges face participants in the courses offered by municipal adult education, and they are eligible for the study grants available to all adults, as described below. (Sweden, 1977, pp. 5-6; Swedish Institute, 1978, 1982).

Educational Leave

Paid educational leave is an approach to widening access to education and training that is potentially of great importance to employed persons, since it directly confronts the obstacles they face--a lack of time in which to engage in types of education or training not directly provided by the firm, a need for substitute income while away from work, and protection of job security rights upon return from leave.

As developed by the International Labor Office in the Convention and Recommendation adopted in 1974, the term "paid educational leave" refers to leave granted to an employee for a specific time period during working hours, with adequate financial entitlements. Such leave is to be used either for occupational training, or general, social, and civic education, or trade union education. The right to educational leave should include financial entitlements, protection of job rights, and guarantee of all fringe and social benefits associated with work. Workers should be free to choose their educational or training programs without employer influence. Suitable programs should be developed that reflect the national interest, the needs of specific enterprises, and the self-improvement of the individual. Provision for paid educational leavae can be effected through a variety of methods--laws or regulations, collective agreements, arbitration awards, and other means consistent with national practice. The ILO stresses that paid educational leave is not a substitute for adequate education and training early in life and that it is only one of a variety of means for establishing continuing education and training. (Levine, 1974; ILO, 1979, pp. 247-258; NU B 1977: 30, pp. 30-38).

In Western Europe, the measures instituting paid educational leave have been quite diverse. With regard to the method of establishment:

Some countries have enacted legislation that provides both the right and the payment features (e.g., France, Belgium).

Some countries have passed legislation, but have omitted the question of compensation because it is covered by general laws on study grants (e.g., Sweden, Finland).

Some states within a federal country have enacted legislation without action by the national government (e.g., F.R. Germany).

Some countries include paid educational leave in education/training legislation of a broader type (e.g., France).

Some countries have established fairly wide coverage through collective bargaining agreements on paid educational leave (e.g., Italy).

Some countries have uneven and spotty paid educational leave, mainly through collective bargaining agreements (Great Britain, the U.S.).

Some countries have special laws that grant paid educational leave to special groups and to workers who exercise trade union, worker representation, or other functions in the enterprise (e.g., Sweden, F.R. Germany). Sweden also has a general law, but Germany does not.

Some countries have combinations of legislation and collective bargaining (e.g., France, Sweden, West Germany).

The sources of funds for legislated paid educational leave are usually employers and the government. French employers were until recently able to charge off wage payments to those on leave against the minimum total expenditure on all types of training stipulated by the law of 1971 as an incentive to avoid paying a tax. As of 1984, the payroll tax incentive for paid educational leave was financially separated from that for training in the firm. (INFFO, 1984). The French government participates by reimbursing part of employers' outlays under certain circumstances and by paying the wages of those taking a government-approved course after the employers' limited obligation to pay wages ends. (ILO, 1979, pp. 25-27). In Sweden, the government's study grants to those on educational leave come from general funds, supplemented bya special tax on employers. Belgian employers and the government contribute equally to an educational leave fund and employers are reimbursed for wages and social security contributions. Under collective bargaining agreements for paid educational leave, both employers and workers or only

employers may finance leave.

The source of financing, the form of the organization that collects and disburses funds, and various other aspects of the financial system have been identified as key elements in the number and composition of the participants in educational leave. (Luttringer and Pasquier, 1980, pp. 418-422).

Even where general legislation establishes the right to paid educational leave, utilization rates are affected by various restrictions on eligibility. Firms with less than 10 employees were originally exempt in France and now have separate conditions. Most general laws exclude the public sector because other legislation or internal programs provide for these employees. In two of the five West German states that have educational leave laws, only employees under 25 years old are eligible. An age limit of 40 was set in Belgium in 1973, but it may be lifted. (Degen and Nuissl, 1984, pp. 49, 142, 152). Full-time employment (Belgium) or a minimum length of service in the company (France, Sweden) may be required. In Belgium, a period of voluntary education or training in non-work hours without benefit of leave or compensation must be undertaken in the two years preceding application for paid leave in order to obtain the full allowance; others are granted paid leave only for one-fourth of the selected course hours. (Degen and Nuissl, 1984, pp. 142-143). The city-state of Bremen in West Germany is unusual in that the self-employed, housewives, and retired persons may apply for paid educational leave.

Once eligibility is established, actual participation may be constrained by various factors. Rules exist in some countries about the proportion of the workforce that may be on educational leave at any one time (Italy, France). In Italy, paid leave is granted only for half the hours of any given course and on condition that the worker puts in an equal number of unpaid hours on his own time. (Degen and Nuissl, 1984, pp. 68-69). The length of absence from work for educational leave may be limited directly (Italy, West Germany) or may be influenced by the amount and duration of financial support, length of service, or other criteria. Permitted leave runs from a few days to a year or more. Limits may be placed on the number of periods of educational leave within a given number of years.

Participation may be further limited by a narrow definition of permitted courses or by excluding or refusing to pay for courses that are not officially approved. Thus, the stated aims of paid educational leave in France are very broad, but "approval is generally limited to vocational training courses." (Luttringer and Pasquier, 1980, p. 413, 419). Preparation for general or vocational examinations has been most prominent in Belgium, but approval is granted to all types of courses run by approved institutions. Remedial education to provide a second chance to

earn the diploma awarded at the end of eight years of compulsory education has been the chief use in Italy. (Luttringer and Pasquier, 1980, p. 413; Degen and Nuissl, 1984, pp. 70-71, 143).

If the courses require out-of-pocket expenditures, workers may be discouraged from applying for educational leave. While most countries offer free courses and materials in public institutions, or subsidies to the students to cover costs in private or not-for-profit institutions, this is not the universal practice. Employers, trade unions, training insurance funds, and workers also contribute to funds that cover the institutional costs. (Luttringer and Pasquier, 1980, p. 421).

Even more important as a deterrent is the failure to provide full pay and fringe benefits for the duration of educational leave. Many collective bargaining agreements on educational leave make no provision for compensation. Legislative provision for paid leave also may involve financial sacrifice. In France, statutory provision for financial compensation of workers on educational leave was vague from 1971 to 1978 and the establishment of full pay and benefits required further legislative reform in 1982 and 1984. French supervisory staff taking long-duration leave have a fixed upper limit on remuneration during leave that is discouraging. The amount provided in Sweden and Finland is less than previous earnings for most workers. Originally designed in 1976 to provide the same level of income as the labor market training allowance, the Swedish study grant/loan has not been increased enough with inflation, resulting in the need to combine studies with employment. The hourly and daily study grant for short courses "is no longer a realistic alternative for an undereducated person wishing to take time off from work in order to study." (Sweden, 1983, p. 10). Belgian workers on leave receive a monthly maximum payment that is barely above the statutory minimum wage. (Degen and Nuissl, 1984; France, 1982; INFFO, 1984; Sweden, 1983, p. 10).

Given these limitations, it is not surprising that to date the total amount of participation in paid educational leave has been disappointing. A study of five Western European countries in the late 1970s found that "paid educational leave remains a marginal institution in the vast field of adult education." (Luttringer and Pasquier, 1980, p. 422). A survey among French workers revealed that, as of 1975, 90 percent had never submitted a request for educational leave, although half of the total qualified. (France, 1976). Preliminary results for France in 1982 show under 48,000 workers benefitting from educational leave; by contrast, almost 2 million workers out of 10 million covered were chosen to receive training by the firm. (France, 1983; INFFO, Jan.-Feb. 1984; Legave and Vignaud, 1980, pp. 52-56; CEDEFOP News no. 1, 1981, no. 6, 1983).

A recent review of the experience of the ten members of the

European Communities concluded that relatively few of those covered by the general educational leave statutes had utilized their privileges. Employees in the public service, trade union officials, and middle and top managers in private companies were found to benefit disproportionately. Nor has educational leave made much of a contribution toward realizing the goals of opening up temporary jobs for unemployed workers, encouraging shorter work hours, or improving vocational qualifications. (Degen and Nuissl, 1984).

Beyond the reasons given above, the low utilization rate of paid educational leave has been attributed to inadequate leadership and information to make workers fully aware of their rights, excessive complexity in the schemes and their administration, lack of an independent financing system, an inadequate number and range of approved courses, too many political or general courses, workers' worry about the security of their jobs in periods of high unemployment, unwillingness of workers to let their choice of training course inform employers that a change in firm was planned, concern that the leave will not result in advancement in position or pay, opposition by employers to utilization of leave rights, and opposition by fellow-workers. (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, pp. 199-200; Degen and Nuissl, 1984, pp. 52-53; France, 1976; Luttringer and Pasquier, 1980, pp. 417-418, 423; CEDEFOP, 1983, no. 6; Stockfeldt, 1976).

In France, implementation was weakened in the 1970s by the economic deterioration that led to government's effort to use the law to aid the unemployed. Until the 1984 reforms, French employers chose to fulfill their training obligations under the broad 1971 law by providing firm-related training courses to workers selected by the firm, doing little to encourage educational leave initiated by workers and denying a strong role to the Works Council. (ILO, 1979, pp. 28-30, 36-39; France, 1982). Clearly, the promise of paid educational leave lies in the future, but it is undeniable that it is one of the most important methods of reaching adults.

Financial Assistance to Participants

In the broader field of adult education and training, the payment by government of adequate study grants, without a means test, is an important stimulus to participation by both the employed and the non-employed. Most Western European Countries provide tuition-free higher education and make grants and loans to all students. Many countries also pay student allowances above the compulsory level, thus including the equivalent of U.S. high school students. The same or better terms may be offered to adult students. For example, Germany's federal government instituted a Study Support Law (BAFoG) in 1971, giving modest financial support to post-compulsory students up to the age of 35, subject to a means test. Both the Norwegian and the

Swedish national governments base study grants and loans to adults on those offered ordinary students. In Sweden, a study allowance is paid to upper secondary students as a continuation of the child allowance previously paid to parents. A combination of a grant and repayable loan is paid to undergraduates in higher education. Adult students are eligible for the same allowances, grants or loans when they take the same type of course, but in some cases they may be given extra allowances to support a family. In addition, special hourly and daily study grants are available to adults who systematically pursue courses for part of the day or short time periods. (Swedish Institute, 1982).

The city-state of Bremen, West Germany, has introduced vouchers to be used by the unemployed for further education, in response to an increase in the fees for courses. The vouchers, permitting the unemployed or those undergoing retraining to attend courses free of charge, have been used by half of the eligibiles in Bremen. Four-fifths of the vouchers have been applied to basic courses in German, arithmetic, typing, shorthand, English, French, and bookkeeping. (CEDEFOP News, no. 7, 1984, p. 3).

Training courses for the unemployed and other designated groups pay a generous allowance in all Western European countries. The amount, deliberately set below the last earnings level, may reach 80-90 percent of that level, and usually exceeds the amount of unemployment insurance benefit by a margin calculated to offset extra expenses and serve as an incentive. In most cases, dependents' allowances and other allowances are calculated as additions, unless the country has a system of family and other social allowances that continues regardless of employment status.

In 1969 West Germany instituted a program under the Labor Promotion Act (AFG) that attracted much attention outside the country. It proposed to use surplus funds in the national unemployment insurance fund to pay generous training allowances to persons, employed, unemployed, or out-of-the-labor force, who submitted an acceptable training plan to a local employment service office. Financial incentives were also offered to providers of training, all outside the federal government. Training was broadly conceived, although primarily vocational. The response was so great and the costs so high that, starting in 1972, various restrictions were placed on eligibility for training by reference to prior contributions to the U.I. fund and recency of employment. The scope of acceptable training for the full grant, reduced in amount, was narrowed to courses relevant to labor market demand, with a lower grant for other courses. Loans were made in some cases instead of grants. And the payroll tax to the U.I. fund was raised for employers and workers. (CEC, 1983, pp. 88-89, 92, 94; Lenhardt, 1978; Sengenberger and Lutz, 1974; SO, no. 12, 1973).

In spite of these actions, growing unemployment increased the unemployment payments of the fund so much that the federal treasury had to make extraordinary grants to the fund, further limiting its use for the training originally offered. The BA (Federal Employment Institution) began to focus its paid training under AFG on the unemployed and the problem groups in the labor market, who had, thus far, constituted a small propportion of all trainees. (Hofbauer, 1981; Hofbauer and Dadzio, 1984). The German experience suggests that, unless unemployment rates constantly remain at a very low level, an unlikely situation, a country cannot use unemployment insurance reserves to any great extent for training, especially of persons not receiving unemployment benefits, without impairing the financial soundness of the Fund. However, the German experience does support the idea of using unemployment insurance reserves to sponsor training of some persons who otherwise passively draw unemployment benefits, since the net additional costs are not great.

2. Targeting on Special Problems and Groups

Either through separate legislation or sections of legislation dealing more generally with adult education and training, or administrative programs, many Western European countries have conducted targeted efforts to assist the following groups of educationally disadvantaged adults:

-- Illiterates in the country's language.

-- Low educational attainers.

-- Physically, mentally, and socially handicapped.

-- Females in and out of the labor force.

In addition, Western European countries have long-established education and training programs for the unemployed as a whole. A newer concern has been the provision of training and education to employed persons in imminent danger of becoming unemployed.

Wage subsidies to employers to encourage the hiring and training of disadvantaged groups, especially the physically or mentally handicapped, have long been a part of the labor market policy of Belgium, the Netherlands, F.R. Germany, and the Scandinavian countries. On the whole, these countries do not ask employers to provide basic or remedial education, if that is required, but rather offer public programs for this purpose.

Sweden has been notable in using a variety of methods to increase participation of the disadvantaged groups, among them a committee on experimental adult education activities, funded research and development studies, surveys among participants and

non-participants, and the establishment of experimental education areas to encourage pilot projects on local and regional issues. (Sweden, 1977). Subsidized outreach programs are conducted at workplaces and in residential areas to attract the disadvantaged groups to adult eucation, and additional subsidies are available to some programs that aid these groups. The national government funds such projects, supplemented by part of a payroll tax on employers and municipal contributions; the funds are distributed by special regional adult education councils. (Swedish Institute, 1982, p. 1; Sundqvist, 1982). Denmark also has been conducting experiments in recruitment strategies in order to reach new target groups. (Vocational Training, Sept. 1982, p. 30).

Sweden has also utiilized its labor market training program to obtain redistributive effects in employment patterns. Labor market training for shortage or bottleneck occupations has been given to the less educated, thus promoting upward mobility. Women were a majority in training until the contraction of demand for the traditional female occupations. The handicapped constituted one-third and foreign citizens 24 percent of total trainees in 1982. The KAFU (special committee on training) recommended further efforts on the redistributive goals of labor market training. (KAFU, 1983). Programs of various countries to aid the special groups are described below, with particular attention to those that are comprehensive or innovative.

Illiteracy and Low Educational Attainment

Within the member countries of the European Community, illiteracy and functional illiteracy have been identified as problems not only of the immigrant population, but also of natives. (CEDEFOP News no. 4, 1982, p. 2). In 1984, the EC Commission estimated conservatively that 4 to 6 percent of the population was unable to read, write, or comprehend at the level expected of a 13-year-old. The proportions are considerably higher in Italy, Greece, Spain, and Portugal. The EC is implementing pilot projects to deal with the problem, and is stimulating member countries to take additional action on this issue.

In Sweden, a major effort has been directed toward immigrants. Free courses in Swedish language and orientation to Swedish society have been offered by the educational associations, and language courses are offered in labor market training centers. In 1973, prior to any action for workers as a whole, paid educational leave was legislated for immigrant workers. Initially consisting of 240 hours to study the Swedish language during the work day, employers now must permit 400 to 600 hours of language study. The government pays for the hours away from work at the same rate as for basic vocational training. Also, unemployed or nonemployed immigrants receive a substantial hourly payment from the government if they study Swedish; child care is

provided so that homemakers can participate. (CEDEFOP News, no. 3, 1982, p. 4).

In Italy, a program was launched in 1974 under collective bargaining in the metal industry. It has spread to other industries and now involves all three trade union federations and a large number of workers. Called "150 hours," the program has emphasized leave paid by the employer for eligible workers who take remedial courses at lower secondary level leading to a diploma. A high proportion of participants has achieved diplomas. (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, pp. 172-184; Vocational Training, Sept. 1982, p. 17).

The Netherlands in 1981 doubled the number of places in the public vocational training centers for adults, giving priority to adults with a low level of education and the unemployed. Centers for vocational orientation and vocational practice operated for unemployed foreigners subsequently were opened to all. Pilot projects have been operated in the education of cultural minorities. (CEDEFOP News, no. 1, 1981, p. 2).

In Belgium, 60 percent of those on unemployment benefits were found to be educationally at or below primary school level. Various governmental and semi-governmental institutions have developed special training programs that are not narrowly occupational. Some opposition arose from employers and trade unions to the use of vocational training funds for this purpose. (CEDEFOP News, no. 2, 1982, p. 1).

Since 1977, Swedish municipalities have been required to provide basic education for adult Swedes and immigrants whose achievement in basic skills is below the average for sixth grade Swedish pupils. (Sweden, 1983, p. 3). Participants are instructed individually or in small groups and are paid an hourly fee. In 1981, 37 percent of the 10,000 participants were Swedes. Sweden has also made it easier to organize study circles for older people who had only six or seven years of primary education by granting extra subsidies for such courses and reducing the number of enrollees required for subsidy to a study circle in order to promote education in rural areas where attainment levels tend to be lowest and the population is disproportionately older.

Despite these measures, an official Swedish review reveals disappointing results.

> Small municipalities and sparsely populated areas have a much smaller proportion of adult students than cities and towns...Only one sixth of those with less than nine years of primary schooling take part in adult studies, while nearly half of those with higher education do so...The forms both for educational distribution and for outreach activity must be developed through research and experimentation. (Swedish

Institute, 1982, pp. 3-4).

Handicapped

The newest trend is to try to integrate handicapped adults into regular adult education, while providing for their special needs. (Sweden, 1984b, pp. 5-11). Germany's extensive network of rehabilitation centers and special provision for on-the-job training of handicapped persons in firms produce very high rates of completion and success in the regular vocational examinations that are essential to good job opportunities. Because the handicapped seek only a few of the many available training courses, there is a wait of almost a year for the most popular occupations. (CEC, 1983, pp. 38-43, 82-84; CEDEFOP News, no. 4, 1982, p. 4).

In Sweden special efforts have been made to open up the regular schools and various forms of adult education to the handicapped. Educational broadcasts, labor market training, and trade union courses are designed with the needs of the handicapped in mind. (Swedish Institute, 1982, p. 4).

Women

Inadequacy in the availability of training, overall and by type, and low rates of voluntary participation by women in technical and vocational training are widely noted. (BMBW, 1980, pp. 12-15; ILO, 1979, pp. 43, 162; NUA, 1979, p. 352 CEDEFOP News, no. 4, 1982, p. 4). These are far more marked than are six differences in levels of academic attainment, although concern is felt about the more limited range of academic courses chosen by females at upper secondary and tertiary level.

The European Community, in its program for equal opportunities for women, has placed great stress on improving vocational training opportunities and participation, especially for females in part-time work, rural areas, family businesses, and the services sector. (CEC, 1983, pp. 22-29; 75-77; CEDEFOP News, no. 1, 1981). The European Social Fund, an arm of the EC which distributes money to member countries that initiate programs sponsored by the EC, has offered aid on this issue. Member countries have responded and have also been attentive to the needs of women entering or reentering the labor force after some time at home. Training for nontraditional occupations also has become a prominent issue, but in Sweden it is addressed equally for each sex.

The provision of publicly sponsored technical and vocational training courses for women is not as difficult as securing more training opportunities for women within the enterprise. Information and counseling services also lag in some countries and everywhere confront resistance from females, their relatives,

teachers, employers, and the community, if nontraditional occupations are proposed.

Unemployed

In most of the Western European countries, training and other "active" labor market measures are favored over "passive" payments to the unemployed, although only Sweden countinues to spend less on the passive than the active measures during periods of economic downturn. Basic training, upgrading, and retraining are very popular expedients for the unemployed and, in some countries, for the employed in danger of becoming unemployed. Although the concept of displaced worker is not recognized officially, this type of worker has increased in importance; special training measures, as well as the ordinary public training programs have been used for them.

Most Western European countries have a permanent system of public training centers, nationally financed and operated. These form the core of the public training effort on behalf of the unemployed or non-employed, and they serve the entire population, not just disadvantaged groups. Public training courses may also take place at educational institutions and training may be purchased from private or public enterprises.

Increasingly, public training programs have offered a wide range of courses to prepare workers for occupational skill training. Preparatory courses include introductions to working life, sampling of occupations, special adjustment courses for those with handicaps, basic or remedial education, and advanced education in such subjects as math or science for those upgrading an existing skill.

In establishing the menu of occupational skill courses to be offered, countries vary in the balance between the perceived needs of the employment market and the characteristics and capacities of the trainees. Attempts to shape training to the demands of the labor market are successful in accord with the strength of the labor market agencies and the accuracy of labor market information. Sweden has been more labor market oriented than other countries, and requires employers to notify all job vacancies to the employment service, though firms are not obliged to hire the candidates sent them.

Recently, high levels of unemployment and stagnant or declining total employment in Europe have reduced post-training placement rates. Pressures to review the functioning of public training programs have arisen also from budgetary constraints and a drive for cost-effective and efficient operations. In Britain, where the public image of training centers has been tarnished by the increased difficulty in placing trainees, it was decided that

the 87 government training centers and annexes, called Skillcentres, should change their mode of operation and sell their services at full cost. From 1986-87, the centers, under the new Skillcentre Training Agency within the Manpower Services Commission, will try to cover full costs of the training centers by charging employers who send workers or trainees, whether employed or unemployed. It is hoped that firms will be attracted because the training courses will provide the skills desired by firms and required in growth occupations, industries, and areas. A government loan scheme probably will be introduced to assist trainees with their training fees, when employers do not pay. At the same time, MSC will continue to pay for and has set aside an enlarged number of places to offer basic level training for those unemployed who need it. Surplus classes and staff of the centers will be cut and centers may be combined or closed. (Employment News, February 1984; CEDEFOP News, no. 5, 1983, p. 2; MSC, 1983).

While France has not followed Britain's pattern, considerable reexamination and reshaping of public training centers is occurring. (France, 1983; INFFO, 1984). A special committee in Sweden, assessing the division of responsibilities for labor market training between the AMS (National Labor Market Board) and the SO (National Education Board), recommend that AMS and is subdivisions, the regional labor market boards, should be given both the planning and operational responsibilities. (KAFU, 1983, pp. 22-28). In acting on this recommendation, the government went even further and devised a new and separate labor market training organization which would market its training services to the regional labor market boards and to other users, including private companies. For their part, the regional labor market boards would be free to purchase training from other sources, thus fostering competition and cost-effectiveness. (Sweden, 1984a, p. 3).

Preventing Unemployment

A laudable goal of adult education/training is to reduce the need for crisis interventions by enhancing the education, employability, and potential mobility of the work force during employment. The hope is that unemployment can be avoided or minimized. If retraining is needed, it should be briefer because of the better base on which it is built. The German Labor Promotion Law of 1969 (AFG) and the French law of 1971 (the Organization of Vocational Training within the Framework of Lifelong Education), both initiated in a period of economic growth and full or overfull employment, specifically aimed to give participants precisely the strengths that would enable them to withstand an economic downturn. (Sengenberger and Lutz, 1974; von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, p. 57).

However, some important elements were omitted from these programs. The training courses were not established on the basis

of sound labor market information or occupational forecasts. Individuals were not selected for training because of vulnerability to displacement. Nor were the programs large enough, given the employment crises that emerged in the mid-1970s. It is not known whether the participants in the programs became more resistant to unemployment as a result of their training, but we do know that those chosen or volunteering for these programs were already less vulnerable to loss of jobs than the whole work force and particularly than unskilled workers.

Similarly, the situation in Belgium, France, and Italy was investigated to determine whether these countries had instituted programs to alternate periods of work with periods of training and education, as proposed by the European Community for adoption by its member countries in order to establish a preventive measure against unemployment. The findings were that present programs of continuing education in the three countries fail to exert a preventive influence; prospects for future progress seem most favorable in France. (Berton, 1983; INFFO, 1984, pp. 5-6).

A variant on the preventive approach has been used in Sweden since 1963 when public "bottleneck training" for occupations with serious labor shortages was introduced. Here, the needs of the economy take precedence over those of individuals. Yet the two are mutually supportive, since those receiving bottleneck training may be vulnerable in their present occupations. Because "bottleneck training" may also be used to meet the internal needs of firms, the recent report of the committee on labor market training and in-firm training suggested some guidelines to prevent abuse. (KAFU, 1983, pp. 6-8).

Thus far, no country has developed such a successful preventive strategy as to demonstrate that crisis interventions and total expenditures on adult education and training need not increase in periods of high unemployment. However, recent discussions at CEDEFOP, the training organization of the European Community, noted the difficulty in establishing a counter-cyclical expenditure pattern for adult education and training.

> The economic and structural conditions prevailing on the labour market require an anti-cyclical approach in developing continuing education and training opportunities. The reality is, however, that public resources, unemployment insurance funds and other agencies which could contribute mor towards financing continuing education and training measures, are opting not to, because of the difficult economic situation, a higher rate of unemployment, and/or other priorities. The private sector, too, is tending to cut down on the wide choice of skills readily available among jobseekers. (CEDEFOP, 1984, a, 1, p. 3).

A report from the Scandinavian countries notes that "training

costs are among the first things to be cut (by companies) when the national economy begins slipping into recession." (NU A 1979, p. 357).

Whether the failure of existing preventive programs or the unexpectedly severe and long-lasting recession are responsible, the fact is that Europeans no longer believe that individuals can be fully armed in advance against changes in the employment market. (CEDEFOP, 1984, a, 2). Crisis interventions are required even if people have had a good training and education before becoming unemployed. Given the more optimistic outlook in the U.S. on employment growth, it is possible to take a more positive view of the potential of education and training during employment to reduce the need for assistance during unemployment. However, European experience suggests caution because such a policy is difficult to execute on a sufficient scale, with the right preparation for each individual, and with adequate foresight about future employment developments.

While prevention as defined earlier has not been realized, many Western European countries have intervened with programs to prevent unemployment among employed workers in imminent danger of losing their jobs, that is, to avoid having displaced workers. In the early 1970s, the German Minister of Labor offered inducements to employers who provided training to workers rather than fire them. An analyst powerfully stated the benefits to workers of such a policy:

> Workers stay in their old environment, where they are familiar with colleagues and working conditions in general. Social insulation, the feeling of social degradation, and the trauma of being refused by society--experiences caused by unemployment--can be escaped by the participation in adult education. Whereas the unemployed are hit by severe insecurity and tensions when they cannot use occupational work as the structural basis of everyday life, students in adult education can enjoy a situation very similar to their normal environment at the working place (Lenhardt, 1978, p. 461).

The advantages of this approach are thoroughly recognized in West Germany. Protection is given by statute against mass dismissals without long advance warning. The "social plans" drawn up by trade unions and industries have elaborate provisions for alternatives to layoff, retraining while employed, etc. (Lindner, 1982, pp. 17-18). The preventive actions of the federal, state, and local governments under general programs and in particular situations lead to efforts to maintain employment as long as possible, sometimes beyond the point of economic rationale. But they do protect workers from abrupt lay-off and ease their entrance to unemployment, if that is the outcome.

In France, workers covered by the collective bargaining agreements of 1969 and 1970 are entitled to preventive training from the time they receive information or official notice that there will be a group dismissal. Workers covered only by the law of 1971 are less protected because the law did not make specific provision or dismissed workers, but included them as part of the whole work force entitled to leave for training. Government programs offer paid training both to employees threatened with group dismissal and those whose work contracts have been terminated. (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, pp. 48-55, 69; Luttringer, 1973). Another approach in France is the training or adjustment agreement that the National Employment Fund (FNE) signs with enterprises engaged in restructuring or diversifying their activities or modifying the job structure because of technical changes. Covering only a few thousand workers, such agreements provide financing for the in-firm retraining of workers facing layoff. Training and retraining in specialized centers is covered by agreements with the Ministry of Labor, which pays some operating costs of the training courses and reimburses employers for up to 70 percent of the wages paid during training.(ADEP, 1982, pp. 16-17).

Sweden has extensive activities to prevent unemployment under both the comprehensive labor market policy and the industrial policy. A general preventive measure enables employed persons in danger of becoming unemployed to be given labor market training. The severe recession of the late 1970s led to heavy use of a "first line of defense against unemployment within the companies, by means of various subsidies to employers to keep people in their jobs until economic conditions improved." (Swedish Institute, 1983, p. 1). Companies are granted an hourly wage subsidy for each worker given up to 480 hours of occupational training in the company or up to 160 hours of general education; training lasting longer than this is compensated at a reduced hourly subsidy. At the high point in 1977, the potentially redundant constituted almost one-fifth of all persons receiving labor market training. (Johannesson, 1983, Table B2). A recommendation of an official committee likely to be enacted is that the government should pay employers for 65 percent of their total training costs, including the maintenance of the full wage for workers trained in the firm for labor market reasons. (KAFU, 1983, p. 35).

Estimates have not been made of the extent to which the measures described above actually preserve jobs, as against merely delaying the entrance into unemployment, where, however, the individual may be better prepared for a new job as a result of the training received in the firm.

3. Information, Counseling, and Supervision of Standards

A consensus exists that information and counseling on adult education and training opportunities need to be improved, especially among target groups (Council of Europe, 1982, pp. 101-102). Polls among the general population commonly reveal a perception that information has been inadequate and the existence of a passive approach toward obtaining it. (CEDEFOP, no. 6, 1983; France 1976). Little knowledge of our recourse to the counseling services is shown. The multiplicity of organizations, courses, and financial providers, each with its distinct information and counseling services, complicates matters for potential users. (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, pp. 242-245). While several admirable national efforts to catalog all available or particular types of adult education and training exist, it appears that they mainly meet the needs of administrators or highly educated potential participants. (Luttringer and Pasquier, 1980, p. 418).

Too much reliance is placed on the general media. More effective are efforts at local level to provide comprehensive information on all opportunities available nearby. Financed by the Manpower Services Commission, the British Open University has hired 100 community development officers who promote the use of Open University Community Education materials among the educationally disadvantaged. A short course called "Work Choices" is among the materials being disseminated. Other projects involve feasibility of computerized information and advisory services on the opportunities for adult education and training in specific regions. (Employment News, July 1984, pp. 3-4).

When local information sources are supplemented by information and counseling provided through peer groups, such as trade unions or work councils in the workplace, or by neighborhood groups, the effectiveness appears to be increased. (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, pp. 226-230, 242-245; Viklund, 1977, p. 3). Sweden's educational leave legislation provides for "study organizers," elected at the workplace and trained with a government subsidy to provide relevant information during working hours, especially to the most disadvantaged workers. The regional multipartite adult education committees also disseminate information and liaise with the study organizers. Brief, undemanding courses for Swedish adult workers who fear schools or training courses because of failures in youth also serve as a valuable type of information. (Luttringer and Pasquier, 1980, pp. 417-418).

Outreach information and counseling also seems productive for rural areas, disadvantaged groups, and isolated groups and persons. While enlarged and improved counseling services are undoubtedly desirable, it should be noted that those countries which have devoted thought to their form and have invested

heavily in such services are not satisfied that they have discovered the methods to improve the response rate among the segments of the adult population with a low participation rate in adult education and training.

A related area of adult education and training in which official action is required is the supervision of the content and quality of courses offered by commercial institutions. This is an area poorly supervised in the United States. In West Germany where a half million persons a year take correspondence courses offered by about 200 commercial or non-profit institutes, a strict inspection and registration law is in effect. Only approved and registered institutes may operate. Since the students can recover part of their fees to approved courses under the Labor Promotion Law (AFG), unapproved institutions will not prosper, even if they chance their illigal status. (BW, no.-11/12, 1981, p. 185).

An Office for Distance Learning (ZFU) was established in Cologne in 1969, following an agreement among the German states, which have responsibility for education. The Office, including a representative of each state that signed the agreement, has the task of determining whether the methods of the correspondence courses are educationally sound, have suitable content from an educational and vocational point of view, prepare properly for the examinations as they claim, and whether the contracts offered students are adequate in protecting student rights, especially as to termination. The Office also collects and disseminates complete information on available correspondence courses to prospective students, and formulates policy for the states. (BW, no. 1, 1970, p. 22; CEDEFOP News, no. 2, 1982, p. 3).

4. Staffing, Training, Learning Methods, and Accreditation

It is generally agreed that the teaching of adults should be distinguished from that of youth; if there is a science of pedagogy, there should also be one called andragogy. (von Moltke and Schneevoigt, 1977, pp. 220-221). Teachers of adults may or should differ from teachers in the regular educational system in background, qualifications, training, and expectations. Differences in adults' learning pace and study habits should be considered in devising courses and choosing teachers. The teacher training college of Stockholm University has long offered a special course for those preparing to teach adults at the secondary school level. (Johansson, 1973, p. 16).

In France, two universities introduced a new diploma course in 1981 on in-firm training for students with some experience in training adults in the firm or in institutions. Among the subjects is the methodology of adult education. (CEDEFOP News, no. 2, 1982, p. 2). A British review finds that the "major trends are those of increase in the amount of 'training of the

trainers' and staff development undertaken, particularly within the industrial context, and in the content of that training...." (Evans and Bennett, 1983, pp. 10-11).

Learning methods that place great emphasis on student participation, peer and self-assessment, self-starting, individualization of study, negotiated curricula, and even learning without teachers attract considerable attention. (CEDEFOP, 1984b; Sweden, 1977; Council of Europe, 1982, pp. 155-162). New teaching methods in the firm that overcome negative attitudes toward training, and especially training to use new equipment, have been described in France as a success story in upgrading. (ADEP, 1982, pp. 18-22).

Considerable attention has been given recently to methods of granting credit toward diplomas or degrees for education and training courses that may not have the traditional length, content, or location. In the German state of North-Rhine-Westphalia, a unit/credit system has been developed through a network of People's Universities (Volkshochschulen) that serve areas with 40,000 population. In France, various different institutions are grouped (workplace, training center, correspondence course, etc.) in awards of credit for common core units applicable to several types of training. (Council of Europe, 1982, pp. 105-106; ADEP, 1982). Sweden adds training in labor market centers (AMU) to years of regular education in calculating an individual's educational attainment and in compiling national education statistics. Admitting the advantages of the unit/credit system, Scheffknecht writes of dangers also: fragmented knowledge, bewilderment at the complexity of the system, excessive rigidity under the guise of flexibility, isolation of the individual, and perpetuation of the division of knowledge. (Council of Europe, 1982, p. 106).

5. Breaking Down Institutional Rigidities and Divisions of Authority

One of the most troublesome barriers to the expansion of adult education and training is the lack of cooperation and coordination between the governmental bodies that supervise education and those that are in charge of training. The struggle for effective coordination between the two types of agencies is made more complex if training is a national responsibility and educational policy is largely made by local authorities.

In Great Britain, the colleges of further education, operated and funded by local authorities, are an important source of adult general and vocational education. They have not been very open to suggested changes in curriculum and teaching methods from the Manpower Services Commission (MSC), which has been decentralizing its operations to meet local needs. The government, favoring the MSC initiatives for adult training, decided

that the MSC should have greater influence over the content of further education by increasing its share of the total expenditures on work-related non-advanced further education. The resulting reduced expenditure by local authorities would reduce national goverment financial support to local authorities. (Employment News, Feb. 1984).

More common is the creation of coordinating bodies to bring the education and training bureaucracies together. Reasonably effective coordination of the education and training policy-making bodies has been achieved in Sweden by having members of the National Labor Market Board sit on the School Board and vice versa. It is understood that the concerns of each body are a valid part of the decision-making process of the other. Nevertheless, even close working relations do not eliminate the problems of divided or overlapping authority. (Sweden, 1984a, pp. 2-3; KAFU, 1983).

Sharing of facilities, while retaining a division of authority, is another method of combatting institutional rigidities that also fosters full utilization of buildings, equipment, and, possibly, staff, as in Swedish Municipal Adult Education, mandated by national legislation in 1967. It is expected that facilities of regular schools will be fully utilized, including placing adults in regular youth classes. Suitable and full use of existing buildings and equipment is expected during nights, weekends, and holidays. However, if an adult education school is large enough, national government subsidies will cover the entire cost of employing a separate administrative, support, and teaching staff to provide courses as well as information and outreach services. (Swedish Institute, 1978, 1982; Johansson, 1973, pp. 15-16).

Pioneering efforts in individual cases also can set examples for others to follow, as in Nelson and Colne College, Lancashire, England. This post-compulsory institution offers a comprehensive program of educational and training activities designed to enrich the quality of life of the community and its adult residents. Among its functions are:

--to provide full-time and part-time courses for those over 16. These courses, educational, vocational, or leisure-time in orientation, may, in some cases, lead to diplomas or certificates.

--to offer formal classes in leisure time activities in old people's homes, clubs, churches, etc.

--to generate and promote sporting events, concerts, performances, craft fairs, festivals, etc.

--to meet the training needs of business, industry, etc.

--to act, in cooperation with other bodies, as the agent for the community in such matters of concern as meetings on highway plans, formation of neighborhood councils, and other causes of activist groups.

--to make special arrangements to meet the needs of disadvantaged members of the community, e.g., a talking newspaper for the blind.

A recent activity of the College was to design a Drop-in Skills Center (DISC), in cooperation with the Manpower Services Commission which pays all expenses from its experimental fund. This new type of assessment center is open to both employed and unemployed persons who wish to gain advice and help on self-presentation and job-finding, improve basic skills, or sample new skills such as computing, bricklaying, industrial sewing, home electrics, plumbing, etc. The center, sponsored by the Lancashire County Council, is used by the unemployed during the day and the employed at night. (Employment Gazette, March 1984, p. 93).

6. Financing Adult Education and Training

Throughout the preceding pages reference has been made to the methods of financing specific aspects of adult education and training in Western European ciountries. In summarizing this subject, a division is made between the sources of funds for the education and training institutions serving adults and the financial support offered to adult students or trainees. The following points are relevant:

--Adults are able to obtain education and training in a large variety of publicly funded institutions which have no or very small tuition or other fees. This is in keeping with the free or low tuition policy in public post-secondary education which serves a much larger share of all students than in the United States.

--In several countries, non-public adult education or training programs are sustained by institutional grants and categorical subsidies from national and/or state and local governments. Where there are no public training centers, as in F.R. Germany, the federal government makes categorical and institutional grants to not-for-profit or private centers that meet government standards. Other levels of government also contribute.

--National governments bear usually out of general revenues, an overwhelming share of the total costs of adult education

and training. Other levels of government contribute in varying degree, according to the country's form of governmental organization (federal or not) and according to the composition of the adult education and training programs. Employers in some countries contribute to the support of public institutions and programs through payroll taxes, but their main contribution is through their expenditures on training their own employees or, to a lesser extent, groups designated by government.

--In some countries and under certain conditions, a national government may subsidize private firms for training their own employees, if an overriding social interest or employment objective is present.

--Payments to adults who participate in education and training are common in Western European countries. For leisure time study, incentive payments, or payments to cover out-of-pocket course costs come entirely from government, chiefly at the national level, unless education is a state responsibility.

--Payments are far more substantial to those undertaking full-time education or training. Replacement of foregone earnings under paid educational leave legislation falls chiefly on the employer, but may, as in France, be shared by government. Under collective bargaining agreements, workers' contributions may partially finance paid leave.

--All who enter public training centers or other publicly sponsored training receive allowances that are at least as large as the unemployment benefit and often larger.

--Adults of any age pursuing part or full-time education often are eligible for the same extensive system of allowances, grants, and loans that younger students are given. Some countries have special grants to aid adults whose family expenses exceed those of the ordinary student.

--Those taking correspondence and other private sector education usually will pay the fees and charges themselves, but, in some countries, they may receive partial or full reimbursement, if certain conditions are met by the course.

7. Increasing the Training Offered by Employers

It usually is assumed that firm-organized training is almost entirely firm-specific, and, as such, leaves a gap to be filled by more general training in order to make workers occupationally mobile. A survey in Finland and Sweden of employee opinion on the transferability of the training they had received from their companies is, therefore, of considerable interest, the more so as

such surveys are rare. In Finland, from 36 to 73 percent said their in-firm training could be used in similar jobs with other companies, varying with the occupational category of the trainee, while 8 to 29 percent said the training applied only to their present job. In Sweden, half thought the training transferable and a third considered it firm specific. (NU A 1979, pp. 353-354). Public policies to increase training by employers may, therefore, be regarded, in part, as a supplement to public policies to provide transferable skills.

Interesting financial devices have been introduced by Great Britain and France to:

--increase the total amount of vocational training offered by employers to their own employees.

--improve its quality.

--influence its type and direction.

--establish the division of financial and program responsibility between the public authorities and employers.

The situation that produced action in Great Britain was an inadequate amount and quality of employer training for apprentices, adult semi-skilled and skilled workers, and technical personnel. The perception was widespread that employers who did not train benefitted by pirating workers from those who did. Therefore, the issue was to obtain a fairer distribution of costs and benefits. A law of 1964 required firms to form Industry Training Boards (ITB), which were authorized to levy a training tax on all covered firms, either as a percent of payroll or a flat amount per employee. Firms that offered training according to Board standards received grants from the ITB. The ITBs also used levies to improve the quality of training, establishing off-the-job training centers, etc. Although the Act creating the Manpower Services Commission in 1973 modified the system and introduced some government funding and supervision, the elements of the system remained until 1983 when most of the ITBs were dissolved by the Thatcher government. Improvement of training and levy-grants were left to voluntary action by industries.

In evaluations, the potential of levy-grant for sharing training costs among employers was rated high, but the actual effects on the volume of training were called disappointing. The observed improvements in quality were associated with active efforts by conscientious ITBs and probably could not be realized through a levy-grant system alone. After the MSC entered the scene, the division of financial and program responsibility became an issue and probably contributed to the dissolution of ITBs. (ILO, 1979, pp. 101-110, 197, 204, 209, 210, 217). Although not widely adopted, the British model of a levy-grant

for training has been discussed in many European and non-European countries. (ILO, 1979, pp. 91, 93).

In 1971, France introduced an incentive to employers to train by requiring that covered firms with 10 or more employees which failed to spend a stipulated percentage of payroll on training would have to pay to the Treasury the difference between actual expenditure and the required amount as a special tax. The law has had its intended effect of causing most employers to make expenditures on training, rather than to make payments to the Treasury. In 1982, the 117,000 covered firms spent 70 times as much on training as they paid to the Treasury. (France, 1983, p. 52). Thus, a major effort to collect and redistribute funds is not required, as in the levy-grant system. Instead, the corps of French tax inspectors must examine the books of firms to ascertain that deducted expenditures have actually occurred and are for approved purposes.

The principles of the French training tax have attracted favorable interest outside of France. (KAFU, 1983, pp. 31-33; Bishop, 1983). While the quantity of training appears to have increased as a result of the 1971 law, the level of the payroll tax, set at only 1.1 percent, and its uniformity have served as an incentive only for small firms and certain industries whose current expenditures fall at or below the legal amount. In 1982, the average firm spent 1.96 percent of payroll on training and only firms with 10-19 or 20-49 employees were, on average, below or at 1.1 percent level. Similarly, all but three industry groups were above the prescribed rate. (France, 1983, p. 55-57). Even if the overall rate moves to 2.0 percent of payroll, as intended, many firms will have no incentive to increase training, since their expenditures will already greatly exceed the required amount.

Both internal and external observers suggest possible improvements in the French model. A revised level of required expenditure has been proposed, with possible variations by size of firm, industry group, and region. (France, 1982, pp. 37-38). The Swedish report suggests a differentiation of the tax according to the training achievement within a specified plan, in order to have companies, municipalities, and county councils conduct training that would further the goals of labor market policy. (KAFU, 1983, pp. 31-33).

The French system has no organized check on the quality of the training delivered within the firm in which over half of all training under this law occurs. (France, 1983, p. 55). Indeed, much that is known about the system results from the data collected by the tax inspectors as they perform their financial duties and make reports locally and regionally. Until the 1984 legislation reaffirmed and strengthened the role of Works Councils, these representatives of employees were unable to have

much influence on the quality or type of training offered. It remains to be seen whether this will change.

The French system does not permit much influence on the specific type and direction of employer training except by changes in the law or new financial regulations. Both have occurred repeatedly in order to obtain training by firms of the unemployed, youth, or women, or to ensure that applicants for educational leave for individuals received attention. Nevertheless, the 1979-1982 record indicates that almost 80 percent of all trainees were employees given training to improve their job performance. (France, 1983, p. 55). Similarly, little change appeared from 1972 to 1982 in the distribution of trainees or hours of training by occupational level, except that the share of skilled workers rose as that of the other three groups dropped slightly. (France, 1983, p. 54; France, 1982, pp. 50-51). It appears that social objectives are not easily implemented.

Finally, Bishop (1983, pp. 17-18) raises two objections to the French system's principles. A firm that is below the required level of expenditure on training and is increasing its training outlays in order not to pay the tax has no incentive to watch over training costs. This may partially explain the observed sharp rise in the costs of training per capita. (France, 1982, pp. 39-40; France, 1983, p. 52). Another effect is to favor formal training over informal and thus to injure small firms. Bishop (1983, pp. 19-25) offers two alternative plans for American policy makers, based on modifications of the basic design of the French plan.

The division of financial and program responsibility between government and the private sector continues to change in many countries as experience reveals new needs and faults. Proposing an approach to the division of responsibility, the Swedish Committee on labor market training recommends a very large role for the public sector, but introduces elements of competition within the public sector that were previously lacking, as well as principles by which public responsibility can be demarcated from private. (KAFU, 1983).

Conclusion

Some of the differences between the United States and the Western European countries outlined in the Introduction to this paper may explain the paucity of American public policy on adult education and training. On the reasonable assumption that the measures adopted in Western European countries to promote and finance adult education and training have served to increase the types and number of opportunities and the number of participants, a major conclusion from this review would be that the U.S. could achieve larger participation by replicating those European methods that seemed most useful.

There is overwhelming evidence for a great many countries that those who already have the most education and training in youth are most likely to enroll in or be selected for most types of adult education and training. This situation poses the most challenging dilemma to all countries in which there is a desire to expand and improve adult education and training. Much can be learned in the United States from the measures adopted by the Western European countries to expand access in total and to particular groups.

At the same time, the European experience suggests the possibility that the United States presently has distinct advantages over the Western European countries in recruitment to adult education and training. Because Americans have a higher average number of years of education in youth, a greater familiarity with post secondary education, and wider opportunities for occupational, industrial, and geographical mobility based on additional education and training, the amount of adult education and training in the United States compares favorably with that in most of the Western European countries, although the direct provision and subsidy level is far lower in the United States. It is at least a hypothesis that additional years of education in youth are a good base for lifelong or recurrent education, even if the current division of educational-training resources between youth and adults may seem to favor "front-loading." The answer is not to cut back on the resources for youth education and training, but rather to add to those allocated to adults.

European experience also can be helpful regarding the training sponsored by employers. It suggests that employers in Western European countries take less responsibility for providing and financing remedial and basic general education than in the United States. But it also appears that some Western European governments exercise more influence on the quantity and quality of training offered by employers than is the base in the United States. Both situations offer leads to policymakers.

Finally, the Western European experience indicates that even so well planned and extended a system of adult education and training as is found in Sweden cannot ensure that crisis interventions will not be required. The lesson seems rather that a permanent, adaptable, and well-financed system for dealing with the education and training needs of the unemployed and the potentially unemployed is the best way to deal with inevitable crises due to changes in the levels and requirements of employment.

REFERENCES

ADEP. Innovations in Continuing Education. Berlin, F.R. Germany: CEDEFOP, 1982.

Berton, Fabienne. Reintegration of Adults into the Continuing Vocational Training System as a Means of Preventing Unemployment. Berlin, F.R. Germany: CEDEFOP, 1983.

Bishop, John, Subsidizing Training to Reduce Structural Unemployment. A Statement before the Joint Economic Committee, United States Congress. Washington, D.C., October 26, 1983.

BMBW (Federal Minister of Education and Science). Weiterbildung Chance fur Arbetnehmer, (Further Education Opportunities for Workers), Bonn, F.R. Germany, 1975.

BMBW (Federal Minister of Education and Science). Situation of Women in Technical and Vocational Education. Werkstattberichte 25. Bonn, F.R. Germany, 1980.

BW (Bildung and Wissenschaft). Inter Nationes New Service. Bonn, F.R. Germany, monthly.

CEC (Commission of the European Communities). Educational Leave in Member States. Social Policy Series, no. 26. Brussels, Belgium, 1976.

CEC (Commission of the European Communities). Social Europe, Special Issue 1983. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 1983.

CEDEFOP (European Center for the Development of Vocational Training). Conference on Continuing Education and Training and the Labor Market. Berlin, West Germany, 7-9 March 1984a, mimeo.

1. General Discussion Paper
2. Discussion Paper for Group 1 by Rainer Brodel
3. Paper for Working Group 1 by Fabienne Berton
4. Study Group no. 1: Report
5. Paper for Group 2 by C. J. Snyders
6. Discussion Paper for Group 2 by Gunther Degen and Ekkehard Nuissl
7. Study Group no. 2: Report
8. Paper for Croup 3 by Hilary Steedman
9. Position paper by Federal Ministry of Education and Science, Bonn, West Germany
10. Synthesis Report by Adelheid Hege
11. Position paper United Kingdom
12. Paper by Clive Norris, Commission of the European

Communities
13. Study Group no. 3: Report

CEDEFOP (European Center for the Development of Vocational Training). New Perspectives on Continuing Education and Training in the European Community - Seminar Report. Berlin, West Germany: CEDEFOP, 1980.

CEDEFOP (European Center for the Development of Vocational Training). Trends and Innovations in Continuing Education and Training. Berlin, West Germany: CEDEFOP, 1984b.

CEDEFOP News. Berline, F.R. Germany: periodic newsletter.

Charnley, A. Paid Educational Leave. St. Albans, England: Hart-Davis Educational, 1975.

Council of Europe. Development of Adult Education. Strasbourg, France: Council for Cultural Co-operation, 1980.

Council of Europe. A Contribution to the Development of a New Education Policy. Strasbourg, France: Council for Cultural Co-operation, 1982.

Degen, Gunther and Nuissl, Ekkehard. Educational Leave and the Labor Market in Europe. Berlin, F.R. Germany: CEDEFOP, 1984.

Employment Gazette. Great Britain. Department of Employment. London, England, monthly.

Employment News. Great Britain. Department of Employment. London, England, monthly.

Evans, Karen and Bennett, Ruth. Innovation in Continuing Education and Training in the United Kingdom. Guildford, England: Department of Educational Studies, University of Surrey, 1983.

France. Projet de loi de finances pour 1984. Formation professionnelle (Vocational Training). Annex. Paris, France: National Publication Office, 1983.

France. Rapport de synthese des trois groupes de reflexion sur le reforme de la formation continue. Ministere de la formation professionelle. Paris, France, 1982.

France. Results of a Sample Survey among Employees and Heads of French Enterprises on Continuing Training. Secretary of State for Vocational Training in the Prime Minister's Office. Paris, February 1976.

Hofbauer, Hans. "Untersuchungen des IAB uber die Wirksamkeit der beruflichen Weiterbildung." Mitteilungen aus der Arbeitsmarkt - und Berufsforschung, no. 3, 1981.

Hofbauer, Hans and Dadzio, Werner, "Berufliche Weiterbildung fur Arbeitslose." Mitteilungen aus der Arbeitsmarkt - und Berufsforschung, no. 2, 1984.

ILO (International Labor Office). Ten Years of Training. France, Federal Republic of Germany, United Kingdom. Geneva, Switzerland, 1979.

INFFO. Actualite de la formation permanente. Paris, France. No. 68 and Supplement to no. 68, January-February 1984.

Johannesson, Jan. On the Composition of Swedish Labour Market Policy. Stockholm, Sweden: Department of Labour, EFA, 1983.

Johannsson, Berndt. Government-Subsidized Adult Education in Sweden. The Swedish Institute. Stockholm, Sweden, 1973.

KAFU (Committee on Labour Market Training and In-Plant Training). Education for Working Life. SOU 1983: 22. Stockholm, Sweden, 1983. (Summary in English).

Legave, Catherine and Vignaud, Dominique. Descriptions of Vocational Training Systems. France. Berlin, F.R. Germany: CEDEFOP, 1980.

Lenhardt, Gero. "Problems in Reforming Recurrent Education for Workers." Comparative Education Review, October 1978.

Levine, Herbert A. Strategies for the Application of Foreign Legislation on Paid Educational Leave to the United States Scene. National Institute of Education. Washington, D.C., 1974.

Lindner, Rolf B. Examples of Innovations in Continuing Education and Training in the Federal Republic of Germany. Berlin, F.R. Germany: CEDEFOP, 1982.

LO (Swedish Trade Union Confederation). Trade Union Education in Sweden Today. Stockholm, Sweden, 1979.

LOVUX. (LO Working Party on Adult Education). The Trade Union Movement and Adult Education. Stockholm, Sweden, 1969.

Luttringer, J.M. "Garantie de l'emploi et droit a formation: le stage de prevention." Droit Social, Sept.-Oct. 1973.

Luttringer, Jean-Marie and Pasquier, Bernard. "Paid Educational Leave in Five European Countries." International Labour Review, July-August, 1980.

Marger, Pierre-Louis. Les enjeux de la formation professionnelle face aux mutations industrielles. Paris, France: Ministry of Vocational Training, April, 1984.

Marklund, Sixten and Bergendal, Gunnar. Trends in Swedish Educational Policy. The Swedish Institute: Stockholm, Sweden, 1979.

MSC (Manpower Services Commission). An Adult Training Strategy. Sheffield, England, 1983.

National Labour Market Board. Swedish Employment Policy. Annual Report 1982-83. Stockholm, Sweden, 1983.

New Society. London, England, weekly.

NU B 1977:30. Betald Studieledighet i Norden. (Paid Educational Leave in Nordic Countries). Copenhagen, Denmark: Council of Nordic Ministers, Secretariat for Nordic Cultural Cooperation, 1977.

NU A 1979:9. Vuxenutbildning: Arbetslivet. (Adult Training at the Workplace). Copenhagen, Denmark: Council of Nordic Ministers, Secretariat for Nordic Cultural Cooperation, 1979.

Senenberger, Werner and Lutz, Burkhart. Developments Related to the German Labour Promotion Act of 1969. Report prepared for CERI, OECD, Paris, France, 1974.

Smithers, A.G. Sandwich Courses--An Integrated Education? Windsor, England: NFER Publishing Co., 1976.

Sonderdienst. Inter Nationes News Service. Bonn, F.R. Germany, monthly.

Stockfeldt, Torbjorn. Educational Leave of Absence in Sweden. Paper prepared for CERI, OECD, Paris, France, 1976.

Sundqvist, Allan. New Rules for Swedish Study Circles. The National Swedish Federation of Adult Educational Associations. Stockholm, Sweden, 1982.

Sweden. Adult Education on the Threshold of the 1980s.

Stockholm, Sweden: National Swedish Board of Education, August 1977.

Sweden. Everybody is Entitled to Education. Stockholm, Sweden: National Swedish Board of Education, May 1984b.

Sweden. Equal Educational Opportunities. Stockholm, Sweden: National Swedish Board of Education, September 1983.

Sweden. Labour Market Training in Sweden. Stockholm, Sweden: Department of Labor Market, August 1984a.

Swedish Institute. Adult Education in Sweden. Fact Sheets on Sweden. Stockholm, Sweden, 1978, 1982.

Swedish Institute. Swedish Labor Market Policy. Fact Sheets on Sweden. Stockholm, Sweden, 1983.

Viklund, Birger. Rising with One's Class, Not Above It: Adult Education. Swedish Institute. Current Sweden No. 153. Stockholm, Sweden, March 1977.