DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 167 339 RC 011 241

AUTHOR Oliva, Leo E.
TITLE Apaches in Three Dimensions: Anthropology, History and Literature.
PUB DATE 76
NOTE 19p.; Best copy available

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.83 HC-$1.67 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS American History; American Indian Culture; American Indians; *Anthropology; Cross Cultural Studies; Fiction; *History; History Instruction; *Instructional Materials; *Interdisciplinary Approach; *Literature; Novels; Social History; Social Studies; Teaching Methods; Tribes
IDENTIFIERS *American Indian Studies; *Apache (Tribe)

ABSTRACT

As many disciplines as possible should be used in the teaching of Indian Studies. In particular, creative literature adds another dimension to the understanding of Indian culture and the history of Indian-white relations when it is used in conjunction with historical and anthropological material. The serious student should read historical novels because they communicate an understanding of Indians as human beings and an appreciation for Indian culture, and they fill the gap left by the Indians' lack of written language. For example, there are available fine anthropological and historical overviews of Apache life. However, historical novels such as Will Comfort's "Apache", Elliott Arnold's "Blood Brother" and "Camp Grant Massacre", and James Olson's "Ulzana", which have resulted from long research and study and contain much accurate information on Apache culture and history, can serve as excellent supplements to more standard instructional material. In general, the historical novel can provide insight, understanding, and a third dimension to anthropology and history by providing points of reference, giving specific examples, establishing integrity by portraying reality, providing synthesis, serving as a source of motivation, aiding the interpretation of controversial subjects, expanding the audience of Indian history, and stimulating research. (SB)

AP[illegible]ON THREE DIMENSIONS: ANTHROPOLOGY, HISTORY AND LITERATURE

by

Leo E. Oliva

1976

At the recent meeting of the Organization of American Historians in St. Louis, on April 9, 1976, Professor Calvin Martin from Rutgers University delivered a paper titled "Ethnohistory: A Better Way to Write Indian History." In his abstract he declared:

> The writing of American Indian history has oftentimes been undistinguished . . . because most of us are embarrassingly ignorant of the anthropological literature on our Indian subjects. Histories of Indian and white relations would be considerably more satisfactory if they were more informed ethnologically and ethnographically. Cultural anthropology and its subdisciplines . . . have much to offer the historian of the Native American.[1]

Probably few Indian scholars would disagree with his point.

My concern in this paper is not so much with the writing of Indian history as it is with the understanding and teaching of that subject. In both instances, however, there is surely a necessity to utilize as many academic disciplines in Indian studies as can contribute something. Most teachers and students recognize that anthropology provides one dimension and history another. In general anthropologists tend to use deductive methods and give most attention to cultural history while historians tend to use inductive methods and emphasize Indian-white relations. The contention of this paper is that creative literature can provide an invaluable third dimension. When properly used in conjunction with the other two disciplines, literature contributes toward a better understanding of Indian culture, past and present, and the history of Indian-white relations.

The popular images of Indians, regardless of how incorrect the images may be, have been fixed more by fiction, written and audio-visual, than by

the works of anthropologists and historians. Most anthropologists and historians who write about Indians do utilize the works of scholars in the other disciplines, but few of them acknowledge the creative literary works in their bibliographies or suggested readings.[2]

The Apaches were selected to serve as an example in this paper because the paper is being read in Apacheria, the topic is narrow enough to serve satisfactorily, and there are as many good novels about Apaches (and one should add probably more bad ones) than about any other regional Indian group. C. L. Sonnichsen provided an insightful evaluation of much popular fiction about Apaches in his article, "The Ambivalent Apache," in Western American Literature (August 1975).[3] No effort is made here to duplicate that study.

One thing becomes clear in the study of literature about any Indians; novels, just as historical and anthropological studies, are not of equal value. Many are filled with old stereotypes, good and bad, and others create new stereotypes, all of which may distort our understanding of reality instead of contribute toward better understanding. Still, there is a body of historical literature about Indians, including Apaches, that the serious student cannot afford to dismiss simply because it is fiction. Vine Deloria, Jr., declared in Custer Died for Your Sins: An Indian Manifesto that some novels have done the best job of communicating what he called "the intangible sense of reality that pervades the Indian people."[4]

The student of Indians, by supplementing historical and anthropological studies with a select group of fictional writings, may gain that important third dimension. These novels, sometimes breaking away from the stereotypes, communicate an understanding of Indians as human beings who, like all people, have both virtues and vices. Likewise these novels communicate an appreciation for Indian civilizations which, like all civilizations, have complex institutional networks, high ideals to seek and practical realities to frustrate

their attainment, and cultural achievements and rich heritages to instill pride and respect. These novels illustrate the difficulties, frustrations, aberrations, and destruction which resulted when the impact of alien influences forced adjustments for individuals as well as for entire tribal groups. The fiction can help fit ethnic studies into the universal human condition. It should also be noted that the history of American Indians, filled as it is with struggles and tragedies, lends itself well to the major ingredient of all good literature--conflict.

Novels are important to Indian studies because the Indians had no written history. Thus anthropologists and historians, limited by the standards of their disciplines, have been unable to document, except through remnants of the oral tradition which Indians have often been reluctant to divulge, the thoughts and feelings of individual natives. These disciplines have been able to document the physical aspects of Indian culture (such as dwellings, clothing, foods, tools, and weapons), the social and political institutions (such as families, societies, clans, bands, and tribes), cultural highlights (including religion, music, folklore, and ceremonies), and some other things (including languages, migrations, and alliances). But because they have no Indian diaries, journals, or letters, these scholars of early Indians are virtually unable to convey, beyond reluctant and limited speculation, what went on in the minds of individual Indians or the conversations which occurred within families and small groups. Because the empathetic artist can recreate believable and insightful accounts of the personal lives of native Americans, historical fiction may be more significant to the study of American Indians than any other ethnic group in our society.

Thus students of Indian history and culture would do well to heed

the words of Walter Laquer, who declared in an article "Literature and the Historian" that "historians sometimes forget that they have no monopoly in their own field of study. The reading public, perhaps unfortunately, has a preference for amateurs over professionals, and outsiders over academics." Still, he maintained that this is not always unfortunate; sometimes literature has "answered a definite need which historians had been unable or unwilling to satisfy." Pointing out that historical novels based on solid research do provide "insight and knowledge," he declared that these works may be "as near the historical truth as the work of professional historians. Even so historians have usually regarded the historical novel as unfair competition and have not, on the whole, taken it seriously." His conclusion was brief and to the point: "history and literature need each other."[5] With regard to Indian studies, the same conclusion should include anthropology.

Students seeking to know the Apaches and their history need to study the works of anthropologists, such as Morris E. Opler, Keith H. Basso, Harry Hoijer, Grenville Goodwin, James and Delores Gunnerson, and others, and historians, such as Francis Lockwood, Dan L. Thrapp, C. L. Sonnichsen, Jack D. Forbes, Max Moorhead, Odie B. Faulk, and others. They would benefit from the historical novels of Elliott Arnold, Will L. Comfort, James R. Olson, Paul Horgan, Reuben Bercovitch, Edwin Corle, Logan Forster, and Paul Wellman. If one included the linguistically related Navajos, the list in each case could be expanded. Some examples of each of the three dimensions will be presented, followed by some generalizations about the contributions of historical novels to Indian studies.

Among anthropological writings on the Apaches, the works of Morris Opler rank high. His Apache Life-Way: The Economic, Social, and Religious Institutions of the Chiricahua Indians (1941) is a thorough study of customs which fulfills his goal "to show how a person becomes a Chiricahua as well as to indicate what he does because he is a Chiricahua." He traces the

life cycle as collected from informants, telling much about the "socialization of the Chiricahua."[6] This fine study served some of the novelists well in their endeavors to portray the realities of Chiricahua life, particularly Elliott Arnold's Blood Brother (1950) and James Olson's Ulzana (1973).

Little of the information in Apache Life-Way is tied to individuals, but the general characteristics of many facets of life are explained. The life of the child is shown as a preparation for adult roles, with emphasis on training, discipline, bilateral kinship connections, and home life. The importance of puberty in the maturation of both boys and girls into men and women is explained. The girl's puberty rite ceremony is detailed as is the preparation of the boy for raiding and warfare. The social relations of men and women, including courtship, love, marriage, sexual activities, matrilocal residence, and mother-in-law taboo, are tied to the importance of obligations each had to relatives and the people. Religious beliefs, ceremonies, and rituals of the Mountain Spirit dancers are described. Other topics include housing, clothing, warfare, foods, industries, recreation, and political structures. The end of life with a look at burial and mourning customs complete this overview of the life cycle.

There are other anthopological writings the student of the Apaches should consult. These include a recent collection of papers edited by Keith Basso and Opler, Apachean Culture History and Ethnology (1971), Basso's Western Apache Witchcraft (1969), Harry Hoijer's Chiricahua and Mescalero Apache Texts (1938), Charles R. Kaut's Western Apache Clan System (1957), Grenville Goodwin's Western Apache Raiding and Warfare (1971) and Social Organization of the Western Apache (1969), and Dolores A. Gunnerson's Jicarilla Apaches: A Study in Survival (1974).

Anthropologists provide much general information about culture, but students of Indian history often feel set adrift in strange waters without landmarks because so little is tied to time, place, and identified individuals. Sometimes the general conclusions seem based on extremely limited hard evidence. Even so, anthropological studies provide an important dimension and, as Martin argued in the opening quotation in this paper, they "have much to offer the historian." It is one of the perspectives from which students and teachers should view Indians, but it has more meaning when another dimension is added.

There are many historical studies about Apaches. A standard overview account is Frank Lockwood's Apache Indians (1938). It is a good place for the student to begin before moving into more specialized studies. Lockwood did not overcome the white racist views about Apaches prevalent in his generation, and his study concentrates on warfare in which Apaches were the problems. He briefly summarized life and culture in a chapter titled "Primitive Apache."

The Apaches were described as fine physical specimens, "capable of extraordinary activity and endurance," and possessed of "superior mental qualities."[7] Toward their own people they maintained a high moral code and were honest, loyal, and sharing. Yet they were declared to be cruel and savage and to consider all aliens as enemies. Lockwood also described the wickiup, eating habits, industries, ceremonies, family life, and practice of war. But his sketchy details on culture need to be supplemented with the works of the anthropologists.

Lockwood traced relations between Apaches and European invaders of Apacheria. His book was strongest on the Anglo era. A more recent and better study of European impact on Apaches and other Indians of the Southwest

is found in Edward H. Spicer, Cycles of Conquest: The Impact of Spain, Mexico, and the United States on the Indians of the Southwest, 1533-1960 (1962). One of his interesting conclusions was that the European introduction of livestock brought major changes, stimulating the Apaches to develop a raiding economy.

> The raids were directed primarily toward the taking of livestock, not toward killing, and especially not toward driving out the White men. The relationship was a symbiotic one in which it was to the interest of the raiders to maintain their source of supply, in other words to keep the Whites in a position to supply them with horses, sheep, and cattle.[8]

The most comprehensive history of the Apache wars is Dan L. Thrapp, The Conquest of Apacheria (1967), which provides an overview and introduces the main characters, Indian and white, in a well researched study. Other historical studies of Apaches which students will find helpful include Thrapps other books, Al Sieber: Chief of Scouts (1964), General Crook and the Sierra Madre Adventure (1972), Juh: an Incredible Indian (1973), and Victorio and the Mimbres Apaches (1974); Jack D. Forbes, Apache, Navajo and Spaniard (1960); Max L. Moorhead, The Apache Frontier (1968); Ralph H. Ogle, Federal Control of the Western Apaches, 1848-1886 (1940); C. L. Sonnichsen, The Mescalero Apaches (1958); Eve Ball, In the Days of Victorio (1970); Odie B. Faulk, The Geronimo Campaign (1969), John U. Terrell, Apache Chronicle (1972), and others far too numerous to mention here.

As stated, the two dimensions of Apaches provided by anthropology and history may be given a third dimension through literature. For purposes of illustration, four historical novels are considered and others are mentioned. Each one considered concerns an actual Apache leader and the story of Indian-white relations, and much accurate information on Apache culture is found in each. Another type of historical novel, for which there are better examples for other Indians than the Apaches, are those in which a fictional character is used to portray history (the finest example

to date being Jack Crabb in Thomas Berger's Little Big Man, ~~1956~~). The four historical, biographical novels selected are Will Comfort's Apache (1931) which deals with Mangas Coloradas, Elliott Arnold's Blood Brother (1950) which considers Cochise, James Olson's Ulzana (1974), a fictional life of that Chiricahua, and Arnold's brand new Camp Grant Massacre (1976) which includes the Aravaipa leader Eskiminzin.

Comfort's Apache was a carefully researched and faithful account of Mangas Coloradas, c. 1790-1863, and his struggle to keep the Apache way in the face of Mexican and Anglo invasion of southwestern New Mexico. Comfort narrated the childhood and early manhood of Mangas and assessed the strengths and weaknesses of this physical and political giant among his people. His family life, skills as a warrior, relations with Cochise and other Apache leaders, and his talents and wisdom as a political leader were presented. His weaknesses, such as his desire to marry a Mexican girl, were included. The infamous massacre at the Santa Rita Copper Mine was portrayed as the tragedy it was, and Mangas's brilliantly executed and successful retaliation was detailed.

The problems his people faced because of invaders, especially the miners, weighed heavily on Mangas. After years of fighting, when he was at least seventy years of age, he determined to make peace with the whites. He gave himself up, but military leaders eliminated this powerful Apache. Held as a prisoner, Mangas was awakened in the night by soldiers who poked him with hot bayonets. When the old man tried to get up he was shot several times.

The novel was authentic in most details, so far as they were known. Comfort utilized historical sources, such as John C. Cremony's Life Among the Apaches (1868). According to historian Ray Brandes, currently preparing

a biography of Mangas Coloradas, "Comfort not only pierced the warrior's character, but he reflected a deep sensitivity to the nature and character of the Apache Indians." Brandes concluded that the dialogue in the novel "is not proved, yet it conveys the real sense of Apache life."[9]

Cochise, even more of a legend than Mangas Coloradas, was the subject of Arnold's Blood Brother. It is based on the true story of the famous Chiricahua leader and the white man, Tom Jeffords, who became the Apache's friend and blood brother.

The novel considers approximately the last twenty years of Cochise's life, who was born about 1815 and died in 1874. Until 1861 Cochise was friendly toward Anglos, although his Chiricahuas had long raided the Mexican settlements. The book explains about the life of the Chiricahuas and the people close to Cochise, especially his wives, brothers, and sons.

When the Gadsden Purchase brought these people of southern Arizona into the United States, Cochise determined to follow a policy of peace toward the Anglos. Other Chiricahuas, such as Geronimo, chose a different road. Cochise was faithful to his decision until 1861 when his people were accused of a crime they did not commit and an eager and misinformed young military officer hanged some of Cochise's family in retaliation. Then Cochise and his people took the pledge to fight the Americans, and the following decade was perhaps the bloodiest in the Southwest.

Tom Jeffords, whose background and interest in Indians was sketched by Arnold, became the key to peace with the Chiricahua leader. In 1872 Jeffords took General O. O. Howard to Cochise, and a peace agreement was reached whereby the Chiricahuas were granted a reservation in their homeland. The trials of reservation life were also shown, and the book ended with the death of Cochise (after which his people were moved to another reservation).

Arnold explained that the love interests of Tom Jeffords in his novel, one with a white girl he rescued from an attacked wagon train and the other with a beautiful Chiricahua maiden (whom he also married in this story), were purely fictitious. They did help Arnold develop his story and the character of Jeffords. Jeffords close relationship with the Indian girl, Morning Star, provided the author the opportunity to present more about Apache customs and beliefs.

Blood Brother was a beautiful and tragic story. It was good literature as well as good history; it provided factual insight into Apache life, Indian-white relations in early Arizona Territory, and the life of an Indian who was respected as great warrior and leader by his people and feared as the chief of the most effective warrior society among Southwestern Indians.

Olson's Ulzana is another fictional biography based on five years of research. Olson gave the Americans in his story fictional names, for example George Crook is called James Harrison, but used real names for the Indian characters. Ulzana and his brother Chihuahua were Chiricahuas and their names appear in historical studies. Olson included informative descriptions of Apache daily life, and it is clear that Opler's Apache Life-Way was his major source.

The novel begins with Ulzana's birth in 1845 in southeastern Arizona. During childhood he learned about the spirit powers, especially Child of Water who made the earth safe and White Painted Woman who gave the people the ceremonies they were to practice to remain strong.

The boy's father was killed on a raid in 1850; his mother married his father's brother. The boy began training to become a warrior when he was eight years old. He served as an apprentice on four raids when he was sixteen and thereafter was an accomplished raider. Olson had Ulzana at the battles of Dragoon Springs and Apache Pass. He lost his stepfather and

and grandfather at the latter engagement and soon thereafter his mother was killed when their village was attacked. Ulzana raided constantly for supplies, killed to avenge the deaths of his family, and fought for the survival of his people.

Ulzana took a wife when he was 26 and fathered a son. Peace came with the settlement with Cochise in 1872, but the death of Cochise two years later saw the Chiricahuas moved to San Carlos Reservation where they were expected to become farmers. Ulzana tried but nothing would grow. With his family facing starvation, he became a scout for the army in the search for Victorio. He was dismissed from the service and tried again to farm, again without success. In the 1880s Ulzana escaped from San Carlos and went to Mexico with a large party of Apaches. Squabbles among leaders caused them to split into smaller groups; Ulzana stayed with his brother Chihuahua and raided in Mexico and Arizona. They surrendered to General Harrison (Crook) and returned to San Carlos. Later, through Geronimo's influence, Ulzana escaped again.

Ulzana was sent by Chihuahua to lead a party of twelve men back to Arizona to attempt to arrange a new truce with General Harrison. Near San Carlos they were attacked in camp, and they tried to return to Mexico, raiding as they went. In seven weeks they covered over 1,200 miles, stole at least 240 horses and mules, and killed 38 people. Although the intent of this party had been to arrange surrender, it became known as Ulzana's raid. Later Ulzana surrendered with Geronimo. The story ends with the Apaches boarding the train that would take them to prison in Florida. In an epilogue Olson explained that Ulzana was relocated at Fort Sill, Oklahoma, in 1894, and he died there in 1909. ~~This writer visits his grave in August, 1975. I should add that the privilege of visiting Cochise strongly~~ omit earlier this week.

Because Olson followed historical and anthropological sources so

closely, one might argue that it is not good literature, in fact Brian W. Dipple declared in a review that, as literature, the book should never have been published.[10] But for the accurate insight it provides into Apache culture and the characters around Ulzana, as well as Ulzana himself, it is a worthy book for the student of the Chiricahuas.

The infamous Camp Grant Massacre of 1871 is mentioned in many volumes, fiction and non-fiction, but by far the most thorough explanation of the causes were found in Arnold's latest novel. Like his earlier Blood Brother, the Camp Grant Massacre concentrated on Indian-white relations, providing information about the Apaches in the process. The book was carefully researched, and Arnold used everyone's real name. The result was a sound historical novel which, incidentally, could easily be made into a fine moving picture.

As one would expect, much of the narrative in Camp Grant Massacre is devoted to the people of Tucson and their attitudes toward the Apaches. Military leaders, especially Lt. Royal Whitman who commanded at Camp Grant and brought the Aravaipa band under the leader Eskiminzin into camp nearby, undergo considerable evaluation. The authenticity of the volume is enhanced by the use of quotations from Tucson newspapers and official military reports and orders. Each of the characters is developed through thoughts, words, and actions rather than description. Arnold's creativity is found in the thoughts and conversations which could never be documented. The result is a powerful novel about a terrible tragedy that was a classical example; i.e., one could see what was going to happen but there was nothing that could be done to prevent the inevitable conclusion.

Although the whites of Arizona Territory lived in fear of the Apaches, Lt. Whitman and the reader are surprised to learn that the Apaches lived in

terror too, fearful for the lives of their children and always on the move. Citizens of Tucson opposed feeding those Indians, for other groups continued to raid. When it was learned that the encampment near Camp Grant had been disarmed by Lt. Whitman, a group of citizens made plans to destroy it. Whitman had worked hard to earn the trust of Eskiminzin only to have it almost wiped out by a mob that was comprised of 94 Papago Indians, 48 Mexicans, and 6 Americans. Of the 125 Apaches killed, most were women and children. The surviving Aravaipas were stunned beyond comprehension. Nothing was done about the massacre, but Eskiminzin stayed and trusted Whitman. When a scouting party of soldiers from another military post ran onto some of the Camp Grant survivors and attacked them, Eskiminzin realized that his people could not remain at peace without being exterminated. They returned to the warpath. One serious attempt to find an alternative to warfare had failed.

Because the lives of Mangas Coloradas, Cochise, Ulzana, and Eskiminzin overlapped, the novels, as do historical works, corroborate each other. Without these historical novels, students of Apaches would search long and hard to find all the information presented by three conscientious artists who knew their Indians. Such novels should be used to supplement anthropological and historical studies. Other novels about Apaches and warfare between Apaches and whites that might shed additional light are Paul Horgan's Distant Trumpet, Paul Wellman's Broncho Apache, Logan Forster's Proud Land, Reuben Bercovitch's Odette, and others.

These are sufficient examples on which to base some general observations about the relationship of historical novels to Indian studies. I hasten to acknowledge, as others have observed, that literature is not history, but it can be historical. Sometimes it can tell us more about what Deloria called "the intangible sense of reality that pervades the Indian people." Personally, I prefer to find history and anthropology in the

fiction I read than to find fiction in the history and anthropology I study.

The authentic historical novel, the type of Indian literature that has been identifed in this paper, can be of aid to students of Indians. In addition to insight and understanding, these novels can help provide a third dimension to anthropology and history by providing points of reference, giving specific examples, establishing integrity by portraying reality, providing syntheses, serving as sources of motivation, aiding interpretation of controversial subjects, expanding the audience of Indian history, and stimulating research. Each of these points requires brief elaboration.

A worthy novel can serve as a point of reference. It is an aid to memory because the fictional characters and the plot help to establish points of reference that assist in recalling further details. For example, to recall Jefford's fictional Indian wife, Morning Star, is to remember at the same time much about marriage customs, family relationships, and other details of Apache daily life. Details of the Camp Grant tragedy are more easily recalled when tied with the fictional thoughts and conversations of major participants (Eskiminzin, Lt. Whitman, Bill Oury, Don Jesús Elías, and others).

Historical novels can, just as scholarly studies, provide examples illustrative of Indian culture and history. We know, for example, from anthropological and historical accounts about the general training of an Apache youth for a life of hunting, raiding, and warfare, but to see such examples as the fictional early years of Mangas Coloradas or Ulzana fixes such practices in the mind of a student in a way that cannot be accomplished by an overview. This results because one is able to trace the development as the skills are learned and then to see them utilized by the adult example. Most of us find one good example more meaningful than generalizations.

By expanding on the possibilities of the novel as example, it is

possible to create an artistic experience which has in it the reality of truth, for fiction can establish integrity. Possibly, in some instances, reality can be most accurately portrayed in a fictional account. The same truth might be obtained by the anthropologist or historian from an experimental process of gathering, selecting, comparing, discarding, and comparing again until a conclusion was reached, but this would sometimes require access to components that the scholar does not have. But reliable fiction built on such a process (which occurs in the imagination) can approach truth. Most discussions of motives, involving the thinking of a person which is not recorded anyplace, are more easily established in good creative fiction than within the limited disciplines of professionals.

In most novels mentioned there are valid characterizations of both Indians and whites. Some have argued that only through a novel can a reader fully understand a character, for only the novelist gets inside the head to examine deepest thoughts. The novel can create a feeling for individuals, for a place, for a time, for a way of life, and those feelings can portray reality at least as successfully as can history or anthropology. It should be noted that novelists deal with the sexual aspects of human nature while many scholars tend to ignore them, considering them either too delicate or beyond documentation. Thus the novel, despite the overemphasis some writers devote to sex, presents a more realistic view of men and women than many scholarly accounts.

Just as novels provide examples, they may also present syntheses of an era or series of events, proving a meaningful overview. Most of the novels mentioned provide both example and synthesis. They synthesize the Apache reactions to European encroachments, Apachean cultural traits and customs, struggles to retain the old way of life in the face of new conditions,

and so on. It must be emphasized again that the novels cannot replace the scholarly accounts but may be used to supplement them.

A major function of the novel to the student of the Indian, viewed from the perspective of a teacher, is that it can serve as a motivation to study history and anthropology. Good novels are pleasurable devices by which young and old can become interested in specific topics. Apache can send one searching for more material on the Santa Rita Massacre, Apache marriage customs, methods of warfare, and the death of Mangas. The Camp Grant Massacre can stimulate an interest in Tucson politics, military operations in Arizona Territory, Eskiminzin, and related topics. The novel can be used to motivate students who have come to believe that scholarly studies are dull and lifeless. There is, one must be warned, a danger that, if the novel has too much sparkle and too little authenticity, it may make the situation worse; the student will find scholarly studies more dull and lifeless. But properly used the novel can motivate historical investigations. In my own class on the Indian in American History, the reading of at least one historical novel about Indians has become a course requirement.

Because the creations of historical novelists are not founded solely on documentary evidence but on considerable imagination, they can suggest interpretations that are plausable and deserve the attention of scholars. There is a high degree of selectivity in all anthropological and historical presentations. The novelist has an expanded range of selectivity which expands the range of interpretation. Thus the novelist can shed light, albeit through speculation, on difficult questions. Why did the Apaches resist the occupation of their homelands so fiercely? What qualities produced such leaders as Mangas Coloradas and Cochise? Why did a group of citizens take the law into their own hands and attack a disarmed Indian village? One should be cautious, but it needs to be emphasized that imagination, which is often more evident in

literature than scholarly accounts, is a vital ingredient to interpretation.

The literary approach to Indian studies can expand the audience. The novel can be of value to the beginner with no background and to the informed student seeking additional insight. The fine arts are somewhat unique in fulfilling such a dual role. Historical-literary treatment is usually broad enough in audience appeal to include those not oriented to the scholarly approach and yet puts no real obstruction in the way of scholarly pursuits. In fact the literature encourages the latter. The flexibility of the novels considered in this paper are examples. They may be read as adventure stories with the reader unwittingly picking up facts of Indian history along with the vicarious participation. They may be read for the good story as well as the conscious effort to gather better historical understanding of the Apaches, Indian wars, military leaders, and others. They may be read primarily as a stimulus to serious investigation of the various possibilities introduced. In this way the novels assist the expansion of the audience of Indian studies.

In connection with motivation, interpretation, and the other attributes identified, the novels can stimulate historical research. The novel can send the historian and anthropologist seeking documentation to support or refute the novelist's product. In many ways the novels can be considered a challenge to the serious student of Indians. If, in this, they result in more carefully researched studies, they have served another valuable aid to the disciplines of anthropology and history and confirmed the conclusion that those disciplines and literature do need each other. Each provides a dimension of Indian history and culture and Indian-white relations which complements the other two; with the aid of all, students can see Apaches and other Indians in three dimensions.

FOOTNOTES

1. Organization of American Historians, 1976 Program, p. 69.

2. Two exceptions are Dan L. Thrapp's Conquest of Apacheria (1967) and Odie B. Faulk's Geronimo Campaign (1969) in which historical novels are recommended to students of Apaches.

3. pp. 99-114.

4. Vine Deloria, Jr., Custer Died for Your Sins: An Indian Manifesto (New York, 1969), p. 16.

5. Walter Laquer, "Literature and the Historian," Journal of Contemporary History, V (1967), 5-14.

6. pp. ix, x.

7. pp. 41, 42.

8. p. 547.

9. Ray Brandes, "Mangas Coloradas: King Philip of the Apache Nation," Troopers West: Military and Indian Affairs on the American Frontier, ed. by Ray Brandes (San Diego, 1970), pp. 23-24.

10. Western American Literature, X (1975), 90-91.