

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 061 143

SO 002 770

AUTHOR Kleiman, Marsha
TITLE Social Studies: Great Debates in American History.
INSTITUTION Dade County Public Schools, Miami, Fla.
PUB DATE 71
NOTE 26p.; An Authorized Course of Instruction for the
Quinmester Program

EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.65 HC-\$3.29
DESCRIPTORS Activity Units; Behavioral Objectives; Colonial
History (United States); *Conflict Resolution;
*Constitutional History; Critical Thinking;
Curriculum Guides; *Debate; Grade 10; Grade 11; Grade
12; History Instruction; Resource Guides; Secondary
Grades; *Social Studies Units; Teaching Techniques;
*United States History

IDENTIFIERS American Studies; Florida; *Quinmester Program


ABSTRACT

This elective course in American Studies, one of a series revised to fit the quinmester organization of schools, is intended for 10th through 12th grade students. The aim of the course is for students to develop their capacity to examine and make judgements about controversial issues of the past and present. Emphasis is on an analysis of selected debates or issues in American history. Personalities of those involved in the controversies are examined. The course content outlines units on debates concerning Independence, between Hamilton and Jefferson, and the Mexican War. After examining selected historical controversies, students research an historical issue of their own choice. A section on objectives and learning activities emphasizes discussion and informal debates. A materials section of the guide lists textual materials, alternate student and class materials, and, teacher reference materials. Related documents are: SO 002 708 through SO 002 718, and SO 002 768 through SO 002 792. (Author/SJM)

ED 061143

Sd 002 770

AUTHORIZED COURSE OF INSTRUCTION FOR THE **QUINMESTER PROGRAM**



DADE COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS

Social Studies: GREAT DEBATES IN AMERICAN HISTORY 6416.12

DIVISION OF INSTRUCTION • 1971

Social Studies:

GREAT DEBATES IN AMERICAN HISTORY

6416.12

by

Marsha Kleiman

for the

Division of Instruction

Dade County Public Schools

Miami, Florida

1971

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,
EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRO-
DUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM
THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIG-
INATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPIN-
IONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY
REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDU-
CATION POSITION OR POLICY

DADE COUNTY SCHOOL BOARD

Mr. William Lehman, Chairman
Mr. G. Holmes Braddock, Vice-Chairman
Mrs. Ethal Beckham
Mrs. Crutcher Harrison
Mrs. Anna Brenner Meyers
Dr. Ben Sheppard
Mr. William H. Turner

Dr. E. L. Whigham, Superintendent of Schools
Dade County Public Schools
Miami, Florida 33132

Published by the Dade County School Board

Copies of this publication may be obtained through

Textbook Services
2210 S.W. Third Street
Miami, Florida 33135

Price: \$.75

INTRODUCTION

This course of study was written as part of a total effort to revise curriculum to fit the quinmester administrative organization of schools. The material and information in this guide are meant to be neither all-inclusive nor prescriptive; but rather, an aide to teachers as they plan instructional programs, taking into account student needs and characteristics, available resources, and other factors.

The major intent of this publication is to provide a broad framework of goals and objectives, content, teaching strategies, class activities, and materials all related to a described course of study. Teachers may then accept the model framework in total or draw ideas from it to incorporate into their lessons.

The guide is divided into 1) a broad goals section, 2) a content outline, 3) objectives and learning activities, and 4) materials. The first section provides descriptive and goal-oriented information for the teacher; "indicators of success" refers to suggested prerequisite or corequisite experiences. The content outline illustrates, in general terms, the scope and major subdivisions of the course. The objectives and learning activities section, hopefully, provides a total picture of the concept or main idea and specific behavioral objectives for a set of given learning activities. The materials section of the guide lists resources in four categories: essential textual or other material; alternate classroom materials to use in place of or in addition to the aforementioned; supplementary teacher resources; and supplementary student resources. The appendix may include other material appropriate for a specific course: e.g., pretests, readings, vocabulary, etc.

Anyone having recommendations relating to this publication is urged to write them down and send to: Social Studies Office, Room 306, Lindsey Hopkins, A-1.

James A. Fleming
Social Studies Consultant

COURSE DESCRIPTION: An analysis of selected debates or issues in America's past. After examining selected historical controversies, students research an historical issue of their choice. Activities will emphasize discussion and informal debate. The aim of the course is for students to develop their capacity to make judgments about issues, past and present.

CLUSTER: American Studies

GRADE LEVEL: 10-12

COURSE STATUS: Elective

INDICATORS OF SUCCESS: Prior experience in U.S. History recommended

COURSE RATIONALE: This course should convey a sense of "living" history through an in-depth analysis of a few selected vital issues in the development of our nation. Conflicting views are presented through primary sources wherever possible. A way of examining issues, rather than an accumulation of information, is stressed.

The course is divided into three main sections. First, the class develops a method of inquiry to use; second, the class examines selected issues together. Third, students work independently or in groups on an issue of their choice. To get a broad view of United States history, the writer chose to develop pre-20th century class models, allowing the students to emphasize more modern debates in their independent research.

COURSE GOALS:

THE STUDENT WILL

1. DEVISE A STEP-BY-STEP METHOD TO ANALYZE CONTROVERSIAL HISTORICAL ISSUES.
2. ANALYZE SELECTED DEBATES IN AMERICAN HISTORY. (There are models given in this course of study which the teacher may or may not use. These model controversies include: For or Against Independence; Hamilton vs. Jefferson; For or Against the Mexican War.)
3. COMPARE OPPOSING POINTS OF VIEW IN THE SELECTED CONFLICTS.
4. EXAMINE THE PERSONALITIES INVOLVED IN THE CONTROVERSIES, AND SUGGEST REASONS WHY THEY TOOK PARTICULAR POSITIONS WITH REGARD TO THE ISSUES.
5. RELATE SELECTED CONFLICTS WITH OTHERS, BOTH PAST AND PRESENT.
6. RESEARCH A CONTROVERSY OF HIS OWN CHOOSING THAT IS RELATED TO THIS COURSE.
7. DISCUSS CRITICALLY THE OPPOSING VIEWPOINTS OF CURRENT DEBATABLE ISSUES.

COURSE CONTENT OUTLINE:

- I. Course Introduction
 - A. Definition of debate
 - B. Definition of controversy
 - C. Historical method
- II. The Debate Concerning Independence
 - A. Historical background
 - 1. Grievances against Great Britain
 - 2. Outbreak of Revolutionary War
 - B. Loyalists
 - 1. Who were the Loyalists?
 - 2. Why would the Loyalists come from these groups?
 - 3. Arguments against independence
 - 4. Personalities involved
 - C. Patriots
 - 1. Who were the Patriots?
 - 2. Why would the Patriots come from these groups?
 - 3. Arguments for independence
 - 4. Personalities involved
 - D. Results of the conflict
- III. The Debate Between Hamilton and Jefferson - Strong Central Government vs. States' Rights
 - A. Historical background
 - 1. Divergent economic interests - commercial and business interests vs. agrarian interests
 - 2. Other conflicts (political, social, etc.)
 - B. Study of Hamilton's life
 - 1. Personal background
 - 2. Why would Hamilton support a strong Central Government?
 - C. Study of Jefferson's life
 - 1. Personal background
 - 2. Why would Jefferson support States' Rights?
 - D. Hamilton's views on government
- IV. The Debate on the Mexican War
 - A. Historical background
 - B. The War
 - C. Polk's arguments justifying the War
 - D. Arguments against the Mexican War
 - E. The relation to events leading to the Civil War
 - F. Relation to U.S. involvement in other conflicts
- V. Group Research Project

d

FOCUS

**DEBATE AND
CONTROVERSY**

OBJECTIVE

- A. The student will define what is meant by debate and controversy.
- B. The student will develop a method of historical inquiry.

LEARNING ACTIVITIES

1. Ask students to define the meanings of debate and controversy. Have them add to the definitions given by the other students. Write these definitions on the chalkboard.
 2. Have the students name some controversies of the past in American History. Add to these any pertinent ones that were omitted by the students.
 3. Have the students name and discuss some important debates or controversies that are going on in the U.S. today.
1. Give the students conflicting views of some event, possibly a current event (e.g., a newspaper article from an American newspaper and one from a Soviet newspaper.) Discuss the differences in interpretation leading to a definition of the term, frame of reference. Other examples could be used, e.g., a student's and an administrator's interpretations of a student fight.
- Possible discussion questions:
- a. Where do you get your frame of reference?
 - b. Are history books only facts or are they influenced by the author's frame of reference?
 - c. How can you tell the difference between fact and non-fact?
 - d. What kinds of materials would you use to get the most objective view of a historical or present-day problem? (First-hand accounts, diaries, etc.) Introduce the term primary source and discuss.
 - e. Encourage students to conclude that by obtaining different views of the same issue, they are better able to separate fact from interpretation and form their own ideas.

2. Divide the class into 4 groups and have each group try to develop a step-by-step method for the investigation of the issues to be dealt with in this course. This may take a whole class period or longer. It might

FOCUS	OBJECTIVE	LEARNING ACTIVITIES
		<p>be good to give them the first problem to be investigated (e.g., the debate over independence) and have them decide what steps they would go through to analyze it.</p> <p>Have each group write its steps on the board or present it to the class. Compare the methods, discuss differences, discuss order of the steps. Have the class then try to agree on a method. Compare it to an established method of inquiry (Edwin Fenton describes a step-by-step method of inquiry in his series Holt Social Studies Curriculum). The following steps should be included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Defining the problem b. Gathering information c. Making hypotheses d. Determining what is fact e. Testing the hypotheses with evidence, modifying if necessary f. Making generalizations <p>3. For the purposes of examining historical debates in this course, list questions that need to be asked in each study:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. How and when did the issue arise? b. Who were the opposing groups or individuals? c. What were the arguments for and against the issue? d. What was the result? e. Can we make a judgment about the conflicting views? f. Is the issue still with us or was it settled?

FOCUS	OBJECTIVE	LEARNING ACTIVITIES
<p>THE DEBATE CONCERNING INDEPENDENCE</p>	<p>A. The student will analyze the historical background of the Revolutionary War.</p> <p>B. The student will identify the main ideas of the Loyalists (those opposing independence) and the Patriots (those for independence).</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Assign the students some background reading material on the Revolutionary War. Discuss the main grievances the colonists had against Great Britain. Define the problem: Should the colonists declare independence from Britain? 2. Discuss the outbreak of the Revolutionary War and the main events leading to the Declaration of Independence.
		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ask the students who they think the Loyalists were. In other words, from what groups in society did they come? (Office-holders, members of Anglican Church, military men, property holders, many recent immigrants) 2. Have the students suggest reasons why the Loyalists would come from these groups. Look at this in relation to the interest these groups would have in preserving the status quo - their connection with Great Britain.
		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. Have the students read the selection from <u>Great Debates U.S.A.</u>, entitled, "Cato Rejects Common Sense, March 1776." Ask the students to list their main arguments. Discuss each one from the point of view of the Loyalists.
		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 4. Have the students read the selection from <u>Rebels vs. Royalists</u>, entitled, "The Advantages of Reconciliation." Ask the students to identify and discuss any different arguments against independence put forth by Charles Inglis.
		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Discuss from what groups in society the Patriots came. (small farmers, artisans, frontiersmen, merchants, some well-to-do Southern planters, urban mechanics, working-class seamen, fishermen and laborers; among the poorer classes generally)

6. Have the students suggest reasons why the Patriots might come from these groups. Why would these groups want to change the status quo? Are there exceptions?
 - a. Give the students the selection from Rebels vs. Royalists, entitled, "The Revolution as an Economic Revolt and Civil War" to prepare for discussion of these possible questions:
 - (1) Why did the Northern merchant capitalists come into conflict with the British?
 - (2) What British groups did the Southern planters come into conflict with? Why?
 - (3) Why did American manufacturing pose a problem to the British?
 - (4) How did the British imperial policy prepare the way for other conflicts between the colonies and Great Britain?
 - (5) What were some grievances of the lower middle classes?
 - b. Have the students read the selection from Rebels vs. Royalists, entitled, "Seeds of Revolution" and prepare their answers to the following questions:
 - (1) What elements of their English heritage contributed to the growth of the spirit of freedom in America?
 - (2) What were some other elements in their colonial heritage that contributed to the growth of the spirit of freedom in America?
 - (3) How did the frontier contribute to the growth of the spirit of freedom in America?

FOCUS

OBJECTIVE

LEARNING ACTIVITIES

7. Have the students read Thomas Paine's article, "Common Sense" from the book, Great Debates U.S.A.

- a. Ask the students to identify the main points Paine gave for independence.
- b. Ask the students if they agree or disagree with these reasons and to explain why.
- c. Ask the students to suggest any additional arguments for independence. For example:

(1) King George planned to take away the self-government of the colonies.

(2) America's potential for economic growth was hampered by England's restrictive measures.

d. Compare Paine and Cato's (activity #3 above) writings.

(Where do they agree? Disagree? Whose arguments are stronger?)

8. Have various students take the role of Loyalists or Patriots. Have the students defend their particular stand for or against independence. Afterward, take a poll of the class to see how many students would join the Loyalist or Patriot cause after hearing the arguments.

9. Question for research: What percentage of the colonists were actively seeking independence?

1. Pass out a copy of the Declaration to the students.

- a. Examine the reasons given for the break with Great Britain.
- b. Compare these reasons with the reasons the class listed for the Patriots.

C. The student will summarize the results of the conflict between the Loyalists and the Patriots.

FOCUS

OBJECTIVE

LEARNING ACTIVITIES

I. THE DEBATE BETWEEN HAMILTON AND JEFFERSON - STRONG CENTRAL GOVERNMENT VS. STATES' RIGHTS

D. The student will compare arguments used for and against American independence to the opposing arguments in selected modern independence movements.

A. The student will examine the historical background of the conflict between Hamilton's supporters and Jefferson's supporters.

2. Play the record, Our Independence and the Constitution - Parts 1 and 2. Have the students apply the main ideas to the present discussion.
3. Show the film, The American Revolution (1-12900), as background information. Have the students summarize the results of the conflict between the Loyalists and the Patriots.

As an alternative, you may wish to show the filmstrip, The American Revolution.

1. Making use of groups or individual reports, have the students research some modern independence movements. (Cuba, Nigeria, Puerto Rico, India, etc.)
 - a. Have students identify the protagonists.
 - b. Have the students discuss the main arguments used for and/or against independence in their selected country.
 - c. Have the students compare these arguments with those used by the Loyalists and Patriots before and during the American Revolution.

2. Debate: When a majority of people living in a definable geographic area desire independence, they should be granted that independence by the government.

1. Have interested students go to the library to investigate the debate between Hamilton and Jefferson. They should try to find out how and when the issue came about and be able to explain the issue, briefly, to the class.

Recalling their steps in a method of inquiry and the steps in analyzing controversial issues, students should proceed to discuss how they might approach the problem: Defining the problem, asking questions, locating resources (review library skills as needed).

2. Explore the divergent economic interests in the time of Hamilton and Jefferson: Commercial and business interests vs. agrarian interests.
 - a. Discuss the commercial and business interests which believed the nation needed to develop commerce and business, and saw the need for a strong role for the central government.
 - b. Ask the students to suggest reasons why many of the agrarian interests supported states' rights.

3. Have the students research the general background of Hamilton's life up to this time. See Jefferson and Hamilton by Claude C. Bowers, Alexander Hamilton by William Wise, or other appropriate material.
 - a. Have students discuss some of Hamilton's general views of life and his society. Points they should discover should include:
 - (1) He believed the masses must be governed by an elite, working through a strong national government. The only alternative was mob rule.
 - (2) He did not understand the special qualities of the new America of Western farmers and frontiersmen, with their independence and self-confidence.
 - (3) He despised the undisciplined agrarian way of life, in which a man was free to work or to be idle.
 - (4) He felt taxes were beneficial as they compelled men to be industrious.

- b. Have students search out some factors that would explain Hamilton's support for a strong central government as opposed to a system of states' rights which would supposedly give the people more representation. Examples: His constant effort to overcome his humble birth by reading the classics, which raised him to the level of the great; his education in America, where he made friends with only the elite; his marriage into an aristocratic family; his distrust of the common people; his aristocratic values.
4. Show the film, Alexander Hamilton (1-12414).
- a. Have the students identify qualities of the man that support;
b. Or contradict their conclusions about his views of society.
5. From the discussion of Hamilton's life and from the information in the film, have the students write a paper analyzing the reasons why they feel that Hamilton would support a strong central government. Have students share this writing experience with others in the class.
6. Give the students a general background of Jefferson's life up to this time. (See Jefferson and Hamilton or other appropriate material.)
- a. Discuss some of Jefferson's general views of life. They should include the following:
- (1) Farming was important because it produced the kind of citizens best qualified to meet the demands of a republican government.
- (2) Jefferson felt the worst that could happen was for America to rush into the Industrial Revolution, exchanging its farms for factories and open countryside for the slums of the large cities.

FOCUS	OBJECTIVE	LEARNING ACTIVITIES
<p>B. The student will compare (1) Hamilton's and Jefferson's views on government and (2) their interpretations of the Constitution.</p>	<p>b. Stress some factors that would help explain Jefferson's support for states' rights, such as the influence of his democratic-minded middle class father, who was a farmer; Jefferson's boyhood on the frontier and frontier values; values of a farmer, Jefferson's main occupation.</p> <p>7. Show the film, <u>Thomas Jefferson (1-12429)</u> to the students. Have them identify points that support or reject their hypotheses about Jefferson so far.</p> <p>8. From the discussion and the film of Jefferson's life, have the students analyze the reasons why they feel Jefferson would be a strong supporter of states' rights.</p> <p>1. Assign the students some background reading on Hamilton's financial program. Describe and analyze Hamilton's program in some detail. Point out the need for the support of the man of wealth.</p> <p>2. Have students read the selection in <u>Great Debates U.S.A.</u>, entitled, "Alexander Hamilton Defends the Constitutionality of the Bank, February 23, 1791." Some points of discussion might be:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Why did Hamilton believe it was constitutional to set up a U.S. bank? What is a "loose" construction of the Constitution? What would a "strict" construction be? When did Hamilton believe a power was constitutional? 	

3. Discuss some of Jefferson's general objections to Hamilton's program. (See Jefferson and Hamilton or other appropriate reference.)

Important points include the following:

- a. Hamilton's plan favored the merchants, bankers and speculators.
- b. The farmers and planters were excessively taxed to aid the bondholders and the financiers in the cities.
- c. The Federalists were subverting the rights of the common man.
- d. Jefferson believed Hamilton was guilty of subverting republicanism and erecting a monarchy.

4. Pass out the selection in Great Debates U.S.A., entitled, "Thomas Jefferson Denies the Constitutionality of the Bank, February 15, 1791." Have students analyze in some detail Jefferson's "strict" interpretation of the Constitution, using Hamilton's program to illustrate his points: The fact that taxes could be collected more conveniently through a bank - did not make the bank necessary. Jefferson believed implied powers must be necessary to carry out an expressed power, not just convenient.

5. Have various students take the roles of Hamilton and Jefferson. In a formal or informal debate, have them defend their reasons for promoting a strong central government or more states' rights. They should include the constitutional arguments.

6. Discuss: Was the debate over states' rights settled? What would have happened if Jefferson's plan had succeeded?

C. The student will analyze the controversy today between the central government vs. states' rights.

1. Have the students list the major areas of conflict today between the central government and local and state governments:
 - a. Segregation vs. integration - busing
 - b. Federal protection of civil rights of people threatened by state laws
 - c. Nixon's revenue sharing plan - an attempt to return power to states and cities. Why is it opposed?

FOCUS

OBJECTIVE

LEARNING ACTIVITIES

→ THE DEBATE ON
∞ THE MEXICAN WAR

A. The student will analyze the historical background of the Mexican War.

2. Have students discuss these controversies in relation to the main theme of a stronger central government vs. more local and state control.
3. Ask the students to analyze why the people involved feel the way they do about the issues. Example: Why are many people against busing? Many favor neighborhood schools; others oppose busing on constitutional grounds. Some of these issues would lend themselves to role playing, a mother explaining why she favors the neighborhood school, etc. Other issues would be analyzed more effectively by the use of discussion questions. Which activity you use would depend on the issue under discussion.
4. Have the students bring in newspaper articles relating to discussions about the controversy between central government control and state control. Have the students give reports on their articles and discuss.
1. Discuss with the students the reasons for friction between the U.S. and Mexico. (Pass out background information to the students. See The War with Mexico: Why did it Happen? or other appropriate material.)
2. Discuss the Texas situation in some detail.
 - a. Have a student give a report on the Texas War for Independence.
 - b. Other students may give reports on some of the main personalities involved in Texas.
 - c. Some other points of discussion might include the following:
 - (1) Mexico broke off diplomatic relations with the U.S. after Texas was admitted into the Union in 1845.
 - (2) Mexico and the U.S. ordered troops to the Texas border after the U.S. announced the annexation of Texas.
 - (3) Both Mexico and the U.S. claimed the land between the Nueces River and the Rio Grande River.

FOCUS

OBJECTIVE

LEARNING ACTIVITIES

B. The student will describe and examine the main events of the Mexican War.

1. Pass out maps with the main events of the Mexican War located on them. The students should refer to these maps during the discussion of the Mexican War. (NOTE: It is not necessary to discuss the war itself in great detail. This discussion is mainly to present to the students a complete picture of this period in American History.)
2. Have several students give reports on the main events of the war:

- a. Outbreak of war and President Polk's war message to Congress
- b. Zachary Taylor's victories
- c. War in California
- d. Invasion of Mexico
- e. Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo

3. Other students may also give reports on Taylor, Scott, and President Polk.

4. Show the film, U.S. Expansion: Texas and the Far Southwest (1-12373). Have the students examine the main events discussed. You may wish to have this film as an alternative to activities #2 and #3 discussed above rather than having the reports and the film.

C. The student will defend reasons supporting or opposing the Mexican War. The student will contrast the two positions.

1. Pass out the selection in Great Debates U.S.A., entitled "President Polk Moves for War with Mexico, May 11, 1846."
 - a. Have the students list and explain President Polk's justification for the war.
 - b. Have them suggest any weaknesses in his arguments.
 - c. Have the students suggest any other possible justifications for the war.

FOCUS

OBJECTIVE

LEARNING ACTIVITIES

2. Give students the selection in Great Debates U.S.A., entitled, "Thomas Corwin Opposes War with Mexico, February 11, 1847."
 - a. Have the students list Corwin's reasons for opposing the Mexican War.
 - b. Ask the students to explain their reasons.
 - c. Have them suggest any other reasons for opposition to the Mexican War.
3. Have students take the roles of U.S. Congressmen for or against the Mexican War. Have them defend their positions in an informal debate.
1. Ask the students to suggest any relation between the Mexican War and the events leading up to the Civil War.
 - a. What groups involved in the slavery controversy supported the war and what groups opposed it?
 - b. Have the students suggest reasons why these groups felt the way they did.
2. Give the students the selections in The War with Mexico: Why did it happen? entitled, "Southerners Want More Slave Territory"; and, "The South was not the Aggressor."
 - a. Ask the students to discuss these articles in relation to the quote below.
 - b. Clement Eaton in his History of the Old South stated, "One of the most important consequences of the Mexican War was that it precipitated a great sectional struggle between the North and the South over the status of slavery in this territory, a controversy that eventually led to the Civil War."

D. The student will relate the Mexican War to the events leading up to the Civil War.

Eaton felt the Mexican War was "an adventure in imperialism of the South in partnership with the restless inhabitants of the West" - a conflict that was "provoked by a Southern President and fought largely by Southern generals and by Southern volunteers."

Ask the students to discuss the validity of this explanation.

(For example: How did the Mexican War add to the sectional struggle between the North and the South?)

c. Some questions to bring up in discussion:

- (1) What are the techniques used to prove the complicity of the slaveowners in the coming of the war?
- (2) What criticism may be made of the techniques?
- (3) Does the refutation successfully demolish the arguments implicating the South?

3. Have students gather some background information on the Wilmot Proviso.

- a. Discuss the significance of the Wilmot Proviso to sectional rivalry.
- b. Have the students contrast the views of different groups or sections of the country toward the Wilmot Proviso.
- c. The Wilmot Proviso was never passed by Congress, but discuss with the students the fact that it became the main principle of moderate anti-slavery men; those who would leave slavery alone in the states where it existed but who opposed its spread into new territory.

FOCUS

OBJECTIVE

LEARNING ACTIVITIES

E. The student will compare the debate over the Mexican War with the debates over U.S. involvement in other conflicts - past and present.

1. Discuss with the students U.S. involvement in other conflicts - past and present - that can be compared to the arguments for and/or against the Mexican War. (Indochina, Spanish-American War, World War II, Dominican Republic, Cuba, etc.)

2. Have the students give individual reports comparing the arguments used for and against the Mexican War and these other wars or conflicts - past and present. (The students should make use of the periodicals in the library where applicable.) Some similar arguments to look for:

- a. Was the war justified?
- b. Was it a "President's War"?
- c. Could the war have been avoided?

GROUP RESEARCH PROJECT

A. The student (as a member of a group) will research a controversial issue and be able to defend a position on the issue.

- 1. Review with the students the research facilities of the library.
- 2. Divide the class into groups:
 - a. Have each group choose a controversial issue in American history - past or present - to research and present to the class.
 - b. Some suggested topics:
 - (1) The debate over slavery (Lincoln, Douglas, etc.)
 - (2) U.S. policy toward the Indians.
 - (3) Should the U.S. have joined the League of Nations?
 - (4) Should the U.S. have dropped the atomic bomb?
 - (5) The SST: An Environmental Hazard?
 - (6) Is our present court system too lenient toward the criminal?

- (7) Is progress in technology worth the price of environmental pollution?
 - (8) Tactics for Black advancement: violent vs. non-violent action.
 - (9) Is a national health insurance system necessary in the U.S. today?
 - (10) Should the Selective Service System be abolished?
 - (11) Lt. Calley: guilty or not guilty?
3. Explain the general requirements:
- a. State the problem.
 - b. Present the historical setting of the issue.
 - c. Identify the main personalities and/or groups involved.
 - d. Explain the individual or group views on the subject and suggest why he or they might have felt that way about the issue. Prepare evidence to support both sides of the issue under debate.
 - e. Present a formal or informal debate on the issue with members of each group taking opposite sides of the issue.
4. At the conclusion of each debate, have the class as a whole discuss critically the arguments given on both sides of the issues. Attempt to make generalizations acceptable to the majority of the class, based on the evidence presented. Relate the issues to today.

NOTE TO TEACHER: The time for this research activity will vary, depending on the time required for your previous investigations, the topics chosen by the students, etc.)

FOCUS

OBJECTIVE

LEARNING ACTIVITIES

5. A culminating discussion should revolve around the importance of careful analysis of opposing points of view before making value judgments about any controversial issue, past and present. Students should be able to identify ways that history may reflect only one point of view. (Frame of reference)

MATERIALS

- I. Recommended basic textual and other materials: None
- II. Alternate student and class materials:
- A. Textual
1. Madgic, Robert F. Rebels vs. Royalists. New York: Scholastic Book Services, 1966.
 2. Mark, Irving. Great Debates U.S.A. Morristown, New Jersey: Silver Burdett Company, 1969.
 3. Rappaport, Armin, ed. The War with Mexico: Why did it Happen? University of California at Berkeley: Rand McNally and Company, 1964.
- B. Audio-Visual
1. Motion Pictures
 - a. Alexander Hamilton, EBEC, 18 min. B & W.
 - b. The American Revolution, EBEC, 15 min. C.
 - c. Thomas Jefferson, EBEC, 20 min. B & W.
 - d. U.S. Expansion: Texas and the Far Southwest, Coronet, 14 min. C.
 2. Records

Fisher, Dorothy Canfield. Our Independence and the Constitution (Parts 1 & 2)
Enrichmant, 10 inches. 78 rpm.
 3. Filmstrips

The American Revolution. Guidance Associates. Harcourt, Brace and World, Inc.
2 filmstrips, 2 cassettes, and guide.

MATERIALS (continued)

C. Other: None

D. Supplemental pupil resources:

Dependent on choice of topics

III. Teacher reference materials:

- Bowers, Claude G. Jefferson and Hamilton. Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin and Company, 1953.
- Dufour, Charles L. The Mexican War. New York: Hawthorn Books, Inc., 1968.
- Miller, John C. Origins of the American Revolution. Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1943.
- Miller, John C. The Federalist Era. New York: Harper and Row, 1960.
- Morgan, Edmund S. The Birth of the Republic. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1956.
- Parkes, Henry Bamford. The American Experience. New York: Vintage Books, 1959.
- Wise, William. Alexander Hamilton. New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1963.