

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 062 355

TE 002 909

AUTHOR Trivette, A. C.; White, Kinnard  
TITLE Title III, Co-Op STEP: Statistical Report Showing the  
Effect of Individual Instruction and Team Teaching  
upon the Academic Growth of High School Students in  
English.  
PUB DATE [69]  
NOTE 6p.; An unpublished paper  
EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.65 HC-\$3.29  
DESCRIPTORS Academic Achievement; Control Groups; \*Educational  
Research; \*English Instruction; Experimental Groups;  
High School Students; \*Individual Instruction;  
\*Statistical Data; Summer Schools; \*Tables (Data);  
Team Teaching

ABSTRACT

Research designed to discover the effect of individual instruction and team teaching upon the academic growth of students in high school English during a six weeks summer school session is discussed. Two control and experimental groups were used. Results are given in tabular form. (CK)

Title III, Co-Op STEP  
Statistical Report Showing the Effect of Individual  
Instruction and Team Teaching Upon the Academic  
Growth of High School Students  
in English

by  
Mrs. A. C. Trivette and Dr. Kinnard White\*

In 1969, Title III, Co-Op STEP designed research intended to discover the effect of individual instruction and team teaching upon the academic growth of students in high school English during a six weeks summer school session.

Two Title I schools served as control groups (Group A Traditional). In these schools the English classes were organized in the traditional manner according to grade level. There was one teacher to a class of about 18 students. State adopted text books were used. Students in the controlled groups numbered 65 of whom 82% were repeating English. The ethnic and socio-economic composition of the control groups was comparable to that of the experimental group. The school population of all groups was predominantly rural.

The experimental groups included 132 students of whom 67% were repeaters. These groups were organized in an essentially nongraded arrangement with teaching teams, made up of instructional specialists and teacher interns working with three groups of students.

Group B was Structured English in which the course objectives, units of study, and methods of lesson presentation were planned by the instructional team. No text books were used, but learning activity packages (LAPs) were developed by the teachers and given to the students. There was some large-group instruction, more small-group instruction, and individual instruction for each according to the particular weaknesses revealed by the student's pre test scores.

Group C classes were Unstructured English. Here students helped to determine objectives, units of study to be covered and methods to be used. Here again, as in the Structured English, class time was used for large-group instruction, small-group instruction and individual instruction using LAPs which were actually produced by students and teachers working cooperatively.

In Group D, Humanities, an interdisciplinary approach, English and Social Studies, was used and the learning packages were developed by the instructional teams. The approach to learning was essentially the

\*Mrs. A. C. Trivette, Director of Co-Op STEP, Title III, Carthage, North Carolina  
Dr. Kinnard White, Professor of Research UNC, Chapel Hill, North Carolina

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS  
COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED  
BY Mrs. A. C. TRIVETTE AND  
DR. KINNARD WHITE  
TO ERIC AND ORGANIZATIONS OPERATING  
UNDER AGREEMENTS WITH THE U.S. OFFICE OF  
EDUCATION. FURTHER REPRODUCTION OUTSIDE  
THE ERIC SYSTEM REQUIRES PERMISSION OF  
THE COPYRIGHT OWNER."

same as in groups B and C, but the theme and units of study were not the same as in the Structured and Unstructured English. No text books were used. Much independent study was done by the students in the Humanities Group.

All students were pre tested using form Q of the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills and administering the tests in Reading Vocabulary, Reading Comprehension, Study Skills (Reference), Study Skills (graphs, maps, etc.), Language, Mechanics, Language Expression and Language Spelling. All students included in this study were post-tested using form R of CTBS.

Those students in the Experimental groups whose total scores on Reading fell below the 38th percentile, spent approximately 160 minutes a week in the Reading Lab with a reading specialist to guide their activities. Those whose score fell below the 38th percentile on total Study Skills received 40 minutes per week in the library under the instruction of the librarian. The reason for this lies in the theory that failure in English may be attributable to reading and/or study skill inadequancies.

The results of this study are tabulated in Tables 1, 2, and 3.

Table 1.  
Mean I.Q., Mean Pre and Post Raw Scores, and  
Standard Deviation in Reading, Language,  
and Study Skills for Four Groups

| Variables | Group  |  |  |                                       |        |
|-----------|--|--|--|---------------------------------------|--------|
|           | (Control)<br>A (65)*<br>Traditional<br>English | Experimental<br>B (12)*<br>Structured<br>English | Experimental<br>C (93)*<br>Unstructured<br>English | Experimental<br>D (27)*<br>Humanities |        |
| I.Q.      | Mean I.Q.                                      | 87.369   | 92.583   | 90.667                                | 87.889 |
|           | Standard Deviation                             | 9.757  | 11.927   | 13.207                                | 9.162  |
| Reading   | Mean, Reading<br>Vocabulary (Pre-test)         | 18.738**   | 20.917   | 19.323                                | 17.926 |
|           | S. D.  | 6.137  | 9.080  | 7.518                                 | 6.604  |
|           | Mean Reading<br>Vocabulary 2 (Post-test)       | 18.062   | 21.917   | 20.151                                | 18.370 |
|           | S. D.  | 7.024  | 9.268  | 7.997                                 | 7.652  |
|           | Mean Reading<br>Comprehension (Pre-test)       | 20.185   | 21.250   | 21.591                                | 20.259 |
|           | S. D.  | 7.303  | 7.448  | 8.661                                 | 5.815  |
|           | Mean Reading<br>Comprehension (Post-test)      | 18.062   | 22.167   | 21.935                                | 19.333 |
|           | S. D.  | 7.693  | 9.666  | 9.203                                 | 6.737  |
|           | Mean Total<br>Reading (Pre-test)               | 38.646   | 42.167   | 41.269                                | 38.185 |
|           | S. D.  | 12.770   | 15.649   | 16.149                                | 11.593 |
|           | Mean Total<br>Reading (Post-test)              | 36.092   | 44.083   | 42.000                                | 37.704 |
|           | S. D.  | 13.270   | 18.002   | 15.895                                | 13.301 |
| Language  | Mean Language<br>Mech. (Pre-test)              | 10.954   | 13.667   | 13.204                                | 13.111 |
|           | S. D.  | 4.453  | 4.735  | 9.544                                 | 4.475  |
|           | Mean Language<br>Mech. (Post-test)             | 11.923   | 15.917   | 17.086                                | 14.370 |
|           | S. D.  | 5.972  | 4.907  | 6.430                                 | 4.805  |
|           | Mean Language<br>Exp. (Pre-test)               | 13.200   | 15.667   | 16.656                                | 13.519 |
|           | S. D.  | 4.845  | 3.985  | 10.266                                | 4.552  |
|           | Mean Language<br>Exp. (Post-test)              | 12.646   | 17.167   | 17.140                                | 15.074 |
|           | S. D.  | 5.541  | 6.520  | 6.641                                 | 5.053  |
|           | Mean Language<br>Spell (Pre-test)              | 13.569   | 14.250   | 15.376                                | 14.407 |
|           | S. D.  | 5.477  | 6.283  | 9.818                                 | 6.393  |
|           | Mean Language<br>Spell (Post-test)             | 13.500   | 17.500   | 15.559                                | 15.481 |
|           | S. D.  | 5.937  | 6.113  | 5.142                                 | 4.995  |

|                                    | (Control)<br>A (65)*                   | Experimental<br>B (12)* | Experimental<br>C (93)* | Experimental<br>D (27)* |        |
|------------------------------------|--|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|--------|
|                                    | Traditional<br>English                 | Structured<br>English   | Unstructured<br>English | Humanities              |        |
| I.Q.                               | Mean I.Q.                              | 87.369                  | 92.583                  | 90.667                  | 87.889 |
|                                    | Standard Deviation                     | 9.757                   | 11.927                  | 13.207                  | 9.162  |
| Reading                            | Mean, Reading Vocabulary (Pre-test)    | 18.738**                | 20.917                  | 19.323                  | 17.926 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 6.137                   | 9.080                   | 7.518                   | 6.604  |
|                                    | Mean Reading Vocabulary 2 (Post-test)  | 18.062                  | 21.917                  | 20.151                  | 18.370 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 7.024                   | 9.268                   | 7.997                   | 7.652  |
|                                    | Mean Reading Comprehension (Pre-test)  | 20.185                  | 21.250                  | 21.591                  | 20.259 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 7.303                   | 7.448                   | 8.661                   | 5.815  |
|                                    | Mean Reading Comprehension (Post-test) | 18.062                  | 22.167                  | 21.935                  | 19.333 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 7.693                   | 9.666                   | 9.203                   | 6.737  |
|                                    | Mean Total Reading (Pre-test)          | 38.646                  | 42.167                  | 41.269                  | 38.185 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 12.770                  | 15.649                  | 16.149                  | 11.593 |
|                                    | Mean Total Reading (Post-test)         | 36.092                  | 44.083                  | 42.000                  | 37.704 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 13.270                  | 18.002                  | 15.895                  | 13.301 |
| Language                           | Mean Language Mech. (Pre-test)         | 10.954                  | 13.667                  | 13.204                  | 13.111 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 4.453                   | 4.735                   | 9.544                   | 4.475  |
|                                    | Mean Language Mech. (Post-test)        | 11.923                  | 15.917                  | 17.086                  | 14.370 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 5.972                   | 4.907                   | 6.430                   | 4.805  |
|                                    | Mean Language Exp. (Pre-test)          | 13.200                  | 15.667                  | 16.656                  | 13.519 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 4.845                   | 3.985                   | 10.266                  | 4.552  |
|                                    | Mean Language Exp. (Post-test)         | 12.646                  | 17.167                  | 17.140                  | 15.074 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 5.541                   | 6.520                   | 6.641                   | 5.053  |
|                                    | Mean Language Spell (Pre-test)         | 13.569                  | 14.250                  | 15.376                  | 14.407 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 5.477                   | 6.283                   | 9.818                   | 6.393  |
|                                    | Mean Language Spell (Post-test)        | 13.500                  | 17.500                  | 15.559                  | 15.481 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 5.937                   | 6.113                   | 5.142                   | 4.995  |
| Study Skills                       | Mean Language Total (Pre-test)         | 37.554                  | 43.583                  | 41.495                  | 41.037 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 12.456                  | 11.285                  | 13.647                  | 12.368 |
|                                    | Mean Language Total (Post-test)        | 37.954                  | 53.083                  | 49.215                  | 44.926 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 11.690                  | 11.362                  | 13.736                  | 11.884 |
|                                    | Mean Study Skills Reference (Pre-test) | 9.154                   | 11.667                  | 11.280                  | 10.296 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 3.620                   | 4.334                   | 4.490                   | 3.291  |
|                                    | Mean Study Skills (Ref) (Post-test)    | 7.185                   | 8.750                   | 8.441                   | 7.667  |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 3.553                   | 3.769                   | 3.518                   | 2.587  |
|                                    | Mean S. S. (Graph) (Pre-test)          | 12.508                  | 13.417                  | 14.698                  | 12.481 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 5.072                   | 5.854                   | 5.538                   | 4.191  |
|                                    | Mean S. S. Graph (Post-test)           | 12.985                  | 13.500                  | 15.097                  | 12.815 |
|                                    | S. D.                                  | 5.343                   | 5.808                   | 5.754                   | 5.241  |
| Mean Total Study Skill (Pre-test)  | 21.662                                 | 25.083                  | 25.247                  | 22.778                  |        |
| S. D.                              | 7.928                                  | 9.501                   | 9.065                   | 6.750                   |        |
| Mean Total Study Skill (Post-test) | 20.169                                 | 22.250                  | 23.538                  | 20.481                  |        |
| S. D.                              | 8.013                                  | 9.077                   | 8.322                   | 7.154                   |        |

\*Number in each group for whom test information is complete.

\*\*See Appendix A for possible scores on this test.

Forms Q and R of the California Test of Basic Skills are equated by percentile scores. For this reason, it will be meaningful to compare the pre and post test scores to determine the amount of the difference in terms of percentiles. This information is presented in Table 2.

Table 2  
Mean Percentile Scores  
in Reading, Study Skills, and Language  
Totals - Pre and Post Tests and  
Standard Deviation

Variables

|              | Groups                  |                   |                     |                   |        |
|--------------|-------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|-------------------|--------|
|              | (Traditional)<br>A      | (Structured)<br>B | (Unstructured)<br>C | (Humanities)<br>D |        |
| Reading      | Reading Total           | 18.077            | 22.917              | 24.925            | 19.222 |
|              | S. D. Pre-test          | 16.930            | 19.884              | 23.178            | 16.235 |
| Study Skills | Reading Total           | 16.923            | 28.500              | 27.140            | 20.074 |
|              | S. D. Post-test         | 18.440            | 24.408              | 24.711            | 16.765 |
| Language     | Study Skills Total      | 17.385            | 27.333              | 30.172            | 19.815 |
|              | S. D. Pre-test          | 17.525            | 25.812              | 25.492            | 15.497 |
| Language     | Study Skills            | 22.308            | 27.917              | 33.753            | 24.222 |
|              | S. D.                   | 22.115            | 29.355              | 26.252            | 21.288 |
| Language     | Language Total Pre test | 15.908            | 22.000              | 24.667            | 21.558 |
|              | S. D.                   | 16.317            | 20.609              | 21.126            | 17.165 |
| Language     | Language Total          | 13.923            | 30.833              | 31.011            | 21.963 |
|              | S. D. Post test         | 18.912            | 26.236              | 25.308            | 17.293 |

Analysis of covariance was used to test the hypothesis of no difference among the organizational patterns of classes. For each post test criterion, the pre test score on the criterion measure and the student's I. Q. were used as covariates. This covariance adjustment controls for any differences between the groups on the post test that might have been attributable to either differential beginning points on the criteria under consideration or differences in general ability.

For purposes of program evaluation a probability level or .10 or less was considered as adequate to reject the hypothesis of no difference.

Table 3

Summary of Analysis of Covariance for Four Treatment Groups: Traditional, Structured, Unstructured, and Humanities, on Each of the Reading, Language, and Study Skills Scores with I.Q. and Pre-test Scores as Covariates.

| Variables              | F     |
|------------------------|-------|
| Vocabulary             | 1.26  |
| Comprehension          | 2.93* |
| Total Reading          | 2.48* |
| *****                  |       |
| Study Skills Reference | 0.18  |
| Study Skills Graph     | 0.46  |
| Study Skills Total     | 0.57  |
| *****                  |       |
| Language Mechanics     | 7.41* |
| Language Expression    | 4.63* |
| Language Spelling      | 2.47* |
| Language Total         | 9.65* |

df = 3,191

\*p1 .10

By comparing the variables starred in Table 3 with the raw scores in Table 1 and the percentile scores in Table 2, it appears that the gains in Reading Comprehension, Total Reading, Language Mechanics, Language Expression, Language Spelling, and Language Total were significant with a likelihood that these differences were due to the treatment factor, team teaching with individualized instruction.

Much more research needs to be done along the lines of this study equalizing the size of each group and extending the time. A follow-up study is being planned to test for the Hawthorne Effect.