

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 071 058

CS 000 319

AUTHOR Zuck, Louis V., Comp.; Goodman, Yetta M., Comp.  
TITLE Social Class and Regional Dialects: Their  
Relationship to Reading; An Annotated  
Bibliography.  
INSTITUTION International Reading Association, Newark, Del.  
PUB DATE [71]  
NOTE 14p.  
AVAILABLE FROM International Reading Association, 6 Tyre Avenue,  
Newark, Del. 19711 (\$0.72 non-member, \$0.50  
member)  
EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.65 HC-\$3.29  
DESCRIPTORS American English; Cultural Differences; \*Linguistic  
Theory; \*Reading Instruction; Reading Processes;  
Second Language Learning; \*Social Dialects; \*Teaching  
Techniques; Ten1

ABSTRACT

Research, pedagogical implications for reading, and the exploration of issues surrounding social dialects and reading are addressed in this annotated bibliography. Criteria for choosing the articles include (1) that all American children and teachers whose first language is English speak a dialect of American English; (2) that all dialects of American English have structure and rules; (3) that all children have a variety of experiences and belong to social groups; and (4) that all social groups have a culture. The entries have been grouped into four sections. The first section deals with literature on linguistic concepts related to oral language and the second, with literature on concepts related to written language. The third section is concerned with implications for the classroom, ranging from those suggesting the postponement of reading until an oral standard English has been acquired to those suggesting that dialect differences would not interfere in reading if the schools allowed children to speak in their native dialect. Finally, the fourth section discusses the relationship between social class dialects and second language learning. This document was previously announced as ED 005 755. (HS)

ED 071 020

**SOCIAL CLASS AND REGIONAL DIALECTS:  
THEIR RELATIONSHIP TO READING**

*An Annotated Bibliography*

Compiled by Louis V. Zuck  
and

Yetta M. Goodman  
University of Michigan at Dearborn  
1971

Ramon Ross, *General Editor*

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,  
EDUCATION & WELFARE  
OFFICE OF EDUCATION  
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRO-  
DUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM  
THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

**CONTENTS**

Introduction	3
Linguistic Concepts Related to Oral Language	5
Linguistic Concepts Related to Written Language	8
Implications for the Classroom	12
Social Class Dialects and Sound Language Learning: Are They Related?	15

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS COPY  
RIGHTED MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED  
BY

International

Reading Association

TO ERIC AND ORGANIZATIONS OPERATING  
UNDER AGREEMENTS WITH THE U.S. OFFICE  
OF EDUCATION. FURTHER REPRODUCTION  
OUTSIDE THE ERIC SYSTEM REQUIRES PER-  
MISSION OF THE COPYRIGHT OWNER

*Published by*

**INTERNATIONAL READING ASSOCIATION**

Six Tyre Avenue • Newark, Delaware 19711

## ii. INTRODUCTION.

In most urban centers as well as in many rural areas there are children who speak a dialect of American English which differs in various ways from the dialect of their teacher. In developing this bibliography, the major objectives were to list articles and books that explored the issues surrounding social dialects and reading, that presented research concerning social dialects and reading, and that suggested implications for the teaching of reading to children with differing regional and social class dialects. Whether the interference of a different dialect of English causes a reading problem or whether the lack of knowledge on the part of teachers about dialect and cultural differences causes a reading problem still remains to be seen. Regardless, teachers, curriculum planners, and educational researchers must continue to become more sophisticated about the language of children in order for children to become more successful in school and especially in reading.

Despite the general agreement among linguists that all dialects of American English are legitimate forms of language with equally developed rules concerning the sound, grammatical, and meaning systems of language, educators and psychologists writing in the field of social dialects and reading continue to operate under a variety of misconceptions about language. Some still view language spoken by people from low social status as inherently wrong and clearly suggest that all children must be taught "standard" English as a prerequisite to reading. Others, although mouthing the phrase that all dialects are legitimate, make it clear that they believe the cultural background in which these children grow up does not provide adequate experiences from which these children might derive language or concepts.

We have decided to be selective about the articles in this bibliography. The following scientific concepts are basic if teachers are to understand the problems of children who speak a dialect different from theirs. We have used these concepts as the criteria for choosing the articles selected.

1. All American children and teachers whose first language is English speak a dialect of American English.
2. All dialects of American English have structure and rules. They are all legitimate forms of American English.
3. All children have a variety of experiences and belong to social groups.
4. All social groups have a culture.

No single position is represented in this bibliography nor do we agree with all the articles included, but we have chosen to include only those articles which accept, implicitly or explicitly, the previous principles drawn from the fields of anthropology and linguistics.

In the following sections, terms such as standard English, nonstandard English, Black dialect, and nonstandard Black English are used. These terms do not yield to any easy definition and under the best circumstances, they simply reflect an attempt to categorize the speech and writing of speakers of English. There is no agreement on how the terms should be applied; there is no agreement on how they should be defined.

L.V.Z.  
Y.M.G.

## LINGUISTIC CONCEPTS RELATED TO ORAL LANGUAGE

For many years linguists have been studying standard and nonstandard regional dialects in America. Only within the last few years, however, have they focused upon the variety of dialects spoken in large metropolitan areas. All dialects have a history and grammar and no dialect can be considered a sloppy variation of some better dialect. Nonstandard dialects are not illogical, imprecise, nor incomplete; they are viewed in this manner because they are spoken by people who have been victims of social and economic prejudice.

Much of the research related to social class dialects and their affect on learning has focused on oral language. Many of the principles applied to problems of reading and social class dialects have been based on such research. This section deals with research and literature in order to give the educator concerned with social class dialects and reading a background upon which to base considerations and decisions.

ABRAHAMSON, ROGER D. "The Advantages of Black English," *Florida FL Reporter*, 8 (Spring/Fall 1970), 27-30, 51.

Points out that the differences between the communicative systems of non-standard Black English and standard English involve more than differences between phonology and syntax. Teachers need to understand these differences if they are to work effectively with Black children.

BAILEY, BERYL. "Some Aspects of the Impact of Linguistics on Language Teaching in Disadvantaged Communities," *Elementary English*, 45 (May 1968), 570-578, 626.

Presents findings in the area of phonology, grammar, and lexicon as related to nonstandard speakers of English. Specific examples are given relating Black dialect to Creole. Bailey favors early training programs for teaching formal written English based on a knowledge of the systematic differences of spoken dialects for instructional purposes.

BURLING, ROBBINS. "Standard Colloquial and Standard Written English: Some Implications For Teaching Literacy to Nonstandard Speakers," *Florida FL Reporter*, 8 (Spring/Fall 1970), 9-15, 47.

Presents Burling's argument that since teachers are tolerant of the differences between standard informal spoken and standard written English, they should also be tolerant of the difference between nonstandard informal spoken and standard written English. He adds that teachers would be more tolerant of nonstandard English if they understood it better. He concludes by saying that learning to read is more important than learning to speak standard English.

DAVIS, A. L. "Dialect Research and the Needs of the Schools," *Elementary English*, 45 (May 1968), 558-608.

Reviews recent linguistic research related to dialect differences in the United States and Canada. Davis lists problems created by new data and suggests need for additional information and research in order to understand the teaching of language in schools.

ERICKSON, FREDERICK D. "F'get You Honky! A New Look at Black Dialect and the School," *Elementary English*, 46 (April 1969), 495-499.

Discusses the relationship of linguistic code (restricted or elaborated) to situational context. Erickson offers several hypotheses, the most important being that "given the proper context, Black dialect can be used to communicate abstractions with considerable precision."

FASOLD, RALPH W., and WALTER WOLFRAM. "Some Linguistic Features of Negro Dialect," in Ralph W. Fasold and Roger W. Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Standard English in the Inner City*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1970, 41-86.

Sets forth in nontechnical language a detailed description of the pronunciation and grammar rules of nonstandard Black English.

FEIGENBAUM, IRWIN. "The Use of Nonstandard English in Teaching Standard: Contrast and Comparison," in Ralph W. Fasold and Roger W. Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Standard English in the Inner City*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1970, 87-104.

Gives several detailed descriptions of exercises that can be used to teach standard English to nonstandard speakers. Although Feigenbaum's exercises are written for junior high and senior high school students, they may be applicable to younger children.

GLADNEY, MILDRED R., and LLOYD LEAVERTON. "A Model for Teaching Standard English to Nonstandard English Speakers," *Elementary English*, 45 (October 1968), 758-763.

Describes oral language materials used to teach standard English as school talk compared to everyday talk. A study based on the use of the materials indicates more success with certain verb forms than with others.

HOFFMAN, MELVIN J. "The Harmful Effects of Traditional Language Arts Teaching Methods When Used with Disadvantaged Afro-American Children," *Elementary English*, 47 (May 1970), 678-683.

Discusses myths in the teaching of language arts. Hoffman believes that linguistic sophistication is necessary for classroom teachers to understand the unique language problems of Afro-American students.

JOHNSON, KENNETH R. "Teacher's Attitude Toward the Nonstandard Negro Dialect - Let's Change It," *Elementary English*, 48 (February 1971), 176-184.

Discusses some of the false assumptions that teachers hold toward nonstandard dialect. Author also presents some unsuccessful attempts to teach standard English to Black children, based on these false assumptions.

KOCHMANN, THOMAS. "Social Factors in the Consideration of Teaching Standard English," in Alfred C. Aarons, et al (Eds.), *Linguistic-Cultural Differences and American Education*. Florida FL Reporter, 7 (Spring/Summer 1969), 87-88, 157.

Argues against teaching standard dialect to speakers of a nonstandard dialect unless those speakers desire to learn it. To do otherwise, the author asserts, is to waste time trying to reach an impossible goal.

LABOV, WILLIAM. "The Logic of Nonstandard English," in James E. Alatis (Ed.), *Report of the Twentieth Annual Round Table Meeting on Linguistics and Language Studies*. Washington, D. C.: Georgetown University Press, No. 22, 1969, 1-43.

Maintains that nonstandard English is not illogical: it is simply unfashionable. Furthermore, the verbal deprivation of some children is nothing more than a defensive posture adopted in a threatening situation. In nonthreatening situations, these same children have no difficulty expressing themselves.

MALMSTROM, JEAN, and ANNABEL ASHLEY. *Dialects, U. S. A.* Champaign, Illinois: National Council of Teachers of English, 1963.

Gives help to the teacher who is just becoming aware of the importance of dialect differences regarding oral language and reading.

MC DAVID, RAVEN I., JR. "Variations in Standard American English," *Elementary English*, 45 (May 1968), 561-564, 608.

Defines varieties of standard English within the United States. Author gives examples of different standards of English according to regional areas with some of their history as they relate to pronunciation, grammar, and vocabulary.

SHUY, ROGER W. "Detroit Speech: Careless, Awkward, Inconsistent, or Systematic, Graceful, and Regular?" *Elementary English*, 45 (May 1968), 565-569.

Reports partial results of a comprehensive linguistic study of Detroit speech. Procedures are outlined and implications for English teaching are presented.

SMITH, VERNON. "The Teacher's Prejudices and the Children's Dialects," in James D. Walden (Ed.), *Going Up the Road to Turn Around. Bulletin of the School of Education*, 45 (1969). Bloomington: Indiana University, 127-144.

Explores the validity of a recognizable standard American English and whether the attempt to change the dialects of culturally different children is prejudicial in nature. Author presents implications for classroom instruction.

WOLFRAM, WALTER. "Sociolinguistic Implications for Educational Sequencing," in Ralph W. Fasold and Roger W. Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Standard English in the Inner City*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1970, 105-119.

Discusses five sociolinguistic principles that can be used to determine a relevant sequencing of standard English features to be taught to nonstandard Black speakers. It is not a matter of common knowledge which features of standard English should be taught first since existing materials do not follow a similar pattern of sequencing.

## LINGUISTIC CONCEPTS RELATED TO WRITTEN LANGUAGE

In recent years, educators, linguists, and psycholinguists have presented a much more sophisticated view of the reading process. Some of these researchers have presented evidence indicating that the child who speaks a nonstandard dialect will have more difficulty learning to read than the child who speaks a standard dialect. This difficulty, to an uncertain degree, is the result of language conflict. However, other researchers have issued a warning: Many children might not be learning to read because of the conflict between the culture of the schools and the culture of the child. Too much emphasis on language conflict might diminish the responsibility of the school to examine its attitude toward imposing one specific culture upon those who have a different culture.

BAILEY, BERYL LOFTMAN. "Some Arguments Against the Use of Dialect Readers in the Teaching of Initial Reading." *Florida FL Reporter*, 8 (Spring/Fall 1970), 8, 47.

Raises several questions which the author thinks need to be answered. Bailey feels that extreme caution should be taken before any program is set up for the teaching of reading to Black children.

BARATZ, JOAN C., and ROGER W. SHUY (Eds.). *Teaching Black Children to Read*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1969.

Compiles key articles which present various positions on issues as well as teaching implications. Chapters are annotated individually under appropriate headings in this bibliography.

BARATZ, JOAN C. "Bi-dialectal Task In Determining Language Proficiency in Economically Disadvantaged Negro Children." *Child Development*, 40 (September 1969), 889-901.

Concludes from research that Negro children perform significantly better on repeating nonstandard English sentences than white children. Baratz states strongly that this awareness must be taken into consideration in all measures of language assessment of nonstandard speakers of Black English.

BARATZ, JOAN C. "Teaching Reading in an Urban Negro School System." in Joan Baratz and Roger W. Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Black Children to Read*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1969, 92-116.

Concludes that on the basis of a sentence repetition experiment, Black children who speak only nonstandard English will learn to read more easily if beginning texts are written in nonstandard English.

GRAHAM, RICHARD T., and E. HUGH RUDOLF. "Dialect and Spelling." *Elementary English*, 47 (March 1970), 363-376.

Reports a study by the authors to discover whether sixth graders would exhibit significant differences in their spelling errors as related in their dialects. Although not specifically related to reading there is interesting data presented and suggestions for further research projects.

HAGERMAN, BARBARA, and TERRY SAARIO. "Nonstandard Dialect Interference in Reading," in Malcolm P. Douglass (Ed.), *Claremont Reading Conference Thirty-third Yearbook*, 1969, 158-167.

Describes research which deals with the question of dialect interference in reading. Although conclusions indicate that dialect interference is involved on a specific recognition task, the basic question still remains.

LABOV, WILLIAM. "Some Sources of Reading Problems for Negro Speakers of Nonstandard English," in Joan C. Baratz and Roger W. Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Black Children to Read*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1969, 29-67.

Presents a detailed discussion of how the pronunciation of a nonstandard speaker can interfere with his learning to read standard English.

LABOV, WILLIAM, and CLARENCE ROBINS. "A Note on the Relation of Reading Failure to Peer-Group Status in Urban Ghettos," *Linguistic-Cultural Differences and American Education, Florida FL Reporter*, 7, 54-57, 167. Also in *Teacher's College Record*, 70 (February 1969), 395-405.

Discusses research by the authors which shows a strong relationship between participation in street culture and reading failure. The authors make suggestions for possible solutions to the problem.

MC DAVID, RAVEN I., JR., et al. "Language Characteristics of Specific Groups," in Thomas D. Horn (Ed.), *Reading for the Disadvantaged*. New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1970, 135-168.

Presents sections dealing with specific linguistic and other cultural characteristics of native Whites, Blacks, Spanish speakers, and American Indians, respectively. Each author suggests the complexities which teachers must be aware of and implications for the teaching of reading for each group.

RUDDLELL, ROBERT B., and BARBARA W. GRAVES. "Socio-Ethnic Status and the Language Achievement of First-Grade Children," *Elementary English*, 45 (May 1968), 635-642.

Presents results of research which investigates the relationship between syntactic language development and socioethnic status of beginning first graders. A significant relationship exists between error rate and socioethnic status on syntactic items unique to groups. On items unfamiliar to both groups, there are no significant differences. Implications for classroom teachers are presented.

SAVILLE, MURIEL R. "Language and the Disadvantaged," in Thomas D. Horn (Ed.), *Reading for the Disadvantaged*. New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1970, 115-134.

Describes how linguistic principles may be applied to solve problems of reading instruction for children who speak nonstandard English dialects, Spanish, French, or American Indian languages. The issues concerning various methods of teaching are examined.



SHUY, ROGER W. "Linguistic Principles Applied to the Teaching of Reading." in J. Allen Figurel (Ed.), *Reading and Inquiry*. Proceedings of the International Reading Association, 10. Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1965, 242-243.

States that in applying linguistics to reading one must consider sound, system, and society. Dialect differences between learners must be understood and accounted for. Shuy offers numerous examples of the effect of such differences on reading. He argues that the child be permitted to "learn to read, or improve his reading, in the dialect which is most familiar to him."

SHUY, ROGER W. "Starting a Reading Program for Speakers of Subgroup Dialects," in Brother Leonard Courtney (Ed.), *Linguistics and Reading*. Highlights of the 1965 Preconvention Institutes. Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1966.

Suggests that ignoring dialect differences may nullify the usefulness of programs emphasizing grapheme-phoneme correspondences and spelling patterns. Shuy cites a number of significant examples.

SHUY, ROGER W. "Some Language and Cultural Differences in a Theory of Reading," in Kenneth S. Goodman and James T. Fleming (Eds.), *Psycholinguistics and the Teaching of Reading*. Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1969, 34-47.

Applies linguistic insights concerning the cultural position of children with reading difficulties and the way these children learn language, to the teaching and learning of reading. Shuy gives specific examples of language differences and educational practices which do not take into account such data.

SMITH, E. BROOKS, KENNETH S. GOODMAN, and ROBERT MEREDITH. *Language and Thinking in the Elementary School*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1970.

Contains two especially relevant chapters (fifteen and sixteen), "The Reading Process: A Psycholinguistic View" and "Teaching Reading: Developing Strategies for Comprehension."

SMITH, KENNETH J. "Phonetics and Dialect Characteristics of Language," in Marjorie S. Johnson and Roy A. Kress (Eds.), *Thought-Language-Reading*, 1969 Annual Reading Institute. Philadelphia: Temple University, 1970, 99-102.

Explores the phonological aspect of dialect difference. Author believes that teachers must be aware of the phonetic characteristics of their own dialect as well as the child's dialect in order not to confuse the child during the teaching of reading. He calls for adequate training in phonetics for all teachers of reading.

STEWART, WILLIAM A. "Current Issues in the Use of Negro Dialect in Beginning Reading Texts," *Florida FL Reporter*, 8 (Spring/Fall 1970), 3-7, 46.

Reviews various viewpoints regarding dialect interference in reading. Stewart discusses the issues that have emerged over the use of dialect readers in beginning reading instruction. His own position favors the use of dialect in beginning reading texts.

STEWART, WILLIAM A. "Foreign Language Teaching Methods in Quasi-Foreign Language Situations," *Teaching Standard English in the Inner City*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1970, 1-19.

Suggests that the average child of six or seven has internalized the basic phonological and grammatical patterns of at least one linguistic system. Stewart illustrates with samples of pidgin how structures within dialects vary. He relates spelling and reading difficulties to phonemic differences in dialect systems.

TORREY, JANE W. "Illiteracy in the Ghetto," *Harvard Educational Review*, 40 (Spring 1970), 253-259.

Contends that it is not the linguistic differences between standard and nonstandard English that make learning to read difficult and sometimes impossible for many Black children. According to Torrey, it is the negative attitudes of many teachers toward the language of the Afro-American.

WARDHAUGH, RONALD. *Reading: A Linguistic Perspective*. New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1969.

Offers material which the compilers consider to be necessary reading for anyone who wants to gain a better understanding of what the reading process is. The book assumes some knowledge of linguistics. There is, however, a glossary of linguistic terms at the back. Some of the relevant chapters are: "Grammar and Reading," "Meaning," "The Spelling System of English," and "Dialect."

WEBER, ROSE-MARIE. *Linguistics and Reading*. Washington, D. C.: Eric Clearinghouse for Linguistics, 1970, 16-22.

Presents specific variation in English occurring in regional dialects, social dialects, and styles which have implications for the teaching of reading.

WOLFRAM, WALTER, and RALPH W. FASOLD. "Toward Reading Materials for Speakers of Black English: Three Linguistically Appropriate Passages," in Joan C. Baratz and Roger W. Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Black Children to Read*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1969, 138-155.

Provides three passages of adequate length that have been written in Black English. Carefully explains points of contrast in the passages between standard and nonstandard English.

## IMPLICATIONS FOR THE CLASSROOM

Many linguists, psychologists, and educators are making recommendations and suggestions as well as developing reading materials which have implications for the classroom. Views range from those suggesting the postponement of reading until an oral standard English has been acquired to those suggesting that dialect differences would not interfere in reading if the school environment allowed children to speak in their native dialect, but encouraged rich and varied language experiences in the curriculum.

ALLEN, VIRGINIA F. "Teaching Standard English As a Second Dialect," *Teacher's College Record*, 68 (February 1967), 355-370.

Defines standard English and offers several suggestions for teaching it. It is Allen's opinion, however, that children below grade four should concentrate on learning how to read and write the English they already know.

BARATZ, JOAN C. "Linguistic and Cultural Factors in Teaching Reading to Ghetto Children," *Elementary English*, 46 (February 1969), 199-203.

Suggests teaching ghetto children through use of their own language for initial reading followed by use of transition readers which move toward the language of traditional texts.

ECROYD, DONALD H. "Negro Children and Language Arts," *Reading Teacher*, 21 (April 1968), 624-629.

Suggests delaying the teaching of reading until a child has developed concepts about what he will read. Ecroyd says that then the teaching of reading should begin by having the child read materials written in his dialect.

FASOLD, RALPH W. "Orthography in Reading Materials for Black English Speaking Children," in Joan C. Baratz and Roger W. Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Black Children to Read*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1969, 68-91.

Argues that it is not necessary to develop a special orthography to represent Black English in order to use Black English structure as a medium to teach beginning reading.

GOODMAN, KENNETH S. "Dialect Barriers to Reading Comprehension," *Elementary English*, 42 (December 1965), 853-860.

Discusses the influence of dialect differences on learning to read. Phonemic, inflectional, syntactic, and semantic aspects are discussed. Three alternate approaches are explained: teach a standard dialect before teaching reading; write materials in the dialect of the learner; let the learner read in his native dialect.

GOODMAN, YETTA. "The Culture of the Culturally Deprived," *Elementary School Journal*, 71 (April 1971), 376-383.

Examines the play-party games and songs of Black children. The author

question, the validity of tests used to evaluate the reading skills of these youngsters.

JOHNSON, KENNETH R. "When Should Standard English Be Taught to Speakers of Nonstandard Negro Dialect?" *Language Learning*, 20 (June 1970), 19-30.

Contends that standard English should not be taught to children who speak a nonstandard Black dialect until they reach adolescence or the secondary grades. Consequently, Johnson suggests that beginning reading might be delayed.

MALKOC, ANNA MARIA, and A. HOOD ROBERTS. "NCTE Eric Report: Bi-Dialectalism: A Special Report From CAL Eric." *Elementary English*, 48 (January 1971), 125-136.

Reviews recent reports, papers presented, and instructional materials concerning oral language and reading programs for children who are linguistically different from their teacher.

RYSTROM, RICHARD. "Dialect Training and Reading: A Further Look." *Reading Research Quarterly*, 5 (Summer 1970), 579-599.

Indicates that teaching standard English to Black children who speak a nonstandard dialect will not improve their reading ability. In fact, training in standard English seems to confuse the children. This article should be read in conjunction with Goodman's reply which immediately follows: "Dialect Rejection and Reading: A Response," 600-603. Goodman's reply questions the assumptions, not the results, of Rystrom's research.

SCHINEYER, J. WESLEY. "Research: Reading and the Disadvantaged." *Reading Teacher*, 23 (March 1970), 571-573.

Offers a short review of the current research and the wide varieties of positions regarding children who have failed to respond to instruction in reading.

SFRWER, BLANCHE I. "Linguistic Support for a Method of Teaching Beginning Reading to Black Children." *Reading Research Quarterly*, 4 (Summer 1969), 449-467.

Concludes that comprehension is both the motivating and reinforcing agent in the Black child's learning to read. After describing research and its results, the author discusses the linguistic theory supporting the language experience approach to teaching reading.

SHUY, ROGER W. "A Linguistic Background for Developing Beginning Reading Material for Black Children," in Joan C. Baratz and Roger Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Black Children to Read*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1969, 117-137.

Discusses several linguistic factors that should be considered when preparing beginning reading material for Black children who speak a nonstandard dialect of English.

SKINNER, VINCENT P. "Why Many Appalachian Children are 'Problem Readers' - We Create the Problems." *Journal of Reading*, 2 (November 1967), 30-32.

Expresses belief that reading difficulties of Appalachian children are due to the different language system they speak. Author suggests a program to teach standard English.

STEWART, WILLIAM A. "On the Use of Negro Dialect in the Teaching of Reading," in Joan C. Baratz and Roger W. Shuy (Eds.), *Teaching Black Children to Read*. Washington, D. C.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1969, 156-219.

Presents several arguments in favor of using material written in nonstandard Black English to teach beginning reading to children who speak nonstandard Black English. Stewart recommends that the transition from nonstandard to standard English be accomplished in a series of stages, each successive stage more closely resembling standard English. He also recommends that the initial stage incorporate minor orthographic changes.

VENEZKY, RICHARD L. *Working Paper No. 43. Nonstandard Language and Reading*. Madison: University of Wisconsin, Wisconsin Research and Development Center for Cognitive Learning, 1970.

Recommends that a combination of two procedures be used to teach reading to nonstandard speaking children: teach standard English before the introduction of reading; modify "the subject matter and vocabulary of standard language materials to better reflect the experiences and expectations of the nonstandard speaking child."

VENEZKY, RICHARD L. "Nonstandard Dialect and Reading" *Elementary English*, 47 (March 1970), 334-345.

Discusses ways of teaching reading to nonstandard English speakers emphasizing initial reading and the language of reading materials. Venezky reviews recent research and explores three different alternatives for the preparation of reading materials. An extensive bibliography is appended.

### **SOCIAL CLASS DIALECTS AND SECOND LANGUAGE LEARNING: ARE THEY RELATED?**

One of the solutions commonly suggested for teaching standard English dialects to nonstandard speakers of English includes an approach used by many who teach English as a foreign language. This approach basically calls for respecting the native language of the speakers and contrasting and comparing the major features of the two languages. Once the speaker has command of the oral language, he can then learn to read the second language with greater facility. Some authors are beginning to raise serious questions about how valid it is to apply the methods of teaching a foreign language to the teaching of standard English dialects to speakers of nonstandard English dialects.

Although this bibliography has not dealt with second-language learning and reading, the following entries are included because the authors discuss second language learning, social class dialects, and reading.

ALLEN, VIRGINIA F. "A Second Dialect is Not a Foreign Language." in James E. Alatis (Ed.), *Report of the Twentieth Annual Round Table Meeting on Linguistics and Language Studies*. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 1969, 189-202.

Points out some similarities and differences between learning a foreign language and learning a second dialect. Procedures for teaching a second dialect are described.

ARNOLD, R. D., and T. H. TAYLOR. "Mexican-American and Language Learning." *Childhood Education*, 46 (December 1969), 149-154.

Presents the problems of Spanish speaking children in school and the disagreements in the field. The authors suggest pattern practice with meaningful learning situations for instructional purposes.

CROWLEY, DALE P. "Language Programs Contrasted," *Elementary English*, 44 (November 1967), 756-761.

Critiques the traditional language teaching approach for culturally different children. Distinctions are made between methods applicable for teaching English as a foreign language and those applicable for teaching standard English dialects to nonstandard speakers. The use of pattern practice, visual aids, memorization, and transfer techniques for instruction are examined.

HOFFMAN, VIRGINIA. "Language Learning at Rough Rock," *Childhood Education*, 46 (December 1969), 139-145.

Describes a bilingual, bicultural school based on an appreciation of the people, the culture, and the language of the Navajo. Rough Rock Demonstration School teaches children to read and write Navajo as well as English. Although this article is concerned with second language learning, its discussion of a bicultural curriculum is appropriate.

JONES, VIRGINIA W. "Training Teachers of English for Alaska's Native Children." *Elementary English*, 48 (February 1971), 198-202.

Describes a reading and language arts program designed for Alaskan rural school children. The children represent a population which 1) speaks only variant dialects of different native languages; 2) speaks a pidgin English; or 3) speaks English fluently.

PETERSEN, ROBERT O. "The Hilo Language Development Project," *Elementary English*, 44 (November 1967), 753-755.

Describes a program in Hawaii developed to help children who speak pidgin produce and understand standard English. Methods used were related to those used to teach English as a foreign language. People in the program developed a contrastive analysis of standard English and Hawaiian Island English dialect. Raises questions regarding the validity of applying a foreign language approach to children who speak a nonstandard English dialect.

ROSEN, CARL L., and PHILIP D. ORTEGA. "Language and Reading Problems of Spanish Speaking Children in the Southwest," *Journal of Reading Behavior*, 1 (Winter 1969), 51-70.

Raises many questions and problems which need to be answered regarding the development of programs for children with Spanish backgrounds. Questions dealing with variations of bilingualism, bidialectalism, and personal differences are examined. Different reading programs are reviewed and action-oriented research is called for. A very complete bibliography concludes the article.

WOLFRAM, WALTER. "Sociolinguistic Alternatives in Teaching Reading to Nonstandard Speakers," *Florida FL Reporter*, 8 (Spring/Fall 1970), 16-23, 48.

Examines the various approaches to the teaching of reading to children who speak a nonstandard Black dialect. Author concludes that a dialectically appropriate reading of existing material should be accepted by the teacher. At the same time further experimentation should be carried on with materials written for children who speak Black English.