DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 077 011 CS 200 525

AUTHOR Nicol, Elizabeth Anne
TITLE Research Design in the Arts: Suggested Apprcaches and an Illustration.
SPONS AGENCY National Council of Teachers of English, Urbana, Ill. Research Foundation.
PUB DATE Feb 73
NOTE 16p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Assn. (New Orleans, February 1973)

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.65 HC-$3.29
DESCRIPTORS *Aesthetic Education; *Educational Research; *English Education; *Literary Analysis; Literary Criticism; Literature; *Literature Appreciation; Secondary School Students; Short Stories

ABSTRACT

Response to literature is the reader's response to the particular function of each element in a work; he is, or becomes, consciously aware of the ways in which aspects of the work interact to form the whole. Thus, response to narrative techniques--setting and exposition, dramatic moments, characterization, point of view, pattern and design, and words and language--is the special focus of the study. After reading two of the six short stories selected, 165 students from advanced high school English classes completed a multiple-choice comprehension test which was developed for each story and which identified and eliminated students who had read the story carelessly or with little understanding. Then, to provide information about response to particular aspects of the stories, each student selected from an inventory of eighteen comments those most like his own responses. The analysis of responses to one short story are presented. Through the method developed for this study, insight was gained into student response to particular stories. Also, this study leads to new possibilities for describing those responses and for facilitating deeper and more articulate reactions to particular literary works. All six inventories are included in the appendix. (TO)

RESEARCH DESIGN IN THE ARTS:

SUGGESTED APPROACHES AND AN ILLUSTRATION

Elizabeth Anne Nicol
Department of Educational Psychology
University of Hawaii
Honolulu, Hawaii 96822

American Educational Research Association, Annual Meeting, February 1973.

RESEARCH DESIGN IN THE ARTS: SUGGESTED APPROACHES AND AN ILLUSTRATION

Elizabeth Anne Nicol

Artists, critics, and professors in the humanities -- those who have devoted careful thought to the qualities of aesthetic response -- are not likely to design research on response to art. Psychologists and educational researchers who make the designs tend to ask questions or test hypotheses which are irrelevant to the arts. A study on student attitudes toward styles of painting may tell the psychologist something about individual differences or personality; it may tell the educator where to begin his instruction in art appreciation or how to evaluate his success in that instruction. Thus, research need not be based on aesthetic theory to be useful. But knowing what students prefer tells us little about the nature of aesthetic response. Studies which purport to describe and analyze aesthetic response should be made in recognition of the special qualities of that response in order truly to advance our knowledge about student response to art.

Aesthetic response is different from other types of response. John Dewey distinguishes an "esthetic experience" from other types of experiences: the experience is an end in itself; it is its own reward (see his third chapter in Art As Experience). Gombrich also discusses qualities of the aesthetic response in his Meditations on a Hobbyhorse. In discussing the inadequacy of the "vague" physiognomic response -- often made initially to some expressive quality in the work -- Gombrich seeks to define the term "aesthetic response" so that it includes understanding and critical awareness. Virgil Aldrich, in his Philosophy of Art, suggests that aesthetic objects are "apprehended" through a unique mode of perception.

There is another way in which aesthetic response is unique: every response occurs as an interaction between the object and the individual at a certain point in time. Thus no two responses are exactly alike. Following this argument for the uniqueness of aesthetic response, some educators have concluded that the mass collection, classification, and reordering of individual responses in an attempt to characterize aesthetic response is a useless and perhaps misleading activity. Nevertheless, a philosophy of art achieves on a theoretical level what educational research would hope to do on a practical one: it describes the nature of response to art. At this level of abstraction, attempts to generalize across individuals and objects have not necessarily denied the uniqueness of particular responses. Accordingly, if aesthetic theory were used to structure an empirical investigation of student response, the findings would be valid at least to the extent that the research design is "true" to the theory.

In order to describe aesthetic response, a theory usually includes some definition of the art object which elicits the response. Initially, two opposing views -- objectivism and idealism -- may be identified. For the objectivist, the art object is the physical thing we see and touch, the particular arrangement of language and words that we read, or the musical sounds we hear. The mark of the artist is his skill in working with his chosen medium, and aesthetic response is elicited by the structure and form of the work. Research which emanates from the

---

The study reported here was supported by a grant from the Research Foundation of the National Council of Teachers of English, and was submitted as part of the doctoral requirements for the Ph.D., Stanford University.

objectivist view of art would focus on the formal elements in the work and their effect on the perceiver. A guiding assumption would be that these elements are primarily responsible for the response which occurs. The objectivist viewpoint has been manifested to various degrees in art and literary criticism and, accordingly, in some approaches to aesthetic education. Gestalt psychology yields a theory of art that is close to the objectivist view, a point which is elegantly made in Art and Visual Perception, by Rudolph Arnheim. In this case the psychological theory has to do with perception and with the things perceived. Thus it can be interpreted as a theory of aesthetic perception and many of the questions asked by research in Gestalt psychology are most relevant to the arts.

Idealists focus on the artist's imagination. Idealism, says Benedetto Croce, "denies, above all, that art is a physical fact: for example, certain determined colors, or relations of colors; certain definite sounds, or relations of sounds; certain phenomena of heat or of electricity -- in short whatsoever be designed as 'physical.'" For the idealist, art is an image conjured in the mind of the artist and recognized by the imaginative perceiver. Working from the idealist's standpoint, the research designer must concern himself with the idea represented by the art object. What is communicated by the artist? And what does the viewer comprehend? Imaginative interpretation, the key to aesthetic response, is the subject for research.

Objectivism and idealism are well-argued theoretical positions and either could form the basis for sound research in art education. The research investigator is usually working within an educational context, however, with goals or at least traditions that are more eclectic than fundamental. His work will be useful to the extent that it reflects or is consonant with those purposes. That is, the definition of aesthetic response which is stated or assumed by the study must be acceptable and meaningful to its audience.

For the study reported here, a good part of the initial work was to define one class of aesthetic response, response to literature, in a way that was consistent both with aesthetic theory and with the current thinking in literary education. A second major problem was to devise a task for the subjects and a method of eliciting and analyzing literary responses that would follow logically from that definition. This paper presents a summary of the study which is reported elsewhere in detail (Nicol, 1973).

Definition of Literary Response.

Technique, says Mark Schorer, is the difference between experience and art. Experience is the substance of a story, the material with which the literary artist works. But it is his technique -- the particular choices he makes as he creates -- that transforms experience into a work of art. Literary appreciation requires sensitivity to unique relationships in a literary work; the reader responds to the particular function of each element in the work at hand. The ultimate in literary response is apprehension of "organic form" -- conscious awareness of the ways in which aspects of the work interact to form the whole. Knowledge of literary techniques, apart from their relation to any particular stories, is of value to the reader. But more important is the reader's ability to respond flexibly to stories, to discover in the process of responding that the narrative devices are linked to the stories themselves.

Design of the Study

A necessary part of literary response as defined above is sensitivity to the particular techniques an author has used to create a story. Thus "response to narrative techniques" was the special focus of the study. To which aspects of narrative technique do students attend? Do students attend to the particular aspects that made a story an effective work of art, or do they respond to the same literary aspects regardless of unique qualities in a work?

Previous research has found that older students are more aware of technical aspects and formal elements in literature than younger students; that students with superior verbal ability are more likely to appreciate literature; that students do not often speak of formal elements when expressing their responses to a story; and that many students misread or misunderstand stories at a superficial level, precluding appropriate response at any level. These findings suggested certain precautions to be taken in designing the study. (1) The students, selected from advanced high-school English classes, attended a school in a middle-class, suburban neighborhood and were mostly above-average in verbal ability and in reading achievement. (2) Instruments to which the students responded after reading a story were designed to focus attention on authors' techniques. (3) A check was made on comprehension of the stories.

One hundred sixty-five students each read two of the six high-quality short stories selected for this study. After reading a story, the students completed an Inventory and Comprehension test developed especially for the story. The Comprehension test, consisting of multiple-choice questions about what happened in the story, identified and eliminated students who had read the story carelessly or with little understanding. This test also included the questions, "Did you like this story?" and "Did you get involved in this story?" The Inventory -- eighteen comments from which readers selected those comments most like their "own" responses -- provided information about response to particular aspects of the stories. The Inventory was essentially a recognition task which gave students a chance to report more sophisticated responses than they would be able to express in their own words.

Six categories were used to classify the elements with which an author deals as he writes: (1) setting and exposition, (2) dramatic moments, (3) characterization, (4) point of view, (5) pattern and design, and (6) words and language. Each Inventory comment was placed in one of the categories. Thus, although the comments were unique for each story, the categories were common across stories, allowing comparisons in the course of analysis.

Analysis and Results

Data were submitted to two types of analyses. The first included an examination of the Comprehension scores, an assessment of the reliability of the Inventories, and a determination of the effects of certain factors like order of presentation and sex of the reader on response to the story Inventories.

Of interest here are the findings on the reliability of the Inventories. Because the Inventory responses were reported for all students who read a given story rather than for individuals, the variability of the test-retest data on single "comments" was the indicator of reliability. Perfect reliability, for our purposes, would be demonstrated if each comment were endorsed by the same number

of students in both administrations. Of 90 comments, 49 had the same number of endorsements in both situations, while an additional 31 comments were endorsed by one more or one less student on the "re-test." These results, based on data from only four or five students for each story, do raise questions regarding the reliability of the Inventories. Nevertheless, students appear to be responding with some consideration rather than in a random or careless manner.

Twenty-seven students, selected randomly from the larger sample, were interviewed regarding their responses to the stories prior to completing the Inventories. About half of the comments they endorsed on the Inventories were substantiated by their own remarks in the interviews. Generally, they said less and their remarks were less sophisticated than were the statements provided by the Inventories. Two explanations are advanced. The students may react to stories at a more complex and sophisticated level than they are able to verbalize, and so the Inventory comments provided a means for expressing their responses. On the other hand, the comments may suggest new and more sophisticated responses. Students may then be endorsing comments that do not actually reflect their original responses to the story. The problem is a serious one for this type of instrument. The comments must be constructed in such a way that they reflect accurately the complexity of the student's unverbalized responses without at the same time distorting those responses or making them something they are not.

In addition to the general analysis of the instruments and of trends in the data, Inventory responses were analyzed separately for each story. Published critiques of the story were introduced to help explain and evaluate the students' responses. One of the six analyses is presented here. The sources of the critiques are listed by author's name at the end of the section; there are no footnotes in the text. Numbers in parentheses refer to the Inventory comments. A table shows the substance of the Inventory comments and gives the proportion of students endorsing each comment. The complete instruments for all the stories appear in the Appendix.

Response to "The Grave"

Synopsis

"The Grave" tells of a young girl's initiation into womanhood. Through symbolic objects -- a grave, a golden wedding band, and a pregnant rabbit -- the author shows how Miranda, the girl, makes her first discoveries about life and death. She and her brother are hunting; he shoots a rabbit that turns out to have been pregnant. Miranda is disturbed suddenly by the event and refuses the rabbit skin, although she usually likes to have the skins for her dolls. The concluding scene takes place twenty years later: Miranda is startled by a vivid recollection of the events of that earlier day and recognizes now the significance of what had happened.

Student Response

Dramatic moments in this story were its most effective aspect according to the students' endorsements of two comments. One is about Miranda's "realization" when she saw the dead rabbits (17), and the other (11) is about her sudden comprehension, twenty years later, of all that had happened on that day. A greater proportion of students (.60 versus .40) endorsed comment 17, suggesting that it made a stronger impact. In the critical writings on "The Grave," however, there

is more emphasis on Miranda's later discovery. It is crucial to the structure of the story: "the past returns, transfigured, informed," says S. H. Poss. Sister M. Joselyn, who uses "The Grave" as an exemplar of the "lyric" or poetic story, says of that scene: "In her 'vision' Miranda achieves a final form of knowing, and the story attains completion through the intensive evocativeness provided by the interlocked symbols, an essentially poetic device." The student readers may have been more responsive to the earlier scene for several reasons. It created a shocking effect through the killing of the rabbit and then the discovery that the rabbit was pregnant. Miranda was just nine years old, and perhaps because she was so young the students became more readily involved in her emotional responses. But finally, the impact of the last scene comes only with one's perception of its dramatic relationship to the rest of the story, while the earlier moment can be appreciated simply as it happens and for the meaning it imparts on its own.

The interview responses fully supported the evidence from the inventory. Some students mentioned the scene with the rabbits: "When they killed the rabbit, and that the rabbit was pregnant, and the rabbits were just about to be born." But seven of the nine respondents gave some interpretation to the scene or at least noted its significance in Miranda's life. Three of the students were impressed by the conclusion, remarking upon the importance of the last scene to the form of the story. As one girl put it, "Then the ending was kind of abrupt. But it was sort of to the point, so you really...'Ah, now I understand what they meant all the way along now.'"

Table 1

Response to Inventory Comments for "The Grave"

Proportion of 47 Students Endorsing the Comment	Comment No. on Inventory	Category	Substance of the Comment
.60	17	2	Miranda's realization that birth and death are related
.49	4	6	Conflicting images
.40	11	2	Miranda's sudden understanding of that day
.38	9	5	Her changed reaction is a turning point
.26	8	5	Change in tone after she sees the rabbits
.23	2	4	Story is her recollection, long afterwards
.23	13	3	Closeness of relationship between Paul and Miranda
.21	12	3	Characterization of Miranda
.19	7	5	Paul's image as a steadying influence
.19	6	6	Recurring forms of "knowing" and "seeing"
.19	14	3	Miranda's continuing conflict
.15	3	4	Story told from Miranda's point of view
.15	1	1	Explanation of social traditions
.15	10	6	Use of symbolic objects like graves, dove
.12	16	4	Tenderness with which the story is told
.12	18	2	Exchange of treasures
.04	5	1	Story set in the South
.04	15	1	The way the story begins

Categories are: 1, setting and exposition; 2, dramatic moments; 3, characterization; 4, point of view; 5, pattern and design; and 6, words and language.

We had originally placed GRAVE in the words-and-language category, recognizing the strength of the imagery and symbolism. Porter's use of symbolism in the story is discussed elaborately by Sister Joselyn as she supports her thesis of the "lyric" story. Other critics are less ardent, but certainly agree that the grave and the rabbit are strong symbolic forces. In responding to two Inventory comments about words and language in the story the students showed that they, too, found the images effective. One comment (4) was endorsed by 49% of the students and another (10) by 15%. A third, about the recurrence of "seeing" and "knowing" throughout the story, was endorsed by 19% of the readers. The endorsements indicate that students were more impressed by the "conflicting images" presented (4) than by the symbolic import of those images (10). But of course the image created by the description of a "dead rabbit about to give birth" is colored by its symbolic associations as well, so that we may at least suggest that the students were responding to the symbols in their endorsements. In their interviews, the students all spoke of Porter's descriptions; e.g., "The descriptions appealed to me. Her overalls...I could almost picture her...and her brother wearing the brown ones." And several talked of the symbolic uses of the rabbits and the dove.

Two Inventory comments, both in the setting-and-exposition category, were endorsed by only two students each. Students apparently were not impressed by the choice of geographic setting for the story, although several students who were interviewed had enjoyed the setting of the story because it was outdoors, "in Nature."

The Inventory responses show that students did not find the way the story begins to be as effective as other aspects. We find with several of the stories that students tend not to like or to respond to descriptive passages at the beginning of a story -- before the "action" begins. More students found the intervening paragraphs explaining about the graves...(1) effective. The action of the story is, in a sense, interrupted at several points during which the narrator describes bits and pieces of Miranda's background -- why the graves are empty, how Miranda's behavior is viewed by old friends of her grandmother, and how she has come to have such a keen social sense herself. Brooks speaks of the importance of this "special context" and remarks on how "skillfully...the author has rendered the physical and social context that gives point to Miranda's discovery of truth and has effected the modulation of her shifting attitudes -- towards the grave, the buried ring, her hunting clothes, the dead rabbit..." Although not much interest in the "origins" of the graves was expressed, several interviewed students mentioned other parts of these passages. They noted that Miranda was thought to be improperly dressed and mentioned the way the old woman talked to her. The indication is that they did not see the formal contribution of these passages, but used the passages to help in understanding and becoming more involved in the story.

The students did not emphasize characterization. Three comments, two about Miranda (12 and 14) and one about her relationship with Paul (13) were endorsed by less than one-fourth of the students. Looking at the cross-tabulations of items, we find a strong relationship between two of the characterization comments; i.e., students who were impressed by the way Miranda is characterized also endorsed the comment about her relationship with her brother. These students tended not to endorse two comments about point of view and the change in tone in the story (2 and 8) which are surely about more subtle, and ultimately more important, aspects of the story. It seems again with this story, that the students

who were most responsive to characterization paid less attention to more subtle formal aspects. As a group, however, the students gave more endorsements to comments like 2, 9, 11, and 17, which, although they are "about" Miranda, are also about the form of the story.

References

Brooks, Cleanth. "On 'The Grave.'" In Katherine Anne Porter; A Critical Symposium, by Lodwick Hartley and George Core. Georgia Press, 1969, pp. 115-119.

Joselyn, Syster M., O. S. B. "'The Grave' as Lyrical Short Story." Studies in Short Fiction, I, Spring 1964, pp. 216-221.

Poss, S. H. "Variations on a Theme in Four Stories of Katherine Anne Porter." Twentieth Century Literature, Vol. 4, 1958, pp. 21-29.

Additional Bibliography

Warren, Robert Penn. "Irony with a Center: Katherine Anne Porter." In Prose and Criticism, edited by John H. McCullum. Harcourt, Brace and World, 1966, pp. 677-681.

West, Ray B. "Katherine Anne Porter and 'Historic Memory.'" In Southern Renascence, by Louis Rubin and Robert D. Jacobs. John Hopkins Press, 1953, pp. 278-279.

Discussion

Sensitivity to the techniques employed in creating a story is made possible as the reader shifts his attention from the actual event to the story told about that event. Conversely, the more involved the reader is with the action or characters of a story, the less likely he is to attend consciously to technical aspects of the work. Squire (1964) found an overall correlation between frequencies of "involvement" and "literary judgment" responses, but he also found that readers made more "literary judgments" before they got involved in a story or after they had finished than while reading the central portion. It appears from the present study that the use of the Inventory helped to establish a more objective "set" for the readers, enabling them to step back from the work and examine it more carefully. Such objectivity is a necessary -- though certainly not sufficient -- condition for full literary appreciation. Thus, it is sometimes useful and appropriate to encourage objectivity among students of literature. And the Inventory appears to be an effective device for facilitating objective response.

There was a marked difference in sophistication between the language used in the Inventory comments and the more typical remarks made in the interviews. On a number of occasions, the interviewers had the impression that students could not or, for one reason or another, would not express their more complicated ideas. They would begin to speak of some relation in the story or make an analogy but then would stop and cover up with a general or vague remark. For example, one student began to compare the two stories she had read saying, "It was an entirely different mood; the other one was more like...." But then she continued, "They're similar but they're different." Another comparison ended with this ambiguous comment: "It had a little bit more to say about what something would be like after something happened."

The difference between the Inventory and interview data may show that students have not learned to express their responses at the level of the Inventory statements. Or the difference may be a true difference between the level of perception expressed in the comments and the students' own perceptions of the stories. More intensive study must be undertaken to discover where a reader's true response lies on the continuum between what he expresses and what we have stated for him.

The students' reactions were initial responses; they were responding to the story immediately after reading it, and before hearing or reading anything about the story. Often teachers wish to capitalize on initial literary responses, but are hesitant to do so because they may inadvertently encourage inaccurate or irrelevant lines of thought. The use of the Inventories shows that a field for appropriate literary response may be delimited, which still allows the students to assert individual reactions. If it is difficult for students to express their responses, there is even more reason to supply direction through alternatives, giving students an opportunity to recognize or identify their own responses.

The Inventory comments were too sophisticated even for this advanced group of students: the comments were not at the same level as the students' own remarks. But we have shown the Inventory to be a viable method for recording student response to different aspects of stories. Teachers whose students are less likely to exhibit sensitivity to authors' techniques might begin with a set of simple comments on the action in the story, the objective still being to find what it is in the story that interests and affects the reader. If one will invest time and consideration in developing a set of comments, the readers' responses can then be compared with one another and can provide organized feedback to the teacher.

Building the connection between literary criticism and an empirical study of student response, and formulating the questions for this study, were major parts of the task. Educators could, and probably should, undertake an analogous approach in the process of defining objectives for themselves and for their students. Careful articulation of aesthetically valid assumptions about literary response underlying classroom practices would benefit students as well as teachers.

We asked what makes a story effective. This set the stage for an objective reply. Had the question been, What did you like about the story? we might have had similar responses to the Inventory, but the data would have to be considered differently. Likewise, the very words the teacher uses in eliciting responses from the class imply -- perhaps unwittingly -- the approach the reader should be taking to the work (and the approach the teacher may take to the reader's response).

Through the method developed for this study, insight was gained into student response to particular stories. The study also produced more general statements about what students attend to in stories and about the sources of variability in students' responses. Finally, the successful use of an objective instrument to record literary responses leads to new possibilities for describing those responses and for facilitating deeper and more articulate reactions to particular literary works.

References

Aldrich, Virgil. Philosophy of Art. Prentice Hall, 1963.

Arnheim, Rudolph. Art and Visual Perception: A Psychology of the Creative Eye. University of California Press, 1969.

Gombriech, E. H., Meditations on a Hobby Horse; and other essays on the theory of art. New York Graphic Society, 1963.

Nicol, Elizabeth. Student Response to Narrative Techniques in Fiction. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Stanford University, 1972.

Squire, James. The Responses of Adolescents While Reading Four Short Stories. National Council of Teachers of English, 1964.

[A]

Name _____
(last) (first)

The Grave

These statements are about different aspects of the story you have just read. What do you think makes this story effective?
Mark 1 to 6 statements that express what you responded to as you read this story. Put a ✓ by at least 1 (and no more than 6) statements.

___ 1) The intervening paragraphs explaining about the graves and the social traditions of Miranda's family.

___ 2) The fact that the story turns out to be Miranda's recollection of that day, long after it happened.

___ 3) The way that the story is told from Miranda's point of view, even though it is narrated in the "third person."

___ 4) The use of conflicting images, like children playing in graves, a dead rabbit about to give birth, and a young girl carrying a rifle.

___ 5) The fact that the story is set in the southern United States, many years ago.

___ 6) The recurring forms of "to see" and "to know": e.g., the graves were a "new sight"; Miranda wanted to "see...having seen...she had known all along."

___ 7) The way in which Paul's image at the end sets things right for Miranda, just as he provided a steadying influence during that day.

___ 8) The way the tone of the story changes after Miranda has seen the baby rabbits.

___ 9) The fact that Miranda's changed reaction to the dead baby rabbits can also be seen as a turning point in her life.

___ 10) The effect of using symbolic objects like graves, a dove, rabbits, and a gold ring.

___ 11) The way in which Miranda suddenly understands the meaning of what had happened to her that day, twenty years before.

___ 12) Miranda's characterization as a typical nine-year-old girl, part tomboy.

___ 13) The interactions between Paul and Miranda, showing the closeness of their relationship.

___ 14) The continuing conflict Miranda feels between what she is and what she should be.

___ 15) The way the story begins, on a "burning" hot day in a graveyard.

___ 16) The tenderness with which the story is told.

___ 17) Miranda's realization, when she sees the dead rabbits, that birth and death are closely related.

___ 18) The children's exchange of treasures, signifying Miranda's increasing awareness of herself.

[When you have finished, turn this page and the story face down. Begin page B]

[A]

Name _____
(last) (first)

The Portable Phonograph

These statements are about different aspects of the story you have just read.
What do you think makes this story effective?
Mark 1 to 6 statements that express what you responded to as you read this story.
Put a ✓ by at least 1 (and no more than 6) statements.

___ 1) Dramatic moments, such as when Dr. Jenkins pegs the canvas on his cave to shut the others out.

___ 2) The unemotional tone with which the story is told.

___ 3) The point of view from which the story is told - of one who is more aware of what is happening than the characters themselves.

___ 4) The characterization of the young musician.

___ 5) The balancing effect of having the descriptions of the sky at the beginning and again at the end of the story to set the mood.

___ 6) The choice of animals to appear in the descriptions - wild geese and wolves.

___ 7) The distance which the narrator seems to place between himself and the characters.

___ 8) The language used to describe the landscape.

___ 9) The mood of desolation established by the extensive description at the beginning.

___ 10) The tense moment when Dr. Jenkins opens up the black case and reveals the treasured phonograph.

___ 11) The air of superficial civility created both by the men's conversation and the descriptions.

___ 12) The way the characters' choice of music highlights the differences between them.

___ 13) The use of language to give a religious overtone to the events in the cave.

___ 14) The particular characters created by the author - all are intellectuals, helpless in the face of such physical hardships.

___ 15) The way that Dr. Jenkins, possessor of the treasures, emerges as the "leader of the group.

___ 16) The way the musician's coughing recurs and assumes significance in the story.

___ 17) The fact that the cave is such an unlikely setting for the intellectual events that take place.

___ 18) The agony expressed in the musician's sudden movement during the music.

[When you have finished, turn this page and the story face down. Begin page B.]

[A]

Name _____
(last) (first)

A Clean, Well-Lighted Place

These statements are about different aspects of the story you have just read.
What do you think makes this story effective?
Mark 1 to 6 statements that express what you responded to as you read this story.
Put a [illegible] by at least 1 (and no more than 6) statements.

___ 1) The [illegible] older waiter is characterized - he, too, prefers staying out late to going home to bed.

___ 2) The meaning given in the story to the words "light" and "clean."

___ 3) Moments of conflict, such as when the waiter says to the old deaf man, "Finished...No. Finished."

___ 4) The way the author elaborates his theme, making "nothing" into something concrete.

___ 5) The way the word "nothing" ("nada") is repeated over and over near the end of the story.

___ 6) The cruelty of the young waiter's remark about the old man - that he should have killed himself.

___ 7) The way the two waiters are set apart by their conversation.

___ 8) The way the older waiter takes up the pattern begun by the deaf man, wandering on alone in the night.

___ 9) The fact that the older waiter ends up in the kind of place he has just finished talking about.

___ 10) The increasing importance given to the older waiter's viewpoint as the story progresses.

___ 11) The poetic quality of the dialogue which sounds like a translation from the Spanish.

___ 12) The "sameness" of each description of the cafe.

___ 13) The soliloquy about "nada" which becomes the climax of the story.

___ 14) The way the meaning of the waiters' dialogue is reinforced by their blunt and clipped conversation.

___ 15) The author's choice of Spain as the setting for this story.

___ 16) The way the cafe assumes different meaning for the two men who work there.

___ 17) The minimal characterization of the old man, except to show that he is in despair.

___ 18) The sympathy shown by the narrator for the older waiter.

[When you have finished, turn this page and the story face down. Begin page B]

[A]

Name _____
(last) (first)

Araby

These statements are about different aspects of the story you have just read.
What do you think makes this story effective?
Mark 1 to 6 statements that express what you responded to as you read this story.
Put a ✓ by at least 1 (and no more than 6) statements.

___ 1) The way the story is told - as if the boy were now grown and reflecting back on the events.

___ 2) The drama of the moment when Mangan's sister first speaks to the boy.

___ 3) The use of religious words to describe the boy's praying, his worship of the girl, and the bazaar itself.

___ 4) The physical description of the bazaar - its improvised wooden platform and its emptiness.

___ 5) The way Mangan's sister appears with the light behind her, dressed in brown.

___ 6) Moments of relief, such as when the boy discovers that the bazaar is still open.

___ 7) The expression of the boy's disillusion in the words used to describe the bazaar.

___ 8) The choice of the back drawing room, where the priest had died, as a setting for the boy's own ceremony of adoration.

___ 9) The way that the boy's every action relates to his love for Mangan's sister.

___10) The reflection of the boy's sense of alienation in the description of the street as "blind," the houses as "imperturbable."

___11) The conflicting image of spirituality and sensuality presented in Mangan's sister.

___12) The contrast of the boy's sense of awe towards the bazaar with the idle conversation of the people who worked there.

___13) The boy's feeling that his surroundings were hostile to his own romance.

___14) The way an event, like the porter pushing the others away from the train, accentuates the boy's loneliness.

___15) The design of the story - like a religious "quest."

___16) The fact that Mangan's sister is always seen from below, like an adored object on a pedestal.

___17) The way "Araby" changes from an exciting fantasy to a disappointing reality.

___18) The fact that the story is told by the boy from his own point of view.

[When you have finished, turn this page and the story face down. Begin page B]

[A]

Name _____
(last) (first)

The Poker Party

These statements are about different aspects of the story you have just read. What do you think makes this story effective?
Mark 1 to 6 statements that express what you responded to as you read this story. Put a ✓ by at least 1 (and no more than 6) statements.

___ 1) The descriptions of the characters, revealing only what the boy finds significant.

___ 2) Moments of affection such as when the father takes the boy in his lap.

___ 3) The warmth and protectiveness of the mother, Pablina.

___ 4) The repeated emphasis on the "visual:" the way the boy sees things is important.

___ 5) The way a certain event, like Carey's statement, "Now I know why you didn't want to redeal," changes the course of the story.

___ 6) The sympathetic manner in which the boy regards his father, even in the midst of the conflict.

___ 7) Climatic events, such as when the boy points to the card on the table, giving away his father's hand.

___ 8) The way the story is told so that the reader sees everything just as the boy does.

___ 9) The forewarning of future events in the beginning of the story, through the tenseness at the dinner table, for example.

___ 10) The description of the boy's apartment - its tall, narrow halls, and the way the water can be heard through the walls.

___ 11) The perspective of the story - the fact that it is told by the boy, but with the wisdom of a grown man.

___ 12) The characterization of the father, who is strict and insists on following precisely the rules of the game.

___ 13) The use of childlike descriptions - the card decks "smooth as ice," the setting sun like "orange sherbert."

___ 14) The way the boy describes his surroundings, like the walls "moving up into a blackness so thick I was not certain there was a ceiling to stop them."

___ 15) The changing mood of the story with each shift from the boy's descriptions to the dialogue between adults.

___ 16) The importance of softness - the table cover is "softer than my blanket," the "soft street lamp," and his mother's hair, "soft as smoke."

___ 17) The atmosphere associated with the kitchen - it seems stuffy and close.

___ 18) The dramatic, play-like narration of the episode in the kitchen.

[When you have finished, turn this page and the story face down. Begin page B.]

[A]

Name _____
(last) (first)

An Occurrence at Owl Creek Bridge

These statements are about different aspects of the story you have just read.
What do you think makes this story effective?
Mark 1 to 6 statements that express what you responded to as you read this story.
Put a / by at least 1 (and no more than 6) statements.

___ 1) The language used to describe Farquhar's exceptionally keen senses as he enters his fantasy world.

___ 2) The way the tone of the story changes as the narrator begins to describe the fantasy in Farquhar's mind.

___ 3) The discovery that Farquhar has been deceived by the Federal scout.

___ 4) The fact that the story occurs during the Civil War.

___ 5) The eventual disclosure of two meanings for the word "occurrence."

___ 6) The way that each of the real events of the hanging is introduced and interpreted in Farquhar's fantasy.

___ 7) The use of certain words like "whiz," "rattle," and "plash" to emphasize the clarity of Farquhar's imagination.

___ 8) The characterization of the soldiers - their stiff, lifeless poses.

___ 9) The sudden change of perspective in the final sentence, making it sound like the first paragraphs.

___ 10) The design of the story into three distinct episodes.

___ 11) The fact that Farquhar acts with such intelligence throughout his fantasy.

___ 12) The way the surroundings are described in the fantasy - as if perceived through the senses not with the mind.

___ 13) Moments of disparity, such as when the stream races madly and yet the driftwood moves slowly.

___ 14) The sound of phrases like "vertical in front of the left shoulder," and "the barrels inclining slightly backward against the right shoulder."

___ 15) The image of the river, which changes from a threatening force into the man's salvation, and then becomes his grave.

___ 16) The way the tense changes from past to present just as Farquhar arrives "home."

___ 17) The simultaneous occurrence of two time patterns: one in reality, and the other in fantasy.

___ 18) The fact that Farquhar seems too kind and gentle a person to be hanged.

[When you have finished, turn this page and the story face down. Begin page B]