

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 083 143

SP 006 903

AUTHOR Ulibarri, Mari-Luci  
TITLE Of the Variables Causing an Institution to Have an Outstanding Teacher Education Program, How Much Import Can Be Attributed to the Fact that the Institution Recruits & Selects "Outstanding" Students?  
SPONS AGENCY Bureau of Educational Personnel Development (DHEW/OE), Washington, D.C. Div. of Assessment and Coordination.  
PUB DATE Aug 71  
CONTRACT OEC-0-71-3339  
NOTE 120p.  
EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.65 HC-\$6.58  
DESCRIPTORS Faculty Recruitment; \*Teacher Education; \*Teacher Recruitment; \*Teacher Selection; \*Teacher Supply and Demand

ABSTRACT

The question of entrance requirements for teacher education program is discussed; in particular, the relationship of student quality to program quality is examined. Selection procedures, recruitment, curricula, faculty, students, resources and facilities, and program review and evaluation procedures are analyzed in detail. Also mentioned is the need for a scientific definition of an outstanding human being so that such humans can be assimilated into outstanding teacher education programs. (JB)

ED 083143

Order Number  
OEC-0-71-3339

OF THE VARIABLES  
CAUSING AN INSTITUTION TO HAVE  
AN OUTSTANDING TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAM,  
HOW MUCH IMPORT CAN BE ATTRIBUTED TO THE FACT  
THAT THE INSTITUTION  
RECRUITS & SELECTS "OUTSTANDING" STUDENTS?

A Literature Search

Presented to

Bureau of Educational Personnel Development  
Division of Assessment and Coordination  
DHEW/U.S. Office of Education  
7th & D Streets, S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20202

by

Mari-Luci Ulibarrí, Ph.D.  
University of New Mexico  
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87105

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,  
EDUCATION & WELFARE  
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF  
EDUCATION  
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRO-  
DUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM  
THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGIN-  
ATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS  
STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT  
OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF  
EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

August, 1971

0006 903

OF THE VARIABLES CAUSING AN INSTITUTION  
TO HAVE AN OUTSTANDING TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAM,  
HOW MUCH IMPORT CAN BE ATTRIBUTED  
TO THE FACT THAT THE INSTITUTION  
RECRUITS AND SELECTS OUTSTANDING STUDENTS?

INTRODUCTION

Teacher education has been heavily researched in the United States from the early days of its inception to the present. During certain periods of time during its history, certain variables seem to have been studied more in depth than others. However, as one looks at the total research, one finds that almost every variable conceivable has been studied either in depth or superficially some time during the history of teacher education.

However, an outstanding teacher institution has not been researched as such. The literature, although once in a while alluding to it, does not define the outstanding institution as such. Perhaps one will never be able to define such a concept because the outstanding teacher education program satisfies local and regional educational needs to a great extent. There is no one set of exclusive principles that represents the nation as a whole in teacher education. As an example of this, medicine, or more in particular, the school of medicine, regardless of the place where it is situated in the nation will have the same principles for all areas. Perhaps there will be some variation of the degree to which an

understanding of cultural differences and social class differences is emphasized. But the principles, by and large, would be the same. However, in teacher education, different groups of people decide the needs of such a program for a particular region or locale. Although there are some basic principles that are the same, there are too many elements which can vary.

As this paper will show, some institutions have been singled out as having excellent teacher programs in the last few years. The American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education has been a pioneer in the effort. However, the literature review will show that they have been selected as outstanding institutions for different reasons.

The effect of the selection in recruitment in outstanding programs also is something that has been researched but not to the degree that one would hope after reviewing the literature pertaining to this area.

Although the problem as stated appears to be concise and simple, it actually encompasses many areas of teacher education. There are many unanswered questions. For example: What is an outstanding teacher education program? What methods of recruiting and selecting are used? What is an excellent student? How does the student affect the institution? All these questions have a direct relationship with the issue and thus each must be clearly

understood before the question of how recruitment and selection of excellent students affect the program may be effectively answered.

The literature shows that in the past, teacher education programs were simply meeting the demand and as such, it can almost be said that everyone that applied was admitted. It is only in the very recent past where a serious attempt has been made to screen and select teacher candidates. This selection criteria to a very large degree is now centered around members of ethnic minorities participating in the teacher education courses as opposed to strictly outstanding students regardless of ethnic background. However, since that is not the topic to be discussed here, much of this very recent literature will be omitted.

In analyzing the problem, one quickly sees that it can be easily divided into two different parts for further study. One part is composed of the variables that are causing an institution to have an outstanding teacher education program. The second part deals with the recruitment and the selection of outstanding students. This one would appear to be much easier to answer because most of the selection has been self-selection in the teaching field.

In order to answer the main questions posed in this literature search, many subquestions will have to be generated and explored. The subquestions will be analyzed

in detail. For example, how do teacher education programs relate to their students or, how do students relate to said programs? What criteria do colleges for teacher training use? Who decides what students want?

The selection procedures will be analyzed also, from the beginning of the effort to the present. How have the institutions decided which students are to be selected from those which apply?

In recruitment, the literature will be scrutinized to see if the recruitment procedures have attracted outstanding students or if it has attracted mostly anyone that wanted to become a teacher for whichever reason. The literature will also give the reasons why some people want to become teachers.

In the section called the program such elements as the curricula, the faculty, the students, resources and facilities, evaluation, program review, planning and outstanding programs will be analyzed in detail.

Hopefully, such a literature search will supply the answers so sorely needed in the seventies for getting into the teaching field outstanding human beings with special talents. They could help create a truly democratic world for all citizens of this country.

In the 1970's, it seems that supply and demand in the teacher market has been reached. Now is the time to make recruitment and selection techniques work to attract

only the highest caliber human being. But first, one must be able to scientifically say what a high caliber outstanding human being is. Only through more research in this area will one, once and for all, be able to define this type of human being that all institutions, not only teacher training institutions, have tried to produce. Perhaps this is one of the areas where research has failed the most in that it has not given guidelines as to what kind of human beings are needed for the different institutions.

The report is divided into chapters. The content in each is arranged from the past to the present. Each is further sub-divided into the specifics of the topic that is being discussed. Hopefully, the readers will be able to get the sense of urgency that the author has felt in reviewing the literature. It is absolutely necessary that one define the goals in teacher education much more precisely.

## THE PROGRAM

The concept of what an outstanding teacher education program is, must be established. This is a rather difficult task since few professionals agree on the subject. "...the problem of teacher effectiveness is so complex that no one today knows what 'The Competent Teacher' is."<sup>1</sup> Also, there are so many aspects of teaching that "until effects desired of the teacher are decided upon, no adequate definition of teacher competence is possible."<sup>2</sup> And until a measurable definition is found for an outstanding teacher, there cannot be a concrete definition for an outstanding program since part of the criteria for selecting an institution as outstanding should be the quality of teachers it produces. Therefore, a few of the variables which lead to the establishment of an outstanding program will be discussed in some detail so as to produce a general understanding of that which is implied by the label, outstanding.

Within the last ten years the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education has been ardent in its quest to promote better teacher education programs. This organization's central purpose is to encourage excellent programs in teacher education. It is the hope of this association that by calling attention to outstanding programs other colleges will be stimulated to try



innovative programs. Also, it is hoped by this association that by singling out outstanding programs, the American people will then believe that there are quality programs for training prospective teachers.

In a recent study, the association reviewed those standards which it recommended for teacher education institutions. The areas of curriculum, faculty, students, resources, facilities, evaluation, program review, and planning were all discussed in full. Those which the Evaluation Criteria Study Committee felt were important factors in the development of an outstanding, or at least acceptable teacher education programs will be used to develop the concept of an outstanding program.

### Curricula

In the area of curriculum it was pointed out that both private and public institutions within the United States have a heritage of self governance.

The rights of colleges and universities to set their goals and to shape their own destinies has accounted for a large measure of the excellence - perhaps inadequacy as well - which is found among institutions of higher learning today.<sup>3</sup>

According to the committee, curricula for teacher education are developed to achieve certain well-defined goals. The curriculum should encompass not only the opinions of the representatives of the teaching profession,

which takes into account the thoughts of faculty, students, and graduates, but should also be aware of new research and developments in teacher education.

The committee recommended that teacher education curricula be based on objectives which reflect the institution's concept of the teacher's role. The curricula should be organized in such a manner as to include general studies, content for the specialty in teaching, behavioral and humanistic studies, teaching and learning experience combined with laboratory, and clinical experience and practicum.

Within this design, the general studies component should be planned to include a minimum of one-third of each curriculum for teacher candidates to consist of the symbolics of information, natural and behavioral sciences, and humanities.

Slightly more complex is the professional studies component. The curriculum ought to be designed to distinguish the general studies component from the professional part. The former, general studies, must include all instruction deemed desirable for all students, regardless of the profession they plan to enter; the latter would cover the requirements that are needed specifically by teachers.

The professional studies component must include the study of the content of the material to be taught to

which takes into account the thoughts of faculty, students, and graduates, but should also be aware of new research and developments in teacher education.

The committee recommended that teacher education curricula be based on objectives which reflect the institution's concept of the teacher's role. The curricula should be organized in such a manner as to include general studies, content for the specialty in teaching, behavioral and humanistic studies, teaching and learning experience combined with laboratory, and clinical experience and practicum.

Within this design, the general studies component should be planned to include a minimum of one-third of each curriculum for teacher candidates to consist of the symbolics of information, natural and behavioral sciences, and humanities.

Slightly more complex is the professional studies component. The curriculum ought to be designed to distinguish the general studies component from the professional part. The former, general studies, must include all instruction deemed desirable for all students, regardless of the profession they plan to enter; the latter would cover the requirements that are needed specifically by teachers.

The professional studies component must include the study of the content of the material to be taught to

pupils, and the subject matter of the teaching specialty and allied fields that the teachers will need for perspective and flexibility in teaching. This curriculum for prospective teachers should include instruction in the humanistic and behavioral sciences where the humanistic and behavioral studies require a familiarity with the parent disciplines on which they are based.

This professional aspect of the curricula must also include the systematic study of teaching and learning theory combined with appropriate laboratory and clinical experiences.

Finally, the professional studies component must include direct substantial participation in teaching over an extended time period and under supervision of qualified personnel from both the institution and the cooperating school.

In a more general view of the planning and developing of curricula for teacher education, the institution must give due consideration to the guidelines for teacher preparation developed by national learned societies and professional associations.

For a more effective control of the basic program, the committee felt the design, approval and continuous evaluation and development of teacher education programs should be the responsibility of an officially designed unit. The membership of this unit should be primarily

composed of faculty and/or staff members who are significantly involved in teacher education.<sup>4</sup>

### Faculty

The committee indicated that the "teacher education programs require a competent faculty which has been systematically developed into a coherent body devoted to the preparation of effective teachers."<sup>5</sup> The competence of the faculty was recognized as the crucial factor in the training of teachers not just because of the quality of instruction which is provided but also because of the productive atmosphere which is thus implemented. Above all, the quality of the program which is offered and the degree to which the quality is maintained depends primarily on the faculty.

In the area of faculty competence and their effective utilization, the committee said that an institution engaged in preparing teachers has to employ full-time faculty members in teacher education, each having attained a post-masters' degree and/or having demonstrated scholarly competence, and each faculty member having developed an appropriate specialization. Such specialization makes competent instruction feasible in the areas of humanistic and behavioral studies, in the theory of teaching and learning, and in teaching methods in each area of specialization for which the institution prepares its teacher candidates.

The specializations insure competent supervision in laboratory, clinical, and practicum experiences.

The faculty in teacher training institutions must be in frequent contact with their related community school environment so that their teaching and research are current and relevant. Elementary and secondary school personnel are assumed to share a common purpose and interest in teacher education with the faculty of the college and universities. The specialized talent of the faculty of teacher education is regarded as a potential source for providing inservice assistance for the schools that are within the area served by the institution.

The institution must provide conditions which will facilitate effective performance by their faculty members. These provisions include such policies as the establishment of maximum limits on teaching loads, allowing for adjustments in teaching loads whenever non-teaching activities are assigned, and the faculty member must be allowed sufficient time to plan a means to most effectively carry out his assigned responsibilities.

As far as the use of part-time faculty, the committee felt that all part-time faculty should meet the requirements for appointment of full-time faculty. These faculty should be employed only when they can make special contributions to the program.<sup>6</sup> In general, the full-time faculty has the greatest influence on the student.

### Students

The teacher education programs described require students who have "intellectual, emotional, and personal qualifications that promise to result in successful performance in the profession."<sup>7</sup> Awareness of the characteristics of the students admitted to, retained in, and graduated from teacher education is necessary in designing and maintaining acceptable programs. How, or if, the students were recruited is a question which is left unanswered.

The committee indicated that the institution should apply specific criteria for the admission into teacher education programs. The criteria should be both subjective and objective since, as yet, no single criterion can predict success or failure accurately. Scores on standardized tests are still, however, helpful in predicting the probability of success of an individual in the program of studies suggested for teacher education candidates. Perhaps this criterion allows only the "outstanding" students to enter. There appears to be no research to substantiate or to refute this premise.

Once a student has been admitted into the program, the institution should apply specific criteria for the retention of candidates in the basic programs. Only those who possess academic competencies and personal characteristics which are parallel to the requirements of

teaching should be retained in the program. The study fails to specify this criterion.

It further states that the institution owes it to the individual to be as objective as possible in assessing his strengths and weaknesses as a teacher as they affect his continuation in the program. The committee believes that a well-defined plan for counseling and advising students would greatly aid this situation. This counseling would also afford the students an opportunity to become informed about professional organizations and agencies as well as current problems in the field of teaching. The students would also learn of the wide variety of options open to them in teaching.

The committee stressed the importance of student participation in program evaluation and development. They felt the student to be an integral part of the program and should, therefore, have a voice in the governance of their program.

The committee failed to mention the use of recruitment of students. The means by which outstanding students enter the teacher training institutions is by the screening and selection procedures used. The committee did not elaborate on the "specific criteria" it deemed necessary for student screening.



### Resources and Facilities

In recommending standards, the committee even studies the resources and facilities available to the student. The institution must provide an environment which aids the education program that is offered. The committee treats the value of the library, the learning materials center, the physical facilities, and other resources related to providing good teacher education programs.

The library should be adequate to support the instruction, research and services related to each individual program.

A materials and instructional media center for teacher education maintained either as part of the library, or as one or more separate units should give the program adequate support. Because modern media and materials play essential roles in the communications systems of contemporary societies, teachers need to be able to use such media and to understand the technologies that make the use of this media and materials possible.

Having a role, not of great importance but still relevant, the committee reviewed the adequacy of the physical facilities, equipment, and special resources which are judged in terms of the operational requirements of the programs offered.

### Evaluation, Program Review, and Planning

Maintenance of desirable teacher education programs demand continuous evaluation of the institution's graduates of existing programs, as well as long-range planning.

The institution conducts a well-defined plan for evaluating the teachers it prepares. The institution evaluates the teachers it produces at two critical points: when they complete their program study, and after they enter the teaching profession.<sup>8</sup>

The outstanding institution uses its evaluation results in the study, development, and improvement of its teacher education programs. The institution plans for long-range development of its program. These plans are part of a total design for institutional development.<sup>9</sup>

It should be reiterated at this point that the committee set no specific criteria for the recruitment and selection of students. How is the institution to distinguish the outstanding student? How can it recognize those students "who possess academic competencies and personal characteristics appropriate to the requirements of teaching."<sup>10</sup> The committee has only listed desirable characteristics but has not given any concrete means by which these characteristics may be achieved.

#### Outstanding Programs

This study yields rather definite guidelines of characteristics which an outstanding program should possess. In order to fully understand how these guidelines

are used in practice, the programs of the recipients of the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education's Distinguished Achievement Awards for the year 1968 will be discussed. Those characteristics on which the AACTE based their decision will be considered and by reviewing these characteristics an understanding of how the guidelines are put into practice will be established. An understanding of what is involved in an outstanding teacher education program will also be discussed.

University of Maryland. Of the five colleges given awards, the University of Maryland was considered to have the best teacher training program in the nation. The institution received its award for "its development and implementation of the Teacher Education Center concept as a unified approach to the study of teaching and supervision."<sup>11</sup> The program was able to integrate theory and practice and incorporate the preservice and inservice components of teacher training into a unified and continuous program.

The program included a full-time coordinator whose role was to plan an effective laboratory experiences program for the institution's students, and to coordinate an inservice program for supervising teachers who work with these students. The responsibility for planning, directing, and assessing the development of an undergraduate

student teacher was placed on numerous people within the center's staff. The university supervisors were free to serve as curriculum and teacher education consultants for the center staff. The university, then, worked more closely with the cooperating teachers than with the individual student teachers. Thus, the public school personnel assumed increased responsibility for the pre-service program and the university assumed increased responsibility for inservice education.

The customary honorarian pay to the cooperating teachers was diverted to staff development. Therefore, the teacher education center was established without additional funding. It is hoped that this type of program will ultimately establish a new kind of "joint sovereignty" for teacher education. The program's effectiveness is supported by the evaluation data.<sup>12</sup>

It is interesting to note how closely this university's program follows the recommended guidelines previously discussed. The main quality that the association stressed was the "joint sovereignty" that was established between the public schools and the teacher training institution. It will be recalled that the committee's statement read: "It is assumed that elementary and secondary school personnel share with faculty members in colleges and universities a common purpose and interest in teacher education."<sup>13</sup>

The committee also emphasized the importance of an effective laboratory experience under supervised instruction.<sup>14</sup> The university developed a system which used both the coordinating school members and the universities supervisors efficiently. (See footnote 12)

It is as though part of the criteria for an outstanding program is the development of the most efficient means of using resources, e.g., the funding, the controlled use of supervisors. It would seem logical to carry the process one step further and say that the incorporation of only outstanding students into the program would cause the institution to be the most effective, but there is no mention of either recruitment or selection of outstanding students as having a significant role.

University of New Mexico. The University of New Mexico combined the teaching of methods courses and actual laboratory experiences into a modular approach. By scheduling courses consecutively rather than concurrently, there was time for immediate follow-up laboratory experience. The program implemented "intensive study of the content of methodology of the single subject in the university followed by an intensive laboratory experience in that subject in an elementary classroom."<sup>15</sup>

The characteristics of this program were (1) a combination of instructional theory and classroom practice

into a single integral of time, (2) "the utilization of the satellite public schools for laboratory experiences and the staffing of these schools by resident clinical supervisors who coordinate the university program and teach in-school, in-service seminars,"<sup>16</sup> and (3) the use of teaching - supervising teams composed of faculty members, graduate students in education and public school personnel "who are participants in a teacher exchange program between the university and the cooperating public school system."<sup>17</sup> The program was financed jointly by the university and the public schools system.

The University of New Mexico, as did the University of Maryland, followed closely the guidelines set forth by the AACTE. The major area of similarity was in the joint effort of the public schools and the university.<sup>18</sup> It was this basic characteristic which gave the university its outstanding award.

The university also employed a unique use of laboratory and clinical experience. Of this aspect, the committee said:

The professional studies component of each curriculum includes the systematic study of teaching and learning theory with appropriate laboratory and clinical experience.<sup>19</sup>

A step in the right direction for the university as far as the association is concerned.

into a single integral of time, (2) "the utilization of the satellite public schools for laboratory experiences and the staffing of these schools by resident clinical supervisors who coordinate the university program and teach in-school, in-service seminars,"<sup>16</sup> and (3) the use of teaching - supervising teams composed of faculty members, graduate students in education and public school personnel "who are participants in a teacher exchange program between the university and the cooperating public school system."<sup>17</sup> The program was financed jointly by the university and the public schools system.

The University of New Mexico, as did the University of Maryland, followed closely the guidelines set forth by the AACTE. The major area of similarity was in the joint effort of the public schools and the university.<sup>18</sup> It was this basic characteristic which gave the university its outstanding award.

The university also employed a unique use of laboratory and clinical experience. Of this aspect, the committee said:

The professional studies component of each curriculum includes the systematic study of teaching and learning theory with appropriate laboratory and clinical experience.<sup>19</sup>

A step in the right direction for the university as far as the association is concerned.

Again the university is characterized by efficiency. Every characteristic that was listed shows an attempt to gain greatest use of time, personnel and facilities, e.g., combination of instructional theory and classroom practice, utilization of public schools, supervising teams, joint financing. All indicates efficient planning. But, again resembling the University of Maryland, no mention is made of the importance of recruiting and selecting.

Western Michigan University. This university was given recognition for its development of a master's degree program for teaching of culturally and educationally deprived children and youth. The main purpose of this program was "to develop teachers' empathy with lives, the values, the customs, and the difficulties of the disadvantaged children they intend to teach."<sup>20</sup> The program also wanted to better the necessary qualification of college professors who prepare teachers for the disadvantaged.

Features of the program included:

- (1) preservice teachers directly involved with the disadvantaged,
- (2) the use of consultant specialists in informal seminars,
- (3) supervised teaching in camp counseling experience for eight weeks with either migrant or inner-city children,



- (4) faculty counseling to familiarize the students with and prepare them to deal with the problems of the poor,
- (5) sensitivity training to aid students and teachers to accept and deal with new challenges in the teaching of the disadvantaged,
- (6) evaluation of the program which indicates positive changes in attitudes and in the readiness for working with deprived children.

The program upon evaluation appears to be excitingly close to reaching its goals. There is:

a strong emotional commitment to the education of the disadvantaged on the part of students and faculty. There has also developed a greater understanding of the social forces which create poverty, of the psychological problems of the poor, and of the role the schools can play in helping the poor to a better place in society.<sup>21</sup>

These results parallel closely the standards set forth by the committee in the area of curriculum.

"Teacher education curricula are based on objectives reflecting the institution's conception of the teacher's role..."<sup>22</sup> For this institution the teacher's role includes an empathetic being, fully aware of and capable of dealing with the problems of the disadvantaged.

This institution has placed the student in a rather unfortunate position. It appears that the student, according to the program, need only be receptive to new ideas. The institution feels that its program has the

necessary methods to instill their students with the characteristics needed to teach the disadvantaged.

San Francisco State College. This program includes such features as, for example, a year long experience in the classroom as teacher assistants, student teachers, and teacher interns. The instruction and curriculum are concurrent with and related to direct experiences in the classroom by the use of seminars, small group discussions and individualized attention. Six to eight students met in counseling sessions every week to explore and develop their self-image along with their professional image. The program used in-service education activities as a parallel and/or compliment to their preservice program. The progress was checked by an evaluation and research program.

San Francisco State College placed slightly more importance on the student than did the other universities discussed thus far. But the emphasis was placed upon the development of the teacher personality within the student rather than the actual recruitment or selection of the students.

The program is similar to the others discussed because of its use of coordinating schools, personnel and evaluation procedures. (See footnotes 13, 14, 18 and 19). Whether or not the institution envisions only certain personality

designs to be capable of assuming the teacher personality, cannot be answered with the available information.

Saint Olaf College. Saint Olaf designed a program entitled, "Perspective on Teaching Program". It was used to provide extensive experience in teaching activities for those sophomore students who sought out career counseling and also to provide a background of various teaching experiences "pertinent to required course work in professional education."<sup>23</sup> A three-day seminar on secondary education was followed by three different teaching experiences with each student being assigned to cooperating teachers. The students spend a week in rural community school, a suburban junior high school, and in the third week the students have a choice of assignments in some area of special education. The three assignments are built around the proposition: "If I had one week to show college sophomores what teaching is about, I would..."<sup>24</sup> The final two days are spent in seminar, exchanging ideas while the students precede with their own evaluations and decisions.

It appears that this is merely an extension of a recruitment program. It shows some students the great expanse that is covered by the teaching profession, and hopefully encourages them to consider teaching as a profession and adds more incentive to those who are already committed.

To those who continue with the program, their assignments would make their choice of fields a choice of knowledge gained from experience rather than a haphazard guess. This in itself would be a tremendous aid to the institution, since they would, hopefully, not be required to spend as much time with guidance, and use their time for planning and implementing new aspects within their program.

Towson State College. Along with these five universities who were presented awards, the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education identified five other colleges with special recognition awards. Of these colleges the Towson State College program should be reviewed.

"This program is a unique adventure in teacher education."<sup>25</sup> It provides "an interdisciplinary, interinstitutional, and incultural contractual agreement."<sup>26</sup> This creates a union of theory and practice in the inner city. It also has an integrated staff and students, a full school year of intern teaching and supervision, a stipend which is granted during internship, learning centers located in public schools, and interschool, multilevel visitations. The program is the only one which mentions recruitment as such as having a role in creating an outstanding institution. The association does not, however, mention the kind of recruitment which is used at Towson. It could be the traditional brochure hand-out or it could

be an intensive search for "qualified" students.

### Summary

There are many aspects involved in the development and implementation of an outstanding teacher education program. Very little work has been done in the area of defining such a program. Of the many teacher associations, the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education is the one which has given the most contribution to this field.

In the association's search of inspiring improvement within institutions it has reached many people. Judging on the basis of the awards, it appears as though the primary concern in the developing of an outstanding program is efficiency. If all resources are used to the institution's and the student's best advantage, then there is an outstanding program within the institution.

The association places more emphasis on the recruitment and selection of students, than did many institutions previous to the second world war. The exact role which these procedures play is not made clear. There is no criteria which is recognized as being essential in the screening of students. There is not even an indication of what specific characteristics should be sought or if there even are characteristics essential if an individual plans to become a good teacher, and acquire "the teacher personality."

It would seem then that the "outstanding" program is merely the efficient program. It is that program which can produce the best teachers with the most wise use of time and money.

## NOTES

- 1 Bruce J. Biddle and William J. Ellena (eds.), Contemporary Research on Teacher Effectiveness. (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1964), p.2.
- 2 Ibid, p. 4.
- 3 "Recommended Standards for Teacher Education," prepared by Evaluative Criteria Study Committee, AACTE, Washington, D. C., March 1970, p. 1.
- 4 Ibid, pp. 3-7.
- 5 Ibid, p. 7.
- 6 Ibid, pp. 7-9.
- 7 Ibid, p. 9.
- 8 Ibid, p. 12.
- 9 Ibid, p. 13.
- 10 Ibid, p. 10.
- 11 "Excellence in Teacher Education: 1968 Distinguished Achievement Awards of the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education." Washington, D. C., 1968. p. 7.
- 12 Ibid, p. 7.
- 13 "Recommended Standards," op.cit., p. 8.
- 14 Ibid, pp. 5-6.
- 15 "Excellence in Teacher Education," op.cit., p. 8.
- 16 Ibid, p. 8.
- 17 Ibid, p. 8.
- 18 "Recommended Standards," op.cit., p.8.
- 19 Ibid, pp. 5-6.
- 20 "Excellence in Teacher Education," op.cit., p. 9.
- 21 Ibid, p. 9.

- 22 "Recommended Standards," op.cit., p. 3.
- 23 "Excellence in Teacher Education," op.cit., p. 11.
- 24 Ibid, p. 11.
- 25 Ibid, p. 13.
- 26 Ibid, p. 13.



## THE STUDENT

The idea of an excellent student is rather difficult to conceptualize. The standards by which one must measure an individual are extremely arbitrary, each person having his own unique set of values by which he judges others. It would seem likely that one should define the concept of the outstanding student in terms of his potential to become an outstanding teacher. Even though there has been an extraordinary amount of research on the subject of the "teacher personality" within the last fifty years, very little is actually known about the relationship between teacher personality and teacher effectiveness.<sup>1</sup>

According to a 1926 conference, the teacher personality is unique from all other personalities. There are three outstanding characteristics which help distinguish him: his character, his general knowledge of subject matter, and his methods.

Personality stands first. It is the teacher's personality that places one teacher above another. It is not knowledge or methods alone that tell. It is the ability to apply and use them in the right spirit, and the power to attract attention to them that counts in teaching.<sup>2</sup>

Again the characteristics of an outstanding teacher that are being studied are elusive and difficult to

measure accurately. If the profession has decided upon the qualities that produce an outstanding teacher, how will they find candidates that show promise for this type of personality development? Or do the candidates already have to possess these characteristics? If they do possess them, how can one show that some possess them and others don't in a controlled scientific manner?

All of the above questions remained unanswered in the late twenties. The profession was still concerned with "the right spirit," a most elusive characteristic to capture.

In recent years research has taken a slightly different approach. Researchers realize that

....personality is a complex and dynamic entity composed of many equally complex and dynamic forces constantly undergoing changes. For this reason, if no other, most searches for single qualities depicting effective teachers in various and nonspecific situations have been unfruitful.<sup>3</sup>

What is needed is the discovery of specific, unique characteristics of the teacher personality and the effective teacher rather than research which leads only to the repetition of the self-evident -- that the teacher must be able to relate to children, have a certain type of formal education, etc.<sup>4</sup>

In a study by Symonds and Dudek, it was found that there are four factors distinguishing the best teachers

from the poorer. These were:

- (1) personality organization
- (2) judgment of reasoning
- (3) capacity to relate to others
- (4) aggression.<sup>5</sup>

There have not been developed as yet any means by which these characteristics can be measured. It is for this reason that the focus of research studies have shifted.

It is now believed that teaching is chosen as a profession because of emotional needs of the individual as opposed to purely intellectual interest. Therefore, it is felt, institutions should inquire into the motivations of their prospective candidates.<sup>6</sup> Some of the literature discussed the "trouble" in teacher training colleges which contained students who had no intention of becoming teachers. Of these colleges, Judd said,

In some of the states the public institutions organized for the training of teachers are attended by many students who have no intention of becoming teachers but register in these institutions because they are easily accessible geographically and because they do not charge tuition.<sup>7</sup>

A sorry fate for the profession indeed if better screening procedures do not appear.

In 1963 the sex role versus the occupation role approach was thoroughly studied, according to the literature.

The questionnaire in one study was distributed to a national sample of beginning teachers. It was found that relatively few new teachers planned to continue with teaching as a career through retirement. Many of the women expressed desire to leave their teaching position at least temporarily for homemaking. Many of the men saw their position as a stepping stone into supervisory and administrative posts. The study concluded that there is obviously a definite need to make teaching a more rewarding occupation for men, and to reduce the conflict between occupational and family responsibilities for women, if the profession wishes to retain its staff.<sup>8</sup> And, as Willcox and Beigel had indicated in footnote 6, the teacher training institution must be better informed about motivations of their teacher candidates. In 1953 these two authors were still suggesting the use of personality tests which most investigations of teacher qualification deemed necessary.

To know what the adult formulation of the original motive is, personality tests already at hand should be used and new ones developed which will have specific validity with respect to trait configurations of good teachers.<sup>9</sup>

More current literature implies that students seem to select a career and thus the institution because they have certain needs they feel compelled to fulfill. Further

investigation is needed to establish what these needs are and how they affect the individual.

One of the early studies of this phenomenon, "Occupational Choice and the Teaching Career," saw that it would be safe to assume that a teacher chooses teaching because of "his understanding of his relation to various social institutions, his values, his needs, and the like."<sup>10</sup> The career, then, "may be viewed as the means by which individual and collective lives are articulated."<sup>11</sup> It will provide a person with the roles he will play during his life.

The above study attempted to answer several basic questions. First, does the definition of a career so limit the roles that only certain types of personalities enter the preliminary stages? Secondly, as the career demands become more specific, do they exert such pressures that the personality type appropriate to the career tend to fall into a single pattern? A corollary question asks if the career roles force out personalities that are not the same as the dominant career type. And thirdly, how adequate are the individuals who conform closely to the dominant career type as contrasted with the deviate types?

In the initial study, 366 teachers of both sexes and at all levels from first grade through high school took part. The study used the Edwards Personal Preference

Schedule which measures the following personality variables:

Achievement - to accomplish demanding tasks; to be able to do things better than others.

Deference - to yield to the leadership and judgment of others.

Order - to organize one's work and personal life systematically.

Exhibition - to talk cleverly for the sake of impressing others; to be the center of attention.

Autonomy - to act without regard to the opinions of others.

Affiliation - to form many strong friendships and to share experiences.

Intracception - to observe and analyze the behavior of one's self and of others.

Succorance - to gain encouragement and sympathy from others when one is depressed or hurt.

Dominance - to lead; to make decisions and to influence others.

Abasement - to feel timid and inferior to others and accept blame for things that go wrong.

Nurturance - to show sympathy and generosity toward those who are in trouble.

Change - to seek new experiences and new acquaintances.

Endurance - to work at a task until it is completed.

Heterosexuality - to be interested in members of the opposite sex and in the subject of sex.

Aggression - to show anger and criticize others openly.12

The study found that the teachers were characterized by high deference, order, and endurance. They were also characterized by low heterosexuality, dominance, and exhibition. These needs can probably be taken as representative of an emergent occupational pattern found in teachers with ten or more years of experience.

In administering the tests to different groups of trainees, the investigators found that "The decision to enter a specific profession is made only after the individual has spent one or two years in the institution in which he will ultimately receive his professional preparation. Such individuals would be school-oriented rather than profession-oriented."<sup>13</sup>

Some groups of trainees showed that their need patterns conformed more to an institutional press rather than to a professional press. This shows that some students choose the school because of congruence between their personalities and the demands of their chosen profession.

In studying a Black group they found that the need pattern seemed to be a cultural one rather than the need pattern for teacher trainees. The investigators concluded that "since institutional choice is probably severely limited for this group, one might not expect to find the same kind of 'school-oriented' patterns previously discussed."<sup>14</sup>

In the same research with 35 students from a private teachers college, a well-managed "technical" school, they found that without exception the need pattern of this group and the veterans teacher group were the same.

In the light of these figures, the data are highly suggestive. Multi-purpose institutions apparently are able to develop a unique press to which students conform despite their choice of a profession which has a markedly different personality press.<sup>15</sup>

It is interesting to note, however, that

...institutions designed particularly for the task of teacher training impose a personality press which conforms remarkable to the professional press.<sup>16</sup>

How the institution develops the personality requirements of a teacher within the student, how the students make choices, and why some students willingly submit to two distinct patterns of personality are problems which remain to be solved.<sup>17</sup>

The study also found that

the length of time spent by the student in the training institution apparently has little or no effect upon his personality structure. ...These results accentuate the strength of the press imposed by the training institution and also the effectiveness, in terms of personality of the formal and informal means by which prospective teachers select their training institutions and are selected by them.<sup>18</sup>



This particular study continued by attempting to discover if groups which differed initially due to the type of institution from which they graduated remained different as experience accumulated. It was found that somehow, the initial differences in personality disappear and emerge into a common personality pattern. "Whether or not this process occurs by genuine change in non-conformist personalities or by attrition as nonconformist drop outs remains a moot question."<sup>19</sup>

This study supports the evidence that teachers are drawn to the profession because of basic emotional needs. Certain types of personalities are attracted to teaching and apparently only certain personalities remain in teaching. This study does not, however, aid in discovering what type of personality creates an outstanding teacher. What characteristics should be sought in selecting candidates is another question left unanswered.

It seems rather a useless effort to even attempt to find the characteristics deemed necessary to become a "good" teacher. Estimating the potential success of teacher education candidates tends to be subjective. Through all the investigations of teachers' backgrounds and idiosyncrasies, evaluations made by campus supervisors has proven to be the most reliable measuring device for predicting success of neophyte teachers.<sup>20</sup> Should one then merely allow the campus supervision to

say who will or will not make a good teacher or should one instead continue the search for the outstanding candidate?

The University of California at Los Angeles in a 1968 publication revealed its standards for admission of candidates into their two-year college.

To be selected an individual needed to have:

1. A post graduate degree or the equivalent, requiring a minimum of five years of university preparation.
2. Forty-five semester hours of course work in four of the six areas listed below had to be taken from UCLA or an approved school.
  - a. Humanities
  - b. Social Sciences
  - c. Natural Sciences
  - d. Mathematics
  - e. Fine Arts
  - f. Foreign Languages
3. A major and a minor in a subject normally taught in the junior college.
4. An undergraduate grade-point average of 3.0 or higher; a minimum grade-point average of 2.75 in major or minor work; a grade-point of 3.0 in graduate work (A=4.0)
5. The tests required for admission at the graduate level.
  - a. The Graduate Record Examination or the Miller Analogies and the Doppelt Mathematics Test,
  - b. Specialized tests in the candidate's teaching field and,
  - c. Personality inventories.
6. Satisfactory ratings in group and individual interviews.
7. Effective oral and written skills of communication.
8. Good physical and mental health.
9. United States citizenship.
10. Satisfactory letters of recommendation.<sup>21</sup>

The school places its emphasis on the above general aspects of a person's background rather than upon his personality. Upon re-examining the list there are only two factors relating to personality. And yet, research up to now, shows that it is the personality which makes the teacher.

The above university is typical in its selection procedures. Most universities do classify their students by academic achievement, rather than by personal development.

### Conclusion

The profession as a whole has not agreed upon a definition of an outstanding student. Judging from the criteria of selection procedures used by the universities, the outstanding student is usually distinguished from others primarily by grades. An individual maintaining a certain grade point average can easily and is often chosen before the individual who if given the opportunity could perhaps become a better, more efficient teacher. Within the last few years, the concept of the teacher personality has begun developing.

Recent research has indicated that the teacher has a unique personality. Researchers have begun to concentrate on discovering characteristics of the teacher personality, but as of now, there is very little known. Studies are, however, being aimed at formulating means of distinguishing the potentially excellent teachers from those of average or below average ability. If this can be done the methods of recruiting and selecting shall be greatly enhanced. As it will be shown later, institutions are severely limited in so far as active recruitment and screening are concerned.

## N O T E S

<sup>1</sup> N. L. Gage (Ed.), Handbook of Research on Teaching, (Chicago: Rand McNalley & Co., 1963), p. 574.

<sup>2</sup> Problems in Teacher Training: Proceedings of the 1926 Spring Conference Conducted by the Normal School and Teacher College Section of the New York Society for the Experimental Study of Education, (New York: World Book Company, Vol. 1, 1928), pp. 275-76.

<sup>3</sup> Arthur M. Cohen & Florence B. Brawer, "Adaptive Potential and First Year Teaching Success," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume XVIII, No. 2, Summer 1965, pp. 180.

<sup>4</sup> Gage, Op.cit., p. 574.

<sup>5</sup> Cohen, Op.cit., p. 180.

<sup>6</sup> Isabel Willcox and Hugo G. Beigel, "Motivations in the Choice of Teaching," The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume IV, No. 1, March 1953, p. 109.

<sup>7</sup> Charles H. Judd, Preparation of School Personnel: Report of the Regent's Inquiry. (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 1938), p. 25.

<sup>8</sup> W. W. Charters, Jr. and N. L. Gage, (Eds), Readings in the Social Psychology of Education. (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc. 1963), p. 286.

<sup>9</sup> Willcox, Op.cit., p. 109.

<sup>10</sup> Charters, Op.cit., p. 271.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid., p. 271.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid., p. 272.

<sup>13</sup> Ibid., p. 273.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid., p. 275.

<sup>15</sup> Ibid., p. 275.

<sup>16</sup> Ibid., p. 275.

<sup>17</sup> Ibid., p. 275.

18 Ibid., pp. 275-276.

19 Ibid., p. 277.

• 20 Cohen, Op.cit., pp. 179-180.

21 Arthur M. Cohen and Florence B. Brawer,  
Focus on Learning: Preparing Teachers for the Two Year  
College, (Los Angeles: University of California, 1968),  
pp. 17-18.

## THE STUDENT IN THE PROGRAM

Judging from some literature it seems that the student plays an almost insignificant role in the institution. It has been said that the university has become a corporation. Its main desire is to recruit superior faculty (faculty sometimes more interesting in publication than in teaching) and by so doing increase its prestige and money intake.<sup>1</sup> "To suggest that the real purpose of liberal arts education for non-specialists is to teach them to help make their society and culture express the best that is in man would be to risk being labeled Victorian, naive, radical, or simply absurd... As with all bureaucracies, the administration is primarily interested in extending the power, prestige, and wealth of their institution."<sup>2</sup> In such an institution it is the student who suffers. "The student level of performance is checked but not raised. Improvement, when it occurs, will be a chance by-product of irrelevance."<sup>3</sup>

This is definitely a cynical point of view, but still many people seem to agree with this concept.

Organizations such as the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education feel that the students needs to participate more fully. He should have a voice not only in the classroom but in the development of curricula and the evaluation of existing programs. It is thought that the student's perspective is essential in maintaining

an outstanding program.<sup>4</sup>

At present few institutions allow students active participation in the planning and implementation of programs. Final decisions, even with student input, are still made by the administrators who, in the end, are held accountable for everything that happens or does not happen.

This seems to hold constant for teacher education programs as well. The student has little effect on the development of a program. Whether or not the student has effect on the maintenance of program quality, must be queried. Few professionals seem to take active interest in checking the quality of teacher that is finally placed in the field.

As American nationalism, the national economy, and the mass media reflect an increasing uniform color, colleges tend to copy one another in order to be sure of keeping their programs acceptable as certificates of respectability.<sup>5</sup>

The schools are apparently not interested in quality of program they develop for their students, but instead, for the prestige their programs can bring to the institution. The institutions are willing to lose some individuality to fit the pattern of the "top" schools without questioning what effect such an action would have upon the students.

Since there has been no evidence that supports the theory that students play an important part in teacher



an outstanding program.<sup>4</sup>

At present few institutions allow students active participation in the planning and implementation of programs. Final decisions, even with student input, are still made by the administrators who, in the end, are held accountable for everything that happens or does not happen.

This seems to hold constant for teacher education programs as well. The student has little effect on the development of a program. Whether or not the student has effect on the maintenance of program quality, must be queried. Few professionals seem to take active interest in checking the quality of teacher that is finally placed in the field.

As American nationalism, the national economy, and the mass media reflect an increasing uniform color, colleges tend to copy one another in order to be sure of keeping their programs acceptable as certificates of respectability.<sup>5</sup>

The schools are apparently not interested in quality of program they develop for their students, but instead, for the prestige their programs can bring to the institution. The institutions are willing to lose some individuality to fit the pattern of the "top" schools without questioning what effect such an action would have upon the students.

Since there has been no evidence that supports the theory that students play an important part in teacher

education programs, there is no reason to believe that the outstanding student should have any effect either. If one is to believe the literature, it would appear that the student is a victim of the university corporate system. They are fed into the machine and ground out, mere zombies in their respective fields. "The student is pushed toward a mindless apathy to all but his career by virtue of the structure of the college itself."<sup>6</sup>

This is definitely a pessimistic point of view. Let it be hoped that such organizations as the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education will have a positive influence to reverse the system and make institutions provide a more personalized and meaningful education for its students.

## NOTES

1 Radical Perspectives on Social Problems,  
Frank Lindenfeld (ed.). (London: The Macmillan Company,  
1969.) pp. 84-85.

2 Ibid., p. 89.

3 Ibid., p. 86.

4 Recommended Standards for Teacher Education.  
Prepared by Evaluation Criteria Study Committee. The  
American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education,  
Washington, D. C. March, 1970. p.3.

5 Lindenfeld, Op.cit., p. 78.

6 Ibid., p. 83.

## RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION

Now that the outstanding student and program and how they relate to each other in the institution have been discussed, the question of how recruitment and selection of outstanding students affects the program may be answered.

The effect actual recruitment of outstanding students has upon establishing an outstanding teacher education program seems to be very limited. It appears that very few institutions, if any, actively recruit for their program. Most professionals agree that an institution should be selective of their students but find limitations on their selection possibilities for any number of reasons.

The concepts influencing recruitment and selection will be discussed. For example, the motivations of the institution in recruiting and selecting are an important factor. It must be asked if the institution wishes to improve any aspect of the teaching profession by being discriminatory, or if they are merely herding students in and out to meet the supply and demand of teachers in the field.

### Recruitment

The concept of recruitment has not been altered greatly in this century. Recruitment, according to a 1950 study, is defined as:

the dispensing of accurate information concerning the significance of careers in education and the satisfactions teachers find in their work.<sup>1</sup>

The colleges surveyed for this study emphasized three incentives for becoming a teacher. These were:

- (1) opportunity for service;
- (2) social significance; and
- (3) joy of working with children.<sup>2</sup>

The preceding definition of recruitment is not distant from the one found in the 1928 studies of advertising the good features of the teaching career. Teacher training institutions were still operating on the assumption that telling about the virtues of the profession would attract many "good" candidates. As late as 1946, educators still stated that

If the advantages of the teaching profession - its social worth and personal satisfactions - are adequately set forth there can be little doubt that more able persons will be attracted to it.<sup>3</sup>

Today, even though it is still emphasizing the non-material receiving and giving in the teaching profession, there appears to be a stronger emphasis on the psychology of the teacher. There is a realization, as has been indicated previously, that people are drawn to teaching to satisfy personal needs. Recent studies, therefore, have emphasized the teaching personality in an attempt to develop better recruitment and selection techniques.

Many feel that the primary approach to recruitment should be the development of first-rate programs of vocational guidance. Recruitment should be considered the joint responsibility of both high schools and colleges and should receive "helpful support" from state departments of education.<sup>4</sup> Thus far, this type of recruiting has been limited mainly to the area of individual counseling at the high school level. Few states use mass media to lure students into their programs. If they do, it is usually in the form of university catalogues or the use of special pamphlets distributed to prospective students. This process of literature distribution is naturally not highly discriminatory.<sup>5</sup>

Recruitment of "outstanding" students is a topic which the literature does not identify. There is an indication that recruitment is heavily dependent on teacher supply and demand. Institutions are actively concerned with promoting the teaching profession only because they have not met their quota of number of teachers they are expected to turn out. When they have reached or surpassed their quota, institutions can become selective in their choice of teacher education candidates. This indicates that the "outstanding" student has no more selective advantage over the average student as long as the institution's quota is in danger of not being met.

The fear that the profession may be passing by outstanding candidates has always been in the literature.

In the late forties it was said,

There can be no doubt that many young men and women capable of becoming superior teachers never even consider entering the profession. This is partly because its rewards are never sufficiently called to their attention, partly because they cannot afford the preparation required.<sup>6</sup>

It seems that if educators and teacher education institutions were sufficiently interested in improving the quality of students at their college they would find means by which to better the chances of bringing in the outstanding student, such as by making more scholarships available, and, of course, by actively promoting their institution. If this has been done on any large scale, it has not been recorded in the literature.

In a study conducted in 1950, it was found that those institutions that appeared to have "the most active, well-coordinated programs of recruitment" had delegated the responsibility of recruitment to specific personnel. Most colleges indicated that the entire faculty had the responsibility of recruitment rather than just a particular group or individual. Thirty-four per cent of the colleges mentioned the president and dean of education as the individuals who held most of the responsibility for recruit-

ing. Almost a quarter of the colleges had special committees for recruitment. There were a total of twenty-one other categories of individuals or groups listed by the various colleges as possible for recruitment efforts. One college went so far as to have a full-time recruitment field worker.

The colleges taking part in the study indicated that the social virtue of service to the community in a socially significant position, and the personal joy of working with children were the incentives they most frequently emphasized. Even though these are parallel to research findings as to the reasons people enter the teaching profession, the study felt there was insufficient attention given to some appeals to youth. Such items as the advantages of having a two to three month vacation for those individuals who want to continue their education should have been more highly stressed. The fact that there is offered reasonable security within the teaching profession was neglected in most cases. It was thought that colleges in states having good retirement benefits, tenure, and relatively high minimum salaries, should stress these advantages.<sup>7</sup>

It would appear that recruitment practices are extremely weak in bringing people into the profession. The actual recruiting procedures are extremely limited and few do more than stress the social virtues of teaching.



This does not imply, however, that the teacher education institutions are oblivious to their need of securing suitable candidates. The primary force in obtaining outstanding candidates for the teaching profession is through selection.

### Selection

Selection has a much more extensive role in the teacher education institutions than does recruitment. Selection is, of course, limited to the extent that the choice of candidates must be made from those individuals who have expressed a desire to enter the teaching profession. It has, however, proved to be the greatest influence in the eventual certification of a teacher. In the first part of this century when the need for teachers was so extensive, the institutions were unable to be highly selective. In recent years, as the pressure for increasing numbers of teachers has declined, institutions have been able to show greater selective discrimination in the quality of teacher they put into the field.

Selection is usually done at different levels throughout the course of the teacher training program. Selection should, in general, be a successive movement, cumulating evidence to be used as a means for periodical reevaluation of earlier decisions.<sup>8</sup> By this means a teacher education candidate is measured for his teaching

abilities at all levels of training not just at the point he initially enters the institution, thus he is checked for potential and activation of that potential into reality.

Noting the lack of uniformity in the nation in selecting teacher candidates, Troger and Pace complain that

Laws make the selective admission of students difficult in some states, while in other states selective admission is mandatory.<sup>9</sup>

Perhaps this is one of the reasons why there is such a dearth of literature in finding how "outstanding" institutions recruit "outstanding" students. Each institution would have to study in depth its own programs because there are fundamental differences between the various programs across the nation.

#### Recruitment and Selection Procedures

There is a wide variety of actual recruitment and selection procedures. It seems as though most teacher colleges have bettered themselves primarily by requiring high standards of their candidates.

In 1963, a survey of 121 colleges by the American Association for Colleges of Teacher Education (AACTE), indicated that a majority of teacher colleges have higher admission requirements than other colleges.<sup>10</sup>

Most universities admit students either by high school

diploma from an accredited high school, or by examination. A 1946 study showed that ninety per cent of all institutions use either one or both methods in accepting students for admission. It further states that many colleges felt that a student's high school record was a reliable indication of the capability of the student. The most important of all considerations in reviewing a student's application was almost always scholarship.<sup>11</sup> It is here that the differences between the teacher education programs and the university itself emerge.

A higher grade-point average is generally needed when applying to enter teacher education than for initial admission into the college. Approximately half of the colleges surveyed used some scholastic aptitude test for selection and admission but very few required aptitude, personality, or teacher-attitude ratings. Almost all colleges surveyed required a recommendation from some faculty member who had had contact with the student. Whether it be from the dean of students or an instructor in the student's minor field was irrelevant. Some colleges included such factors as health, English proficiency, and social maturity in selecting their candidates.<sup>12</sup>

These requirements are definitely more rigorous than the few stipulations the university places on incoming students. The respondents to the survey were asked, "How do the students in teacher education compare with other

students on your campus in regard to intellectual capacity, high school standing, grade point average, etcetera?"

The answers to this question indicated that in 59 of the institutions, students entering teacher education were of a stronger caliber than the average of their institution. Fifty-four colleges reported their student average about the same as those in other fields of preparation, while only five indicated their teacher education students ranked below average. This is very enlightening and is a rather sharp refutation of the trite comment, "Those who can't, teach." <sup>13</sup> However, like so many surveys, this may merely reflect opinions of many people. Also there are many qualities that are not measurable. For example, what is meant by "stronger caliber?"

This information is indeed very enlightening but the means by which this was achieved must be more clearly understood. The methods used to recruit competent students are given in the following table:

SEE NEXT PAGE

students on your campus in regard to intellectual capacity, high school standing, grade point average, etcetera?"

The answers to this question indicated that in 59 of the institutions, students entering teacher education were of a stronger caliber than the average of their institution. Fifty-four colleges reported their student average about the same as those in other fields of preparation, while only five indicated their teacher education students ranked below average. This is very enlightening and is a rather sharp refutation of the trite comment, "Those who can't, teach." <sup>13</sup> However, like so many surveys, this may merely reflect opinions of many people. Also there are many qualities that are not measurable. For example, what is meant by "stronger caliber?"

This information is indeed very enlightening but the means by which this was achieved must be more clearly understood. The methods used to recruit competent students are given in the following table:

SEE NEXT PAGE

TABLE I 1.4

MEANS USED TO ENCOURAGE COMPETENT STUDENTS  
TO GO INTO TEACHING

Means of Encouragement	Total Colleges	
	Number	Percent
Student National Education Association (SNEA)---	36	29.7%
Major professors in personal conferences-----	20	16.5
Guidance-----	19	15.7
Orientation of freshman class-----	15	12.3
Brochures-----	14	11.5
Talks with student groups on career days-----	11	9.0
Members of department of education-----	10	8.2
Endorsement and cooperation of other departments of college-----	9	7.4
Talks to freshman class-----	9	7.4
Student Education Association arouses interest	8	6.6
Faculty advisers-----	8	6.6
Announcements on bulletin boards and at assembly-----	7	5.7
Provides favorable climate of opinion-----	6	5.0
Introductory course in "Philosophy and History of Education"-----	6	5.0
Nothing was listed-----	6	5.0
Working through high schools-----	5	4.0
Offer placement service-----	4	3.5
Scholarships-----	4	3.5
High school future teachers' organizations---	4	3.5
Sponsorship of student teachers association---	3	2.5
Seminars-----	3	2.5
No need for recruitment (Most want to teach)---	3	2.5
Former students now teaching-----	3	2.5
Faculty-student contact outside classroom----	3	2.5
Improved teacher education program-----	2	1.5
Stress responsibility to teach children-----	2	1.5
Tradition-----	2	1.5
Teacher education battery of tests-----	2	1.5
Talks to sophomores-----	2	1.5
Teacher-career month observed-----	2	1.5
Upper classmen in teacher education meet with freshmen and answer questions-----	2	1.5
Orientation course (no credit)-----	2	1.5
Student newspaper-----	2	1.5
Higher standards for admission to teacher education-----	2	1.5
Personnel dean-----	2	1.5
References in catalog-----	2	1.5

TABLE I 1.4

MEANS USED TO ENCOURAGE COMPETENT STUDENTS  
TO GO INTO TEACHING

Means of Encouragement	Total Colleges	
	Number	Percent
Student National Education Association (SNEA)---	36	29.7%
Major professors in personal conferences-----	20	16.5
Guidance-----	19	15.7
Orientation of freshman class-----	15	12.3
Brochures-----	14	11.5
Talks with student groups on career days-----	11	9.0
Members of department of education-----	10	8.2
Endorsement and cooperation of other departments of college-----	9	7.4
Talks to freshman class-----	9	7.4
Student Education Association arouses interest	8	6.6
Faculty advisers-----	8	6.6
Announcements on bulletin boards and at assembly-----	7	5.7
Provides favorable climate of opinion-----	6	5.0
Introductory course in "Philosophy and History of Education"-----	6	5.0
Nothing was listed-----	6	5.0
Working through high schools-----	5	4.0
Offer placement service-----	4	3.5
Scholarships-----	4	3.5
High school future teachers' organizations----	4	3.5
Sponsorship of student teachers association---	3	2.5
Seminars-----	3	2.5
No need for recruitment (Most want to teach)---	3	2.5
Former students now teaching-----	3	2.5
Faculty-student contact outside classroom-----	3	2.5
Improved teacher education program-----	2	1.5
Stress responsibility to teach children-----	2	1.5
Tradition-----	2	1.5
Teacher education battery of tests-----	2	1.5
Talks to sophomores-----	2	1.5
Teacher-career month observed-----	2	1.5
Upper classmen in teacher education meet with freshmen and answer questions-----	2	1.5
Orientation course (no credit)-----	2	1.5
Student newspaper-----	2	1.5
Higher standards for admission to teacher education-----	2	1.5
Personnel dean-----	2	1.5
Features in catalog-----	2	1.5

Table I shows most of the means by which colleges recruited in the sixties. Hopefully, they are all methods to recruit top candidates. However, since more recent literature shows only those with certain needs let themselves be recruited, this list loses some of its apparent validity.

The colleges surveyed also had different focuses in their teacher education councils.

Teacher education councils in 17 of these colleges work at the development of programs for teacher education; 15 concern themselves with the improvement of such programs; 12 establish requirements for admission to teacher education; 11 screen students for teacher education; 6 work with the accrediting and professional organizations in teacher education; 6 work toward better liaison between departments; and 5 recruit for teacher education.<sup>15</sup>

Obviously, few colleges felt the importance of needed recruitment. Recruitment was secondary to many other problems.

Although only 212 colleges were surveyed, perhaps it could be concluded that these represented a pattern in teacher colleges across the nation.



Summary

The processes linking the recruitment and selection of students to teacher education programs are practically immiscible according to the literature. Recruitment, if practiced, is in most cases very superficial and in general it is non-existent for all practical purposes. Selection is, as stated, the primary force in obtaining outstanding students for the teacher programs. Until recently, selection was also extremely superficial because selection had to be curtailed in order to increase the limited supply of teachers. In general, recruitment and selection have a very insignificant role in the training institution.

## N O T E S

- 1 Loretta M. Byers, "Organization and Procedures Employed by Colleges to Recruit Candidates for Elementary School Teaching," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume 1, No. 4, December 1950, p. 295.
- 2 Ibid., p. 295.
- 3 The Improvement of Teacher Education: A Final Report by the Commission on Teacher Education, American Council on Education, Washington, D. C., 1946, p. 266.
- 4 Ibid., p. 266.
- 5 Habib Amin Kurani, Selecting the College Student in America: A Study of Theory and Practice, Teachers College, Columbia University Bureau of Publication, New York, 1931, p. 7.
- 6 The Improvement of Teacher Education, Op.cit., pp. 264-265.
- 7 Byers, Op.cit., p. 295
- 8 The Improvement of Teacher Education, Op.cit., p. 266.
- 9 Maurice E. Troger and C. Robert Pace, Evaluation in Teacher Education, American Council on Education, Washington, D. C., 1944, p. 18.
- 10 Liberal Arts College and Teacher Education: A Survey of Programs, Practices and Problems. American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education. Washington, D. C. 1963, p. 5.
- 11 Benjamin Fine. Admission to American Colleges: A Study of Current Policy and Practice, Harper and Brothers: New York 1946, p.
- 12 Liberal Arts College and Teacher Education, Op.cit., pp. 5-7.
- 13 Ibid., p. 45.
- 14 Ibid., p. 52.
- 15 Ibid., p. 9.

## HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION

The procedures which institutions employ in their effort to recruit and select, have changed very little in this century. The change has, instead, occurred in the attitudes about these procedures. The mechanics, or the logistics of implementation related to recruitment and selection are stifled.

The following section will deal primarily with the evolution of thought behind recruiting and selecting. It will attempt to discover the reasons this history took the course it did.

### Pre-World War II Literature

As early as 1917, the literature discloses that professionals were interested in the "image" of the teaching profession. To begin with, they wanted it to be thought of as a "profession." They were interested in questions asked about teaching.

The most important single question which the self-surveyor or outside surveyor can ask about the normal school is this -- how does it advertise the rewards of teaching?<sup>1</sup>

This question can be divided into many sub-questions which these professionals saw as important. These questions included:

1. In what manner do the normal school personnel approach prospective students and possible teachers about the rewards found in teaching?

2. Is teaching considered to be and thought of as a "doleful, underpaid, overworked, under-appreciated profession?"<sup>2</sup>

3. Is it portrayed as being work with no enjoyment?

4. Is it for the best type of person or only for those who can't succeed at another profession?

5. Is it merely the last possibility of a career choice available to a person or is it the first and the best choice?

6. Is it a money-earning step to another profession or is it the "best possible ability-testing, character making introduction to any profession?"<sup>3</sup>

7. Is it an unfruitful experience that should be avoided or is it a means to achieve one's own potential?

8. Is it something that is done for the financial remuneration or is it because each individual is entitled to the fullest self-expression?

9. Is it a profession for the philanthropist or for "enlightened self-interest?"

10. Is it a profession that should be avoided unless an individual plans to spend his life on it or is it a profession which gives an individual the best preparation for a lifetime?

The dichotomy which has been built around the teaching profession was formed since the beginning. The thesis makes the teaching profession an "either-or" proposition.

The cliches about it being a vocation or an occupation; a way to make money or a way to achieve self-fulfillment; a thankless profession or an exciting career; or that only those who have high qualifications or those who can't succeed in any other job should apply.<sup>4</sup>

But more than this, Allen and Pearse are concerned with the "advertising" of teaching itself. What are the teachers asking themselves and what are the "outsiders" asking? This is the question they want answered.

This article continues by offering concrete suggestions given by the authors to help the professionals answer the questions asked by the outsiders. However, little mention is made of how the professional can answer his own questions. They suggest the following ways of advertising:<sup>5</sup>

1. President's report.
2. Catalog.
3. Advertising Matter.
4. Letters to parents.
5. Letters to candidates.
6. Public bulletins.
7. Public addresses.
8. Talks of teachers.
9. Talks at assemblies.
10. Courses in management.
11. General School atmosphere.

Obras de consulta

1. Angel, Frank, Elementos para elaborar el plan de lección, Universidad de Nuevo México, Albuquerque, 1969.
2. Arbuthnot, M. H., Children and Books, ed. Scott Foresman and Company, Chicago, 1964.
3. Craig, Gerald, Certain techniques used in developing a course of study in science for the Horace Mann Elementary School, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, 1927.
4. Departamento de textos escolares, "La enseñanza y el aprendizaje de conceptos", Ministerio de Educación Pública, Quito, Ecuador, 1968.
5. Gonzales, Dolores, La enseñanza de las ciencias en la escuela primaria, the Pennsylvania State University Latin-American Education Project, Pennsylvania, 1965.
6. Gonzales, Dolores, "Léamos en Español", sin publicar, Universidad de Nuevo México, Albuquerque, 1970.
7. Jenkins, Gladys, Shacter, Helen, and Baner, William, "These Are Your Children", Scott Foresman and Company, Chicago, 1953.
8. Maslow, Abraham H., Toward a Psychology of Being, Van Nostrand, Princeton, New Jersey, 1962.

These means all seem rather superficial. They are the profession's first attempts at advertising the "good life" of teaching and have since then taken on the label of traditional. The effects such methods produced can be inferred by later research to be very limited.

Allen and Pearse suggest that, "examination of these sources will show whether advertising is calculated to draw or to repel the strongest, most ambitious, most favored personalities into teaching."<sup>6</sup>

It will be noted that the professionals already were aware that certain personalities were favored to become good teachers over others. But no definition is made of the "strongest, most ambitious, most favored personalities." At this stage of development, it could be anyone's guess. The terms are vague and wide open for definition. At this time there were still few methods of measuring "outstanding" personalities for the teaching profession.

A 1928 study suggests "that careful selection of those students entering the institutions must be made."<sup>7</sup> No mention, however, is made of formal recruitment procedures. And the selection criteria only applied to those who solicited admittance to the normal school. The institution obtained outstanding students only by chance. It had no means to actively seek the student. Its effectiveness

can be seriously questioned.

The "special" teacher has always been referred to in the literature as a great humanitarian. In the early thirties, Schleier recommended a criteria which individuals interested in becoming special teachers needed to follow in order to obtain special certification. He said all individuals after graduation from high school needed to have a minimum of two years of teacher preparation in the elementary school. This training should occur with particular emphasis on the elementary school grades kindergarten to sixth. Schleier felt that the two years of preparation would insure well-trained elementary school teachers. Of course working with "special" students should further be preceded with at least two years experience with "normal" children.<sup>8</sup>

The author further recommended that in so far as possible, the institution should choose only those individuals who expressed an earnest wish to become teachers for the handicapped. These individuals should also have

the desired personal qualifications of sympathy, patience, cheerfulness, deep understanding of humanity, keen sense of justice, firmness, tolerance, a love for work, and good health.<sup>9</sup>

Once again the teacher personality is sought. Again certain qualities were required of the individual before



admittance to the program. Again the article fails to mention any attempt to produce the person described during formal training.

Up to this time there seems to be very little that is known concerning the teacher personality. It can only be spoken of in the most general of terms. It is an illusive essence that is found in some individuals but cannot be captured. From the literature, one gathers it cannot be taught.

A conference held in 1933 at Northwestern University showed a greater degree of awareness of the problems surrounding the profession. The participants indicated a concern for the state of their teacher programs. They felt that the field of professional education was placing the area of academic preparation in a secondary position.

The early normal schools placed emphasis upon drill in the three R's, but as the total program of preparation increased the professional aspect received consideration out of all proportion to the academic.<sup>10</sup>

To aid the situation many institutions at this time extended the two-year program, weighted heavily with professional courses, to a four-year program allowing the academic subjects to develop their current status, thus creating an equilibrium and harmony for a thorough educational endeavor for the student.

Although arts colleges were the primary source of supply for high school teachers, their program for a student planning to enter teaching did not significantly differ from the student who was not. The theory practiced was:

"The kind of college education for one who expects to teach should not differ from that of anyone else."<sup>11</sup> The actual importance differentiation "has had to do merely with the selection of those subjects as majors and minors which the student expects to teach."<sup>12</sup>

The conference reflected that, the Arts Colleges had developed their curricula almost entirely without taking into account the fact that approximately fifty percent of their graduates became high school teachers.<sup>13</sup> The obvious question concerned whether or not professional education should be differentiated or if an engineer needed the same education as a teacher.

The conference concluded that "The most important problem in the preparation of teachers has to do with securing a thorough-going modification of present academic program."<sup>14</sup> The participants felt that possibly the most important factor in teacher education consisted of the type of academic preparation which the program provided. This feeling that the academic preparation is more important than the professional preparation indicates that many professionals felt there was a unique teacher

personality and no matter how many methods courses an individual was required to take, his natural abilities would have been the primary factor if he had become an outstanding teacher.

The academic aspect of teacher education was necessary so that the individual could more easily identify with his teaching experience. In the words of the conference: "This must be, both in its purpose and content, in harmony with the purposes and means of the school in which the teacher works."<sup>15</sup> This insures that, as in many cases, the program's curricula will not be mutually opposed to that which is needed for effective teaching in the classroom situation.

The conference reflected that the modification of teacher training programs should be accomplished with this awareness. Only after the public schools and the universities begin to work in complete harmony can the teaching profession reach its peak. The university must be awake to the needs of the schools. If it is not, the individual is ill-prepared to face the task before him when he enters the field. He has for all intents and purposes wasted his time. He must begin anew in an inservice approach to learn to teach. It can hardly be argued that the profession would not benefit from such conditions.

As has been indicated, before this there had seldom been any form of selection for the candidates entering the teacher training institutions. The conference recognized that candidates have different capacities and it would seem fundamental that the institutions would select those with the greatest capacity for development. The conference realized that the selection procedures which had been used were extremely inadequate. What selection had been done was largely based on scholastic rank in high school. Even though scholarship is one of the requirements of teaching it is by no means the primary one, though it was the fundamental means of selection.

In order to better understand what was needed in the area of selection, the conference sought out those institutions which have established some form of selection program. One of the universities which was discussed was the State Teachers College at Milwaukee which adopted its selection program in 1931. The program consisted in using the Henmon-Holt formula which is based on two factors: rank in high school and score in a state wide aptitude test. The general plan at Milwaukee made the first two years contain very general-nature material and the last two years were devoted largely to professional education. After the initial admission screening, further

elimination of candidates occurred after the sophomore year.

In addition to grade point average, certain other standards will be taken into account, such as achievement in silent reading and the possession of certain personality traits, particularly a pleasant speaking voice and freedom from speech defects.<sup>16</sup>

It would seem that an individual would need more than just a pleasant speaking voice to be a good teacher and yet this was one of the primary devices used in screening.

It is one of the personality traits which is emphasized as being essential to the teacher personality. Should the teaching profession recruit radio announcers? There are no individuals whose work depends so much on whether or not they have a pleasant speaking voice. Certainly this is absurd but this is what the professionals sought. This is on what they based their judgments.

Perhaps the conference can be forgiven for their limited knowledge. They continued by saying that "the educational practitioner must himself possess the skills and abilities."<sup>17</sup> This indicates that teacher programs assisted very little in the making of a teacher. The natural skill was a necessary ingredient. The programs should select those persons who are "properly qualified."

One of the problems of selection is that training

institutes can select only from those candidates who have sought entrance. Whereas many qualified women wish to enter the field of teaching, the selection of men has been much less effective. Greater public awareness of the opportunities in teaching were and still are needed. In the words of the conference, "At present the teacher's plight is due in part at least to the ease with which one can become a teacher."<sup>18</sup>

This study shows that as early as 1933, some institutions were concerned with the type of teacher candidate it selected. However, they were hampered by the lack of proper instruments. It is implied that a great problem was the need to secure teachers. The teaching field lacked qualified personnel thus, the institutions were compelled to mass produce teachers rather than allowing only the best to enter the profession.

A 1938 study prepared by Judd indicated that the selection procedures that were practiced were not accomplishing the desired results. The normal schools, according to Judd, were all selective to the point that applicants for admission were not allowed to register as freshmen if they didn't have an average of at least 72 percent on the Regents' Examination.<sup>19</sup> It appears from this article that the one examination was the total basis of selection during this time.

The reliability of such procedures must be questioned. It is hard to conceive that one examination could accurately screen students when only five years previously certain members of the profession had used the criteria of voice quality for their screening.<sup>20</sup> It would appear difficult to gain sufficient knowledge in such a short lapse of time to develop a test which had eluded the profession for so long.

Judd further points out that the institutions did not control the selection process completely at this time. He said,

More girls than boys are attracted to teaching as a profession... The less able young men, or those who are bright but cannot afford to pay the tuition at colleges and professional schools, are in many cases the ones who attend public teacher-preparing institutions.<sup>21</sup>

Obviously, Judd was not totally satisfied that the profession was getting the most "outstanding" students. He felt that the major problem was finding an effective system for selection of students that would raise the quality of candidates for the teaching profession.<sup>22</sup> As in most of the literature, he offered no suggestions as to what type of criteria might be used successfully, but instead only criticized.

Before World War II there was a dearth of literature about recruitment and selection. The procedures that existed were extremely superficial and indicated the lack of knowledge which hindered the profession. Few of the professionals were aware of the extent of the problem. Those who were aware were unable to establish any reasonable means to correct the situation. With the coming of the war, new problems arose to hinder the teaching profession's growth.

#### The Fifties.

By the early fifties, the teaching profession had been confronted by a new crisis: Recruitment of elementary-school teachers was essential. The crisis was derived from three primary forces. These were:

- (1) failure to secure and accord elementary-school teaching the status and prestige it deserves;
- (2) the effects of the recent war on educating elementary-school teachers and keeping them on the job.<sup>25</sup>

The means by which this problem was faced caused much turmoil within the profession. In order to obtain elementary teacher candidates more extensive recruitment had to be accomplished. The institutions expanded their programs in:



the areas of orientation practices, advertisement procedures, general education program, professional education programs, and prestige factors involved in on-campus activities.<sup>24</sup>

Even though, the profession needed teachers, it was as usual defensive that people "not qualified" would be asked to join the ranks. Klausmeier states that

It is more desirable for educational leadership to meet the need for more and better educated elementary school teachers than to have quotas prescribed or to have substandard emergency certificates issued by the states.<sup>25</sup>

There was no indication that the institutions who became actively concerned with recruitment, attempted to obtain "outstanding" students. Whether or not the selection requirements were maintained by the institutions at a "proper level" is a question which the literature did not answer. It did, however, give indications that the institutions were aware of the fact that if they were not careful the profession would be filled with mediocre teachers rather than the best. Most professionals agreed that careful use of recruiting and selecting needed to be accomplished, and much of the literature is filled with warning, but as before the teacher personality obstructed the way.

Syracuse University, in 1950, made some interesting observations in the selection of prospective teachers. Although a "no-nonsense" approach was used, the adjectives used to describe the outstanding teacher are difficult to measure. The following seven strong statements make this clear:

First, present-day teaching demands a superior person; second, the university's primary obligation is to school children and their parents; third, a teacher-training institution cannot afford to graduate students who are a mediocre advertisement and a threat to professional standards; fourth, quality is attracted by quality; fifth, training facilities must be developed on the basis of quality rather than quantity; sixth, many students accept needed guidance only when faced with a definite barrier; and seventh, selection by indirection has proved inadequate.<sup>26</sup>

In studying the quotation carefully, one sees the idealism that prevails in the situation. It is a rehashing of the old "If only we could..." But again, little concrete evidence is offered to help define the "superior" person in measurable ways. He is still a most elusive creature that will hopefully find the university on his own. The quote says that the university must meet the needs of children and parents. But how should the university meet the supply of teachers need to stop overcrowding in the classroom, or should it put out only quality? The third statement is hilarious in

that it would be difficult to check teachers to see if they are "mediocre advertisements." Each individual would have to decide for himself, seldom guaranteeing any kind of serious concensus. The assumption that quality is attracted by quality was probably even more difficult to prove in the 50's than it is in the present. But perhaps most important of all is the comment that there has been no direction in selection up to the time the article was written. The investigator found no evidence that the statement was challenged in the literature that followed this period.

What this implies is the existence of a tremendous ailment within the profession. As has been shown, for half a century the professionals complained that there was a need for more and better selection. And yet, according to this article nothing was done to alleviate the problem. "Selection by indirection" indicates that the recruitment and selection of outstanding students can be assumed not to have existed, at least, prior to the fifties. Before this, the profession apparently was only beginning to recognize the need to incorporate outstanding students but could not find the means by which this could be accomplished.

One of the problems which had plagued the professionals was a need for a specific criteria that could be used with reasonable accuracy. In a separation of specific

characteristics attributed to outstanding teachers in the Syracuse study, it is found that the basis of selection are the same that have been used in many studies since that time. They are "intelligence, general culture, scholarship, special aptitudes, physical health and vitality, mental balance, personality, character, and attitudes.."27

These are still stated in very general terms. How much they really say can be viewed in terms of how the technique of selection changed.

In regard to the process of selection, White added,

The process of selection today has become increasingly one of guidance. There is a definite attempt to make contact with the student in the pre-selection period so that he may examine the demands of his profession and his own potentialities in relation to these demands... .28

This seems to be a much more fruitful way of viewing the problem. The student must be contacted and he must evaluate his own personality. Here we encounter the first change in attitude about the procedures used. Even though there had been criticism of these processes before this time, it was not until then that any workable advice had been given. Selection had become guidance rather than the "pleasant speaking voice" previously sought.<sup>29</sup> From this point on the institutions seem to be increasingly

more conscious of the limits which encase them. They begin to gain greater knowledge of all that is encompassed within the teacher personality. There is an emergence of more concrete ideas to use in screening students.

1952 found Robert Magie referring to teacher recruitment. He felt that teacher education institutions were in a good position to aid the profession in obtaining good teachers. The institutions, however, were not carrying the major responsibility in recruiting outstanding prospects, or in eliminating poor teachers already in the field. Magie saw that it was the intermediate process of selecting students for teacher education, in training them for teaching, and in their recommendation for certification that teacher education institutions had made a unique contribution.<sup>30</sup>

It appears that few would admit they had something to do with recruiting the "not so outstanding" teachers already in service. How did they get into the profession if nobody recruited them and nobody selected them?

If institutions were to be selective, they had to develop more reliable techniques. In 1952 there was the feeling that personality was the most important element in teaching. Magie added,

Teaching is a highly complex function,  
and those who succeed at it do so,  
not because they possess certain

separate traits to a given degree, but rather because the total personality in action exerts a salutary influence upon those it touches.<sup>31</sup>

The total personality is the crucial factor. What characteristics could be distinguished within this entity that were unique from other entities? Magie believed that there were four characteristics found in teachers. He based this statement on his personal experience. He said:

Experience and observation indicate that certain human characteristics and competencies are related to success in teaching to such an extent that we would expect prospective teachers to possess them to a reasonable degree.<sup>32</sup>

Magie listed these characteristics in very broad terms as follows: "(a) physical and mental health; (b) intellectual capacity, (c) personal interests, traits, drives and enthusiasms, and (d) social maturity."<sup>33</sup>

Magie did not offer a means by which such an individual could be accurately identified. He did, however, indicate more than just that the teacher candidate should be a superior person. Even though he has not been able to become more specific, he did begin to unravel the teacher personality to some extent.

In conclusion, Magie asserted that a teacher education

institution must necessarily achieve reasonable success in graduating outstanding teachers if "it operates on a combined program of selective admission, selective retention, and sound training."<sup>34</sup> This statement sounds very much like the statements of previous researchers. He seems to place slightly more importance on the procedures than did the others. Magie felt that selection must begin upon receiving applications from possible students.

The admission decision prior to professional training represents the best guess possible at the time on the basis of available information relative to the probable success of the applicant.<sup>35</sup>

After the initial admission where the admissions director assumes all responsibility for the action, the faculty must have " ... the discernment and courage to correct the bad guesses of the admissions officer and screen out the misfits."<sup>36</sup>

Magie clearly states that selection is vitally important in the process of teacher education. He feels that selection aids tremendously in the establishment and maintenance of an outstanding program. (See footnote 32).

Bancroft, in the same year, was slightly more skeptical of the advantages of the procedures used for recruitment and selection. He thought that "Teacher recruitment is

too shallow and superficial."<sup>37</sup> He felt that it was justifiable to say that "...the programs described as recruitment are also too prosaic, too stereotyped, too obvious."<sup>38</sup> Bancroft realized that those conferences which concentrated their efforts on talking about movies, posters, student group discussions, university catalogs and pamphlets were not dealing efficiently with the problem. With such conferences "Routine suggestions are compelled to be passed on to guidance directors and administrative officers."<sup>39</sup> Bancroft did not recognize these traditional suggestions as having accomplished much. "The answer to the recruitment problem is for more complex than can be furnished by these necessary but relatively minor details."<sup>40</sup>

One of the main complaints expounded, was in the area of what type of student needed to be recruited. The entire recruitment program should, according to Bancroft, be considered in terms "...not only of students who are most likely to succeed in college but also in terms of students who are most likely to become the most efficient teachers."<sup>41</sup> He implies that the profession seems solely interested in the academic accomplishments of their prospective students rather than their total personality.



Throughout the literature on recruitment, there is a constant reference to "aptitude", "pupils of promise," and "able students." It is inferred that only students with high scholastic ability (and therefore high potential ability to succeed in college) are being sought by recruitment programs. Seldom is reference made to students with great promise in teaching or to students whose action, personality, and experiential background point to success in teaching as well as ability to meet the academic standards of a college scholastic program.<sup>42</sup>

If Bancroft is correct, it would seem as though the profession has not fully recognized the existence of the teacher personality. It had neglected that which is the most important aspect of effective teaching.

With Bancroft and people like him, the profession took another step in their attitudinal development. From the position of guidance which had occupied primary importance rose the realization that certain personality types sought out teaching for their profession. In the words of Willcox and Beigel: "... teaching is chosen not merely because of intellectual interest but more frequently, on the basis of emotional needs."<sup>43</sup> The profession still was unable to define the personality but it had recognized that the teacher had a unique personality.

Willcox and Beigel felt that the personality tests that most investigators of teacher qualification had

thought were needed, should be employed in the recruitment and selection programs. The authors felt that with proper use of these methods, they would give an accurate indication of students. The tests would "...be valuable in finding out stimulating those students whose personalities augur well for future success in teaching."<sup>44</sup>

The influence which this change in attitude had upon the changing of recruitment and selection procedures was practically unnoticeable. The reason for this is quite simple. Even though the teaching profession had recognized the existence of a unique teacher personality, the profession had not yet defined the characteristics of the personality. The procedures used, therefore, changed very little, since there were no new methods offered which could be used successfully.

For example, in 1956 a discussion group participating in the ninth annual conference of the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education listed four steps they felt should be used in screening. These steps were: (1) initial screening of students, barring those who would have little chance to succeed in their college work; (2) the criteria for students wishing to enter the teacher education program, should be highly restrictive; (3) students should be screened again prior to their practice teaching experience in their junior year; and (4) the final screening should occur after completion of the

program and before recommendation for certification.<sup>45</sup> Very little was added or changed in the actual procedures, but now instead of merely noting where the student was in regard to the other students academically, the faculty noted how effectively the student was assuming the teacher role.

Of the other speakers involved in the conference two brought forth new thoughts on recruitment. Lewis B. Larkin pointed out the direct relationship the community and family had upon recruitment for teaching. It will be agreed that few individuals will enter a profession which is contrary to the norms of his society. Recruitment programs, therefore, must enhance the teaching profession not only in the mind of the prospective teacher but also in the community at large. Without at least family support, recruitment cannot be effective.

Larkin also pointed out that salary is an important factor. Many individuals do not consider teaching, because of the low salaries teachers receive in most states.<sup>46</sup> It would seem that a community interested in the quality of education their children receive, would offer possible teacher candidates a greater incentive to enter the profession by raising the salaries and, therefore, the style of living made accessible for individuals by teaching. It seems to be a small sacrifice if the profession would gain more and, hopefully, better candidates.

The other speaker, Stanley M. Elam, presented his evaluation of the recruitment programs used by teachers' colleges. His research offered some new insights to the effectiveness of recruitment procedures. His results indicated that though the type or combination of types of methods used actually show some differences in effectiveness, there is "no significant differential qualitative effects on students recruited."<sup>47</sup> He found that the combined program of personal and impersonal techniques prove to be the most effective in increasing enrollments in teacher colleges. The important factor here is that the quality of student obtained was not improved.

The reason for this may be thought of in terms of the value of the procedures used. Elam found that while the attitudes of high school students can be changed to view teaching more favorably, the change is not in a significant number nor is it particularly rapid. Elam felt that this was due in part to the over-rated value which has been placed on the printed page. The study indicated that the best emissaries are usually found to be the students themselves or the alumni who work on a personal level.<sup>48</sup>

Looking back on the recruitment procedures discussed thus far, it has been shown that most institutions used brochures or catalogs for their primary recruitment

procedures. Their effectiveness can be questioned. According to Elam, it seems that most teacher education institutions had, up to that point, failed to achieve their goals. The institutions were presumably unconscious that their procedures were all but effective.

The conference continued with a discussion period that brought forth several suggestions. Among these were included that a more useful term than recruitment would be the word guidance.<sup>49</sup> This is parallel to White's conclusion stated in 1950, that recruitment procedures had become essentially guidance.<sup>50</sup>

Because the process of recruitment had become so much a question of guidance, the conference further suggested that "placement officers and others be asked to urge and even to insist that high school principals send in strong enrollees for teacher education."<sup>51</sup> The value of such an action must be questioned since it places much emphasis on the principal who in general has very little contact with the students. It also seems to indicate that the university officials in charge of recruitment would delegate their responsibilities to the high school.

The conference further suggests that such organizations as the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education become active in preparing and distributing pamphlets and other promotional material. This could be accomplished

on the basis of either sales or donation so far as the actual materials, once developed, were concerned. The emphasis should necessarily be placed upon the smaller teacher training institutions since they are generally the most in need, due to financial limitations and, in some cases, lack of knowledge in the area of recruitment.

In the area of developing and implementing new techniques for recruitment, the conference suggested a plan used first by New Jersey. The state had reportedly begun using state-wide billboards as part of their recruitment program. The state had been given the free use of two hundred billboards for the expressed use of promoting interest in teacher education.<sup>52</sup> The success of the New Jersey plan was not reported. As inferred in the section of recruitment and selection, in order for effective recruitment, the teaching profession must have social recognition and acceptance. Billboard techniques would offer definite advantages in overcoming this situation. It has been shown that such advertising has aided industry and there is no reason to doubt that it could not be used in a similar manner for teaching.

The conference continued by acknowledging that better screening procedures of candidates for teaching must be developed. It was felt that this would promote "more self-respect and a higher type of recruitment for the profession."<sup>53</sup> This sounds very similar to a 1946

statement:

If the advantages of the teaching profession -- its social worth and personal satisfactions -- are adequately set forth there can be little doubt that more able persons will be attracted to it.<sup>54</sup>

Does quality attract quality? This is certainly a difficult question to answer. It is true that students are naturally attracted to those universities which have a "good reputation." But is that all that is necessary? Can an institution acquire outstanding students in another more effective manner? Apparently, this conference did not believe that any of the techniques that had been developed at that time were better.

The following year, at the next conference of the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, very similar material was discussed. The feeling that "...we need to continue to improve methods of attracting competent young people into the profession"<sup>55</sup> was still prevalent.

Of a total of fifteen discussion groups, however, only two considered the problem of recruitment. A few mentioned the topic but passed over it as secondary to other problems.

One of the groups offered three methods which might be used to help improve the recruiting programs used by teacher education institutions. These were:<sup>56</sup>

"(a) evaluation of methods now being used; (b) the listing of suggestions for recruiting; (c) working out a battery of tests to be used for initial admission to institutions offering teacher education programs." Specific goals were not discussed. Very little seemed to be changed. The profession was still criticizing the recruitment procedures but not offering valuable suggestions.

The other group did offer one possibility for new techniques in recruiting not only for public school teaching but also for college level teaching. They suggested that qualified personnel, such as deans of graduate schools of education, should visit colleges in an attempt to show undergraduates the opportunities of college teaching. The outlines for the recruitment of high school juniors and seniors were not listed specifically. It was stated, however, that "superior" students should be encouraged to prepare for teaching.<sup>57</sup>

The fifties showed no significant change in procedures of recruitment and selection. The profession seemed to have increased its awareness of the problems involved, but found little means to overcome them. They were hampered by an increasing demand for teachers and were faced with a need to supply these teachers. How were they to meet this supply and demand without decreasing the quality of



teachers? Could the profession afford to be selective?

Recent Literature.

With the arrival of a new decade, new advances occurred not only in science but in teacher education programs as well. In the spring of 1966, Robert Ebel in a review of research listed five items which were essentially what the research had to say about measurement applications in teacher education. In summary this is what was said:<sup>58</sup>

1. Students must demonstrate academic ability in order to be admitted to some, but by no means all, programs for teacher preparation.
2. Few of the programs that are selective are highly selective. Many students of very ordinary ability are admitted.
3. Human, interpersonal relations are obviously important in teaching but attempts to use personality tests as bases for selecting prospective teachers have not been successful. Refinements in rating actual behavior in teaching appear to offer more promise.
4. Tests are used to evaluate achievement in courses and to assist in academic advisement and personal counseling; but little, if any, special research on these applications has been published.
5. Limited use is made of measurements to determine competence to teach. Efforts are being made to expand this use, but there is strong opposition from those who mistrust tests.

The study indicates several important points. Elam says that most programs do not select and admit only outstanding students. Elam did not differentiate if the selection procedures for the outstanding student referred to the student's academic record or his potential to become an excellent teacher. It can be deduced, however, that it was not the teacher personality that most institutions were seeking. This is indicated by Elam's next comment that the personality tests used for selection were ineffective, or at least not always reliable.

This seems to be a continuation of the struggle to find the teacher personality that had eluded the profession for so long. There is a difference here in that Elam recognizes that these tests are not an extremely effective means of evaluating personalities. It will be recalled that Willcox and Beigel in 1953 still advocated the use of these tests and believed they were the answer to the problem.<sup>59</sup>

Elam's statements indicate that many professionals were becoming wary of the personality tests. The tests had not been refined, according to Elam, to the point where they could be used to determine competence to teach. It seems that the profession was still caught in the production of, although not mutually exclusive, excellent scholars rather than good teachers. It still was using

those procedures which single out the scholar but not necessarily the teacher personality.

Slaughter, in a study conducted during 1969, recognized the failure of the selection programs to obtain qualified candidates. He said:

Although the failure of a teacher education candidate can usually be predicted beforehand, educators, in spite of many years of experience, have not yet clearly identified the evidence they need to screen applicants successfully.<sup>60</sup>

He supported this statement by suggesting that "criteria based judgments are generally undependable."<sup>61</sup> Slaughter says that judges tend to base their conclusions on unsystematic observations and also the standards used vary between different judges. It is for this reason that "The judge's estimate may be influenced by qualities which are irrelevant to the study in hand."<sup>62</sup> This is certainly a rather discouraging thought since, "Other than grades and courses, the personal interview continues to be the most widely used screening device, in spite of its unreliability."<sup>63</sup>

Slaughter continued by stating that invariably the first criterion identified by the faculty as being pertinent to teaching success, is the student's grade point average. In spite of numerous investigations, however, researchers have not been able to establish any relationship between

grade point average and teacher success.

Slaughter is of the belief that the profession should use children's perceptions as one factor in the selection of teacher education candidates. Children would not be as prejudicial in judging the students.<sup>64</sup>

A study cited by Beck identified five perceptual factors which pupils utilize in judging teachers. These were:

(1) affective - the approachable teacher; (2) cognitive - the ability to communicate; (3) disciplinary - the ability to maintain order; (4) motivational - makes children want to learn; (5) innovation - variety in the methods used.<sup>65</sup>

The one major advantage of the development of this type of approach is the possible standardization of questions which could subsequently be studied for their reliability. The profession would use the field of statistics to develop their questionnaire and thus develop a scientific method of screening students.

This type of a screening program would have its greatest use after the student had taken an educational methods course and prior to student teaching or internship. It would be most effective here because almost no one fails to get a passing grade in student teaching which is essential to being certified to teach. If the colleges are to fulfill their screening role, they must logically conclude ~~that~~ teacher-screening prior to experiences which insure certification.

Slaughter felt that the weaknesses of most screening practices is that they require changes. In the author's words: "it is hoped that new practices will be based on reliable evidence and not on whim."<sup>66</sup> It can be inferred that institutions rely heavily on opinion rather than fact. For example, they cling to the grade point average as an accurate indicator of potential, yet have no evidence to support the theory. The profession must become, it would seem, more scientific in its approaches to seek out the outstanding students. If it doesn't, it will continue to be trapped in what appears to be an endless cycle of criticism without change, or sight of change.

The literature shows special recruitment efforts for teachers in special fields. In a recent article several procedures were given that showed how to recruit teachers to work with handicapped children. Among those listed are the following:

1. Orientation program is provided for high school graduates. (Program is provided in which the work of the department is explained, usually with the aid of a movie.)
2. Students who have worked with the handicapped are encouraged to enter the field.
3. Program of special education and the need for teachers are interpreted to students, beginning with freshmen in colleges.

4. Sophomore classes are addressed to induce students to elect courses in special education.
5. College and university placement bureaus are contacted.
6. Teachers untrained in the teaching of the handicapped are accepted with the provision that they secure training while in service.
7. In-service programs are provided for regular teachers interested in special training. (Classes are held after school hours and during summer vacation.)
8. Special scholarships are offered to regular teachers for study purposes.
9. Salary differential is provided for teachers of the handicapped.
10. Teachers in the field are urged to be alert for possible candidates.
11. Special class teachers make others conscious and create interest of others in the field.
12. Panel discussions are conducted.<sup>67</sup>

All of the above procedures show how to attract teachers for special education. Actually, there is little to differentiate them from recruitment strategies for all teachers.

This program seems to have overcome some of the aspects the profession had so often criticized. It offers active recruitment at all levels, from high school students to regular teachers all ready in the

field. Recruitment is the responsibility of the entire profession, not just high school counselors, but also the special teachers who have experience. It seems to be a multilevel effort to attract as many candidates as possible. There is no indication, however, that the institution selects outstanding students. It would appear that, at least in the area of special education, the profession still is shackled with a need of teachers.

The sixties brought some advances in recruitment programs. The profession was able to identify some new problems and give suggestions for improvement. Some areas of education were still hampered by supply and demand. The sixties like the first fifty years of the century saw little hope to practice highly selective procedures.

### Summary

The means by which institutions practiced recruitment and selection has changed little. Most institutions have continued to use the printed page as their primary means of recruitment. Selection of students continues to be a question of academic competency.

With the increased awareness of the teacher personality, the professionals began to question the value of the procedures which were being used. Unfortunately, concrete suggestions for the improvement of the procedures were few in number and were often only restatements of the original procedures. The profession was hindered by too many unanswered questions and research which was adding almost nothing to their knowledge.



## NOTES

1. William H. Allen and Carroll G. Pearse. Self-Surveys by Teacher-Training Schools. (New York: World Book Company, 1917), p. 90.

2. Ibid., p. 90.

3. Ibid., p. 90.

4. Ibid., p. 90.

5. Ibid., pp. 90-91.

6. Ibid., p. 91.

7. Problems in Teacher Training: Proceedings of the 1928 Spring Conference Conducted by the Normal School and Teacher College Section of the New York Society for the Experimental Study of Education. Volume 3. (Albany: Brandow Publishing Company, 1928).

8. Louis M. Schleier. Problems in the Training of Certain Special Class Teachers. (New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1931), pp. 73-74.

9. Ibid., p. 74.

10. Preparation and Improvement of Teacher: A Report of a Conference Held at Northwestern University, Northwestern University, 1933, p. 9.

11. Ibid., p. 10.

12. Ibid., p. 10.

13. Ibid., p. 10.

14. Ibid., p. 21.

15. Ibid., p. 21.

16. Ibid., p. 26.

17. Ibid., p. 142.

18. Ibid., p. 143.

19. Charles H. Judd. Preparation of School Personnel, Report of the Regents' Inquiry, (New York: McGraw Hill Book Company, Inc., 1938), p. 26.

### Summary

The means by which institutions practiced recruitment and selection has changed little. Most institutions have continued to use the printed page as their primary means of recruitment. Selection of students continues to be a question of academic competency.

With the increased awareness of the teacher personality, the professionals began to question the value of the procedures which were being used. Unfortunately, concrete suggestions for the improvement of the procedures were few in number and were often only restatements of the original procedures. The profession was hindered by too many unanswered questions and research which was adding almost nothing to their knowledge.

- 20 Preparation and Improvement of Teachers, Op.cit.,  
p. 26.
- 21 Ibid., p. 27.
- 22 Ibid., p. 32.
- 23 Herbert Klausmejer, "Can More Elementary-School Teachers be Secured from the Current College Enrollment?", The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume II, number 1, March, 1951, p. 9.
- 24 Ibid., p. 10.
- 25 Ibid., p. 10.
- 26 Verna White, "Selection of Prospective Teachers at Syracuse University", The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume I, March, 1950, number 1, p. 24.
- 27 Ibid., p. 24.
- 28 Ibid., p. 26.
- 29 Preparation and Improvement of Teachers, Op.cit.,  
p. 26.
- 30 Robert M. Magie. "Selection of Candidates for Teacher Education", The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume III, number 3, September, 1952, p. 168.
- 31 Ibid., p. 168.
- 32 Ibid., p. 169.
- 33 Ibid., p. 169.
- 34 Ibid., p. 172.
- 35 Ibid., p. 172.
- 36 Ibid., p. 172.
- 37 Roger W. Bancroft. "Recruitment for Elementary School Teaching," The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume III, number 3, September, 1952, p. 192.
- 38 Ibid., p. 192.
- 39 Ibid., p. 192.

- 40 Ibid., p. 192.
- 41 Ibid., p. 194.
- 42 Ibid., p. 194.
- 43 Isabel Willcox and Hugo G. Baigel, "Motivations In the Choice of Teaching," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume IV, No. 1, March, 1953, p. 109.
- 44 Ibid., p. 109.
- 45 Recruitment with Vision. Recorder: C.L. Crawford. American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education Ninth Year Book. Chicago, 1956, p. 53.
- 46 Ibid., p. 53.
- 47 Ibid., p. 54.
- 48 Ibid., p. 54.
- 49 Ibid., p. 54.
- 50 White, Op.cit., p. 25.
- 51 Crawford, Op.cit., p. 54.
- 52 Ibid., p. 54.
- 53 Crawford, Op.cit., p. 54.
- 54 The Improvement of Teacher Education: A Final Report by the Commission on Teacher Education, American Council on Education, Washington, D.C., 1946, p. 266.
- 55 Our Problems - Suggestion for Solution, Groups II and XV, American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education Tenth Year Book, Chicago 1957. p. 81.
- 56 Ibid., p. 82.
- 57 Ibid., p. 110.
- 58 Robert L. Ebel. "Measurement Applications in Teacher Education: A Review of Relevant Research." The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume XVII, No. 1, Spring 1966, p. 24.
- 59 Willcox, Op.cit., p. 109.

60 C. H. Slaughter. "A Proposed Screening Program for Elementary Teacher Candidates." The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume XX, No. 3, Fall, 1969, p. 343.

61 Ibid., p. 343.

62 Ibid., p. 343.

63 Ibid., p. 343.

64 Ibid., pp. 344-345.

65 Ibid., p. 345.

66 Ibid., p. 346.

67 "Practices and Problems in Recruiting Teachers of the Handicapped in Large Cities." Jacob S. Orleans and Sandra Finkelstein, The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume 1, No. 1, March, 1970. p. 38.

## CONCLUSION

Literature Findings

It appears that the literature search has revealed little that unites the "outstanding" student with the "outstanding" teacher training institution. The "outstanding" student was portrayed as an element which was considered important but which was almost unattainable. This was due, in part, to the shortage of teachers, and weak procedures which the institutions used to recruit.

The profession needed to overcome the low position which teachers were given in society. They had, in short, to overcome the general feeling that "those who can't, teach."

Their struggle for respectability was hindered by a shortage of teachers following the "population explosion" after World War II. Even though the professionals became increasingly aware of the ineffectiveness of the recruitment and selection procedures being used, they felt a need to meet the demand for teachers.

There was no statement which yielded any information as to whether the institutions maintained their selective standards or sought only to meet the supply and demand. It can be inferred, however, that few institutions were able to be highly selective. If they had, the pro-

profession would probably have stopped being so highly critical of the ineffective procedures.

#### Outstanding Student.

The literature does not do an adequate job of describing the outstanding student in measurable terms. It spends more time describing the excellent teacher, but again, seldom in measurable terms. From the literature, it can be concluded that the excellent teacher was an excellent student. The apparent weakness in all the studies is that few "excellent" attributes can be measured scientifically.

It should be noted that the profession was aware of the existence of a unique teacher personality since, at least, the beginning of the century. Unfortunately, much of the information known about the teacher personality was extremely superficial. For many years, the teacher personality was an elusive character that was found in individuals but which could not be developed. It seemed to be all a matter of chance that an individual would become an outstanding teacher.

In the fifties research uncovered some new aspects concerning the teacher personality. The question of how to distinguish those characteristics within individuals still remained to be answered. None of the personality tests that had been developed were adequate in this area,

so the profession needed other means of distinguishing the outstanding student.

Up until the present, most institutions judge the quality of the students by their academic performance. There has not been, however, any research which has been able to establish a relationship between grades and teacher competency.

In recent years, more of the traits involved in the teacher personality have been recognized. Research has been conducted in hope to find an adequate instrument to measure teacher effectiveness. Until this is found, the outstanding student cannot be accurately identified.

Outstanding Institution. The outstanding teacher-training institution has been singled out for awards during the last few years. However, as with the student, the definition of such an institution is elusive. The program can be interpreted from many different points of view, indicating its lack of objectivity. The literature continues suggesting the need for more careful selection.

The American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education has given the most contribution to this area of teacher education. It seems that in the opinion of the association, the most effective or outstanding program is merely the efficient program.

Though the association does recognize the need for



recruitment and selection, it does not specify the type of individual which should be sought.

Noting the demands of the seventies, Teachers For The Real World indicates that teacher training programs must become more selective in the area of integration of the teacher populus, and also in the filling of varied positions. It says that,

In teacher training, reform must be undertaken in the selection of teachers. There must be more adequate representation of the poor, the Black, the Mexican, and the Indian in teaching ranks.<sup>1</sup>

But as always, the recruitment procedure suggestions are limited. The book further elaborates,

The schools must allow persons with different capacities to function where they can be most useful. Teachers must be specifically trained for different positions in a program which recognizes the importance of a differentiated staff.<sup>2</sup>

The criteria, by which such an endeavor could conceivably be accomplished is not given. Certainly a differentiated staff is important. But can the profession adequately place individuals? Much of the problem is found in the fact that, as yet, there is no efficient method of selecting outstanding students. The profession cannot be certain of its selection procedures, though

now it has an opportunity to be more discriminatory.

The outstanding program was defined in terms of the effectiveness of the teachers it placed in the field. Without the ability to define the competent teacher, the profession can only express opinions. More and better research is needed before any statements can be made which are conclusive rather than elusive.

#### Recruitment and Selection.

Recruitment and selection procedures as practiced have been extremely superficial. Selection has a much greater impact on the program, than does recruitment. It too, however, has been severely curtailed because the profession was in need of teachers.

Many of the methods used for recruitment and selection are by all indications useless. These procedures seem more to fulfill the function of giving " ...the selectors and the selectees the feeling of using a fair system of rules than of really augmenting the predicted powers of the selectors over the chance levels."<sup>3</sup> In conjunction with the role of selectors, the program is charged with the assessment of potential teacher effectiveness throughout the training period and must give some kind of marks in the end. The value of these marks has not been demonstrated.

...there is much evidence to show that confidence in validity and reliability of these marks is many times greater than is justified by their demonstrated value as predictors.<sup>4</sup>

Again, the difficulty is found in the fact that there is no means to define the competent teacher.

The difficulty of predicting teaching effectiveness has been well-known among educational research workers for a long time, and the amount of research directed at this problem has been impressive. Unfortunately, the results emerging from this research have been less than impressive and, in many cases, of no practical value at all.<sup>5</sup>

The profession appeared to have been caught in a circle of endless criticism; all finding fault with the situation but none being able to offer positive suggestions.

Much of the difficulty was caused by the demand for teachers which seemed to be almost impossible to fill. Many institutions did not maintain high selection requirements and many students of "ordinary" ability were allowed into the teacher training programs. Apparently, as long as the supply of teachers is limited, the procedures of recruitment and selection are merely fictitious aspects of teacher education programs.

### Projections

It would appear that this search was conducted pre-

maturely. Up to the present, there had been a demand for teachers. However, the supply and demand have finally been equated. In the summer of 1971, beginning teachers had difficulty locating positions. The following quote from a newspaper is offered in its entirety, double-spaced for easier reading, for it summarizes the teacher-education situation extremely well.<sup>6</sup>

"The World War II baby boom has passed through the nation's public schools and left in its wake the worst job market for teachers since the depression.

No relief is in sight for the next decade, says the National Education Association, predicting that the teacher surplus will double by 1965.

The job situation is so bad that one large eastern school has sent a letter to elementary education students suggesting they may wish to reconsider teaching as a career.

Unless new jobs are created, says the NEA in a private memo to its staff, overproduction of teachers will reach 100,000 to 150,000 annually. Added to this is that each year 15,000 to 35,000 experienced teachers who quit teaching want to return to school jobs, an NEA official said.

The job picture is further complicated by financially pressed school districts cutting back on programs and the

size of their teaching staffs, and by professionals laid off by business and industry turning to the field of education in search of work.

'The situation is completely unlike anything we have faced since the Great Depression of the 1930s,' the NEA Research Dept. said in the memo. 'Not only beginning teachers but persons with above average experience and qualifications are unable even to find vacancies for which to apply.'

High school employment also has been hit but the full impact of unemployment probably won't reach that educational level until the mid-70s, said the NEA.

The job pinch is just beginning to be felt at the collegiate level, nonetheless the Cooperative College Registry, originally formed to find qualified instructors, finds its role changing. Now it's looking for jobs.

Mrs. Elizabeth S. Fisher, executive director of the registry, said that of 6139 persons with doctorates who registered for jobs, 34 per cent were still without work last week. Fourteen of those who found jobs aren't going into teaching.

'Many of these people are having to settle for less,' said Mrs. Fisher. 'They don't get university level jobs, and have to take jobs in junior colleges and high schools and business. In one case, the man began driving

a taxi rather than teach at a level below his degree.'

She said the number of persons with master's degrees still seeking jobs for the start of the school year was even greater, but she had no figures available of applicants and jobs.

Underscoring the bleak outlook, Syracuse University's School of Education sent a letter July 1 to its elementary education students saying:

'Among our current graduating class, less than half have positions for next year. . . it appears that at least a third of our graduates will not be employed come September. The situation among State University of New York graduates is even worse; in June, less than 30 per cent of the Oswego, Cortland and Potsdam graduates had teaching positions.'

As examples of the tight job market in elementary schools, the Syracuse letter noted that among area school districts, one had 400 applicants for six openings; another more than 300 applicants for each vacancy.

'Blame it on the pill or whatever but the cause of all this appears to be a reduction in the birth rate,' the letter continued. 'Give it some serious thought before you get so far into a program that it's impractical to change . . . We are fairly certain, the situation that confronts us will not go away overnight.'

The situation is not confined to New York or any other geographical area. Throughout the United States, teachers are finding job openings few and far between.

Dr. A. C. Murphy, director of placement at the University of Texas, said 60 per cent of the school's 1970-71 graduates had lined up teaching jobs, far above average, but 'there is no way a graduate can continue to be selective over such matters as climate, geography and money.'

'Only a year ago,' said job-hunting Patty Stevenson, a University of California graduate, 'they needed elementary school teachers. Now the word is more like, --forget it - we're not even taking applications--'

Roy Archibald, an NEA official in California, said he advised friends to look for jobs in the mountains but 'they came back and said they're not hiring out there, either.'

In the past, Los Angeles has sent recruiters across the country looking for teachers. Now it has a waiting list with hundreds of names.

Lester G. Wahrenbrock, who hires for San Diego's 6000 teacher system, said that 'our teacher turnover has been reduced at least 30 per cent.'

Normally, Wahrenbrock hires between 500 and 700 new teachers each year. This year he expects to hire 200 'at the outside maximum.'

'One way of meeting the problem of unemployment is to create more jobs,' said the NEA. But is conceded that almost all steps 'would cost a great deal of money,' and added, 'in the present economic situation, it would be unrealistic to hope that any of them can be, at best, more than partially implemented.'

The NEA memo said 'minimum quality in staffing would have created a demand for 157,000 more beginning teachers in the fall of 1970 than were available then.'

Quality in staffing, the NEA said, would include:

--Replacing teachers who do not have at least a bachelor's degree.

--Reducing class size to a maximum of 34 in elementary school or a pupil load of 199 in secondary school.

--Staffing adequately a comprehensive education program, including such services as kindergarten and special education and correcting such deficiencies as misassignment and restoring curricular offerings that have been 'dropped because of teacher shortages.'

Perhaps now selection and recruitment will become meaningful, legitimate functions. Perhaps now only the outstanding student will be solicited. But the work must begin in defining elements with measurable terms. A new era is upon teacher-education institutions.



The literature does not support the theory that recruitment and selection significantly contribute to the development and maintenance of an outstanding teacher education.

## NOTES

1 B. Othanel Smith, et al, Teachers for the Real World. (The American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education: Washington, D. C., 1969), p. 9.

2 Ibid., p. 9.

3 Ake Bjerstedt, "Interaction-Oriented Approaches to the Assessment of Student Teachers," The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume XVIII, no. 3. Fall, 1967, p. 339.

4 Ibid., p. 339.

5 Ibid., p. 339.

6 William W. Waugh, "Teacher Surplus Worst Since '30s," Albuquerque Journal. July 28, 1971.

## Books

- Allen, William H. and Carrol G. Pearse. Self-Surveys by Teacher-Training Schools. New York: World Book Company, 1917.
- Biddle, Bruce J. and William J. Ellena, Eds. Contemporary Research on Teacher Effectiveness. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1964.
- Charters, W.W., Jr., and N.L. Gage, Eds. Readings in the Social Psychology of Education. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1963.
- Fine, Benjamin. Admission to American Colleges: A Study of Current Policy and Practice. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1946.
- Gage, N.L., Ed. Handbook on Research on Teaching. Chicago: Rand McNalley and Company, 1963.
- Gilbert, H.B. and G. Lang, Eds. Teacher Selection Methods. Brooklyn: New York City Board of Education, 1967.
- Kurani, Habib Amin. Selecting the College Student in America: A Study of Theory and Practice. New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1931.
- MacNeel, Joseph Raymond. Admission of Students as Candidates for Master's Degree. New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1932.
- "Our Problems -- Suggestions for Solution." Chicago: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education Tenth Year Book, 1957.
- "Recruitment with Vision." (C.L. Crawford, Recorder). Chicago: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education Ninth Year Book, 1956.
- Schleier, Louis M. Problems in the Training of Certain Special-Class Teachers. New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1931.
- Smith, Othanel B., et al. Teachers for the Real World. Washington, D.C.: The American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1969.

## Articles

- Bancroft, Roger W. "Recruitment for Elementary School Teaching," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume III, No. 3, (September, 1952), 193-96.

- Bjerstedt, Ake. "Interaction-Oriented Approaches to the Assessment of Student Teachers," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume XVIII, No. 3, (Fall 1967), 339-57.
- Burnett, Collins W. and Alice Z. Seeman. "Guidance of College Freshman in Teacher Education," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume 3, No. 1, 19-22.
- Byers, Loretta M. "Organization and Procedures Employed by Colleges to Recruit Candidates for Elementary School Teaching," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume 1, No. 4, (December, 1950).
- Cohen, Arthur M. and Florence B. Brawer, "Adaptive Potential and First Year Teaching Success," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume XVIII, No. 2, (Summer, 1967), 179-185.
- Cope, Edith. "Teacher Training and School Practice." Education Research, Volume 12, Issue 2, (February, 1970), 87-98.
- Cornett, Joe D. "Effectiveness of Three Selective Admissions Criteria in Predicting Performance of First-Year Teachers," Journal of Educational Research, Volume 62, Issue 6, (February, 1969), 247-50.
- De Long, O.A. "Teacher-Selection Program at Minot State Teachers College," The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume II, No. 2, (June, 1951), 117.
- Dixon, W. Robert and William C. Morse. "The Prediction of Teaching Performance: Emphatic Potential," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume XII, No. 3, (September, 1961), 322-29.
- Dugan, Ruth R. "Personality and the Effective Teacher," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume XII, No. 3, (September, 1961), 335-7.
- Ebel, Robert L. "Measurement Applications in Teacher Education: A Review of Relevant Research," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume XVII, No. 1, (Spring, 1966), 15-25.
- Gwinn, Joseph M. "Tendencies in Entrance Requirements of Normal Schools," Education, Volume 28, (December, 1907), 233-37.

- Heiges, Ralph E. "Continuous Selection of Students for the Profession at One State Teachers College," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume II, No. 1 (March, 1951).
- Hertzberg, Oscar E. "More Rigid Entrance Requirements For Teacher Training Institutions," School and Society, 34: 702-704, (November 21, 1931)
- Inlow, Carl M. "The Interview in Selecting Student Teachers," The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume IV, No. 2, (June, 1953), 100-105.
- Klausmeier, Herbert. "Can More Elementary-School Teachers be Secured from the Current College Enrollment?" The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume II, No. 1, (March, 1951).
- Magie, Robert M. "Selection of Candidates for Teacher Education," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume III, No. 3, (September, 1952), 168-172.
- Manuel, Herschel T. "Recruiting and Training Teachers for Spanish-Speaking Children in the Southwest," School and Society, (March 30, 1968), 4.
- Nelson, Clifford L. and G.K. Cochran. "Grass Roots - Suggestions for Improving Teacher Recruitment." The Agricultural Education Magazine, Volume 39, No. 5, (November, 1966).
- Orleans, Jacob S. and Sandra Finkelstein. "Practices and Problems In Recruiting Teachers of the Handicapped in Large Cities," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume 1, No. 1, (March, 1970).
- Ort, Virgil, K. "A Study of Some Techniques Used for Predicting Success of Teachers," The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume XV, No. 1, (March, 1964), 67-71.
- Rabinowitz, William and Harold E. Mitzel. "Some Observations on the Selection of Students for Teacher Education Programs," The Journal of Teacher Education. Volume XII, No. 2, (June, 1961), 157-164.
- Slaughter, C. H. "A Proposed Screening Program for Elementary Teacher Candidates," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume XX, No. 3, (Fall, 1969), 343-346.

- Waugh, William W. "Teacher Job Market Poorest Since 1930's," Albuquerque Journal, (July 28, 1971).
- White, Verna. "Selection of Prospective Teachers at Syracuse University," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume 1, No. 1, (March, 1950).
- Willcox, Isabel and Hugo G. Beigel. "Motivations in the Choice of Teaching," The Journal of Teacher Education, Volume IV, No. 1, (March, 1953), 106-109.
- Yee, Albert H. "Teacher Education: Rube Goldberg or Systems Management," Education Technology, Volume 9, Issue 9, (September, 1969), 36-41.

#### Pamphlets and Reports

- Cohen, Arthur M. and Florence B. Brawer. "Focus on Learning: Preparing Teachers for the Two Year College." Los Angeles: University of California, 1968.
- Commission on Teacher Education. "The Improvement of Teacher Education." Washington, D.C.: American Council of Education, 1946.
- Evaluative Criteria Study Committee. "Recommended Standards for Teacher Education," Washington, D.C.: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education March, 1970.
- "Excellence In Teacher Education," Distinguished Achievement Awards of the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education. Washington, D.C., 1968.
- Hanushek, Eric. "The Production of Education, Teacher Quality and Efficiency," Washington, D.C.: Bureau of Educational Personnel Conference, February, 1970.
- Judd, Charles H. "Preparation of School Personnel, Report of the Regent's Inquiry." New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 1938.
- "Liberal Arts College and Teacher Education: A Survey of Programs, Practices, and Problems." Washington, D.C.: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1963.

- Madden, George R. "Teacher Selection... How To Weed Out The Duds." American Association of School Administrators, February, 1968.
- Millett, George B. "Comparison of Four Teacher Training Procedures in Achieving Teacher and Pupil 'Translation' Behaviors In Secondary School Social Studies." Los Angeles: American Educational Research Association, 1969.
- Normal School and Teachers College Section of the New York Society for the Experimental Study of Education. "Problems in Teacher Training: Proceedings of the 1926 Spring Conference." New York: World Book Company, Volume 1, 1926.
- "Problems in Teacher Training. Proceedings of the 1928 Spring Conference." New York: Brandow Publishing Company, Volume 3, 1928.
- "Preparation and Improvement of Teachers: A Report of a Conference." Northwestern University, 1933.
- Ryans, David G. "Characteristics of Teachers." Washington, D.C.: American Council on Education, 1960.
- "Scholastic Level of New Graduate Matriculants in Teacher Education and in Arts and Sciences." New York: City University of New York, Division of Teacher Education, July, 1966.
- Southworth, Horton C. "A Model of Teacher Training for the Individualization of Instruction: Educational Specifications for a Comprehensive Undergraduate and Inservice Teacher Education Program for Elementary Teachers." Washington, D.C.: Office of Education, October 31, 1968.
- "Study on the Supply and Demand for Teachers in Primary and Secondary Education." Washington, D.C.: Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development Publishing Center, November 17, 1969.
- Troger, Maurice E. and C. Robert Pace. "Evaluation in Teacher Education." Washington, D.C.: American Council on Education, 1944.